

# Theology on the Web.org.uk

*Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible*

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

---

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

[https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles\\_churchman\\_os.php](https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php)

# Book Reviews

## **THE LAND OF THE BIBLE: A Historical Geography**

**YOHANAN AHARONI** translated & edited A. F. RAINEY

*first published in Hebrew 1962 and in English 1967*

*Burns and Oates 1979 (2nd ed. revised) 481pp. £14.25 ISBN 0 86012 093 7*

Yohanan Aharoni was an Israeli archaeologist of great flair who died in his fifties in 1976. He had virtually completed a revision of this standard work when he died, and it has been edited and translated by the translator of the first edition, A. F. Rainey.

The first third of the book surveys the main regions of the country, its boundaries and roads, and the methodological problems of studying it. The bulk of the volume, however, examines 'Palestine through the ages': it looks at the story of the land during the Canaanite period, the course of the Israelite occupation, the united monarchy, the kingdoms of Israel and Judah, and (briefly) at Judah from the fall of the northern kingdom to the Persian period. This historical structure makes it interestingly different from other books on the land of the Bible; indeed, it could perhaps be described as geographical history rather than historical geography. Perhaps for space reasons, Professor Aharoni does not discuss alternative opinions on controverted matters: sometimes this affects points of detail (such as alternative locations for Mizpah), but in the chapter on Israel's occupation of Palestine it involves the whole presentation, for Professor Aharoni presupposes his own view of the historical process involved without indicating that a highly controversial set of issues underlies the chapter.

A brief comparison with the first edition did not reveal to me where revision had taken place, except for some updating of the notes; otherwise both text and notes seem to be word-for-word the same, though the whole has been reset in larger type. There are thus still a fair number of more minor places mentioned in the text which cannot be traced on the maps; I found myself needing to refer to an atlas in order to make the most of the text, and a volume of photographs of the holy land would be another useful adjunct when reading it.

Professor Aharoni remarks that his book is not intended to replace George Adam Smith's *Historical Geography of the Holy Land*; 'as a general introduction to the subject, and as a beautifully and vividly coloured description of the Land and its environs, his book remains unrivalled.' Smith (or one of Denis Baly's books) remains the natural starting-point for this subject, at least for a non-Israeli. But Aharoni's textbook is a valuable next-level volume, especially to accompany a study of Israelite history.

St John's College, Nottingham

JOHN E. GOLDINGAY

## **WHAT DOES THE OLD TESTAMENT SAY ABOUT GOD?**

**CLAUS WESTERMANN** edited F. W. GOLKA

*John Knox Press, USA 1979*

*SPCK 1979 107pp. £4.95*

ISBN 0 281 03714 0

'Not a great deal', the casual browser may think, rubbing his eyes when the

publisher's blurb informs him that this book is 'a landmark in Old Testament studies.' It is hardly that; but it is a handy summary of some of the freshest and most significant research on the OT in recent years, much of it due to Westermann himself, as the notes amply testify.

The book's content is organized around the themes of God's action, God's word, and man's response (I did not find the attempt to relate the act-word-response pattern to the structure of the Hebrew canon convincing). Throughout, Westermann stresses the dynamic character of the divine word: 'Instead of looking at the Word of God for its thought-content, we shall have to approach it as an *action* between God and people and determine its functions.' (p. 13) So, too, the OT is more concerned with God's saving actions than with Israel's state of salvation. On this kind of basis, Westermann is able to draw together in illuminating ways much of the theological content of the OT, as well as to make some attempt to outline the relevance of the resulting picture for the relationship between Old and New Testaments. Among the many valuable points made is Westermann's insistence that the OT views God not only as Saviour, but as the one who carries on in the world his quiet, continuous work of *blessing* (for some possible implications of this, see F. W. Golka, *Theology* 83 [1980], pp. 83-91). This forms an important corrective to rigidly conceived salvation-history approaches, and in its own way raises again questions about the possibility of a 'natural theology'.

The book is, in effect, an OT theology in miniature, and it is interesting to compare it with an earlier series of Sprunt Lectures on the same theme, H. H. Rowley's *The Faith of Israel* (1956). For Westermann, the unity, the centre, within the diversity of the OT is the unity of God himself, and OT theology has the task of pointing to him and not merely theorizing about him. For to know him is to know his benefits.

St John's College, Nottingham

EDWARD BALL

**MYTHS IN THE OLD TESTAMENT** BENEDIKT OTZEN,  
HANS GOTTLIEB & KNUD JEPPESEN translated F. CRYER

SCM Press 1980 143pp. £4.95

ISBN 0 334 01050 0

This short work consists of four essays by Danish scholars: Otzen on 'The Concept of Myth' and 'The Use of Myth in Genesis', Gottlieb on 'Myth in the Psalms', and Jeppesen on 'Myth in the Prophetic Literature'.

The first chapter in the book is the most useful as it defines the difference between saga, myth and fairy-tale. A saga is a story that is regarded as true, deals with particular people living in particular situations, has a historical basis and explains present phenomena. This definition covers most of the stories in Genesis. Fairy-tales on the other hand have no connection with history and are told purely to entertain. Myths lie somewhere between saga and fairy-tale. They are not simply stories about the gods. They express the deepest truths about reality as a society sees them. They deal with events outside time, such as the creation of the world and the consummation of history. But it is in worship that these myths are used and become real for the worshipper. For example, in baptism the believer dies and rises again with Christ.

Armed with this definition of myth, the authors explore in the rest of the book how far myths are used by the OT writers, particularly the myths associated with creation used in Babylonian and Canaanite new year festivals. They evidently consider themselves quite radical in their approach,

but it would seem to me that most of their conclusions are commonplace. In the trite sense that myths express the deepest truths about life, the Bible is mythical from beginning to end. In a narrower sense the psalms are myths, because they were used in the worship of the temple. However, I think it is less confusing to speak of biblical theology in the first case, and liturgy in the second, than to lump both together as myth.

What does emerge very strongly from this study is that there is very little trace in the OT of myths in the narrowest sense, namely stories about battles with monsters or sacred marriage liturgies, such as are found in other oriental cultures. Though the authors labour to show that the Israelities were probably aware of this kind of myth, the OT only refers to such myths to condemn them or to use them as mere literary devices to express its quite distinctive theology.

Queen's University of Belfast

GORDON WENHAM

### **A BASIC INTRODUCTION TO THE OLD TESTAMENT**

SCM Press 1980 216pp. £3.50

ISBN 0 334 00071 8

### **A BASIC INTRODUCTION TO THE NEW TESTAMENT**

SCM Press 1980 237pp. £3.50

ISBN 0 334 00073 4

Both volumes edited ROBERT C. WALTON

The alert reader may be excused from wondering whether he is suffering from double vision in that both these volumes start with identical chapters, viz. 'What is the Bible?' and 'The Biblical Scholar and His Tools'. Thus the impecunious may feel somewhat conned if they have bought both books!

It is true to say that these books are abstractions from a larger work, *A Source Book of the Bible for Teachers* (published by SCM Press 1970 and still in print), and it was felt that by leaving out the parts only suitable for teachers the book might teach a wider public of students, clergy and others.

One wonders whether the target-group was defined clearly enough, for whilst the glossy cover and pleasant photographs give the feel of an up-to-date O-level textbook, the text is likely to appeal to a more advanced clientele who would be unlikely to appreciate the slight treatment given to individual books and characters of the Bible. However, the books do better when they take a more thematic approach. The chapters on Jewish religious life in the first century AD and the thought of Paul seem particularly useful as a lucid introduction in easily palatable form.

Though the writer on the miracles of Christ has tried to be scrupulously fair in giving varied interpretations to the subject, in other places there is much myth or (to this reviewer) mis-talk, especially in the *Basic Introduction to the Old Testament*. Indeed, the conservative evangelical will find much in these volumes alien and alarming. Statements like 'The book of Jonah is pure fiction. It is perhaps the only book in the Bible which is actually meant to be funny . . .' seem slighting and incongruous at the very least.

However, most of the material is not written in that vein, and much of it could be a helpful *aide-memoire* to the parson in a hurry or a student revising. Yet I cannot see a wide market for these volumes in the current climate, and it would perhaps have been more sensible to keep to the original format—*A Source Book of the Bible for Teachers*—where at least the target-group would be clearly identified.

London NW1

GILLIAN HYLSON-SMITH

CHURCHMAN

**A SURVEY OF THE NEW TESTAMENT**  
**ROBERT H. GUNDRY**

first published by Zondervan, USA 1970  
Paternoster Press 1979 400pp. £6.00

ISBN 0 85364 255 9

Paternoster have now issued this work in paperback, in an edition unaltered from that in which it first appeared in 1970. (I note that the Hebrew manuscript reproduced on p. 44 is still upside-down!) They obviously feel that they are on to a good thing, and they are quite right. I know of no other NT introduction like it for content, layout, and readability. It is profusely illustrated (in black and white), and the text is printed with wide margins in which the main headings and topics under discussion are given. This makes for very easy reference. At the start of each section, 'leading questions' are given to stimulate the reader along the lines of the subject to be tackled, and, at the end, questions 'for further discussion' attempt to stimulate thought on the modern relevance or application of the section. Bibliographies 'for further investigation' are also given after each section (containing no books later than 1966). The approach is thoroughly conservative and evangelical, and does not aim to introduce the reader in any depth to NT criticism as conducted today, except through the bibliographies. Gundry's emphasis falls on the historical background and content of the NT, devoting more space to the latter than the former. Pages 117-213 are a commentary on Robertson's *Harmony of the Gospels*, taking it paragraph by paragraph and seeking to illumine the gospels historically, culturally, literarily, and spiritually. Throughout, the style of writing is vigorous and simple.

It is an excellent book for that mythical creature, 'the general reader', whom I take to be the intelligent and investigating Christian. I hope it sells well.

Oak Hill College, London

STEPHEN MOTYER

**KERYGMA AND DIDACHE: The Articulation and**  
**Structure of the Earliest Christian Message**

**JAMES I. H. McDONALD**

Society for NT Studies Monograph Series 37

CUP 1980 247pp. £9.50

ISBN 0 521 22055 6

Despite its title, this specialist monograph is not about *kerygma* and *didache* (early Christian preaching and teaching) as these slippery terms are generally used in NT scholarship. The author has widened the scope of his research considerably; and the result is an important inquiry into the nature of Christian communication as a whole in the NT period.

For this purpose Dr McDonald identifies four related NT procedures: prophecy, homily, catechesis and the transmission of tradition. In all these areas the writer expertly probes the relevant classical background, as well as their reflection in Jewish history, in the teaching of Jesus, and in the tradition of the primitive church. Dr McDonald concludes that the first followers of Jesus came to conceive, articulate, communicate and develop their message by means of these many-sided and interlocking 'experiences-within-community' (p. 126), all four of which flowed ultimately from the earthly Jesus himself. In him the transcendent had been expressed in human terms, as 'good news' in word and action; and the proclamation of the Christian

gospel was now to be similarly accomplished, in traditional word and shared experience. Aware that his material is vitally relevant to the communication of the Christian message in our own day, McDonald ends with a gallant but inevitably brief attempt to grapple with this issue.

This volume began life as a PhD thesis, which presumably accounts for the fact that the footnotes (printed separately from the text) and indexes occupy roughly one half of the book. The style is not always easy, and the 'unjustified' format cannot be said to help the reader. Moreover, some of the author's basic presuppositions are still open questions: for example, the widespread influence of 'midrashic' technique on the preaching of Jesus and the early Christians, including the writers of the fourth gospel and 1 John (chapter 2). But the positively critical stance of the monograph, together with the author's exact scholarship and his thorough treatment of the subject, make this a fresh and significant contribution to the debate about Christian origins, as well as about the nature of the gospel itself.

