

Evangelical Review of Theology

A Global Forum

GENERAL EDITOR: THOMAS SCHIRRMACHER

Volume 40 • Number 4 • October 2016

Published by



for
WORLD EVANGELICAL
ALLIANCE
Theological Commission

Can We Measure the Success and Effectiveness of Entrepreneurial Church Planting?

Samuel Lee

I Introduction

The growth of the church in the Global North has been accompanied by a commitment to share the gospel with those beyond its national borders. The approach used in missions was a direct reflection of the dominant understanding of what the church's mission was, the understanding of the culture of the targeted groups and the policy of sending the best representatives of the gospel. Social, economic and technological advancements, combined with the emergence of a global society, have resulted in changes in the northern churches and in their missions program. Additionally, missions is no longer the domain only of western nations due to the rise of southern Christianity as a powerful religious force in the twenty-first century.¹ Southern Christianity has begun to challenge the more complacent definition of many western nations regarding 'how to care

for my neighbour'.

Missions have matured to where a lost soul is seen in a larger context. This results in a greater appreciation of the circumstances of people on the other side of the world and a fuller realization of who my neighbour is and how I need to care for my neighbour. Contemporary missions, regardless of the sending country, often include socio-economic dimensions.

One application of the socio-economic aspect is Entrepreneurial Church Planting (ECP),² which uses business entrepreneurs and clergy members to launch spiritually and economically integrated communities of faith as illustrated by the Redeemer Community Church and Dayspring Technologies in San Francisco, California. (These en-

¹ Philip Jenkins, *Next Christendom : The Coming of Global Christianity* (Oxford University Press, 2002), 1.

² Entrepreneurial church planting (ECP) is an umbrella term describing the birth and growth of the new expressions of churches by using entrepreneurial approaches. It goes under various designations of 'fresh expressions of church', 'organic church', 'liquid church', 'tentmaking', 'business as mission', and 'missional communities'.

terprises will be discussed later in this paper.) In some cases, ECP suggests that one outgrowth of the business is a church plant. In other cases, ECP shows that a church is started first and it helps to set up a business. Either the church or the business may come first and still be appropriately designated as an ECP.

Simply put, ECP is the intersection of entrepreneurship and church planting. By combining entrepreneurship and church planting, ECP has sought to reach the unchurched and dechurched by creating 'Third Space'.³ 'Third Space', a relatively new concept, refers to implementing ventures of creative neutral spaces, such as a café, that are more inviting to strangers than traditional ecclesiological models and are used for bringing the gospel to people.

While it may be conceptually inviting for spiritual and business forces to co-mingle in reaching the lost, dechurched, and unchurched, activities need to be evaluated as to whether they are accomplishing the goals of the Great Commission (reconciliation), the Creation Commission (stewardship), and the great commandment (transformation). In a world that measures success economically, how is success being measured in ECP endeavours? In-depth study is needed now to consider outcomes relative to goals.

To that end, I want to ascertain: 1) how practitioners of ECP activities define success, 2) how they measure

the success and performance of ECP activities, and 3) how do the measurements help them achieve their initial objectives.

II Entrepreneurial Church Planting (ECP)

Church-planting efforts combined with a business model have taken various forms throughout history. A brief investigation into the diverse Christian traditions illuminates this point—for example, one could consider Paul's tent making, the Nestorians, the Moravian Missions and the Basel Mission. Though history offers a basis for the melding of a church-plant with a business venture, there are fewer contemporary examples of viable businesses combined with intentional, effective church planting.

Globally, the ECP movement is now an emerging phenomenon with examples appearing in Asia, Africa, Latin America, North America, and Europe. While the greatest flowering of this enterprise has been in Britain and the United States, by integrating business and church planting, ECP has served as a revitalizing force for churches and whole denominations throughout the world, including missions.

One of the main appeals of this strategy is that it incorporates a broad approach to include those who are unreached and those outside the church. No longer do missions want to create 'rice' Christians, but to provide a culturally sensitive economic and social environment to nurture nascent Christians, and to reach people who mistrust older, traditional western evangelical approaches.

Just as many American churches

³ David E. Fitch, *The Great Giveaway: Reclaiming the Mission of the Church from Big Business, Parachurch Organizations, Psychotherapy, Consumer Capitalism, and Other Modern Maladies* (Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 2005), 63.

have attempted to reshape ecclesiology through socio-economic engagements by integrating business and church planting as illustrated by bi-vocational ministers, Business as Mission practitioners,⁴ and fresh expressions of church entrepreneurs,⁵ mission organizations have sought outreach opportunities with spiritual, developmental, and social dimensions.

The additional appeal of ECP in foreign contexts is the creation of communities for seekers and/or converts. In situations where conversion causes ostracism, the community provides both an economic and a social home. Furthermore, foreign governments are open to business opportunities that are inherent in ECP activities. In less developed countries, economic opportunities for the disenfranchised are welcomed.

However, consideration of ECP also demonstrates that a combination of business and church planting has not always been productive. A focus on multiplying profits reduces the attention to church planting, produces a poor witness, and results in a decline in spiritual interest.⁶ In contrast, fo-

cusing primarily upon church planting results in a secular-sacred division that consecrates the church-plant and sees the commercial side as an unavoidable vice, thus resulting in financial drain. In this way, planting a church combined with operating viable for-profit business presents significant challenges, especially when the creation of a spiritual community is also a desired end.

