Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:

https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology

https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb

PayPal https://paypal.me/robbradshaw

A table of contents for *The Expository Times* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_expository-times_01.php

pdfs are named: [Volume]_[Issue]_[1st page of article].pdf

Literature.

UNITARIANISM.

A VERY interesting volume of essays by prominent Unitarians has been issued, with an introduction by Dr. J. Estlin Carpenter—*Freedom and Truth: Modern Views of Unitarian Christianity* (Lindsey Press; 6s. net). The distinguished editor is now in his eighty-second year, and we read his introductory sketch of the progress of religious thought with respectful wonder at its clear grasp and sustained mental vigour. This introduction is as interesting as anything in the book, but we have all sides of Unitarian thought illustrated in the essays which follow. Dr. S. H. Mellone writes on 'Unitarian Christianity in the Twentieth Century,' Professor Dodson on 'The Idea of God,' Dr. R. T. Herford on 'The Old Testament,' Professor Bowen on 'The Historical Understanding of Jesus,' Dr. H. Gow on 'The Value and Significance of Jesus.' A sermon by the late Dr. Martineau is included, as well as one or two other papers on less vital topics than the above.

These essays, and especially those by Dr. Bowen and Dr. Gow, raise the most vital issues, but it must be confessed they do so in an altogether admirable spirit. The writers are quite clear about their own position, but they deal with orthodox Christianity in the most sympathetic way and at points approach very near its position. This is specially true of what Dr. Gow has to say about Christian experience. He does not deny its validity, but he seeks another interpretation of it: 'The experiences which many Modernists call communion with the living Christ would be described by many Unitarians who have similar experiences as communion with the living God.' Indeed, Dr. Gow does not deny the reality of communion with the unseen Christ or the 'sense of support in His unseen companionship.' There is not a very great deal of difference here between the two types of Christianity which call themselves Orthodox and Unitarian.

The weakness of these essays, so far as they deal with the Catholic faith in Christ, is that they do not deal adequately with the facts. The facts are that the New Testament knows nothing whatever of a humanitarian Jesus, and that the Jesus of the Gospels does things and asserts things which only God has the right to do. It is not only Paul who regarded Jesus as Divine. All the evangelists do so. And if they are telling the truth, so did Jesus Himself. If a purely human Jesus is to be got out of the Gospels, it can only be by rewriting them. And that is just what the authors of these essays are compelled to do. 'All we can say about them [the Christologies of the early Church and St. Paul] is, that there lies behind them the impression of a powerful, awe-inspiring, thrilling personality, which we find for ourselves in the Synoptic Gospels when freed from the legends and theories of the writers who composed them.' The last words of this sentence are significant. Of course we can 'find for ourselves' anything at all if we first remove the 'legends and theories' which present a different picture. The 'legends and theories' present a Divine Christ, and that is the only Christ known to the writers of the New Testament. If you remove this you do not have a human Jesus. You have nothing at all except something you have yourself created.

One thing more may be said. Dr. Gow deals fairly enough with those who say that apart from Jesus they have no assurance of God. He points out rightly that the prophets had an assurance of God. But he misses the point. Many Christians would say, not that they had no assurance of God apart from Jesus, but that they had no real knowledge of what God is to us. The essence of Christ's revelation of God is that He is the Good Shepherd who goes after a lost sheep until He finds it. That is God in His love. And the value of that revelation (which is a great gospel) is that it comes authoritatively from the very mind and heart of God Himself.

OLD TESTAMENT CRITICISM.

It seems a pity that so excellent a book as Mr. Edward McQueen Gray's on *Old Testament Criticism: Its Rise and Progress* (Harper; 10s. 6d. net) should, as a prefatory note informs us, have had to hunt long for a publisher. For it is a very accurate and unbiased account of the progress of Old Testament criticism from the second century to the beginning of the nineteenth, an account which frankly recognizes that the critics and their opponents were and are equally sincere. It is extraordinary to find how early the critical impulse asserted itself,

and how modern were the conclusions reached not only by thinkers of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries but even of the early Church—of men like Theodore of Mopsuestia, for example, whose chief fault was that he lived a thousand years before his time. It is good to hear again Spinoza claiming that 'freedom of opinion belongs of right to all,' and to listen to Le Clerc, as long ago as 1685, uttering this wholesome doctrine, 'Jesus Christ and His Apostles not having come into the world to teach criticism to the Jews, we need not be surprised if they spoke according to the general opinion.' There is a particularly interesting chapter on 'The Theory of the Verbal Inspiration of the Old Testament,' which indicates happily the Roman Catholic and Protestant reactions respectively to the view that the original Hebrew text was unpointed.