Coventry Cathedral

STEPHEN S. SMALLLEY

### **THE FIFTH EVANGELIST A. M. HUNTER**

SCM Press 1980 136pp. £2.95

ISBN 0 334 00477 2

This work falls into two parts: ten chapters on Paul ('the fifth evangelist') and twelve essays on the new look on the gospel of John and a variety of other Christian topics.

It is forty years since the appearance of Professor Hunter's major work on *Paul and his Predecessors*. He tells us here that it was his former teacher, Rudolph Bultmann, who advised him to 'appraise Paul's debt to those who were Christians before him', and that in carrying out this advice he found himself transformed from a liberal into a biblical theologian. The man from whom he borrows the title of his book, *The Fifth Evangelist*—P. T. Forsyth—had undergone the same transformation himself, and Professor Hunter is plainly conscious of a deep indebtedness to Forsyth.

The principal letters of Paul (including Ephesians) are summarized in a succession of chapters in such a way as to bring out various facets of Paul's personality—liberator, pastor, theologian, churchman, friend and saint. The recipe for the church's renewal today is clearly stated to be: 'Back to that gospel which is the power of God unto salvation to every one that believeth.'

Among the miscellaneous essays in the second half of the book special mention should be made of those on the communion service, on the life-giving Spirit, on personal prayer, on Christian hymnody, and on the triad of theological virtues which lead to the heart of the Christian revelation.

Buxton, Derbyshire

F. F. BRUCE

### **GOD'S NEW SOCIETY: The Message of Ephesians**

JOHN R. W. STOTT

IVP 1979 291pp. £3.50

ISBN 0 85110 597 1

In the last twenty years there have been published no less than nine significant commentaries on the epistle to the Ephesians. So the index of abbreviations reminds us, and one is tempted to ask why the author should wish to add yet another to that list.

A few pages of reading will suffice to answer that question. As the title

suggests, the writer sees the key to the understanding of this epistle not in the traditional evangelical emphasis on the salvation of the individual (the major concern of 1:1-2:10) but on the 'vision of the renewed human community' (p. 10) which is the theme of 2:11-4:16. This vision finds constant expression as the expositor brings out the relevance of Paul's writing for twentieth-century Christians.

Here John Stott displays well his gift for lifting out the central thought from a passage and looking at the whole in perspective, before guiding the Bible student along the finer exegetical points as well, in order to apply the whole forcefully to contemporary church life. Take this analysis of the complex argument of 2:16—'This, then, was the achievement of Christ's cross. First, he abolished the law . . . as a divisive instrument separating men from God and Jews from Gentiles. Secondly, he created a single new humanity out of its former deep divisions. . . . Thirdly, he reconciled this new united humanity to God . . . First he achieved it (peace); then he announced it . . . ' (pp. 102-3)

For those who have been troubled by some modern ideas of how to understand the principalities and powers of 3:10 and 6:12, there is a thoughtful and stimulating treatment of the subject on pp. 267-75 which considers these views with understanding before coming down in favour of the traditional interpretation of these forces as personal supernatural agencies.

There is much else one could commend, but the reader must buy the book and discover for himself. This is vintage Stott and will fill an important gap in IVP's 'The Bible Speaks Today' series. We are glad that the author has added to the list of commentaries on Ephesians.

Oak Hill College, London

DAVID H. WHEATON

## **FULLNESS AND FREEDOM: The Message of Colossians and Philemon** R. C. LUCAS

IVP 1980 191pp. £2.65

ISBN 0 85110 598 X

This further volume in IVP's series 'The Bible Speaks Today' continues to maintain the high standards of the series.

In the general preface it is explained that this is not just another commentary, so that we cannot look here for detailed verse by verse exposition of the books. Nor, on the other hand, is it a series of loosely-connected sermons: rather the biblical text is taken section by section and the main themes arising are introduced, explained, and then forcefully applied to the church and the Christian of the twentieth century.

On the cover the symbolic waves of the sea and rising gull depict for us the twin themes of the title which the author takes (most helpfully) as the key to this epistle, and in context he shows how Paul presents his readers with a true Christian understanding of them in order to guard against the false ideas on the same subjects which were being imported to the Colossian church by new teachers.

Every Bible student will know that Colossians was written by the apostle to an infant church to warn against error that was infiltrating its ranks, and it is generally concluded that at Colossae that danger was an incipient form of Gnosticism. Mr Lucas takes the view that the teachers of error were in fact the precursors of those who, down the years, have sought in various ways to 'complete' the justifying work of God's saving grace in people's lives (p. 60), and in our own day he applies Paul's warnings particularly to the unqualified

acceptance of some charismatic teaching on the one hand (pp. 91-4, 152) and on the other hand the uncritical belief that since Vatican II the Roman church has become a Reformed church (see especially pp. 63-4 on this issue).

At the beginning of the book the writer sets out seven identification marks of the visiting teachers. Examination of them and their claims has, he says, been the road back to a new loyalty to evangelical Christianity. In days when there are many biblical Christians who prefer to dispense with the title 'evangelical', this book could be a great help in opening eyes to see the distinctive and vital contribution that evangelical teaching and the evangelical position still have to make in the church of the twentieth century.

Oak Hill College, London

DAVID H. WHEATON

## **A NEW CHRISTOLOGY**

**KARL RAHNER and WILHELM THÜSING**

*first published by Verlag Herder, Germany 1972*

*Burns and Oates 1980 239pp. £7.95*

ISBN 0 86012 081 3

## **FAITH IN HISTORY AND SOCIETY: Towards a Practical Fundamental Theology**

**JOHANN B. METZ**

*first published by Matthias-Grünewald Verlag, Germany 1977*

*Seabury Press, USA; Burns and Oates 1980 237pp. £6.50* ISBN 0 86012 075 9

Both of these books respond to the work of Karl Rahner and react critically to their background in German Roman Catholicism. Some of their positions are sufficiently well known as to query the term 'new', though Metz's book has a thrust that may be unfamiliar to some. Both emphasize the importance of Holy Scripture, compared with traditional RC philosophical theology of God, Christ and the church.

In *A New Christology*, Rahner's introductory essay again explores the total human situation in history, drawing out implications that call for and respond to God's self-communication in grace, in the person of Christ, the absolute bringer of salvation. He continues by examining the calling of the church, not as founded by Jesus but, as the NT indicates, as finding its provenance in his death and resurrection. This, which makes the Christian revelation 'unsurpassable', provides the root for Rahner's fundamental theology. Thüsing, as a biblical specialist, reacts to this position, fully aware of the contemporary problems in relating exegesis to theology, and refers mainly to the epistles of Paul, John and to the Hebrews. He seeks to explore modern thinking about man and Rahner's theology of human self-transcendence in relation to NT Christology drawn from these epistles. At the same time, he accepts the 'hermeneutic circle' of Scripture, gospel and church, in which the early church doctrine is seen to extend to and involve modern understanding. But he probes Rahner's sufficient response to biblical 'pointers'; and his tacit assumption of biblical Christology, which he goes on to 'discover' emerging from his philosophy of transcendence. This gives an 'evolutionary' slant to Christology, which can undermine the critical particularity of the cross, and its derived NT soteriology. Thüsing explores NT teaching, even with some diagrams, and in a note-form of a series of indexed paragraphs which end in a section on 'Themes for New Approaches to a Contemporary Christology Based on the New Testament'. He urges that Rahner should respond to the richness of this resource to escape from the narrowness of the classical tradition he still expounds. But both format and translation could do with improvement.



Metz's *Faith in History and Society* bears the sub-title 'Towards a Practical Fundamental Theology'. The German publication in 1977 collected a number of previously published papers, with an introduction of four chapters. He again writes as one who owes much to Rahner, but also to the neo-Marxist criticism of Ernst Bloch (author of *Das Prinzip Hoffnung*) and the 'Frankfurt School' of Marcuse, Adorno and Horkheimer. He approves Rahner's criticism of Catholic scholasticism and his theology that explores human self-transcendence, especially in the actual world of the everyday experience. But he subjects this, and western theology generally, to the implicates of the Marxist sociology of knowledge, as a European middle-class product needing to attend more to Latin-American theologies of liberation. Not that he wishes (as does the Frankfurt school) to denigrate middle-class values nor make abstract denial of the individual. He knows that modern socialist states offer no visions of true human solidarity. But he scourges modern, science-based outlooks that look at time in evolutionary ways to remove all genuine hope, which results in the crashing boredom of modern society. Metz rejects the abstraction of theology as a solely cerebral exercise (integral, he thinks, to the European middle-class privatized intellectualism), and calls for a practical, indeed, political orientation. He contradicts the order of first doctrine, then application in practice, because thinking *about* God and obedience to God are part of the one stance of faith in concrete situations. Its basis is the 'dangerous' memory of Christ's passion, enshrined in the gospel narrative but extended into the recorded memory of his suffering people, and indeed all human suffering. This calls the present into question, because of unresolved and unfinished conditions; it opens the way for repentance and redemption, and the eschatological hope of a 'here and not yet' that points to an open future. Chapter 10 sets out 35 theses headed 'Hope as an Imminent Expectation, or the Struggle for Forgotten Time', which provide sharp questions aiming at all men 'becoming subjects in the presence of God', and in a solidarity with all the suffering, especially those suffering oppression. What this approach implies for a statement of Christian doctrine is not apparent, and Metz points to another of his books, *The Faith of Christians*, for this. But it provides a stimulating critique along a certain line that has not been greatly heeded in Britain, and a challenge to theological procedures where assumptions have been probably too much taken for granted.

Archdeaconry of Auckland, Co. Durham

G. J. C. MARCHANT

## **CHILDREN OF PROMISE: The Case for Baptizing Infants** **GEOFFREY W. BROMILEY**

*T. and T. Clark* 1979 116pp. £1.95

ISBN 0 567 29102 2

This book is a slightly revised new edition of Bromiley's earlier work on infant baptism. Intended for the laity, it represents a 'simple attempt, in generally intelligible terms, to get at the biblical understanding which underlies the continuation of infant baptism.' Without question, Bromiley has succeeded in this attempt.

Bromiley first surveys the NT evidence before moving on to 'The Witness of the Old Testament'. Succeeding chapters cover 'The Meaning of Baptism', 'The Election of the Father', 'The Reconciliation of the Son', 'The Scope of Baptism' and 'The Salvation of Infants'. Throughout the book, important theological topics are discussed in a clear and easily understandable manner. One is grateful to find here a 'popular' writing which consistently evidences solid theological foundations. Bromiley repeatedly stresses the covenant

nature of baptism and that this sacrament primarily points to what God has done for us in Jesus Christ, rather than to what we do in confession of faith and repentance. It is not a sacrament signifying our activity, but rather it signifies and seals 'first, last, solely, and supremely the activity of the electing Father, the reconciling Son, and the regenerating Spirit.' Baptism, therefore, signifies a suprahuman work, not achievable by human capabilities, and it is this element which is especially brought out in infant baptism.

The entire discussion is conducted in a fair and irenic spirit. Bromiley is at all times careful not to press beyond the evidence. In fact he readily concedes, unlike many of our Baptist and sacramentalist brethren, that the NT does not provide a direct precept or precedent and, therefore, there can be no 'definite ruling' on this matter.

All in all, this is a very illuminating little book, which will be helpful for individuals and churches alike. It not only provides a biblical case for baptizing infants, but also gives an important theological introduction to the wider significance of baptism in general.