In view of these advantages and disadvantages of ECP, evaluation becomes necessary. What thwarts assessment of ECP is the difficulty of measuring its effectiveness. Those who use ECP as their mission model typically utilize business metrics or mission metrics. However, few, if any, of the commonly recognized metrics measure the multi-dimensional goal of the Great Commission, the Creation Commission, and the Great Commandment.

ECP has been implemented in enough places to make it time to evaluate this strategy more thoroughly and determine its effectiveness. Given the time required and money invested to find appropriate people with the needed skill sets, language study, time to identify good locations, obtain government permits, do demographic research of the target community, etc., we need to use strategies that are known to be effective.

How, then, can we assess the effectiveness of ECP? A tremendous number of books and articles have been written about various theological aspects of ECP, but fewer have tackled the problems of identifying what constitutes effectiveness. To address the issues of determining when success and effectiveness have been achieved, it is important to consider what has

⁴ The models of Business as Mission (BAM) utilize business to fulfill the Great Commission and are focused on setting up businesses among unreached people groups.

⁵ A fresh expression of church is defined as 'a new gathering or network that engages mainly with people who have never been to church'. <http://www.freshexpressions.org.uk/about/whatis>

⁶ Tom A. Steffen and Mike Barnett, *Business as Mission: From Impoverished to Empowered* / Edited by Tom Steffen & Mike Barnett, Evangelical Missiological Society Series: No. 14 (Pasadena, Calif.: William Carey Library, c2006., 2006), 167–180.

been written about the goals of ECP and what suggestions have been drawn from actual measures of ECP.

Thus, drawing on written reviews and a case study approach, this study investigates a definition of goals for ECP activities and the process of identifying concepts to measure ECP outcomes. Based on this, my research will attempt to identify what factors result in economic sustainability and church planting and what effectiveness in ECP looks like.

The argument of this paper is that we can measure the success and effectiveness of entrepreneurial church planting, and that rather than measuring success or effectiveness economically or spiritually, ECP success and effectiveness should be gauged on the grounds of holistic transformation. It is to these issues that we now turn.

III Three Models of ECP

A review of relevant literature identified three models: 1) 'Business for saving souls and planting the church', 2) 'Business for human development', and 3) 'Business for holistic transformation'.⁷ These models aid in pointing to the goals of ECP. Below I will sketch out these three models

1. 'Business for Saving Souls and Planting the Church' model

The 'Business for saving souls and planting the church' model⁸ represents

the Tent-Making movement. This missionary model was originally inspired by the examples of Paul, Aquila and Priscilla, and came into the scholarly spotlight by the late 1980s. Based on Paul's mission strategy, Christians used their professional (business) skills to establish a business as a means of contact with locals and eventually plant a church.

This model permits access to countries where traditional missionaries are denied entry. One early example would be the Nestorians in the sixth century who financially supported themselves through business and planted churches,⁹ and another would be the Moravian Missions and the Basel Mission Trading Company.¹⁰ In 1985, the Lausanne Tentmaking Statement was created and recognized the role of Christian lay people.¹¹ Since then, many mission agencies have used the 'Tent-making' model.

In recent years, this approach is becoming less viable as foreign governments continue to deport business men/women who are not involved in actual businesses or who seek to hide

version to Christ Jesus. See Dana Robert's book, *Christian Mission* (Chichester: Wiley, 2009), 90, and Andrew Walls, *Missionary Movement in Christian History* (Maryknoll, Orbis, 1996), 43-54.

⁹ Samuel H. Moffett, *A History of Christianity in Asia / Samuel Hugh Moffett* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1998-1998), 29.

¹⁰ William John Danker, *Profit for the Lord: Economic Activities in Moravian Missions and the Basel Mission Trading Company*, Christian World Mission Books (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, [1971], 1971), 32.

¹¹ The Lausanne Tentmaking Statement is available at <http://www.globalopps.org/lausanne.htm>.

⁷ Stephen B. Bevans and Roger Schroeder, *Constants in Context: A Theology of Mission for Today*, American Society of Missiology Series: No. 30 (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 2004), 35-72.

⁸ Here 'saving souls' refers to personal con-

their church planting activity. So we see church planting as nested within business activity.

The significant characteristic of the Tent-making movement is that it is a church-centred view. For tentmakers, business is understood as a significant part of the church planting strategy. The ultimate goal remains church planting but business is seen as one step or stage toward this objective. This long-held approach understands the church as the origin and goal of mission. The church-centred approach sought to extend the church and to expand the gospel message specifically to non-Christian lands, often referred to as mission fields.¹²

Personal conversion and a viable indigenous church planting movement were regarded as the goals and metrics of tent-making endeavours.¹³ Tentmakers place a high premium on the importance of helping others to develop a personal relationship with Jesus and with other Christians. They have focused upon evangelistic labour or the realization of the Great Commission by means of reconciliation. As a result, many tent-making ministers use spiritual metrics of success: (1) how many people have heard the Good News, (2) how many people have been converted, (3) how many have joined the church, and (4) how many converts have been

discipled.¹⁴

However, the last is emphasized less. One of the reasons is that many ministers focus on membership (quantity-oriented metric) rather than discipleship (quality-oriented metric), which is one core of Jesus's Great Commission to his disciples (Mt 28:19).

The danger with the tent-making approach is that it is less holistic due to a failure to adequately address structural problems and social justice concerns in the larger society where the activity is located. Furthermore, this view does not appreciate the world as the place where God is active. The world degenerated into 'a sort of ecclesiastical training-ground'¹⁵ and was defined as 'not-yet-church, already-church, still-church and no-longer-church'.¹⁶

Finally, this view might impede work performance because work itself is seen only as a means to an end; thus, there is less motivation to do one's work with excellence as a means in and of itself to honour God. This false distinction has historically had a deep impact on Christian views of wealth, faith, economics, and mission.

