

# Theology on the Web.org.uk

*Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible*

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

**PayPal**

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

---

A table of contents for the *Journal of Theological Studies* (old series) can be found here:

[https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles\\_jts-os\\_01.php](https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_jts-os_01.php)

pdfs are named: [Volume]\_[1<sup>st</sup> page of article]

mother from the pain and peril of childbirth without the intervention of a midwife, belongs probably to an earlier date than the elaborate details of the hymns of Ephrem Syrus.

W. EMERY BARNES.

## A STUDY OF SOME EUCHARISTIC PHRASES IN THE WEST.

IN the present Roman Pontifical at the *Ordinatio Presbyteri* a prayer is used by the ordaining Bishop that God would bless those 'quos ad Presbyterii honorem dedicamus . . . ut . . . in obsequium plebis tuae panem et vinum in corpus et sanguinem Filii tui immaculata benedictione transformet'. The earliest instances of the use of the phrase in this connexion that we now possess are, I believe, to be found in the *Missale Francorum* (668 Mur.) and *Sacr. Gel.* (514 Mur.<sup>1</sup>), where it occurs in the *Benedictio*, which follows the *Consummatio Presbyteri* in the form 'per obsequium pl. tuae corpus et sanguinem Fil. t. immac. bened. transformet.' This we may take to be the original form of the phrase. There are, however, variations. For instance the *Pontifical of Egbert* omits 'benedictione' and reads 'immaculati'; the *Codex Gellonensis* omits 'per'; while the *Benedictional of Archbp. Robert* (125 H B S) seems to have made a more determined attempt to amend the text of the phrase by altering it and joining it on to the beginning of the next in this way: 'per obs. pl. tuae corpore et sanguine Filii t. immac. bened. transformetur ad inviolabilem caritatem.'<sup>2</sup> This last version makes good sense but of course it is a wholly different one from that of the original text. As to the meaning originally intended there is, however, no

<sup>1</sup> The quotations are all, where possible, from Muratori, merely for convenience of reference.

<sup>2</sup> I cannot think that Bp Gore is right in his view (*Church and Ministry* note C p. 367, London 1889) that this is the earliest form of the petition, and perhaps the additional facts I adduce here may convince him. I venture to suggest also that his translation of 'per obseq. pl. tuae' (= 'in the service of Thy people') is not correct, though I do not feel quite certain of this.

difficulty, except in regard to the words 'per obsequium plebis tuae', which Archbp. Robert's version does not touch. I conclude that the words mean that the loyal co-operation of the laity is a necessary element in the consecration of the Elements—a most valuable consideration, which is lost by the alteration in the modern Roman Pontifical of the 'per' into 'in'; this, I imagine, is intended to convey the thought that the 'transformatio' effected by the Presbyter is for the obedient reception of the people. The addition of the other words in the modern Roman rite is unnecessary but not detrimental to the proper meaning.

The interesting point about the phrase I am discussing is that it, together with the whole prayer in which it occurs of course, would seem to be derived from 'Gallican' rather than purely Roman sources: and if so, it is the more remarkable, as it is, I think, the nearest approximation to the doctrine of Transubstantiation at present to be found expressed in the chief Roman Service books.

The following is the evidence on which I base my suggestion:—In the *Missale Gallicanum Vetus*, the section of the Canon which begins *Hanc igitur oblationem* on Maundy Thursday (723 Mur.) has this clause: 'Iesus Christus in novo testamento sacrificandi ritum instituit dum panem ac vinum . . . in sacramento sui corporis et sanguinis transformavit.' This also is what Muratori (130 ff) says he has ascertained to be the form of the *Hanc igitur oblationem* in the Ambrosian *Canon Missae* for Maundy Thursday.<sup>1</sup> And the (Gallican) *Expositio Liturgiae* quoted also by Muratori (col. 144) from Martène is evidently commenting on some such clause in the words 'panis in corpore et vinum transformatur in sanguine'.