King's College, Aberdeen

M. CHARLES BELL

**LIBERATION THEOLOGY: An Evangelical View from the Third World** J. ANDREW KIRK  
Marshalls Theological Library

Marshall, Morgan and Scott 1979 246pp. £6.95

ISBN 0 551 05592 8

This is a book for someone who is uneasy about the way liberation theology uses the Bible. Kirk, unusually among evangelicals, is strongly sympathetic to its aims, but seeks a sounder footing for its hermeneutics. Here is a reply to those who fear that the authority of Christ and the Scriptures must be discarded if the liberation enterprise is espoused. Indeed, the book is important because it tackles that most pressing issue: the proper relationship of Scripture to obedient Christian action in the contemporary situation. Or, as Kirk puts it: 'How should one read the biblical message of liberation through Jesus Christ from within a shanty town whose existence is directly caused by man's greed and violence? This is the context for a contemporary biblical hermeneutic which cannot exclude from its consideration the reality of a poverty which *can* be eradicated.' (p. 145)

Two thirds of the book is devoted to a digest of liberation theology: its origins, themes, and some of its principal exponents (though sadly predating Sobrino and Boff). There is scarcely a hint of evaluation here, and the reader must curb his frustration at all the important questions left hanging in the air and be sure not to tire before reaching part IV. The descriptive sections will be easier for the student with some knowledge of the subject: the argument is close packed and laden with the abstract jargon of the theology's exponents. Apart from the first chapter on the historical background, which excels in clarity and readability, the descriptions are too clipped and lack illustration. But Kirk knows his sources well, and those who desire a better knowledge of these waters will find their pilot a trustworthy guide.

It is the final part of the book in which Kirk's distinctive contribution is offered. The claim of liberation theologians that present-day events are in hermeneutical continuity with the Scriptures is inadequate; they are *not* unambiguous as revelation of God's activity. Nor can the claim be sustained that Marxism provides the objective and scientific analysis of such events. Hence it does not provide the reliable hermeneutical key for understanding Scripture for the present day; there are grounds for allowing Scripture to

speak without such a straight jacket. Firstly, there is its unique exposure of fundamental ontological alienation in man, caused by ungodliness (*asebeia*), such that oppression cannot simply be thrown off. Secondly, Scripture offers the hope of *total* liberation, realistically held in eschatological tension, but established in the finality of Christ, the new man. Here lies the path through both monistic and dualistic salvation claims. For such a biblical kerygma to make its contribution to political practice, the nature of that contribution must be left open. The hermeneutical principle of *sola Scriptura* alone guards this and is consistent with Christ's finality. We are left, then, with two poles in our hermeneutical circle: Scripture, speaking through one of its own major themes; and present-day events analysed as objectively as possible. The circle functions by dialectical analysis and *both* poles demand our practical obedience. The church provides the bridge between these two horizons, for it alone manifests the new order of God's kingdom and takes action against patterns of injustice.

This methodology, along similar lines to that offered by Bonino and Dumas, has possibilities for all who seek to relate the Bible to decision about contemporary Christian action. It demands attention far beyond the discussion of liberation theology. According to Kirk, only such a method will allow the Christ-event to make its unique contribution to political practice. But, tantalizingly, we are given only one paragraph on p. 201 outlining along what lines that contribution is to be. We need to know more.

St John's College, Nottingham

GRAHAM DOW

**PAUL: The Man and the Missionary** BERNARD T. SMYTH

Darton, Longman and Todd 1980 166pp. £3.45

ISBN 0 232 51459 3

Bernard Smyth, an Irish Catholic missionary priest, tells us that on his return to Ireland from a missionary convention in Chile, where he had been reflecting on the sort of missionary spirituality that would be viable in Latin America, he turned to Paul for guidance. The result of his encounter with the apostle is this book, which intends to provide an account of Paul's religious and spiritual outlook. In it we are introduced to Paul the traveller, who always found himself in the midst of turmoil, and to Paul at prayer. We are taken briefly through the letters to see what aspects of Paul's relation to Christ emerge from them and are given an account of the nature of his mission. A final section attempts to relate Paul more explicitly to today's questions and looks at ethical and social aspects of his career, including what he might have made of Karl Marx.

The author admits he is not a Scripture scholar, and this is underlined by his readiness to speculate on various aspects of Paul's inner life and to use material from Acts as direct evidence for the apostle's psychological make-up. The book does not then purport to make any scholarly contribution to our understanding of Paul's spirituality. It must be judged by whether it is able to provide a fresh popular treatment of Paul that enables apostolic spirituality to be seen as a model for those in Christian service today. The author's intended programme is a promising one, but, despite his evident enthusiasm and love for Paul and occasional lively turn of phrase, the treatment has to be judged not to live up to the promise. It lacks sharp insights both into Paul and into the ways he can be related to our twentieth-century world. Too often Paul's distinctive contribution is reduced to commonplaces about spirituality involving a disciplined programme subordinated to love for the person of Christ, or about ethics having rules only for the sake of people, or about the likeli-

hood of Paul accepting the truth of Marx's analysis of society but rejecting his atheistic presuppositions. Subjective factors are often more at work in assessing devotional reading than in assessing other kinds of books. So it could be that, although the book failed to inspire this reviewer, some individuals or study groups might find it a useful basic aid to a devotional appreciation of Paul. There will remain, however, a need for a really good popular introduction to Paul, the man and the missionary.

St John's College, Nottingham

A. T. LINCOLN

**THE GREATEST ENGLISHMAN: Essays on St Boniface and the Church at Crediton** edited TIMOTHY REUTER

*Paternoster Press 1980 140pp £6.00*

ISBN 0 85364 277 X

**BONIFACE OF DEVON: Apostle of Germany**  
**JOHN CYRIL SLADDEN**

*Paternoster Press 1980 254pp £7.50*

ISBN 0 85364 275 3

The simultaneous production of two books on the same subject by one publishing company—even using the same maps as end-pieces—is unusual, but in this case it reflects the contemporary interest in the subject matter. St Boniface, an Englishman who spent most of his life building the Christian church structures in the central regions of the emerging Frankish kingdoms, has stirred both local loyalties (a new cult at Crediton sprang up in 1979) and European interest (his candidacy as 'patron saint of Europe' is urged by many). So two books, one addressed to the academic market and the other to a wider field, can perhaps be justified. For most of us are very ignorant of who Boniface was and what he did.

Born somewhere in the west country (perhaps Crediton, perhaps not) sometime about 680 (or some five years on either side; modern anniversaries pay scant heed to niceties of scholars), Wynfrith became a monk-missionary to Frisia and then to the central Rhine-Main valley region of Germany. His main work was threefold: as preacher of the gospel, as reformer of the church he found, and as promoter of the claims of Rome in this borderland area and indeed over the whole of the Frankish lands. He died in 754, murdered by those to whom he was preaching; but the foundations had been well laid.

The two books are very different. A certain amount of Sladden's dogmatic and simplistic assertions is contradicted by the five essays edited by Reuter. These were presented at Crediton as part of the New Cult Movement there. They show how little is known; but at the same time, they reveal facets of this fascinating character which are not fully dealt with by Sladden. One essay is not about Boniface at all; it is a valuable account of the church at Crediton during the Middle Ages. In reading this, it is important to remember that the events described lie half-way between the death of Boniface and our own days; they are not contemporary, nor even culturally associated with Boniface's age. And ignore the exaggerated title.

Exaggerated claims run right through Sladden's work; the author has swallowed all the hagiographical writings of earlier ages and added some more of his own. Nevertheless, if read as an account of the problems which faced a missionary in Europe in the eighth century, the book still has much to offer. Boniface discovered that, to secure the permanence of his mission and especially his monastic ideals, he was forced (there appears to have been

some reluctance on his part) to use the authority of both Rome and the newly emerging Frankish authorities. He was given extraordinary papal authority north of the Alps, the figurehead used in an attempt to make other clergy acknowledge those same authorities. And he it was who crowned Pippin when that servant of the Merovingian kings 'usurped' the title after having wielded the power for many years. His contemporary prestige was enormous and he became 'useful' to king and pope alike. The story is a fascinating one —of frustration and despair, of persistence and strength, of the complicated weaving of central European politics and society. Ignore the exaggerations (especially the first three chapters) and start with Sladden; then read Reuter to correct some of the hero-worship. And what will come through is that we know really very little about the real man, Wynfrith-Boniface, but a good deal about the mission of his time. And that will teach us a lot.

New University of Ulster

ALAN ROGERS

### THE WORKS OF JOHN WESLEY: Letters 1 1721-1739

Volume 25 edited FRANK BAKER

OUP 1980 763pp. £35.00

ISBN 0 19 812545 3

This book is a triumph of scholarship and editing, and a major breakthrough in Wesleyan studies. Woe betide any academic library which fails to invest in a copy. Telford's edition served its generation, but Professor Frank Baker has produced such a thorough work that almost any book, article, lecture or student essay about Wesley's earlier years will need its help.

There are five more volumes to come. This first one starts with a long, well-written general introduction to the series, offering a pen-portrait of Wesley as seen in his letters, and then discussing the people he wrote to, the physical form, the style and even the routes of the letters, and much else. It is an introduction, of seven chapters in 140 pages, which should be reissued as a paperback for a much wider public.

The following 600 pages of letters take Wesley from a boy of 18 at Christ Church, Oxford, to the end of 1739, about a year and a half after his heart was 'strangely warmed' in the Moravian meeting at Aldersgate. They come from a variety of archives, yet even Dr Baker's unwearied research cannot produce all those which Wesley is known to have written. Many are published here for the first time. Where holographs of previously published letters are extant—and more seem to turn up every year—the editor works direct from the manuscript. Where originals are lost, he sifts printed versions to offer the most probably accurate text. In many instances he can reconstruct a lost letter from Wesley's Journals or even from a reply. Sometimes, as in the famous 'The World is my Parish' letter, he can show how Wesley worked on his draft before posting the final version.

Every letter known to have been written by Wesley, whether or not the text survives, is listed. In addition, Dr Baker inserts many written *to* Wesley. This greatly enhances the value of the volume because the reader can know the course of an argument or a friendship. Apart from its importance to biography and to church history, this is a marvellous book to browse in, as Wesley searches for, discovers, and thereafter devotes himself to promote 'vital, practical, religion'. Many of the later letters do indeed lift the heart.

Rose Ash, Devon

JOHN POLLOCK

**ELIZABETH FRY: A Biography** JUNE ROSE

Macmillan 1980 218pp. £8.95

ISBN 0 333 23806 0

This book is significant because all previous biographies of Elizabeth Fry have relied on a transcribed, edited version of her diary. After her death in 1845, a daughter expunged anything too private or embarrassing, but, unlike Princess Beatrice with Queen Victoria's diary, she did not destroy the original. Miss Rose has worked from that, and thus she can present the great reformer as a very human person.

In some ways Miss Rose depends too much on the diary. Evangelicals of the period (and Elizabeth Fry was a very evangelical Quaker) used their diaries as a Catholic uses the confessional and they can trap the unwary. Introspective saints who write for their own eyes, before God, may leave a false impression to prying posterity; I doubt that Mrs Fry's character justified the snide comments on motive which too frequently obtrude into her new biographer's pages.

This book takes for granted that readers will know all about the Society of Friends and does not explain the unusual character of Betsy Fry's version of Quakerism. And had Miss Rose read a more recent life of Wilberforce than that of 1838 she would have discovered how the two actually met; and also that the Duke of Gloucester did not become Mrs Fry's patron merely because he had danced with her at Norwich in her giddy youth, but because this forgotten prince, the ardent disciple of Wilberforce and Hannah More, was a patron of most evangelical causes of the day.

Despite my quibbles I warmly commend Miss Rose's book, which will interest the general reader and become required reading for anyone concerned with prison reform or nursing pioneers or the role of women in public life, or the social side of the later evangelical revival. Betsy's family, the Quaker Gurneys of Earlham near Norwich, were not 'Plain Friends' and it is interesting to learn that at first these cheerful bankers disapproved of her preaching and public praying. Her husband, Joseph Fry, a feeble fellow who ruined his own bank and thereby nearly wrecked his wife's ministry, supported her throughout yet never really shared her faith. Most of her numerous children proved a sore trial.

Her philanthropic and reforming labours were unceasing. She had the ear of kings and queens. She kept herself going by prayer and the Bible and (strictly under doctor's orders) a steady intake of opium and strong drink.