2. 'Business for Human Development' model

In the latter half of the twentieth cen-

¹² Lalsangkima Pachuau, 'Engaging the "Other" in a Pluralistic World: Toward a Subaltern Hermeneutics of Christian Mission', *Studies in World Christianity* 8, no. 1 (January 1, 2002): 74.

¹³ Ralph D. Winter and Bruce A. Koch, 'Finishing the Task: The Unreached Peoples Challenge', *International Journal of Frontier Missions* 16 (April 1999): 71–72.

¹⁴ Steven L. Rundle, 'Does Donor Support Help or Hinder Business as Mission Practitioners? An Empirical Assessment', *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 38, no. 1 (January 2014): 24–25.

¹⁵ Johannes Christiaan Hoekendijk, 'The Church in Missionary Thinking', *International Review of Mission* 41, no. 163 (July 1, 1952), 324.

¹⁶ Hoekendijk, 'The Church in Missionary Thinking', 324.

tury, 'Business for saving souls and planting the church' model joined company with the 'Business for human development' model. During this time, the concept of *missio Dei* began to gain acceptance. Since the Willingen Conference (1952), the pendulum of theological understanding of Christian mission has swung from the church-centred view to the theocentric view of mission.

In the *missio Dei* concept, mission is no longer subject to the church. Mission has its source in the Triune God. The church's mission is to participate in the mission of the Triune God. The church is viewed as an instrument for God's universal mission. Mission becomes the church's reason for being.

However, interpretation of the theocentric conceptualization of mission has varied. On one side, some proposed that even though the church should be neither the starting point nor the goal of mission, the church, as a foretaste of the kingdom is the agent of God's mission. On the other hand, others supporting the world-centred view of mission argued that the true context for mission was the world, not the church. So the correct sequence is kingdom-gospel-apostolate-world. Consequently, the church and the kingdom of God were viewed as divorced from each other in ecumenical circles.

Alongside this ecumenical mission thinking, the concept of 'Business as Mission' (BAM) came on the scene, espousing similar views. BAM has been broadly defined as business ventures led by Christians that are for-profit and are intentionally designated to be 'used as an instrument of God's mis-

sion to the world'.¹⁷ Particularly in less developed and least-reached countries, which are often hungry for business acumen and earning potential as well as jobs, BAM's unique approach has created a door for missions.

Many BAM practitioners understood that the world was regarded as the locus of God's mission. As a result, the church was increasingly relegated to a marginal position within the BAM community. The theme of humanization and humanitarianism was taken up as its defining word.¹⁸

Vastly different from tentmakers, some BAM'ers intentionally focus on working through a business and find meaning in what they do. Thus work itself is seen as a calling and BAM'ers describe the economic activities as being missional.

The missional aspect is displayed by practitioners as they become involved with the community where their business is located by undertaking holistic community development such as social and economic transformation. They not only find projects that draw on local strengths to enable people to become financially independent, but they also creatively expose others to the gospel, resulting in financial, social, and spiritual growth. Other BAM'ers seek to model biblical values in the marketplace by focusing on ethical business

¹⁷ C. Neal Johnson and Steve Rundle, *Business as Mission: A Comprehensive Guide to Theory and Practice*; Foreword by Steve Rundle (Downers Grove, Ill.: IVP Academic, 2009), 28.

¹⁸ James A. Scherer, *Gospel, Church & Kingdom: Comparative Studies in World Mission Theology* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2004), 108.

practices and providing jobs for women and other outcasts.

From these considerations, it can be inferred that most BAM'ers focus first on ensuring the foundation of business effectiveness such as profitability. Miroslav Volf describes it as a 'vocational understanding of work developed within the framework of the doctrine of creation'¹⁹ or stewardship. In other words, BAM practitioners regard church planting as just a part of the larger role of serving the needs of greater human development.

Consequently, most BAM practitioners have a financial focus, emphasizing financial sustainability, profitability, and larger scale operations—the typical financial metrics of success. They mainly adopt existing financial reporting systems²⁰ such as the ISO 2600, the Global Reporting Initiative, or Global Compact.²¹ These standards are focused on measuring economic, social, and environmental goals alone.

¹⁹ Most discussions of work in the 'Business for human development' view have tended to focus on seeing work as one's vocation, as one's calling, because most Christians start with the creation account in Genesis where God is seen as at work, and we, as bearers of God's image, are called to work as well. Miroslav Volf, *Work in the Spirit: Toward a Theology of Work* (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock, 2001), ix.

²⁰ See Global BAM Think Tank report 2014, which reviews various existing Christian and non-Christian assessment tools, with analysis on what they do, how they do and why they might be helpful, retrieved June 17, 2015, available at <http://bamthinktank.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/05/BMTT-IG-Measuring-BAM-Impact-May-2014.pdf>.

²¹ Cf. <http://www.regententrepreneur.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/10/NamieBimba.pdf>.

One problem in BAM's approach is that it may downplay the importance of the church. The church is relegated from its status as the mystical body of Christ to that of a body of Christ, meaning that it is only one of several sacred venues advancing the Kingdom of God. Additionally, the 'Business for human development' view tends to campaign strongly for the status of calling overshadowing the conceptual framework of being a people of God. More specifically, this model so closely identifies one's specific job as one's calling that it may result in identity crisis if, for some reason, one loses one's job or skills, through dismissal, retirement, or medical disability.