Again in the *Missale Gothicum* the *Post Secreta* for the Circumcision (534 Mur.) contains the phrase 'ut fiat nobis eucharistia legitima . . . in transformationem corporis ac sanguinis Domini Dei nostri Iesu Christi', while the *Post Secreta* for S. Leudegar Martyr (637 Mur.) has 'ut descendat hic benedictio tua super hunc panem et calicem in transformatione spiritus tui sancti.'

These are the only passages I have found in which the word 'transformare' ('transformatio') actually occurs, but we may fitly compare the prayer *Post Mysterium* for the *Assumptio S. Mariae Matris Domini nostri* in the last-named Missal (548 Mur.), 'ut translata fruge in corpore calice in cruore proficiat meritis quod obtulimus pro delictis'; while if we turn to patristic writings on the subject we find parallel words used. For instance, Muratori *Dissertatio de rebus liturgicis* (136 f) quotes two passages from S. Ambrose, where he uses 'transfigurare' in this connexion, viz. *de Fide* iv 10: 'Sacramenta quae per sacrae orationis mysterium

<sup>1</sup> His statement is corroborated by the *Ordo ex codice Heriberti Archiepiscopi* appended by Magistretti to his *Ambrosian Pontifical* p. 101 (Milan 1897).

in carnem transfigurantur et sanguinem,' and *de Incarn. Dni.* iv 'etsi a Christo veram carnem esse susceptam et offeras transfigurandum corpus altaribus, etc.'. Compare, too, Isidore *de Eccl. Officiis* i 18 'sanctificata per spiritum sanctum in sacramentum divini corporis transeunt'; Gelasius *de Duabus Naturis* 'Sacramenta . . . in hanc, scilicet in divinam, transeunt spiritu sancto perficiente substantiam, permanent tamen in sua proprietate naturae'; and Gaudentius (Bp. of Brescia circ. 400) *ad Neophytos* ii 'ne terrenum putes quod caeleste effectum est per eum qui transit in illud et fecit illud suum corpus et sanguinem'.

It is obvious, I think, that these terms, and in particular 'transformare' and 'transfigurare', which strictly correspond to the Greek μεταμορφοῦν and μετασχηματίζειν, belong to a stage in the mediaeval development of eucharistic doctrine earlier than the scholastic stage, and really represent Greek rather than Latin modes of looking at the Presence of Christ in the Blessed Sacrament (see Dr Srawley's Introduction to Gregory of Nyssa, *Catechetical Oration*, pp. xxxvii ff, and his notes on pp. 146 ff).

It is on these grounds that one is tempted to suggest that the phrase we have discussed was introduced into the Roman Pontifical from Gallican sources, which were apparently themselves often drawn from the East.

It seems, indeed, as if the tendency to use strong and definite words for describing the change in the Elements by consecration is first seen in such sources.

Two other instances may be taken to illustrate this:—(1) The use of the words 'mutare' and 'convertere'. The *Missale Gothicum* has an invitation to worship on the Epiphany (542 Mur.) 'poscentes ut qui tunc aquas in vina mutavit, nunc in sanguinem suum oblationum nostrarum vina convertat', and in the *collectio post nomina* in the same *Missa* we have 'omnium simul oblationes et vota convertere dignetur in sacrificium divinum', whilst in the last *Missa Dominicalis* (656 Mur.) the *Post Secreta* has 'ut operante virtute panem mutatum in carne, poculum versum in sanguine illum [sc. sanguinem] sumamus in calicem qui de te fluxit in cruce ex latere'. With this we may compare Ambrose *de Sacr.* cap. ix 'benedictione etiam natura ipsa [sc. of the elements] mutatur', and cap. liij 'tantum voluit humana benedictio ut naturam converteret' (*viz.* in the O. T. miracles).<sup>1</sup> (2) The use of the words 'conficere' and 'perficere'. The *Miss. Franc.*, *Sacr. Gel.*, *Pont. of Egb.*, *Leofr. Missal*, &c., all have a prayer for consecrating a paten 'ad conficiendum in ea corpus Domini'—a curiously strong phrase, which is well illustrated by Ambrose

<sup>1</sup> See also a very curious prayer for the consecration of an altar in the *Benedict. of Archbp. Robt.* (85 HBS) and three allied MSS: 'dignum sit supra quod electas ad sacrificium creaturas in corpus et sanguinem Redemptoris virtus secreta convertat et in sacras agni hostias invisibili mutatione transcribat.'