One important feature of the book is that long quotations from critics, like Astruc, whose works are inaccessible to most people, are given *in extenso*: and into the appendix has been put a valuable series of quotations from original sources in Latin, Greek, French, and German, together with a useful chronological summary. One of the lessons of the book is that intellectual courage and integrity are not the monopoly of any one Church. Alexander Geddes, the Scottish Roman Catholic priest, 'the first British Old Testament critic in the modern sense,' tells us that he has 'fully used his own judgment (such as it is) without the smallest deference to inveterate prejudice or domineering authority.' A second volume, dealing with the criticism of the nineteenth century, is promised, should the reception of this volume warrant it. As we think there can be no doubt about the cordiality of the reception, we look forward with eager interest to the second volume.

THE UNITY OF THE CHURCH.

The 'Living Church' series, published by Messrs. James Clarke & Co., is giving us a number of excellent books, and when it is completed it will present a full picture of the life of the Church. The latest volume is *The One Body and the One Spirit: A Study in the Unity of the Church*, by Canon T. A. Lacey, M.A., F.S.A. (6s. net). The book is an effort to promote, not so much the unity of the Church as the recognition of its unity. The method is expository. Canon Lacey takes St. Paul's metaphor of the Body and its members, and follows it out, tracing the thought of the Apostle through his letters, and seeking everywhere an objective basis in Scripture for his faith in unity. As a Scripture study the book is able and suggestive, though one feels that the application to modern conditions is a little in the air. Canon Lacey's own position is quite definite and raises a hurdle which optimists will find it difficult to negotiate. He has allowed Dr. Vernon Bartlet to criticise his position in an appendix (an amazingly generous thing to do), and Dr. Bartlet deals with the Canon's conclusions faithfully but with entire courtesy. But apart from this interesting controversial episode the book under review is an unusual contribution to a very vital problem; and any earnest attempt to deal with it, especially one so competent as this, is worthy of a warm welcome.

CHRISTIAN MONASTICISM.

Christian Monasticism, by Professor Ian C. Hannah, F.S.A. (Allen & Unwin; 10s. 6d. net), is a well-balanced and impartial history of Monasticism from the days of the desert monks of Egypt down to the Jesuits and later orders. The aim of the writer is to show that Monasticism has been a great force in history. He is attracted by the curious facts that 'ascetics who had left the world in blank despair, voting it so vile as to be past all hope of mending, should in their lonely cloisters, amid desert or forest, have evolved an efficiency that was not known outside, and should have been compelled to take the leading part in raising up again that culture of the West that ceased to be when from the nerveless hand of Rome the rod of Empire fell.' Besides a detailed account of the great founders of the Monastic orders, interesting chapters are given on the Monk as Missionary, Statesman and Soldier, also on Monastic Literature and Art. The corruptions of Monasticism though not concealed are touched upon with a light hand, and perhaps it is well that the brighter side of the picture should be set in the higher light. Undoubtedly Monasticism bore a great share in the rebuilding of European civilization after barbarian hordes from North and East had trampled it in the dust. Here lies the inspiration of the story, and in Professor Hannah's view 'it is hardly too much to say that in these unhappy times our stricken world is waiting for some such compelling force as, in those days long past, devoted monks

gave to Europe in despair when the glory that had once been Rome lay, ruined cities, blood-soaked plains, at the feet of miscreant barbarian hordes.'

The attempt to rewrite the Shorter Catechism, or indeed any Catechism, at the present time needs some courage. But the necessary courage has been imparted to the Rev. Duff Macdonald, M.A., D.D., who essays the task of putting each answer in a better way and the further task of 're-stating' the Thirty-nine Articles. Both enterprises are included in a little book, *Catechism—Alternative Answers, 1643 and 1923. The Thirty-nine Articles restated, 1571–1924* (Aberdeen: The University Press). It would be easy to criticise Dr. Macdonald's answers, just as it is easy to criticise the Shorter Catechism. We greatly prefer, for example, the Catechism answer to Question 3: 'What do the Scriptures principally teach?' Dr. Macdonald's answer is, 'The truth that God desires us to know, and the duty that God requires us to do.' The older answer is more definite and true: 'What man is to believe concerning God, and what duty God requires of man.' But in many things Dr. Macdonald is far better and more Christian than the Catechism. Only (it seems unkind to put the question) was the task worth while? Modern educational methods have discarded catechisms as educationally unsound. And it is unlikely they will be much employed in the future. Hence they have only an archaic interest and value. But the task, if worth doing, has been ably done here, and the comparison of the ancient and modern points of view, question by question, is quite interesting.