Rose Ash, Devon

JOHN POLLOCK

**MISSISSIPPI: The View from Tougaloo**  
**CLARICE T. CAMPBELL and OSCAR ALLAN ROGERS Jr**

University Press of Mississippi 1979 276pp.

hardcover US \$25

paperback US \$10

ISBN 0 87805 091 4

ISBN 0 87805 902 2

In 1869 the American Missionary Association founded at Tougaloo in the Deep South a school to meet the needs of newly emancipated Negroes after the Civil War. It was an enterprising and far-sighted gesture, for teaching slaves to read and write had not long before been punishable by the loss of both hands to the chopping-block.

It was a long time, however, before ideals were implemented by adequate staffing, finance and accommodation, but nothing should take away from the AMA's achievement in founding about five hundred schools in the South,

'primarily for freedmen, but open to illiterates regardless of colour.' Mississippi has always been one of the poorer States of the Union, and bitter battles had to be fought right into the middle of the twentieth century over the issue of racial equality. 'Educate not the Negro, but the child' was an early principle of the institution that became Tougaloo College and conferred its first BA degree in 1901.

There developed the concept of a broad education in order to develop Negro leaders whose race had for long been limited to elementary, agricultural and industrial training. They too should have opportunities, and minds 'well stored with philosophy, science, history, literature, art, and in communings with the intellectual aristocracy of the past.'

This well-written work gives sidelights on how stubborn were the barriers of decades, and how 'churches proved more difficult to integrate than cultural events.' J. Edgar Hoover's FBI tried to discredit Tougaloo because it was a rallying-point for the civil rights movement. That the fight was won in one of the most recalcitrant States was due not a little to the Tougaloo faculty and students whose history is fascinatingly recounted in this attractive book.

St Andrews, Fife

J. D. DOUGLAS

## EVANGELISM IN ECLIPSE: World Mission and the World Council of Churches HARVEY T. HOEKSTRA

Tyndale House, USA 1979

Paternoster Press 1979 300pp. £5.00

ISBN 0 85364 265 6

The 1980 Melbourne Conference of the Commission on World Mission and Evangelism (CWME) of the WCC has come and gone. Some hoped that it would issue a clear-cut call to the personal aspect of evangelism. They were disappointed. The proclamation of the gospel which offers forgiveness of sins and new life to individuals who turn from following idols to the living God through Jesus Christ is a very low priority in Geneva, judging by conference documents and the dossiers and memoranda issued by the staff at headquarters.

Hoekstra's book, which originated as a doctoral thesis for the Fuller School of World Mission, and included a two-month stint in Geneva interviewing WCC leaders and investigating the archives there, traces the fairly rapid demise of evangelism, classically conceived, within the policy-making bodies of the WCC.

Though the author briefly discusses international missionary conferences from earlier in the century, he concentrates his attention on the years 1958-75. In 1958 the International Missionary Council (IMC) wrote its own obituary and decided formally to join the WCC—the marriage took place at New Delhi in 1961. In 1975, the Fifth Assembly took place in Nairobi. In between came the two conferences of the CWME at Mexico City (1963) and Bangkok (1972-3), the Conference on Church and Society in 1966 and the Fourth Assembly at Uppsala in 1968.

Hoekstra's thesis, briefly, is that with the absorption of the IMC into the WCC in 1961 the classical concern for pioneer, cross-cultural evangelism got lost. Mission became not so much what the church does, as what it is. It was redefined as 'New Mission', the concern to be an agent in the socio-political transformation of society into a just, participatory and sustainable society. This helps explain the WCC call for a moratorium on missions and the emphasis on dialogue with people of other faiths.

The book is documented by nearly 100 pages of appendices, covering the

preparatory materials, the Work Book, and the report of Section I of the Fifth Assembly; the Programme to Combat Racism; the Commission on the Church's Participation in Development; ecumenical sharing of personnel; urban and industrial mission; service programmes and projects, and various questionnaires.

Hoekstra's survey is largely historical and descriptive. He is a member of a church within the WCC. Therefore his appraisal, though sharply critical, is both sympathetic and hopeful of change. He is weak, in my opinion, in theological analysis of the continuing shift within the WCC towards a mono-chrome concept of mission. He is also too uncritical of certain evangelical assumptions about evangelism. He writes, for example, more from a North American missionary tradition than from the much broader perspective of the Lausanne Covenant, which he does not discuss. Nevertheless, his critique of the WCC is in many places valid. But its policies and strategies on evangelism will not change unless people with real biblical convictions are willing to work within its structures of power.

St Paul's Church, Robert Adam St, London W1

J. ANDREW KIRK

### **THE QUEEN ANNE CHURCHES: A Catalogue of the Papers in Lambeth Palace Library of the Commission for Building Fifty New Churches in London and Westminster 1711-1759**

compiled E. G. W. BILL introduction H. COLVIN

Mansell Publishing 1979 255pp. £21.50

ISBN 0 7201 0919 1

The Introduction by Mr Colvin comprises a review of the work of the Commission and was first published in the *Architectural Review* in 1950. It has been revised and would make a good booklet in its own right, being well documented. It is followed by a complete list of commissioners appointed between 1711 and 1727.

Mr Colvin's compact style, amplified with footnotes, sets the scene for the main text of litho-reproduced pages. These catalogue a wide range of documents in the library at Lambeth: there are minutes, books of building operations, contracts and warrants, accounts and all manner of papers relating to individual churches and sites. The whole catalogue is then indexed.

The 11" x 9" volume is handsomely bound, with gold lettering, giving an impression of coffee-table elegance. It is, however, nothing of the sort, but is purely a work-book for the researcher, a reference catalogue *par excellence* and the product of splendid librarianship.

For the flesh on these bones, a visit to the library would be essential, and there are many items which encourage this. For example, the erection of Christ Church, Spitalfields, appears to be comprehensively documented, including a problem over bricks! St George-the-Martyr, Queen Square, also gets a comprehensive archive. On the other hand, this reviewer is the present architect to St Leonard's, Shoreditch, and was disappointed to discover an acute lack of record in the library. Strange how the origins of some churches are sparsely documented!

It is hard to imagine this volume on private bookshelves, but in centres of learning it will be valuable to historians, lawyers and architects.

London W1

KENNETH WHITE



**CHURCH FURNISHING AND DECORATION IN ENGLAND AND WALES GERALD RANDALL**

B. T. Batsford 1980 240pp. £15.00

ISBN 0 7134 3382 5

The index to this book lists only place-names; it runs to ten pages with triple columns in small print. About 1,800 churches are therefore mentioned.

It may be thought contrary to commence a review by mentioning the index, yet in this case it is as significant as the number of photographs: 262. The bibliography mentions over 80 pieces, not counting Pevsner, and none of them precisely covers this ground.

These facts are merely the bones of a highly condensed, yet readable, survey of the contents of our churches. The flesh is warm indeed, written with restrained wit and theological sensitivity, mindful of church history and architectural fashions as well as the needs of the church today. Despite Mr Randall's comprehensiveness, it is obvious he could have doubled the scope. As we read, we are reminded of so many other items (and of which Mr Randall is also obviously aware) that we would welcome his opinion of them.

The substance is historical and not a specification for present-day refurbishment. It proceeds logically from the porch, through the body of the church, to the chancel, recording and illustrating the furniture and fittings *en route*. Wall paintings, glazing and memorials also receive careful documentation and there are notes on all manner of objects from acoustic jars to wig-stands.

Archdeacons, members of DACs and church architects should use this book as a working reference; they will find nothing more reliable.

London W1

KENNETH WHITE

**UNDERSTANDING RELIGION AND CULTURE:  
Anthropological and Theological Perspectives**

edited JOHN H. MORGAN

University Press of America 1979 238pp.

ISBN 0 8191 0848 0

'What do you mean by "meaning"?' The book is an attempted answer to this question. It is not a completely satisfactory answer for two reasons: first, because this collection of essays suffers from its varied contributors and their mixed ability in handling a complex idea; and second, because such a varied group of subjects as they choose spoils any attempt at developing a consistent argument. The chapters on 'Bengali Muslims and the Symbolism of the Earth', 'Siona Hallucinogenic Ritual', and 'Maritime Canadians and the Quest for Meaning' are all interesting, though lacking the level of analysis that would satisfy a professional anthropologist.

The major failure results from the fact that the book is a commentary on the work of the anthropologist Clifford Geertz, on his definition of religion, and on his central emphasis on man as a meaning-maker. Now this last point is important, for the social sciences have, since the second world war, emphasized the idea that man's central attribute is that of making a sensible and intelligible world around himself. John H. Morgan's chapters dealing with 'Meaning as Hermeneutics' and with 'Meaning as the Basis for a Dialogue between Theology and Anthropology', are good. They seek to show that Geertz's work on interpreting society as a system of symbols is like the work

of Paul Tillich on interpreting theological systems.

If this whole area of 'meaning' means little to you, then the book will serve a useful purpose in awakening you to what's been happening to theoretical areas over recent decades. If General Systems Theory and Cybernetics in general is an open book for you, then this collection will be of only incidental significance, unless Tillich is someone you have accidentally omitted from your thought.

Geertz's definition that 'Religion is a system of symbols which acts to establish powerful, persuasive, and long-lasting moods and motivations in men by formulating conceptions of a general order of existence and clothing these conceptions with such an aura of factuality that the moods and motivations seem uniquely realistic', is useful when aligned with Tillich's thought that religion involves man's 'encounter with the meaning of being', but this book lacks the necessary philosophical and theological subtlety needed to ensure a happy union of these partners. The contributors are too much like wasps around the jam-pot, eager to identify good things but unable to shift the substance.

Department of Theology, University of Nottingham

DOUGLAS DAVIES

**MORALITY, RELIGIOUS AND SECULAR: The Dilemma of the Traditional Conscience** BASIL MITCHELL

Clarendon Press : OUP 1980 168pp. £7.50

ISBN 0 19 824537 8

This revised version of the Gifford Lectures, given in the University of Glasgow in 1974-5, is firmly rooted in Oxford moral philosophy of recent years: the world of Hare, Hampshire, Iris Murdoch, Strawson and Warnock. In a gentle way Professor Mitchell produces a series of pen portraits of contemporary secular ethical positions, which he labels rationalist, romantic and liberal humanism. The book's main strength lies in the author's power to characterize rather than argue.

The argument, when it becomes discernible, moves forward slowly. Professor Mitchell claims that moral ideals cannot be separated from basic moral convictions (as Strawson and Hare would claim) and that secular moralities do not do justice to morality as a vision and as a response to the intuitions of conscience.

But Christian morality, with its own conceptions of human needs, of man made in the image of God and yet an individual, can fill the gap left by secular moralities. Christian theology makes intelligible what it is to be a man.

How can a Christian persuade the immoralist of his position? By showing that God's purpose for him is fulfilled when he ceases to be self-centred. But why choose Christ to follow? Because following him is the only way to lasting satisfaction (p.155). This seems to be the right answer, or one of them. But is it as non-utilitarian as Professor Mitchell seems to think it is, and wants it to be?

University of Liverpool

PAUL HELM

**BELIEF IN SCIENCE AND IN CHRISTIAN LIFE: The Relevance of Michael Polanyi's Thought for Christian Faith and Life** edited THOMAS F. TORRANCE

The Handsel Press 1980 150pp. £5.25

ISBN 0 905312 11 2

Michael Polanyi was from 1933-48 professor of physical chemistry at the

University of Manchester, and from 1948-58 he held the chair of social studies at the same university without tutorial duties. He spent that decade writing *Personal Knowledge*, which is a revolutionary work of epistemology, particularly concerning the philosophy of science. This present collection of papers is one attempt to draw out some of the implications of Polanyi's thought for Christianity.