3. 'Business for Holistic Transformation' model

In recent years, Volf's pneumatological understanding of work²² has been influential, resulting in the view that Christian business in partnership with the community of faith can be a means to overcome materialism, individualism, and self-centredness. We find activities that combine lean startup business principles²³ and church planting vision.

²² Volf suggests an alternative, a 'pneumatological one developed within the framework of the doctrine of the last things'. Volf, *Work in the Spirit*, ix. He proposes that we frame the way we think about work in terms of the centrality of eschatology in Christian faith, and that we think of work in terms of the Spirit inspiring us in every step of our lives as we walk forward toward the full coming of the Kingdom, the New Creation.

²³ Lean start-up, led by Steve Blank and Eric Ries, is a revolutionary methodological shift in entrepreneurial practice that makes starting a business far less risky. Lean start-up

A mounting body of literature is developing regarding 'Business for holistic transformation',²⁴ categorized by various expressions: 'fresh expressions of church', 'organic church', and 'missional communities'. New contextual churches are freshening the religious landscape of the global North.

One core theological principle of the 'Business for holistic transformation' model is the belief in a 'kingdom-shaped church'. Here the kingdom of God gives rise to the church, which is taken to be the sign of the coming kingdom. The church in the 'Business for holistic transformation' model intends to offer loving relationships—with God and with others, in contrast to the predominate consumer-oriented relationships found in the world and in other models.

So this model pursues on-going contact with potential believers and emphasizes the need to listen to what they are saying. Relationship becomes

the central concept, because business and church planting occur within the contexts of relationships in the larger community.

In short, the 'Business for holistic transformation' model recognizes that God's reign in the world is unthinkable without the church,²⁵ because the church can help build an ethos of mutual civic responsibility and accountable communities of discipleship where the temptations of greed, self-centeredness, and materialism are confronted. Additionally, at the core of the 'Business for holistic transformation' model is a focus on spiritual and economic transformation. Transformation happens as churches are planted and businesses are established that create an environment where people can connect with God, others, and the rest of creation.

However, the risk with the 'Business for holistic transformation' model is that there are differing understandings of God's kingdom. Divergent conceptions of the Kingdom of God have led to differing ideas of the calling of the church.²⁶ Howard Snyder enumerates eight kingdom models.²⁷ He emphasizes that models of the kingdom have changed and will change, and that the church, therefore, needs a new kingdom theology for a new millenni-

is unconventional in that it favours experimentation over elaborate planning, customer feedback over intuition, and iterative design over a large development policy. Steve Blank, 'Why the Lean Start-Up Changes Everything', *Harvard Business Review* 91, no. 5 (May 2013): 66. Eric Ries, *The Lean Startup: How Today's Entrepreneurs Use Continuous Innovation to Create Radically Successful Businesses* (New York: Crown Business, 2011).

24 Michael Moynagh, *Church for Every Context: An Introduction to Theology and Practice; with Philip Harrold* (London: SCM, 2012), xx. Michael Volland defines the entrepreneur as follows: 'A visionary who, in partnership with God and others, challenges the status quo by energetically creating and innovating in order to shape something of kingdom value.' Michael Volland, *The Minister as Entrepreneur: Leading and Growing the Church in an Age of Rapid Change* (SPCK, 2015), 3.

25 Charles Edward van Engen, Dean S. Gilliland, and Paul Everett Pierson, *The Good News of the Kingdom: Mission Theology for the Third Millennium* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1993), 73.

26 Howard A. Snyder, *Models of the Kingdom* (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2001), 13–17.

27 Snyder, *Models of the Kingdom*, 18.

um.²⁸ He presciently remarks that the forces of 'globalization/glocalization' call for a renewed model of the Kingdom of God with regard to ecology and economics.²⁹

Thus far, we have reviewed the literature on the business for saving souls and planting the church, the business for human development, and the business for holistic transformation models. A summary of similarities and differences among these three analytical lenses is reflected in Chart 1 on the next page:

If we start at the bottom of Chart 1, the continuum demonstrates graphically the lack of overlap among the different models. While BAM is not totally business-oriented, neither is HT totally transformational in its style and we note the significant gap between BAM and HT. Therefore we cannot equate BAM and HT.

The upper portion of the chart reveals other similarities and differences among the models. We note a similarity between tent-making and BAM with regard to the success metric. Both reduce their assessment to countable elements. Of course, it is not as easy to count souls saved and the number disciplined as it is to detect closing a business year in the red or black. However, this approach may miss the intangible element of those in the process of transformation.

Additionally, we see the integrated place of the church in both Tent-making and in Holistic Transformation. While implicit, all three of these models open the door for laity to have a full

role in the outreach activities, even to the point of discipling and leading a church.

In sum, the previous discussion has helped us to understand the utility of a joint venture—church planting and a business enterprise. Common to both is the need to reach out to others, and hopefully in so doing, establish relationships with people. However, none of these models indicates how to maintain balance between church planting and business activities. The different goals lead to different outcomes.

To actualize the goals of economic fruitfulness and church planting, we might take into account aspects of all three types. They probably need each other to create a truly novel church that is economically sustainable and to liberate themselves from leaning too closely on a one-sided goal of economic fruitfulness or church planting to the detriment of the other. It is assumed that balance may be achieved by the integration of three theological emphases (the Creation Commission, the Great Commandment, and the Great Commission).