The Future of Protestantism, by Mr. Ambrose Czakó, D.Ph. (Allen & Unwin; 4s. 6d. net), is a book whose title is somewhat misleading. The major part of it is occupied with an account of religious conditions in S.E. Europe, especially Hungary, the writer's own country. Following upon this there is some discussion of what should constitute the line of true religious progress. In the writer's view this lies in the direction of free spiritual religion, best represented by Quakerism, and he has some hope that Roman Catholicism may ultimately reach this through Modernism. It is evident throughout the discussion that Dr. Czakó's knowledge of Protestantism is somewhat slender and his views are deeply coloured by the unhappy religious conditions under which he has had the misfortune to live.

Principal A. B. Wann of Calcutta was known to be a strong man of an eminently sane and balanced mind. And these are the qualities that strike one in his Croall Lectures for 1913 only now published, and that after their author's death—strength, knowledge, balance, and sanity. The volume is edited by the Rev. John Morrison, M.A., D.D.

The Message of Christ to India (Blackwood; 5s. net) is a book that every one proposing to go forward to the Mission field should study. And would that it could be put into the hands of all our young men, whatever their career is to be, before they sail yonder. The book takes some time to reach India; but once it does, it is abundantly interesting and informing. A survey of the most characteristic Indian thought, an acute study of caste, by no means wholly critical, wise guidance upon how to establish contact with the Indian mind, discussions upon how far Western theology ought to be taught, and such like themes, and a chapter on the leavening of India by Christianity, in ways of which it is often unconscious—these are the subjects handled. The principal feeling left upon the mind is an awed sense of the enormous difficulty of the missionaries' task, yet there is something heartening in the calm and quiet faith of this fair mind.

The Story of Sacred Song, by the Rev. W. C. Procter, F.Ph. (James Clarke; 4s. net), is an extremely readable book. It is not intended for the hymnologist but for the general reader, for whom it provides a brief but interesting survey of the history of hymns and their writers, from Bible times to the present day. There is also a chapter on some melody makers. Hymn lovers will find in these pages much that will help them to a better understanding and a greater appreciation of their favourite hymns.

The Moslem World in Revolution, by the Rev. W. Wilson Cash, D.S.O. (Edinburgh House Press; 2s. net), is a most interesting and informing book. It would be impossible to find elsewhere so lucid and up-to-date an account of the vast changes that are transforming the Moslem world to-day. The story is told with simplicity and restraint, but it is

a story that must thrill every reader. For here the Moslem world is seen in the melting-pot, with the most portentous changes in immediate prospect. How completely things have changed may be gauged from the single fact that more Moslems visit Europe annually now than go on pilgrimage to Mecca. For the Christian Church the situation presents unparalleled opportunities. Hitherto the Moslem world has been practically impossible as a missionary field, now all is altering with dramatic swiftness, and it is not difficult to believe that 'we are on the threshold of something truly great.'

In *The Hill of Contentment*, by Mr. Fairfields Whitwell (Epworth Press; 2s. 6d. net), we have a small volume of short essays on rural subjects written in a fine spirit by one who tells us he has recently laid down the principal part of his life's work and retired, from London apparently to a beautiful hilltop. 'It was within a few yards of this spot that Richard Jefferies used to stand and gaze,' he writes; and there is much of Jefferies' spirit and literary flavour in the essays.

There is a great deal of intellectual activity in the Roman Catholic world at present. Individual writers are being encouraged to discuss questions like the authority of the Bible, and Conventions of all kinds are being held to canvass all sides of big problems. The 'Summer School of Catholic Studies' was held at Cambridge in August last year, and its object was to study the teaching of St. Thomas Aquinas and through him the contribution of Scientific Theology to the Faith. The papers contributed are now issued with the general heading *St. Thomas Aquinas*, and edited by the Rev. C. Lattey, S.J. (Heffer; 7s. 6d. net). They deal with such subjects as these: 'The Study of the Summa,' 'St. Thomas and Aristotle,' 'St. Thomas and Modern Thought,' 'St. Thomas and the Reunion of Christendom,' 'Dante, the Poet of St. Thomas,' and others. Professor Lattey in his preface boldly asserts that the refusal to apply reason to revelation is a devastating error of our time, and for so desperate a disease St. Thomas provides the strong tonic of fearless intellectual effort. It was his merit to fit Catholic faith into human thought, and it is this merit which is stressed in the essays contained in the book before us. The competence of these essays is obvious, and the interest of their standpoint lies here, that what St. Thomas did once we have to do again. Every effort in that direction can be welcomed whatever its source.