*de Sacr.* cap. liij 'sacramentum istud quod accipis Christi sermone conficitur', and cap. liij 'hoc quod conficimus corpus ex Virgine est'—though lower down in the same group of benedictions the prayer for consecrating a ciborium uses 'perficere' in a somewhat different sense, 'hoc vasculum sanctificetur et corporis Christi novum sepulcrum spiritus sancti infusione perficiatur'.

But a remarkable parallel to the stronger use is found in a *Preface* for the fifth Sunday *post Theophaniam* in the Ottobon. Codex of the *Sacr. Greg.* (298 Mur.) which strikes one as by no means 'Roman' in phraseology: '(hostia) quae offertur a plurimis et unum corpus Christi sancti spiritus infusione perficitur . . . propterea ipsi qui sumimus communionem huius sancti panis et calicis unum corpus Christi efficimur.'<sup>1</sup>

Lastly, the following extracts will serve to illustrate the ways in which the word 'substantia' itself was used in the West with regard to the sacramental Presence of Christ in these same times, before the scholastic doctrine of Transubstantiation had been formulated and received. *Sacr. Leon.* (297 Mur.) Mense Aprili xij 'repleti substantia reparationis et vitae quaesumus etc.': *Sacr. Leon.* (357 Mur.) Mense Iulio viij 'Rogamus . . . ut qui percepimus caelestis mensae substantiam etc.': *Sacr. Leon.* (419 Mur.) Mense Septembri xi 'consequens fuit ut . . . ederetur qui . . . hoc totum non solum de caelo substantia deferret et nomine sed panem praeberet aeternum'. With the first of these extracts we may compare Ambrose *de Sacr.* cap. xlvij 'ista esca . . . iste panis vivus . . . vitae substantiam subministrat', and a striking parallel to it in the *Sacr. Ambr.* (Pamel. Lit. i) 'panis vivus et verus qui substantia aeternitatis et esca virtutis est'.<sup>2</sup> In all these cases 'substantia' seems to mean the reality ('veritas', ἀλήθεια) in a general sense,<sup>3</sup> not the essence ('essentia', οὐσία) in the technical sense, which it was afterwards taken to signify.

This brief study of early liturgical phraseology in the West is very largely based on the quotations given and discussed in Muratori's masterly *Dissertatio de rebus liturgicis*, with which he prefaced his *Liturgia Romana Vetus* (Venetiis 1748). It seems almost unfair to have so

<sup>1</sup> Cf. *Pont. of Egb.* (p. 42 Surtees ed.) and *Benedict. of Archbp. Robt.* (84 HBS) in a *benedictio tabulae*: 'lapidem hunc ad conficienda vitae sacramenta compositum': Canon 7 of the second Council of Seville (A. D. 619) 'presbyteris non licet . . . episcopo praesente sacramentum corporis et sanguinis Christi conficere': Isid. *de Eccl. Off.* ij 7 'in confectione divina corporis et sanguinis consortes'. Amalarius of Treves (circ. 820) uses nearly the same phrase as this last.

<sup>2</sup> Cf. *Miss. Goth.* (567 Mur.) at beginning of Lent: 'ipse est panis vivus et verus . . . qui est substantia aeternitatis et esca virtutis.'

<sup>3</sup> Cf. Leo Magn. *Serm. de ieiunio septimi mensis vi* cap. 3 'ut nihil prorsus de veritate corporis et sanguinis ambigatis', and *Ep.* lix 2 'nec ab infantium linguis veritas corporis et sanguinis Christi taceatur'.

used his labours, because, though I hesitate to lay down any definite conclusion, yet it cannot but be evident that the tendency of my suggestions is in a contrary direction to his, which is to maintain that the doctrine of Transubstantiation has been held throughout by the (Roman) Catholic Church.

C. L. FELTOE.