It would be hard to over-estimate the importance of this theory of knowledge. At least since Descartes, and probably since Plato, the great quest for knowledge has centred on a desire for objectivity and certainty. And this desire has in turn sought to eliminate the 'subjective'. Within this stream of thought faith, commitment, passion, skills, imagination, and other 'personal' notions have been devalued to a secondary status, and with them Christian faith. Most Christians have responded to this intellectual climate either by capitulating to a subjective account of their faith; or by objectivizing their faith in a way which has the effect of making them think in two compartments. But, to use Professor Torrance's words, Polanyi 'showed that scientific activity, and indeed all rational activity, operate with an inner relation between faith and reason similar to that found in Christian theology.' That is a far-reaching claim and, if it is true, has enormous implications for the way we look at life.

For students of philosophy of religion, this book (and of course Polanyi himself) is a 'must'. But even the less philosophically-minded would do well to read it. Such a reader will find approaches to the kind of questions that worry us: Is Christian theology a second-rate kind of knowing? Is my personal belief purely subjective? Is the Chalcedonian definition still binding on us? Am I significant? He will find fresh light on such diverse topics as: Is faith a gift?; other religions; the Bible and tradition; the importance of the church; conversion; the nurture of disciples; the value of small groups; how does the Bible bring us the word of God?; Christology; God and his creation; prayer.

It is inevitable that a new approach develops its own vocabulary, and not the least helpful aspect of the book is the editor's glossary of terms at the back. For anyone who is unfamiliar with Polanyi's thought it might be a good place to start.

This book is seminal. Frequently the discussion stops short and leaves the reader waiting for more. But it is an important aspect of this epistemology that 'we know more than we can tell'. There's a lot of work to be done.

Holy Trinity, Platt, Manchester

HUGH SILVESTER

**A LONG WAY FROM HOME: A Sociological Exploration of Contemporary Idolatry** J. A. WALTER

*Paternoster Press* 1979 217pp. *hardcover* £7.50 ISBN 0 85364 259 1  
*paperback* £4.50 ISBN 0 85364 260 5

This is a fascinating book which explores the meaning we give to our lives in the secular context. Tony Walter's thesis is that secular society is not without its religion. Man is a religious animal by nature. Thus, when he abandons one set of beliefs he is bound to find alternatives. He must worship something. The provocative aspects of this book concern what the author thinks have taken the place of past religious beliefs. In his opinion we have made idols for ourselves out of established institutions like the family and work. The author does not pull his punches. If, on the one hand, he attacks the pre-suppositions behind the thinking of those who idealize the nuclear family and traditional Protestant attitudes to the virtues of hard work, on the other hand

he questions what those involved in ecology movements and in the modern media are up to. In creating new idols for ourselves we have attempted to make our home in the confines of this created order. Thus we have sought to live in a world shut off from God, yet are still in need of sacred provision to provide new meaning to our existence.

Given that the author is deliberately stating one aspect of the case without attempting to be comprehensive in his approach—he does little to point up the virtues of our modern experience—he is giving us stimulation which we would all do well to take advantage of. I am not wholly convinced by the thesis, just as I am not wholly convinced by the Ellul approach which undergirds it. I do think that a lot of people in our society manage to live both without a faith in God and without falling into the sin of idolatry. It is not always possible to scratch around in the world of meaning in their lives and find idolatry lurking not far from the surface. Nevertheless, this is a fine book, excellently written and full of good provocation.

The Shaftesbury Project, Nottingham

JOHN GLADWIN

**POLITICAL EDUCATION: A Practical Guide for  
Christian Youth Workers** FRED MILSON

*Paternoster Press 1980 128pp. hardcover £4.50 ISBN 0 85364 257 5*  
*paperback £2.50 ISBN 0 85364 258 3*

Fred Milson has directed his book at Christian youth workers. He has been driven to the somewhat despairing conclusion that you can't teach old dogs new tricks and that therefore hope lies with the young. But it would be a pity if this exciting and stimulating little book were to circulate only amongst the youth work fraternity.

The book is not easy reading. It has about it an untidy, unfinished feel, full of unanswered questions and unresolved dilemmas. This can be irritating, but patient reading forces one to admit that here is an honest appraisal of where we are in our present 'agonizing search for reality'.

The author has some fairly tough home truths to impart to the churches that will bring pallor to the cheeks of those intent on fitting stabilizers to the Christian boat. But they are the wounds of a friend who knows us well at national and grass-roots level.

The position advocated in the book is based, it is claimed, on the nature of God as revealed in the Bible. It is a plea to take the Magnificat seriously. But if this position is accepted, we do well to be aware of the direction in which we are being pointed. If the prophetic/political dimension is woven into the very fabric of revelation, then evangelism must have that thread running through it. It is surely nonsense to preach a pietistic, individualistic gospel whilst hoping to introduce the prophetic/political dimension later as some sort of optional extra. Make no mistake, the ideas in this book bear as directly on our evangelism as they do on our efforts at political education. It is a road that will lead us deeper into unfamiliar terrain, but, as the author warns, 'there can be no prophetic church without dangers.'

Here then is an excellent discussion document and introduction to a subject too long ignored. Hopefully it will get a debate going amongst youth workers and the wider church that will move us out of our present situation, aptly described by Fred Milson as producing power in neutral gear.

St John & St Stephen, New Clee, S. Humberside

JOHN ELLIS

CHURCHMAN

**CAPITALISM AND PROGRESS: A Diagnosis of  
Western Society** BOB GOUDZWAARD

*first published in the Netherlands 1978*

*Wedge Publishing Foundation, Canada 1979*

*Eerdmans, USA 1979*

*Norfolk Press 1980 270pp. £4.95*

ISBN 0 88906 106 8

ISBN 0 8028 1809 9

ISBN 0 85211 042 1

The author of this book is a former member of the Dutch Parliament and currently a professor of economics at the Free University in Amsterdam. More importantly, he is one of the few Christian economists who has thought in depth about the relationship between Christianity and contemporary economic problems. His theme in this book is that the current crisis of western society can be traced back to the spiritual roots of contemporary western culture. Although the crisis manifests itself in terms of such things as pollution, inflation and the materialism of western man, its basic cause is the fact that the West has defied progress—in the economic sphere the pursuit of gross national product—and subjected its norms of truth and justice to this goal.

The theme is worked out by attempting to show how the transition from feudalism to capitalism accompanied the Renaissance and Enlightenment world-views, the way in which the evolution of modern capitalism (mass production, separation of ownership and control, advertising and the increasing role of government) reflects the secularization of western culture, the inevitable crisis which has followed the pursuit of progress and in the final section the need for a disclosure of society in which Goudzwaard rejects the idea that a fate is overcoming western civilization and considers the kind of changes which are necessary to create a more human society.

The book is not intended for economic specialists and makes extremely interesting reading for anyone who is concerned to relate the materialism of our culture to its spiritual roots. It is written from a Dooyeweerdian perspective and contains a great many valuable insights into the history of western society and our current economic problems.

Nevertheless, I have a number of reservations regarding the thesis it puts forward: the indictment of progress is carried so far that it leaves no real place for the creation of wealth; the failure to distinguish capitalism as an 'ism' (a social philosophy which embodies modern secularism) from the basic institutions of a market economy (private property, free markets and limited government) which are compatible with other social philosophies; the lack of a clear biblical basis, especially that related to the place of law within a Reformed theology, in developing the positive side of his approach; and the failure to be sufficiently critical about the consequences of the politicization of economic life which would result from his proposals for restructuring the modern corporation. If the basic problem of western society is spiritual, then so must be the answer. Hence the demand for social justice must be accompanied by a concern for evangelism. The attempt to create more 'human' (Christian?) institutions in our society, without repentance and renewal, seem to me of very limited value. I believe that a more distinctive Christian contribution in the final section would have strengthened the book considerably.

City University, London

BRIAN GRIFFITHS

## **A CHRISTIAN PERSPECTIVE ON VIOLENCE**

Britain Today and Tomorrow No. 7 PAUL H. BALLARD

British Council of Churches 1980 100pp. £2.60 ISBN 0 85169 073 2

## **CHRIST AND VIOLENCE RONALD SIDER**

first published by Herald Press, USA 1979

Lion Publishing 1980 96pp. £1.25 ISBN 0 85648 254 4

Any study on violence must enable the reader to grapple with three problems:

- 1) what is violence?
- 2) how may it be theologically analysed?
- 3) what are the practical implications of such an analysis?

There is no question that, overall, Ballard offers a markedly better tool for dealing with these issues than does Sider. Ballard analyses in detail the types, origins and ideologies of violence, drawing significant distinctions between different forms of violence and subjecting each to critical discussion. Particularly important is his chapter on the place of violence in Fascism, Marxism, terrorism, and the Sartre/Fanon view that it constitutes a socially-necessary catharsis leading to liberation and transformation.

Unfortunately, Sider presents no comparable analysis, definitions or discussion. No awareness is shown of the origins, forms or ideological significance of violence. Sider has written not a study of the problem, but a tract to support his advocacy of 'activist non-violent identification with the oppressed.' (p. 89) He does not face the challenge of the liberation theologians who claim that the only effective means of identification with, and rescue of the oppressed is through violent overthrow of oppression.

It is this substitution of rhetorical jargon for considered analysis and conceptual clarity which bedevils Sider's book. Thus, despite a brief acknowledgment of the difference between force, coercion and violence in chapter two, this remains undeveloped so that his discussion of Romans 13 confuses personal vengeance with the state's execution of justice, and so distorts the exegesis.

Woolly thinking and political naïveté in the same chapter lead Sider to conclude that because economic boycotts are non-violent they are acceptable where war is not. But what if a boycott triggers off violent repression in the country under threat, or stimulates violent wars of liberation? Sadly, Sider does not offer any help, because he does not see the problem.

Sider's is a better book, however, in its treatment of biblical material. Despite the controversiality of his adoption of Yoder's interpretation of Jubilee, and his exegesis of NT passages, Sider's theological method gives far more weight to biblical material than does Ballard's, which is decidedly weak and sketchy in this respect. Neither author, though, explains the use of violent imagery by Jesus to characterize his ministry (Matt. 10:34), or the contention of the OT that God fulfills his purpose through violence (Isa. 34:6). Whilst both writers call on the prophets for evidence of Yahweh's concern for social justice, neither considers the violent imagery ascribed to the same Yahweh.

Stylistically, Ballard is slightly wordier but more intelligible, not least because he has defined his terms. He does not employ such terms as 'historicopolitical' (Sider, p. 56); neither does he append sloganized prayers (Sider, p. 91). More importantly, Ballard has a useful bibliography, whereas Sider has only sparse footnotes. Both books complement each other, but the reader will be helped through the problems of violence far more by Ballard than by Sider.

**ETHICS AT THE EDGE OF LIFE: Medical and Legal Intersections** PAUL RAMSEY

first published Yale University Press 1978 (hardcover)

Yale University Press 1980 353pp. hardcover £14.40 ISBN 0 300 02137 2  
paperback £4.40 ISBN 0 300 02141 0

This is an expansion and updating of the Bampton Lectures In America for 1975. The earlier half deals with 'The First of Life', being a microscopic examination of the legal rulings in the United States following the privatization of abortion decisions by the US Supreme Court in 1973. The later attempts of various states to circumscribe the practice of abortion by legislation are described, as are the Supreme Court rulings striking them down. It is idle to deny that the book is hard going. At times the writing is very repetitious. Ramsey suggests, for example, that a Californian law has something of the Jewish wisdom that no one who has any interest in the outcome should hasten the death of another, not even by praying for that person's death. On the very next page he makes exactly the same point. Sometimes the writing is so convoluted that this reviewer was uncertain, even after re-reading, whether a particular viewpoint was being condemned or commended. But it may be that this style is a contaminant from the subject.

Ramsey quotes the New Jersey state legislature passing a Bill to allow private hospitals to decline to offer abortion facilities. This was struck down by the NJ Supreme Court with the following astonishing reasoning. The fact that the state was competent to legislate about private hospitals turned them into state agencies. State hospitals are not permitted to deny abortion facilities: therefore state agencies must be in the same position; therefore the Bill 'No hospital is required . . .' results in 'The hospital is required . . .'