Liberty and Religion, by Mr. Sydney Herbert Mellone, D.Sc. (Lindsey Press; 2s. 6d. net), contains an account of the work of the British and Foreign Unitarian Association during the last hundred years. The book is issued in connexion with the centenary of the Association, of which Dr. Mellone is secretary. The work of the Association has lain chiefly in the direction of the publication of approved literature and the aiding of the weaker Unitarian churches. No one who remembers such names as Martineau, Stopford Brooke, and Estlin Carpenter will belittle the contribution of Unitarians to Christian literature, and in every battle for liberty, whether religious or political, Unitarians have borne an honourable share. Yet this record of the work of the British and Foreign Unitarian Association, telling as it does of the raising and spending of a paltry two or three thousand pounds per annum, with practically nothing to record in the way of foreign missionary work, leaves an impression of feebleness and lack of enthusiasm in striking contrast to the missionary zeal and vast operations of other Churches.

The 'Copec' Conference has been followed by regional sub-conferences where its facts and conclusions are being spread abroad or its gospel preached by fresh voices. One such assembly was held at Sheffield in October 1924, and the report of its proceedings is now issued under the title *The Fourfold Challenge of To-day*, edited by the Rev. Henry Cecil, Vicar of St. Philip's, Sheffield (Longmans; 2s. 6d. net). Every one knows what 'Copec' stands for (an effort to 'claim the whole of life for the sovereignty of Jesus Christ'), and its message dealt with four great needs—decent *houses*, sufficient *work*, a real *education*, and *world peace*. These are the points dealt with in a series of earnest and able addresses, given by Dr. Garvie, the Rev. Will Reason, Bishop Baynes, and others. About five hundred and sixty delegates were enrolled, and the average attendance at the evening meetings was eleven hundred. So the conference may be regarded as having succeeded, and its influence will be spread by this report of the discussions.

The Americans have much to teach us in the way

of presenting Biblical material to the young. One of the latest exhibitions of their ability to combine interest with instruction is Edna M. Bonser's book *How the Early Hebrews Lived and Learned* (Macmillan), a book which is based on the conviction that 'the Old Testament can be made an important element in the education of children.' The Hebrew story is told from the day when Abraham's caravan moved westward, to the disruption of the kingdom in the reign of Solomon's son, special attention being concentrated upon Abraham, Joseph, and Moses. In the recital of the stories full rein is given to the imagination, and scenes are freely invented for which, in the very brief Bible narrative, there is no absolute warrant; but care has been taken to create correct impressions of the ancient East, and the result is a very vivid narrative, whose vividness is enhanced by numerous artistic illustrations. Children would be fascinated by it, the more so as they are encouraged, by frequent suggestions, to dramatize the stories for themselves.

The four chapters of Mr. P. W. Thompson's book entitled *The Old Book and the New Age* (Marshall Brothers; 5s. net) deal pleasantly with various topics—the evils of the merely utilitarian view of life, the economic teaching of Scripture, and Biblical criticism and interpretation. Under the last head he pays a warm compliment to Dr. Weymouth's translation of the New Testament: 'this splendid work,' as he justly calls it, which may be read 'right through with sheer delight.' Mr. Thompson's discussion of Biblical economics is of much more value than his Biblical criticism. It is too late in the day to tell us that the findings of Higher Criticism 'can now no longer appeal to any man of sound judgment.' Who is to be the judge of sound judgment? And when we are informed that 'there is no doubt amongst the more serious and competent scholars that the Pentateuch is of almost entirely Mosaic origin,' we begin to wonder whether Mr. Thompson's test of serious and competent scholarship is its agreement with his own opinions. Dr. Moffatt's name is throughout spelt wrongly—a fact which does not strengthen our faith in Mr. Thompson's powers as an observer of literary phenomena, though this is one of the first qualifications of a critic and of a censor of critics.