Lest the discussion of ECP remain theological and theoretical, I believe it is important to evaluate the ECP strategy in terms of its ability to combine church planting with economic activities. To accomplish the assessment of ECP, a case study of one business/church planting endeavour was carefully chosen for thorough study. In the section that follows, I will note an effort by one Christian community to practise entrepreneurial church planting.

28 Snyder, *Models of the Kingdom*, 133.

29 Snyder, *Models of the Kingdom*, 140-141.

CHART 1. Comparison of Characteristics of Three ECP Models

Models	Archetype	Orientation	Activity	Success Metric	Problems
Business for Saving Souls & Planting church (Tent-making: TM)	tent-making	church-centred Great Commission Cross-cultural	Christians use a professional skill for job, meet people, plant a church	# hear gospel # saved # disciples	limits God's reach to just the church doesn't deal with structural & social justice issues work as end, not to honour God
Business for Human Development (Business as Mission: BAM)	for profit	theocentric/world-centred Creation Commission (stewardship) Cross-cultural	Create profitable businesses with concern for public corporate responsibility & eco justice	profitability & financial sustainability	church relegated to edge of churches job=calling
Business for Holistic Transformation (Holist Transformation: HT)	sustain business & plant a church	foretaste of Kingdom of God Inter-cultural	Establishing good relationships whether for Business or for the church	sustain financial activities and church and build relationships	how to achieve goal
Business (economic)		BAM	HT	TM	
			Transformation (holistic)	Reconciliation (spiritual)	

IV A Case Study of a ECP Model:

1. Redeemer Community Church & Dayspring Technologies³⁰

Dayspring Technologies is a successful web development company with 16 employees and a revenue of \$1.7 million. Their clients include International Justice Mission, Mercy Core, and Golden State Warriors. The firm is located in the Bayview-Hunters Point neighbourhood of San Francisco. Bayview-Hunters Point is in the southeast corner of the city where unemployment and households below the national poverty level are nearly double compared with the rest of the city; in this area, the poverty line is \$23,000 for a family of four.

Redeemer Community Church is also located in this neighbourhood. Redeemer Church and Dayspring Technologies work together. Initially the two entities wondered what it might look like to share space and seek the welfare of the same local neighbourhood. They moved ahead together, establishing both the church and the business. They share not only a common local address, but also a common desire to be a blessing in the neighbourhood.

Historically, Redeemer Community Church was an outgrowth of Grace Fellowship Community Church. In 2002 a group of people was sent from Grace Fellowship Community Church to plant another church that became Redeem-

er Community Church led by Danny. Early on, Grace Fellowship Community Church had a non-profit community development program called Grace Urban Ministries in Bayview-Hunters Point.

Danny and Chi-Ming (a member of Grace Fellowship Community Church) were conducting the youth group. They recognized that there was a social and cultural ceiling limiting the goals of these young people. They wanted these teens to go to college and enter into professional jobs. So Redeemer was planted in the Bayview Hunters Point neighbourhood.

Dayspring Technologies was founded by three church members of the Redeemer Community Church (Danny, Chi-Ming, and Alyssa) with a vision of opening up work opportunities to empower and motivate the youth to aspire to higher education and jobs. The collective vision of Dayspring and Redeemer Community Church has been to demonstrate the redemptive qualities of the workplace and economic exchange in order to bear witness to God's work in the world.

How, specifically, did Dayspring and Redeemer Community Church announce the Kingdom of God in the world of the workplace, marketplace, and community?

Let us first consider the workplace. One aspect of a business is determining the level of remuneration of its staff. Dayspring has intentionally organized its salary scale to reflect better a scriptural vision of economic distribution. A policy of a 2:1 employer-to-employee salary scale has been implemented by Dayspring. This policy is referred to as Isaiah 40. Just as Scripture speaks of valleys lifted up and mountains brought low, the Isaiah 40 policy

³⁰ I conducted a semi-structured interview with Danny, the co-founder of Dayspring Technologies and the pastor of the Redeemer Community Church.

smooths the peaks in salaries. They actually discount the high-end salaries and boost the bottom end salaries; this is understood as a means to practise concretely the love of neighbour in the workplace (The Great Commandment).

Another way that Dayspring Technologies bears witness to God's redemption of the workplace is by creating a work environment where people labour with confidence, not needing to expend energy watching their backs for adverse actions of other staff members. Staff comments have consistently pointed out that Dayspring lacks the political environment so common in the working world.

For example, the practice of 'rank and yank' is not found at Dayspring; in the 'rank and yank' workplace structure, all the people on a team are ranked and the bottom 10% are yanked, meaning they are laid off. Dayspring rejected this practice. Of course, Dayspring Technologies pursues excellence, but brutal competition is a mark of the worldly market, not of the kingdom of God.

So what is an alternative workplace vision? A lack of divisiveness generates the feeling that you do not need to stand watch for your own well-being.

Thus far, we have addressed the workplace. Similar ideas of Kingdom-thinking are discovered in the marketplace. Dayspring attempts to embody the gospel through Sabbath remembrance. While the company esteems the value of work, the Sabbath boundary serves to prevent the idolization of labour. In this way, employees are encouraged to spend Sundays with their families and churches, resulting in a more balanced and spiritually vibrant schedule.