But perhaps we should be careful before throwing the first stone, for that discussion arose out of Ramsey's report on the destruction in NHS practice of the conscience clause in the British Abortion Act 1967. He adds the comment: 'So far as I know the Church of England has not protested.'

The second part of the volume discusses 'The Last of Life', including not only euthanasia but the benign neglect of defective infants and neonatal infanticide. For those with the tenacity to plod on there are some valuable insights here, and as we approach the euthanasia fight this section will need study. He distinguishes sharply and importantly between the dying patient (who needs only tender loving care) and the incurable patient who must be treated. He considers invalid the commonly made distinction between 'ordinary' and 'extra-ordinary' treatments. To his own surprise he finds 'Right to Die' legislation a useful bastion against euthanasia.

Paul Ramsey is one of the most renowned writers on medical ethics today, yet the doctor will find his reasoning sometimes unacceptable. On the neonatal problem—'Would it ever be right to displace poor prognosis infant A in order to provide intensive care to better prognosis infant B?'—he bitterly opposes anyone who would answer in the affirmative, sharply distinguishing this situation from triage in disaster-situations. Despite his pages of argument, he has no word of counsel for the obstetrician or paediatrician with two sick babes and one incubator. There is at least one Christian in obstetrical practice who considers that ethics has no validity unless it provides practical answers for those facing such dilemmas.

In Edwards and Steptoe's account ('A Matter of Life') of the first successful birth after extra-corporeal fertilization, Edwards comments on a public debate with Paul Ramsey. Following the latter's denunciation of their *in vitro* work, Edwards drew loud applause with his riposte, 'Dogma that has entered biology either from communist or Christian sources has done nothing but

harm.' Looking at photographs of baby Brown in the arms of her mother, we find it difficult to support Ramsey, or indeed other ethicists whose dogmatic pronouncements in the name of theology makes the witness and work of the Christian in medicine more difficult.

Sunderland

REX GARDNER

**THE CHURCH AND HOMOSEXUALITY: A Positive Answer to the Current Debate** MICHAEL GREEN, DAVID HOLLOWAY, DAVID WATSON

Hodder and Stoughton 1980 156pp. £1.25

ISBN 0 340 25483 1

As everyone knows, homosexuality is in the headlines. It is the 'in' fashion: but it has been in for a very, very, long time—since the days of Genesis, in fact. Why is it attracting so much notoriety at the moment? Although this book makes no attempt to answer the question (and indeed does not ask it outright), this factor is important to the understanding of the deeper issues involved.

It is partly to do with the sexual revolution which surrounds us. In the affluent West (or North) where basic external survival is not at the moment a social issue, we have time to contemplate and assess the quality of our inner life and relationships and ask questions about identity and personhood. From this arises the feminist liberation movement and other questions about sexual and personal fulfilment. The homosexual phase follows in expected sequence. If we abandon the scriptural principle of man created in the image of God, male and female, we get lost.

One of the more serious aspects of the current demand for homosexual equality is the threat it poses to the church and to society generally. Christian people, for this reason, need to acquaint themselves with the argument and the normality of the various manifestations of sexuality generally. The erotic excitement that both mother and baby often experience during breast feeding is appropriate to the situation but to be controlled, as is a father's interest in his adolescent daughter. Many people are aware of some degree of latent homosexuality in themselves (hence the fear of witnessing it in other people) but most are able to control it without undue difficulty. Erotic arousal is not *per se* a basis for overt sexual behaviour.

The most intractable problem for Christians in these arguments is the attitude to Scripture—its interpretation and its application to present culture. Each protagonist will present the case he feels to be right.

The Church of England's Board of Social Responsibility commissioned a working party to produce a report on homosexual relationships. The report, when it eventually arrived, was so tolerant to both sides of the case that Green/Holloway/Watson produced their work as 'a positive answer to the current debate'. (Rather a bold claim for such a complex issue!) It is mainly geared to the report, and tries to clarify some issues that were left in confusion.

Michael Green set off with a trenchant and uncompromising statement of scriptural teaching (which outraged the homosexual lobby). David Holloway, in a longer section, tried to think carefully about the cultural, ethical and political aspects, and David Watson concluded with a sensitive section on pastoral care and the call to holiness for everyone. I do not know that they add anything new to the debate, but they certainly spell out the main arena of argument. There is no mention of the artificiality of the 'gay' scene, which



## CHURCHMAN

most deeply homosexually orientated people abhor as an insult to their personhood.

Care & Counsel, London EC4

MYRA CHAVE-JONES

### THE IMITATION OF CHRIST THOMAS A KEMPIS

newly translated E. M. BLAIKLOCK

Hodder and Stoughton 1979 221pp. £1.50

ISBN 0 340 24701 0

All who love Thomas à Kempis's classic will welcome this new translation. Professor Blaiklock, emeritus professor of classics at the University of Auckland, New Zealand, has used his specialist knowledge of Latin to produce this wholly felicitous English version of the original text. It is clear that he has deep sympathy with Thomas's spirituality, though, as he indicates in his introduction, there are aspects of the work with which he is less than happy. What appeals to him most, as it surely ought to appeal to all evangelical Christians, is Thomas's devotion to Christ, expressed in all sorts of ways, not least in his passion for holiness. One does not have to be in full accord with everything the book contains in order to be challenged and uplifted by it. And certainly it has been a source of inspiration to countless Christians of all theological and ecclesiastical persuasions since it was written about the year 1418.

The work is divided into four books: 'Counsels Useful for Spiritual Living' (there are some gems here on the practical steps which must be taken in order to become more like Christ—the stress is certainly on discipline, but dependence on God is not ignored); 'Advice About the Inner Life' (with welcome emphasis upon the central importance of loving Jesus); 'On Consolation Within' (the longest of the books, containing a mixture of exhortation and reassurance); 'On the Sacrament of the Altar'. On this last book Professor Blaiklock gently comments: 'Thomas's view of Holy Communion, in the tradition of his church, was a little remote from mine.' Long ago, T. M. Lindsay in his *History of the Reformation* commented on this fourth book to the effect that it keeps alive the essential idea of evangelical religion, namely that God's grace is freely given and not merited by what man can do. This is so. Thomas is saved from works' righteousness here and elsewhere by his clear appreciation of his own unworthiness and of God's graciousness towards him.

This new translation, so beautifully done and so inexpensively priced, could well revive the devotional use of Thomas's great work.

Wheldrake Rectory, York

JOHN COCKERTON

### OUT OF THE DEPTHS HAVE I CRIED: Thoughts on the Incarnational Theology in the Eastern Christian Experience

PHILIP SALIBA and JOSEPH J. ALLEN

Holy Cross Orthodox Press, USA 1979 124pp. \$4.95 ISBN 0 916586 32 4

### GOD AND CHARITY: Images of Eastern Orthodox Theology, Spirituality and Practice THOMAS HOPKO et al.

Holy Cross Orthodox Press, USA 1979 103pp. \$3.95 ISBN 0 916586 34 0

These two books are complementary. They give a simple, overall picture of

Orthodox thinking and attitudes, and, as such, they will greatly assist the growing desire to understand Orthodox spirituality and theology. Also, they reflect the greater articulateness of Orthodox themselves in the West.

*Out of the Depths Have I Cried* is a series of meditations on incarnational theology. The writers see Christ as continuously living in the 'depths' of man, ever becoming incarnate through human lives and acts; their aim is to express the experience of this continual incarnation in both individual and corporate life; and their method is to attempt to reach down into the inner self, in order to reveal the pulsating life which is there. The general approach is simple and non-technical, giving the work an appeal to ordinary people rather than restricting it to the trained theologian. The illustrations are both attractive and relevant to the themes expressed.

*God and Charity*, on the other hand, is more overtly theological and even academic. Three of the six papers which comprise the book were delivered as public lectures at the John Carroll University, Cleveland, Ohio, and, of the six authors, five are Orthodox and one a Roman Catholic.

The first two papers, which occupy half the book, deal, the one, with the way an Orthodox theology of God is rooted in the spiritual life, being in no way 'propositional' in the way a western theology of God is; whilst the second is a careful, sympathetic and illuminating examination of the spirituality, life and thought of the Staretz Silouan (1866-1938), for forty-six years a monk of the Russian Monastery of S. Panteleimon on Mount Athos, a man who worked in the monastery flour mill, served in the kitchen and dining-room, and whom, only a few could see, was the treasure of the monastery. These two papers are followed by the one essay by a Roman Catholic—a survey of eastern influence on western hagiography. The fifth paper examines the question whether the Orthodox Church should engage in social and political action, coming to the conclusion that if the stress is only on spirituality and quietude, then the church is betraying the social ethos of its past. Two short, almost domestic papers conclude the book: one questions the future of an Eastern Rite Catholicism in the United States, expressing the hope that churches of this Rite should work towards their own eventual disappearance and reintegration into the great Patriarchates of the East—a hope which opens itself to the accusation of being partisan in the present ecumenical climate—while the final paper forms a brief comment on current relations between the Orthodox and the Roman Catholic Church.

These are useful short books, not to be despised for being short.

Ridge Vicarage, Potters Bar, Herts

JOHN SIMPSON

## **DISCIPLES AND PROPHETS: A Biblical Model for the Religious Life** FRANCIS J. MOLONEY SDB

*Darton, Longman and Todd* 1980 225pp. £7.95

ISBN 0 232 51463 1

Superficially, this book is a creative response to the crisis of identity and Scripture which has hit the Roman Catholic Orders over the past fifteen years in particular. The hidden agenda (relevant wherever one man's renewal is another's confusion) is the relationships between universal and particular (ministry/vocation), change and stability (personal/communal), and open or closed exegesis (fundamentalist/critical). The book as a whole feels more disparate than the author intended; but that does not detract too much from the acute and gentle examination of Scripture which is his prime purpose: 'The whole renewal process must look to the Word of God as its model and ideal if it is to be a renewal that follows God's ways.' (p. 161)

## CHURCHMAN

Matthew's story of the rich young ruler is simply a call to discipleship, not to a different 'higher perfection'. Poverty does not mean throwing everything away, but sharing everything together 'in Christ'. Chastity, as in the person of Jesus himself, is a positive response to 'the overwhelming presence of the Kingdom' (p. 113); marriage and celibacy alike proclaim our need of intimacy—human and divine. Obedience is essentially *imitatio Christi*, an aspect of the incarnational model. These traditional proof-texts of the 'Evangelical Counsels' (or 'Counsels of Perfection') can no longer honestly be the preserve of the Religious: their application is universal, and that much more challenging; their grounding more theological, and that much more truthful.

What, then, does constitute the specific identity of Religious in the Church? The answer is in the title: they are to be 1) disciples (*simpliciter*, as those who have been baptized); 2) prophets living a vowed, public, communal response to the call of the God who is Love. 'We will act as a thorn in the side of an over-confident, over-organised, over-institutionalised Church, as the quality of our free but obedient lives will keep posing the question—Just why were you instituted in the first place?' (p. 168) Surprisingly simple; but wonderfully evangelical! But perhaps a little too simple? Is there really a 'unique parallel' between Religious and the OT prophets (p. 138)? Is there not an essential ambiguity in Christian monasticism (Daniel Rees, *Consider Your Call*, p. 2)? All the same, it was refreshing to find a Catholic priest saying nothing in this context about priesthood. (But not so good to notice a dozen printing mistakes.)

Magdalene College, Cambridge

PHILIP SEDDON

## WORSHIP AS PASTORAL CARE WILLIAM H. WILLIMON

Abingdon, USA 1979

ISBN 0 687 4638 9 0

SPCK 1979 237pp. £5.95

It is hard to think of any other book covering precisely the same ground as Dr Willimon's (although we have the shorter *Grove* studies), and herein lies its value. The author's purpose is to show that worship and pastoral care are intrinsically related, and that there can be no justification for the planning and understanding of worship being low on the minister's own list of priorities.