From the skilful hand of the late Principal Skinner comes a translation into colloquial English of *The Books of Samuel*, published at 1s. 3d. net by the National Adult School Union. The translation of the prose is thoroughly idiomatic, yet never colloquial in the bad sense; the poetry too—notably the difficult elegy of David over Saul and Jonathan—is finely done. As a specimen of idiomatic prose take these two sentences: 'On these occasions her rival-wife used to exasperate her with gibes about her childless condition' (1 S 1^6); again, 'Sure enough the cows made straight for Bethshemesh' (1 S 6^{12}). The translation of the witch of Endor's words, 'I saw a *spirit* rising out of the earth,' tends to obscure a point that is important for Old Testament theology, but there are many words—like *elohim* here—which can never be translated without giving rise to some slight or grave misunderstanding. The versions have been wisely used, and in cases which are practically beyond doubt, as in the story of Saul's election, parallel narratives have been disentangled. The book is an excellent blend of good literary taste and fine scholarship.

Messrs. Pickering & Inglis, continuing the issue of 'Every Christian's Library,' have published an *Exposition of the Epistles to Timothy*, by Mr. W. E. Vine, M.A. (2s. net). It gives a brief running commentary on the Epistles, with an appendix on the sufficiency and finality of the Scriptures. Critical questions are avoided, the style of exposition is simple and the tone earnestly Christian.

The sudden death of Mr. Bryan gives a strangely belated appearance to a book by Professor H. F. Osborn, LL.D., D.Sc., entitled *The Earth Speaks to Bryan* (Scribners; $1.00). It is not a book of more than passing interest, and this for two reasons. It assumes for one thing a knowledge of the views of Bryan and of the Scopes trial, matters which will soon pass from the public mind. At the same time the writer's observations on Evolution will not be intelligible to any who do not already possess a competent knowledge of the subject. The writer's position is that of a theistic evolutionist, and no doubt many in the United States of America may be relieved to hear that there are distinguished scientists who find no antagonism between Christianity and Evolution. Professor Osborn was a pupil of Huxley's and he gives some interesting reminiscences of that eminent man. 'Huxley once told me that Paley's argument for the direct

handiwork of the Creator was so logically, so ingeniously and convincingly written that he always kept it at his bedside for last reading at night. So long as the chance or fortuitous hypothesis of adaptation reigned, Paley's argument for the existence of God was set aside, but our more profound knowledge of creative evolution, gained by direct observation of Nature, leaves Paley's argument just as strong as ever. Paley's "Evidence" may be challenged now no more effectively than it could be challenged in 1858.'

There are many books which in different ways are applying the newer psychology to life, and many which are combining what is good in this psychology with an ardent Christian faith. The result is a practical philosophy which is sometimes quite healthy and stimulating. Something of this kind may be said of a book which comes from the 'other side'—*A Way to Peace, Health, and Power: Studies for the Inner Life*, by Bertha Condé (Scribners; $1.50). The book is written in sections so that it can be used for group discussion, but with complete continuity so that it can be read for individual benefit. It consists partly of reflections and partly of illustrative Scripture passages. There are fifty-two chapters and the subjects are well distributed. 'The Pervading Presence of a Personal God,' 'The Battleground of Prayer,' 'Finding our Way in Life,' 'Health and Spiritual Laws' are some of the topics, and the teaching seems to us sound and helpful.

We noticed a few months ago a volume of addresses by the Rev. Vernon F. Storr, M.A., Canon of Westminster—a volume to which the Archbishop of Canterbury contributed a prefatory note. Now we have received a copy of the second edition of *The Problem of the Cross*, which was first published in 1919, and by Mr. John Murray. It should be noted that the second edition has been issued by the Student Christian Movement (4s. net).

In the Introduction Mr. Storr deals with the way in which the theology of any age is coloured by the general thought of the age, and illustrates his point by successive doctrines of the Atonement.

'In the age of the Fathers theories of the Cross were frequently couched in the language of ransom. . . . That was a period of constant war. Captivity was the lot of many, and ransom from captivity was a common thing. The Middle Ages were the ages of chivalry, crusades, knighthood. Now in Anselm's theory of the Atonement you find Christ's death treated as a homage or satisfaction paid to the violated honour of God. The idea of honour was in the air. It is reflected in the theology of the period. After the Reformation you have the age of absolute monarchy, the divine right of kings and the like. The king's will was law; he was the fount of law and authority. In this period there is a tendency to interpret the Atonement forensically, in terms of law and the law court. God is supreme Lawgiver and Judge. Sin is treason against His authority. Justice therefore demands the death of the sinner, or of some substitute for the sinner. To-day our thought is of evolution, of a God progressively revealing Himself and near at hand, working out a great purpose of love in nature and humanity. Striving, advance through pain and struggle, a distant goal towards which with blood and tears we slowly progress—that is our kind of outlook. Thus it comes about that in our modern theories of the Atonement we think of God as suffering in some way with His world. The Father shares in the interests and life of His children. He stoops to redeem them by entering into all the sorrows and vicissitudes of their lot. Against such a background the Cross wins a new significance.'