To guarantee that the workload stays controlled, they structure their business in a way that attempts to restrict their working hours to 40 hours a week, not requiring staff to work evenings or weekends. This practice also honours God by no one working on the Sabbath. To complement this practice, Dayspring executives are known to turn down some business opportunities in order to protect their staff and prevent over-extending themselves. In this way, an environment of righteousness and justice is cultivated. Thus the gods of produce more, work harder and longer do not determine the principles of this business.

Now that we have examined the relationship between Kingdom values and Dayspring's operations in the workplace and marketplace, we can push the discussion into implications for the broader community. Dayspring has been working in partnership with Redeemer Community Church on the question of how a business and a church could express love to its neighbours in the community.

One of the things they do is through the Neighbour Fund; this is relationship-based investing or relationship-based small business loans. These loans apply the principle of socio-economic reconciliation as a way of bearing witness to the reconciling power of Christ. The loan committee is participatory, meaning that borrowers sit on the committee and recommend loans to be made to other borrowers. They want to break down the barriers that exist between borrower and lender.

A distinctive is that they want borrowers and lenders to become friends. This is done through the sharing of a meal in order to promote an atmos-

phere of camaraderie. Something unique happens as people fellowship around the table. In these ways, Dayspring and Redeemer believe that God is actually at work reconciling all things to himself through Jesus for his Kingdom.

In sum, Dayspring Technologies and Redeemer have reflected the Kingdom of God by embodying redeemed economies such as Isaiah 40 or shared access to the land and resources,³¹ creating a supportive environment where people get connected, loved, and reconciled to Jesus and the community of faith so that the Holy Spirit may usher in the coming new creation. This is a unique combination where the Creation Commission, the Great Commission, and the Great Commandment meet for

the New Creation.

Accordingly, the case study clearly shows that a combination of business and church planting can provide a way of blessing others, binding people to one another, and eventually to God, in beautiful ways, and, and getting individuals to walk forward toward the full coming of the Kingdom, the New Creation.

2. Outcomes of the Operation of Redeemer Church and Dayspring Technologies

Our case study has provided thus far an account of the establishment and basic operational practices of Redeemer Church and Dayspring Technologies. Now we need to examine these institutions to consider what they have achieved. Insight about their accomplishments came from asking Danny, the co-founder of Dayspring Technologies and the pastor of the Redeemer Community Church five basic questions:

³¹ Christopher Wright uses the term, 'Redeemed Economies', in his article entitled 'Biblical Reflections on Land'. Cf. C. Wright, 'Biblical Reflections on Land', *Evangelical Review of Theology* 17, no. 2 (1993): 161.

Questions	Issue Addressed
What is the primary goal of the ministry of the Redeemer Community Church and Dayspring Technologies?	Goals of the ECP model
With regards to the business enterprise you have established, how do you define success?	Theoretical definition of success along the continuum from business to transformation
How do you measure success?	Operational definition of success of a Kingdom-based business
How do those metrics help you achieve the objectives you set out?	
What kind of story do you want to share with your denomination or friends?	

Earlier the point was made that the goals and visions associated with kingdom-based activities might drive the outcomes. The goals of Redeemer and Dayspring are to bring glory to God and create a space where people can experience God's kingdom (the New Creation) through relational reconciliation with Jesus Christ (the Great Commission) based on the relational expression of love for God and others (the Great Commandment), occurring in transformed business practices (the Creation Commission). Relational reconciliation refers to restoring relationship to self, to others, to the rest of creation, and to God through Jesus and the church (2 Corinthians 5:18).³²

The relational expression of love for God and others refers to the action that flows from spiritual reconciliation.³³ When our other relationships have been transformed, what emanates are business practices that reflect our right relationships to creation in stewardship³⁴ or transformed business practices. Thus we see that the goals of Redeemer and Dayspring Technologies do drive their activities.

With the establishment of goals and activities, it is important to consider their theoretical definition of success. From the beginning it is obvious that the definition of success has been re-

invented in their business endeavours. Unlike most church planters, Danny is critical of the thinking that equates the metrics of success (how much, how often, and how many) necessarily with kingdom advancement. Most church planters assume that if they keep an eye on these three analytics, then their business/church plant will be successful. Instead, at Redeemer Church and Dayspring Technologies there is an emphasis on 'faithfulness' and 'blessing'.

Thus we find a greater focus on how peoples' lives are transformed by the integration of the church and business. There is concern to count success as Jesus did: seeing the lost redeemed and transformed. Too often entrepreneurial church planters can have large congregations and even have significant offerings, but there is virtually no impact for the kingdom in the neighbourhoods surrounding the church, as Reggie McNeal points out.³⁵ However, the laudable intangible indicators of success suggested by transformed lives are not useful when seeking outcomes that can be tracked or counted.

As we move to establish an operational definition of success, the qualitative approach guided by the Holy Spirit manifests itself as Danny elucidates their guiding principles for business assessment.

Our metrics for Dayspring are business metrics [but]... we use them differently. Redeemer and Dayspring operate, using a fourfold relational approach: 1) Are we operating in a way that manifests the love of God? 2) Do

32 Steve Corbett and Brian Fikkert, *When Helping Hurts: How to Alleviate Poverty without Hurting the Poor-- and Yourself* (Chicago, Ill.: Moody Publishers, 2009), 75.

33 'The Threefold Call: A Trinitarian and Reformed Theology of Vocation in Response to Volf's "Work in the Spirit"'—ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Full Text—ProQuest, 277, accessed February 14, 2016.

34 'Threefold Call', 283-284.