More general chapters on both the aims and dynamics of worship are followed by chapters specifically on funerals, weddings, baptism and the Lord's Supper. There are some shrewd words on motivation, good and less good, behind worship, particularly the sacraments: 'We worship to imitate, on a small scale, ritualistically, what God does on a large scale, realistically.' (p. 59) The author reminds us how magic can, unwittingly, still determine the attitudes of some worshippers ('Any deviation from the detailed rubrics is thought to break the spell').

The chapter on baptism is particularly stimulating, and Dr Willimon takes a wholesome swipe at the man-centred view that baptism is simply a human action 'we perform in order to help us remember God's actions in the past.' (p. 150) His practical suggestions about the place renewal of baptismal vows could have, should be of value to those ministers confronted with newly converted Christians 'feeling the need' for rebaptism.

The book's limitations lie, first, in its American source, which make parts not altogether relevant to the English and Anglican scene. (I thought at first the author was an Episcopalian, but then opted for Lutheran and finally

Episcopal Methodist!) Second, the book's theological stance seems indeterminate, although there is a clear supernaturalism and a healthy emphasis on the grace of God throughout. The author's summary of the pre- and post-Reformation scene (pp. 32ff) seems too simplistic, and there is scant reference to preaching. This is perhaps not surprising in view of his statement that 'The common belief among many preachers that preaching changes people . . . persists despite ample psychological, sociological, and theological evidence to the contrary.' (p. 95)

Dr Willimon is somewhat self-consciously well-read (quotations range from Cyril of Jerusalem to Pius XII via Jonathan Edwards). Perhaps fewer quotations, and a rather tighter style, could have resulted in our having rather more succinctly Dr Wallimon's undoubtedly useful insights on a crucial but neglected subject.

Christ Church Vicarage, Beckenham

TONY BAKER

## **COMMENTARY ON THE NEW LECTIONARY**

Volume 2 (revised edition) JOHN GUNSTONE

*first published 1974*

*SPCK 1980 447pp. £4.50*

ISBN 0 281 03739 6

We have recently reviewed the first volume of this commentary, which covers the lectionary passages for Sundays from Advent to Easter. Now volume two completes the cycle by providing a commentary on the lections for both years one and two from Easter 1 to the Last Sunday after Pentecost, as well as the festivals in table 2 and a selection from the readings in tables 3 and 4 of the new lectionary.

Once again John Gunstone provides us with a brief commentary on each of the three lections appointed for each day. Within the compass of these pages there is obviously no scope for detailed exposition: rather it is the author's purpose to give us an introduction to the main themes of each passage. This is done by treating each passage on its own, and there is seldom any attempt to trace out through all the appointed lections the theme of each day. In some ways this is a pity. As we mentioned in reviewing the first volume, this work is likely to be of help to ministers preparing sermons for the parish communion or similar service, and it would be a help to see, for instance, how Colossians 3:1-11 might be handled with different emphasis on Easter 3 in year 2 from the way it would be taken with other passages on Easter Day.

Again, while it is good to see the table of festivals and a selection from the tables of readings for lesser festivals and holy days and for various occasions, as these come at the end the reader is referred on many occasions to the exposition given earlier in the commentary when the same reading is used for a Sunday, and in consequence there is no consideration of the relevance of the particular passage for its appointed day. Even when a commentary is provided, as for instance on St Mark or St Bartholomew, it does not explicitly show the reason why the lections are chosen for the day in question.

There are special notes, as in the earlier volume, on feasts such as the Ascension and Pentecost: while the view that Jesus may actually have ascended initially between the morning and evening appearances on Easter Day seems to be growing in popularity, this view is not necessarily required by John 20:17, as the writer suggests on p. 258. On p. 322 the heading should be Pentecost 10 and not 11.

Oak Hill College, London

DAVID H. WHEATON

**PAPAL LEGISLATION ON SACRED MUSIC  
95 AD TO 1977 AD ROBERT F. HAYBURN**

The Liturgical Press USA 1979 619pp. \$18.50

ISBN 0 8146 1012 9

Monsignor Hayburn has put us in his debt with this much needed anthology of papal pronouncements on the place of music in Roman Catholic worship. But it is more than a collection of documents. As the author explains, his purpose was 'to locate, translate, and place in historical context the documents of papal legislation on Church music.' (p. xi) He adds: 'It is hoped that others will analyze, compare, and synthesize this vast collection of data.' But Hayburn nevertheless does slip in his own analyses from time to time in this survey of 400 and more pieces of documentary evidence.

By any standards it was a mammoth undertaking, involving research on three continents. The important documents are quoted in full, and others are given at length as the author fills in the background and historical context of the principal sources, many of which have never appeared in English before.

The vast array of information will do much to eradicate misunderstandings and clarify misconceptions, as well as give a sense of perspective to developments and practices in other denominations. The English Reformers are sometimes charged with inventing the critical attitude towards over-elaborate church music, but Hayburn demonstrates that such hesitations had frequently been expressed by leading churchmen from about the twelfth century onwards. On the other hand, it is interesting to see the Tridentine Church echoing the views of the Reformers in speaking against 'the curtailment of liturgical texts, the unintelligibility of the sacred words, the insertion of non-churchly songs, and worldly and lengthy organ compositions.' (p. 25) The Anglican desire, first expressed in the 1549 Prayer Book, that there should be 'but one use' instead of 'great diversity in saying and singing' is repeated in many of these papal documents. For example, the *moto proprio* of Pius V, 17 December 1571, states: 'We had the desire, in order that there be one and the same manner of singing in the Church of God.' (p. 35; see also pp. 47, 109, etc.)

Sources from the pre-Trent period are understandably few and take up a mere twenty-three pages. The bulk of the work is concerned with papal legislation between Trent and the *moto proprio* of Pius X, 1903. Much of it concerns the procession of various official editions of Gregorian chant-books, in particular the Medicean, Ratisbon, Solesmes and Vatican editions. Hayburn does not hesitate to give the background, warts and all, to these successive publications: the prominence of one edition over another being determined not by factors of musical scholarship but by intrigue, deception, profit and honour on the part of the musicians and printers involved.

Non-Catholic observers have assumed that the Church of Rome has had a lax and over-tolerant attitude towards the styles and forms of music within the liturgy. Mozart's *Epistle Sonatas* and the overt theatrical and operatic church music of the nineteenth century are taken to be typical evidences. But Hayburn reveals that the official pronouncements of the Church of Rome were in fact critical of unrestrained instrumental and choral music. Time and again a more chaste music was demanded, but 'it is certain that many musicians paid little or no attention to them. This has often been the case since the advent of polyphonic music in the Church.' (p. 142)

The reforms of Vatican II are included—as well as later documents—as here Monsignor Hayburn seems to be at variance with himself. In the preface he asserts that the *moto proprio* of Pius X (1903) 'was the climax of all previous legislation on Church music, and it still remains the highlight of Church music law. The documents which follow it are explanations and augmen-

tations of the principles laid down by Pius X. They add little that is new, but rather set forth in greater detail and for current usage the liturgical and musical norms which he envisioned.' (p. xi) Yet when he comes to consider 'the far-reaching results of Vatican II's *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy*' he states: 'Never again in the Western Church will there be the uniformity of practice that prevailed until December 4, 1963, when important disciplines were fundamentally altered. The two prominent points which became the bases of these really radical interjections were the introduction of the vernacular languages into the liturgy and the mandate that the congregation must henceforth take an active part in worship.' (p. 407) The latter evaluation represents a correct assessment, but the former probably reflects the author's own preferences and ideals with regard to the place and function of music in worship.

There are a few blemishes in the way the book was produced, such as the occasional typographical error (usually confined to foreign phrases) and the rather confusing annotation in chapter five, which is given in three different places (pp. 107, 113, 114), and each time begins with note 1.

However, the work as a whole represents a welcome and valuable source of reference.

Latimer House, Oxford

ROBIN A. LEAVER

**A GUIDE TO BYZANTINE HYMNOGRAPHY:**  
**A Classified Bibliography of Texts and Studies Volume 2**  
**JOSEPH SZÖVÉRFY**  
**Medieval Classics: Texts and Studies 12**

*Classical Folia Editions, Brookline and Leiden*  
 (distributed E. J. Brill) 1979 313pp. Dfl 70

ISBN 062262

Joseph Szövérfy is an indefatigable scholar and classifier of early hymnodic literature. His major work on Latin hymnody has become a much-valued source of reference: *Die Annalen der Lateinischen Hymnen dichtung. Ein Handbuch*, 2 vols., Berlin: Schmidt, 1964, 1965. This was followed by *Iberian Hymnody: Survey and Problems* (Medieval Classics: Texts and Studies 1), 1971, and *Peter Abelard's Hymnarius Paraclitensis*, 2 vols. (Medieval Classics: Texts and Studies 2-3), 1975. Szövérfy has now turned his attention to Greek hymnody. The first volume appeared in 1978 and in the foreword the author described the work as an 'analytical guide to Byzantine hymnography'. That such a guide is necessary is self-evident when the extent and complex nature of Greek hymnody and its extensive literature are considered. Szövérfy informs us that he has collected more than 6,000 entries for this *Guide*, which will be completed by a third volume. The first volume covers the basic background and introductory literature, and the sources and literature of *Kontakia*. This second volume continues the detailed classification by listing texts and studies of *Kanons* and *Stichera*. Particularly valuable are the detailed references to the contents of the volumes of *Analecta Hymnica Graeca* (Rome, 1966ff.), for which, publication being still in progress, no indices are yet available.

With the growing interest in eastern orthodoxy, its liturgy and traditions, this *Guide* provides a welcome key to the whole area and its literature.

Latimer House, Oxford

ROBIN A. LEAVER

## A PANORAMA OF CHRISTIAN HYMNODY

ERIK ROUTLEY

*The Liturgical Press USA 1980 259pp. \$29.50*

ISBN 0 8146 1014 5

## AN ENGLISH-SPEAKING HYMNAL GUIDE

ERIK ROUTLEY

*The Liturgical Press USA 1980 125pp. \$29.50*

ISBN 0 8146 1015 3

The steady output of hymnological studies continues to flow unabated from the pen of Erik Routley. These latest volumes in the long stream of titles, although they are each self-contained in content, are complementary to each other. They are part of a trilogy which Dr Routley plans to complete with a revised and expanded version of *The Music of Christian Hymnody*, which was published in 1957.

*A Panorama of Christian Hymnody* is an anthology of 592 hymn-texts arranged in twenty-eight largely chronological sections which are preceded by brief introductory essays. The editor's purpose is to demonstrate the breadth and scope of English hymnody by giving examples of most of the major types and periods of hymns commonly sung in English. He has resisted the temptation to include only those texts he prefers and approves of. Dr Routley explains: 'A panorama will include some disagreeable sights, the world being what it is' (p. vi). So here is presented a selection of representative hymns, mostly in their original forms and usually with many more verses than generally appear in most hymn-books. However, there are occasions when the original version is deliberately avoided. One example is Cowper's *There is a fountain filled with blood* [No. 9]. Routley prefers the modification of the first verse by Nathaniel Micklem as it 'reflects the original Scripture [Zech. 13.1] more faithfully' (p. 38):

There springs a fountain, where for sin  
Immanuel was slain;  
and sinners who are washed therein  
are cleansed from every stain.

Another feature of the anthology is that the biblical texts which the original authors placed by the verses and lines of their hymns are faithfully reproduced here. All in all, this collection of texts is such a valuable resource and work of reference that one wonders why such a thing has not appeared before. But I wish I could speak with equal enthusiasm about the introductory essays to the various sections. This is something that Erik Routley has done before and has done well; for example, the brief historical survey that appears in *Hymns for Church and School* (London 1964). But there are signs here that these essays were hurriedly put together. For example, the first section on Luther and Nicolai contains a number of errors and misleading generalizations. On page 1, Routley refers to Vol. 53 of the *Augsburg* edition of Luther's works. This is a fiction. It is the *American* edition, published in Philadelphia and St Louis. On the same page he makes the statement that 'there is not much text-writing in the Lutheran church for a generation after Luther's death.' But the evidence does not support the statement: the fourth volume of Philipp Wackernagel's *Das Deutsche Kirchenlied von der ältesten Zeit bis zu Anfang des XVII Jahrhunderts*, Leipzig 1874, contains almost 1,600 texts written between 1554-1584, and most are by Lutherans.