Christian Salvation, by Prof. George Cross (University of Chicago Press; $2.50), is a work of great ability and worthy the attention of serious students. It is an attempt to restate the Christian message in modern terms and to commend its essential truth to men and women of to-day. After setting forth the fact that humanity's deepest longing is for salvation, the writer proceeds to expound at some length the Christian answer as it is variously expressed by the New Testament writers, and later interpreters in Catholicism and Protestantism. Finally he gives an exposition of what he conceives to be the modern Protestant point of view which begins with the basic affirmation of the supreme worth of personality, and in the light of that affirmation gives a fresh significance to the doctrines of sin and atonement, the saved community, and the world to come.

Dr. Cross's purpose is declared to be evangelistic, and he has written this book to secure converts to the Christian faith and recruits for the work of the Christian Churches. His sincerity and earnestness may be cordially acknowledged though we may

take leave to doubt his success or even the value of his effort. No development of Christian doctrine can be held to be legitimate which fundamentally alters the facts of the Christian faith, and certainly this modern interpretation, however excellent, is not recognizable as the faith once for all delivered to the saints. To waive aside the historicity of the Resurrection, to treat the gospel narratives as in great measure legendary, to discuss Paul's interpretation and John's as interesting speculations will appear to ordinary minds as the renunciation of what has hitherto been understood as Christianity; and it is astonishing how able men can delude themselves into the belief that the Christian faith can survive the destruction of its historic foundation, or that a vigorous Christian life can be nourished upon thin air.

Hymn-Mending.

By the Reverend J. P. Lilley, M.A., D.D., Edinburgh.

One happy result of recent consideration of the Church Hymnary has been the discovery of the keen interest which the members of the Presbyterian Churches take in the congregational praise. Clearly the experience of the past half-century has drawn them into a deep appreciation of the materials provided in the hymn-books now in common use. This was specially manifest during the meetings of the Assemblies. Not having the Draft of the Revised Hymnary in their hands and therefore left to depend on references to it in the correspondence of the newspapers, the people of Edinburgh were constantly questioning ministers they entertained in their homes regarding the grounds on which it was proposed to reject certain hymns they had been singing from childhood and introduce others that seemed to them not a whit superior. These changes became a theme of discussion even in the short journeys of the street cars. Many people did not hesitate to enter into conversation on this topic with ministers to whom they were entire strangers. To see in their hands copies of the 'daily proceedings' was enough to raise the whole question. The same feeling doubtless prevailed in the towns and villages of the provinces.

One is glad to know that the privilege of examining the Draft is no longer to be confined to those who happened to be members of the Assemblies, but that copies are being sent to all ministers of the Churches throughout the land. The issue can only be for good. The ultimate form and contents of the Hymnary will be all the more widely acceptable if it bear upon it the stamp of the mind of office-bearers in all the Churches concerned.

Discussions in Presbyteries—perhaps even in some kirk-sessions—will naturally turn first on the method used in selecting the best hymns for inclusion in the new book. But there is another question on which something ought to be said, namely: What attitude should be taken towards the precise form of the hymns that are chosen? Are we at liberty to make any changes in the language and phrasing of the hymns we select? Or, are we morally bound to retain the exact forms they had as they left their authors' hands? To me the question seems sufficiently important to merit more consideration than is accorded to it.

The opinion commonly held in Scotland for more than fifty years past has been opposed to taking any liberties whatever with the original text of hymns. Changes of any sort were regarded as showing a lack of gratitude and respect for the writers. In a collection of hymns for week-day services and Sunday schools, published last century, a prominent minister in Edinburgh ventured to change the opening line of J. H. Newman's hymn, *Lead, kindly Light* into *Lead, Saviour, lead*; and the result was a sharp animadversion upon what a reviewer called an unwarrantable and needless innovation. Similar views were expressed in the recent Assembly of the Church of Scotland. Hymns, it was contended, were the fruit of the writers' travail of soul and should be kept immune from alterations.

The primary source of this view was a protest against changes in hymns which John Wesley made in his preface to *A Collection of Hymns for the use of the People called Methodists*, published in 1779. 'Here,' Wesley says in par. 7, 'I beg leave to mention a thought which has been long upon my