35 Reggie McNeal, *Missional Renaissance: Changing the Scorecard for the Church* (San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 2009), xvi-xvii.

our products and services provide healthy benefits to customers, the community at large, and the creation? 3) Are the values of the Kingdom of God reflected in all business procedures (hiring, training, evaluating, rewarding, and dismissing employees)? 4) Are the values of the Kingdom of God present in relationships with suppliers, distributors and contractors?

The common theme found in the four questions Danny gave is relational connections: between *mission Dei* and human participation, between company and the creation, and between business and clients. There is intent to have business practices that reflect the basic relationship with God as they deal with other people and creation.

To take the analysis a step further, what drives their definition of success is relational righteousness where people are transformed through loving relationships with God and others. Relational righteousness is alluded to when Danny spoke about 'work hard', 'be willing to take a lower salary', 'give away 5% of our time', 'pay a living wage', 'a policy of a 2:1 employer-to-employee salary', and 'give away 10% of our net income to the community'. There is a premium on relational righteousness even at the cost of typical profit maximization strategies used by businesses. Yet this business thrives and is able to expand.

More revealing about the significantly different orientation of Dayspring is found in its non-business activities. When asked what story he wants to tell with regards to Dayspring, he responds with 'partnership built with the community'. He then talked about the Neighbour Fund. The expressions, 'partnership to be built

up', 'the community is being built up', 'friendships are being formed', 'across racial boundaries' convey the relational connections to the community, especially to the community of faith where trust and cooperation for the common good occur. From these relationships lives are being transformed enabling members to live together well and to stand in solidarity with the people in need.

All things taken together, the answers to the five questions about goals and outcomes make it clear that if a ECP is to be successful, entrepreneurial church planters should focus on the relationship between Kingdom values and business operations in the workplace and marketplace, their relational connections with others through Jesus and the church, and their relational righteousness through God and others and for God and others.

3. Discussion

The ultimate goal of the study of Redeemer Church and Dayspring Technologies was to identify factors that distinguished this missional endeavour and then to determine how to measure outcomes. The missional aspect has been considered previously. Based on the preceding discussion we know how Redeemer Church and Dayspring Technologies define success. Following Danny's lead, we use a kingdom-based orientation for a quantifiable assessment of success and effectiveness.

Reflecting on what Danny said about missional activity and success/effectiveness, we note that there are three dimensions to how and what Redeemer Church and Dayspring Technologies do: generate a sense of

belonging or relational connectedness, develop reflected love or relational righteousness, and recognize blessings or relational stewardship of resources.

Three dimensions emerge: belonging, reflected love and blessings. Belonging, a fundamental psychological need, is frequently the starting point for people's entrance into a community. Welcoming others to fulfil the Great Commission requires God's people to have a relationship-building orientation. It is important to understand that belonging is a process, where the degree of interest in becoming a part is key. Therefore it is incumbent on the church and/or business to provide outreach ministries that neighbourhood people define as helpful and desirable.

Next in the process of building a spiritual community is reflected love where the love shown to others begins to be reflected back. In essence, people are being divinely loved into the Kingdom. As people participate in the community of believers they find loving acceptance that, in time, they begin to reciprocate. Reflected love is found in the transition from receiving love to becoming a source of love for others. An ethos of helping each other is created within the community. As reflected love is expressed it can establish the groundwork for reconciliation with God and others, and it fosters the occurrence of divine transformation. The last dimension is blessing or the return that comes from the generation and stewardship of God-given resources.

There is a synergy among these three factors where authentic and healthy relational connectedness requires all three of these elements in order to foster holy interaction. Each component alone is necessary but not

sufficient to guarantee success. At times, one component will be more evident or emphasized, but the outcomes being sought require all three factors.

Thus we find that success for ECP may be defined as both establishing a sustainable business and creating spiritual community, or the relationships established with other believers and Jesus. Ideally, within the spiritual community, spiritual transformation occurs so that loving relationships with God and others are established and the transformed themselves become agents of reconciliation. Furthermore, ECP effectiveness should be evaluated on the grounds of holistic transformation rather than simply measuring effectiveness in terms of economic development or just leading people to faith in Christ Jesus.

With our more developed understanding of success and effectiveness, we are now ready to suggest operational variables for the dimensions belonging, reflected love, and blessing as shown in Chart 2 on the next page

Belonging tries to capture a sense of inclusiveness generated by the church and the business towards the residents of the community as evidenced by local residents getting jobs in Dayspring Technologies or increased participation in church-run programs. It is contact that starts the process of reaching people so that in time spiritual reconciliation occurs. The greater the number of different contacts, whether making a prayer request or church attendance, the greater the belongingness. This is not an exhaustive list of possible ways people can 'belong'.

Reflected love happens as people begin to respond to the loving overtures made toward them. Within the neigh-

CHART 2. ECP's Success & Effectiveness Dimensions

Belonging	Reflected Love	Blessing
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Access to ungospel people by providing economic footing (e.g. employment, small loan) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Greater neighbourliness occurring (e.g. an increase in the sense of responsibility and accountability) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relationships-based investing (e.g. or relationship-based small business loans)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community people make prayer requests 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Make community a better place (e.g. a decrease in socio-economic problems or immorality) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Value creation in a responsible relationship between the creation and clients (e.g. corporate social responsibility)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Requests assistance of ECP (e.g., the woman who needed help packaging her food for the media) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vocational stewardship by giving our vocational self to the society and God's mission (e.g. a talent donation, join a neighbourhood project) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Graduates of job-training program getting full-time work
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attends different types of meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mutually giving/sharing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local teenager going to community college
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Frequency of meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Faithfulness, diligence, and integrity in business transactions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • People who have experienced reconciliation
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Church attendance/participation in ECP's sponsored activities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Peace, harmony, and justice through the transformed (when the righteous prosper, the community and society rejoices.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Story shared by clients and staff

bourhood, reflected love is like 'playing kindness forward', because as people receive assistance from the church plant, they show kindness to someone else in need. One facet of reflected love is to note how ECP revenues are used to help the lives of others within and outside the community.

Reflected love for an economic activity is the expression of the reign and love of God in its business transactions; it is the faithfulness and diligence exhibited on the part of workers as their loving response. Tabulation of reflected love can occur as people

return for additional services, as residents request other types of assistance for the good of the neighbourhood, and as there is evidence that neighbours are helping each other.

The last dimension, blessing, indicates accomplishments and advances realized as the result of having access to ECP. The blessing indicator can be measured in part by things such as stories shared by clients and staff, graduates of job-training programs getting full-time work, local teenagers going to community college, and the experience of reconciliation among different

people. It is through qualitative stories, the level of socio-economic and education participation, and faith in Jesus that one may track the spiritual transformation and blessing in people's lives.

These variables will depend on the type of business established and the various ministries of the church. Ascertaining the number of unemployed who had access to job training and employment coaching, number of jobs created, amount of revenue generated, how money was used, and how resources were stewarded are illustrations of possible variables. What flows through these indicators and the variables used to measure them is the importance of relationships. The variables for each dimension are not tabulated to see if a specific score or number is reached, but they provide a systematic way of assessing what is occurring in both the church and the business.

This brings us to the last topic we want to discuss—how do the measurements help Redeemer Church and Dayspring Technologies achieve their initial objectives? Danny did not have much to say on this point, but scores provide a way of seeing if various programs, whether in the church or the business, have returns and what the returns are relative to last year's. Tracking of outcomes fosters assessment of different ministries. It helps to determine how much use is being made of different services and whether ministry programs need to be improved or replaced. As a community ages, child-care needs may be replaced by needs for tutoring students or organized activities to keep young people away from gangs and drugs.

Another use of scores is to see if

there is a progression from belonging to reflected love. Are the people who are involved in activities associated with 'belonging' advancing to demonstrate 'reflected love'? At this juncture, there is need to quantify these activities to see if what we are hypothesizing about the operation of ECP is an accurate description of their actual experience. If the process associated with ECP, for example, works for five years and then ceases to produce additional 'blessings', it is essential to know this. We must not be afraid to scrutinize what we are doing to advance the Kingdom of God.

The danger with creating quantifiable results is that people get obsessed with the numbers and fail to keep the statistics firmly attached to the ministries. Quantification is a tool for good management but can be misused by people who want quick answers and who fail to understand the real focus of ECP. Numbers may also be useful to identify areas of weakness in ECP endeavours that are struggling or not fully developed. It is important that assessment efforts continue in order to understand and actualize the benefits.

V Conclusion: New Age—New Methods

Missions, like many other activities, have fluctuated as theological shifts occurred. Accompanying these changes has been a swing from counting conversions to demonstrating financial stewardship. Besides the change in theological tilt, global changes have also affected missions. One steady force in the face of change has been the call of the great commission.

While this call has been a continuous

theme, what constitutes the great commission has changed from conversion, sometimes achieved in culturally insensitive ways, to concern about the entire individual—spiritual, physical and social—in culturally appropriate ways. The response to the call has continued, but in different forms. At the convergence of theology, global restrictions, and Spirit-guided response, we see the emergence of church/business endeavors.

What has guided the evaluation of the church/business approach in this paper is a concern for stewardship. Whatever mission strategy is used, fruitfulness must be achieved and at a reasonable cost, ie, good stewardship in operation. A current example of a fruitful entrepreneurial church planting (ECP) model is Redeemer Community Church and Dayspring Technologies. Careful examination of this enterprise was done to identify salient characteristics of effectiveness, and three emergent dimensions were identified—belonging, reflected love, and blessings. Common to all three was a relational aspect.

The relational view of ECP to address the three commissions offers a corrective to the tension between business (economics) and ministry (church planting). These three dimensions identified from qualitative study of one ECP need to be tested more thoroughly. However, on a practical note, this case study provides substantiation that Kingdom-based business is economically viable.

For practitioners of ECP, the study

of Redeemer Church and Dayspring Technologies reveals the possibility of developing measures of success—not just simple quantifiable metrics but also ways to assess holistic transformation. We cannot be content with measures that poorly capture the processes at work in ECP. Perhaps more careful study of ECPs in operation and less theorizing is needed at this time. To further the Great Commission requires time-consuming case studies.

What becomes clear is that there is not one way for an ECP to operate. The emphasis on relationships permits diverse paths to achieve the ultimate goal of kingdom-based business done as church planting. There is no single effective model for ECP ministry that fits all communities. Instead, relational cooperation opens up the opportunity for neighborhood contextualization in terms of ECP ministry.

Those who use ECP need to look beyond business outcomes or aspects of running a church to outcomes of kingdom transformation. In the process of kingdom transformation as the precursor to the new creation, there should eventually be large scale growth beyond the individual; the scope of attention must be broadened to include the community and society with its structural operations.

We need to introduce and maintain Kingdom culture within our own sphere of influence as participants of *missio Dei*. It is additionally incumbent on us to show others the operation of Kingdom culture in our communities.