The text is occasionally enlightened by the illusive typographical error such as the one in No. 434 which makes a line in Percy Dearmer's version of Bunyan's pilgrim hymn read: 'No fees shall stay his might'.

*An English-Speaking Hymnal Guide* is an exceedingly useful piece of work. The title is perhaps a little misleading. The book does not discuss

hymnals as such, but the hymns that are to be found in many modern collections. Dr Routley has taken twelve hymn-books, together with their supplements, published in America and Canada, and twelve British books, again with their supplements. He has collated their contents and arrived at a list of 888 hymns commonly sung in the English-speaking world. The hymns are listed alphabetically and basic information about each one is assembled under each first-line. Here is given the metrical form of the text, a cross-reference, where appropriate, to *A Panorama of Christian Hymnody*, the source of the first appearance, details of subsequent modifications and peculiarities, a note of which of the twenty-four basic hymn-books contain the text, and a brief account of the author's life and work. Some of the material is available in Julian's *Dictionary of Hymnology*, London 1907, and the many companions to specific hymn books, e.g. *The Companion to Congregational Praise*, London 1953. But such works are of little use when questions regarding the many hymns that have been published since the early 1960s are raised. Thus Erik Routley's book fills an important vacuum. Indeed, the value of these two books is that they present a wealth of information that is either not available elsewhere or is only accessible in many different volumes. Notwithstanding their relatively minor shortcomings, these two volumes are indispensable guides to the hymnody found in contemporary hymn-books.

Latimer House, Oxford

ROBIN A. LEAVER

### **SING WITH UNDERSTANDING: An Introduction to Christian Hymnology**

HARRY ESKEW and HUGH T. McELRATH

Broadman Press, USA 1980 331pp. \$12.95

ISBN 0 8054 6809 9

There is a common attitude that asserts that no study or specific knowledge is required for an intelligent use of hymnody in worship: all you have to do is choose the hymns you know and like, and that is all there is to it. Well, it may be for some, but their organists often have to struggle with questions of metre, tune, suitability, mood, pitch, and so on; matters on which the hymn-chooser is blissfully unaware.

The teaching of basic hymnology ought to form an important part of the curriculum of worship in our theological colleges, and this volume by Eskew and McElrath could well become the basic textbook. Although the authors are Southern Baptists, any thought that their coverage of the subject might be somewhat narrow and partisan is quickly dispelled when one encounters the breadth and thoroughness of their book. There are three major sections. The first is 'The Hymn in Perspective', which deals with the poetical, musical, scriptural and theological aspects of hymnody and includes discussions of metre, rhyming patterns, melody, harmony, rhythm, text-tune marriages, etc. The second section, 'The Hymn in History and Culture', is a brief overview, in about 120 pages, of the various historical strands of hymnody. It could be argued that the overview is all too brief, but in an introductory volume such as this all that is required is a marking out of the principal milestones, together with references to sources where the various topics are treated at greater length and depth. This is exactly what the authors have done here. The final section, 'The Hymn in Practice', concentrates on the practical functions of hymnody in proclamation, worship, education and ministry. The authors have a knack of producing challenging statements which have practical implications. For example (p. 221): 'Hymns are never to



be regarded as "musical breaks" for physical relaxation, nor to relieve boredom nor to cover up awkward pauses, nor to function as travelling music for the ministers as they move from one part of the sanctuary to another.'

The bibliography is excellent, a packed source of information running to nearly thirty pages which far exceeds that given, for example, in the recently published *American Hymns Old and New*, edited by A. Christ-Janer, C. W. Hughes, C. S. Smith, 2 vols., Columbia University Press, New York 1980.

The main drawback from an English point of view is the very obvious American perspective. The hymn-books chosen as sources (*The Methodist Hymnal*, 1964; *Baptist Hymnal*, 1975; *Ecumenical Praise*, 1977; *Lutheran Book of Worship*, 1978) are not easily accessible here and the individual hymns referred to strongly reflect American rather than English usage. The need is for a similar book to be written along the same lines but with a clearly English perspective. But until it is written this book, if students are given the opportunity to study it, will do much to foster a thinking approach to the use of hymns in worship—especially when it contains passages such as this: 'Scripture is the basic raw material from which hymns are produced. A hymn cannot be useful unless and until it relates closely to the revealed truth about God and his mighty acts as written in the Scriptures. Therefore the effectiveness of any hymn is measurable in a large part by the extent to which it functions as a vehicle for scriptural truth.'

Latimer House, Oxford

ROBIN A. LEAVER

## CHURCH MUSIC AND THE CHRISTIAN FAITH ERIK ROUTLEY

first published by SCM Press 1959; *Agape*, USA 1978

Collins Liturgical Publications 1980 156pp. £4.00 ISBN 0 00 599650 3

This is not exactly a new book from Erik Routley, but a revision of an earlier work which has been issued in a number of different forms before. It was first published by SCM Press in 1959 under the title *Church Music and Theology*. It was reissued, in an unaltered reprint but with a new preface, under the same title by Waltham Forest Books in 1964. In 1978 *Agape*, Carol Stream, Illinois, issued a revised version, with a foreword by Martin E. Marty, which is here reprinted by Collins Liturgical Publications but without Marty's introductory essay. So, in a sense, the book can be considered as the fourth edition of the earlier work.

Of the fourteen chapters, three are completely new (chs 1, 7 & 14); three remain in much the same form as the original edition but have additional paragraphs (chs 3, 4 & 8); and the remainder are more extensively rewritten and revised. Parts of the text of the first edition have either been deleted, reduced or replaced, and some of the original, longer, footnotes have disappeared. Therefore the reader should heed the author's advice 'to forget the old one and, so far as possible, to enjoy this one . . . [for] not a page has gone unaltered.' The claim is substantially correct, although there are large sections which remain virtually unchanged, and the book would have been improved further if the revision had been more extensive. Just to give an example, the section *Bach and Pietism* (pp. 54ff.) is historically and factually inaccurate: Bach was no pietist, though a man of deep piety, and his cantatas have the note of resurrection-joy more often than Routley assumes.

Nevertheless, it is a book that needs to be read and studied, for such books are rare in English. Most books deal either with the history or the practice of

church music, but this book is more concerned with the nature and function of music in worship. In particular, it explores the important question: What are the criteria by which we may discover what is good music and what is bad music for Christians gathered together for worship? Many would say that it is a question that does not matter very much. They ought to read this offering from Erik Routley, who writes in his usual fluid, pleasing and well-seasoned style, to see that it is a fundamental question with far-reaching theological implications.

Latimer House, Oxford

ROBIN A. LEAVER



**a quarterly magazine for members of synods  
and PCCs, and *all* leaders in the local church**

■ informative   ■ practical   ■ topical

contains a wide range of material for individual  
and group study

why not order a number of copies for *your* PCC?

---

*for further details write to*  
CHURCH SOCIETY  
WHITEFIELD HOUSE  
186 KENNINGTON PARK ROAD  
LONDON SE11 4BT    tel: 01-582 0132

## OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

- Allen and Unwin** *The Inward Odyssey*, E. B. Schnapper, £8.95, 1980
- Banner of Truth** *The Unsearchable Riches of Christ*, D. M. Lloyd-Jones, £4.00, 1979
- Christian Focus Publications** *Mary*, C. Mackenzie, 70p, 1980; *Gideon*, C. Mackenzie, 70p, 1980
- T. and T. Clark** *Great Themes of the New Testament*, W. Barclay, £2.50, 1979; *By the Waters of Babylon*, J. D. Newsome, £3.50, 1980
- Collins Fount** *Square Words in a Round World*, E. W. Kemp, 95p, 1980
- Croom Helm** *Labouring Children*, J. Parr, £11.95, 1980
- Darton, Longman and Todd** *Multiple Echo*, C. Ernst, £8.95, 1979; *Spiritual Man in a New Age*, P. Spink, £1.65, 1980; *Enfolded in Love*, daily readings with Julian of Norwich, £1.50, 1980; *Religious Faith and Twentieth Century Man*, F. C. Happold, £3.75, 1980
- Epworth Press** *Troubled Waters*, N. Dixon, £3.00, 1979; *Our Tradition of Faith*, M. J. Townsend, £2.50, 1980
- Eyre and Spottiswoode** *You can Understand the Bible by its Unifying Themes*, N. B. Baker, £1.95, 1980
- Geoffrey Chapman** *O Holy Mountain*, M. B. Pennington, £7.50, 1979; *The Church of Scotland: an economic survey*, J. M. Wolfe & M. Pickford, £9.95, 1980
- Handsel Press** *Ministers for the 1980s*, J. Stein (ed.), £2.75, 1979
- Harrison Trust** *After the Fire*, D. N. Samuel, 40p, 1980
- Hodder and Stoughton** *New Spring in China?*, L. T. Lyall, £1.40, 1979; *But this I can Believe*, D. Winter, £1.25, 1980; *Can my Church Grow?*, M. Goldsmith, £1.25, 1980; *Crime and the Responsible Community*, C. Colson, N. Anderson, D. McNee et al., £4.50, 1980; *C. S. Lewis on Scripture*, M. J. Christensen, £1.25, 1980; *Hymns that Live*, F. Colquhoun, £2.25, 1980; *Three of China's Mighty Men*, L. T. Lyall, £1.40, 1980
- IVP** *Evangelism—Now and Then*, M. Green, £1.25, 1979; *Christian Meditation*, E. P. Clowney, 60p, 1980; *Shaking the Sleeping Beauty*, M. Griffiths, £1.75, 1980
- Latimer House** *Nationhood*, O. R. Johnston, £1.00, 1980
- Longman** *Religious Thought in the Victorian Age*, B. M. G. Reardon, £6.50, 1980
- Mowbrays** *Confirmation Cook Book*, D. Manship et al., £1.50, 1980
- Norfolk Press** *Labour of Love*, P. Marshall et al., £2.25, 1980
- OUP** *Living the Faith*, K. Jones (ed.), hardcover £5.95, paperback £2.50, 1980; *Doubt and Religious Commitment*, M. J. Ferreira, £9.50, 1980
- Paternoster Press** *Biblical Ethics*, R. E. O. White, £4.80, 1979; *The Bible and the Future*, A. A. Hoekema, £8.00, 1979; *Pornography*, J. H. Court, £1.50, 1980
- Fleming H. Revell** *Songs of Heaven*, R. E. Coleman, \$6.95, 1980

## *Other Books Received*

**Saint Andrew Press** *What Next?*, G. A. F. Knight, £2.75, 1980; *The Expendable Mary Slessor*, J. Buchan, hardcover £5.95, paperback £3.75, 1980; *Knowing Man*, R. Morton, £2.50, 1980

**Sheldon Press** *True Prayer*, K. Leech, £3.95, 1980

**SPCK** *The Moral Teaching of Paul*, V. P. Furnish, £3.95, 1979; *The Contagious Congregation*, G. G. Hunter, £3.25, 1979; *Churchyards*, P. Burgess, 75p, 1980; *A Hundred Years in Bengal*, Two Brethren of the Epiphany, £3.95, 1980

**Summerfield Press** *Canterbury Cathedral*, J. Keats, A. Hornak, hardcover £6.95, paperback £2.95, 1980

**H. E. Walter** *God in Control*, R. Gurney, £7.75, 1980

**Wedge Publishing Foundation** *Balaam's Apocalyptic Prophecies*, C. G. Seerveld, Ca\$3.95, 1980

**Yale University Press** *George Berkeley in America*, E. S. Gaustad, £9.45, 1979; *Introduction to the Code of Maimonides*, I. Twersky, £25.20, 1980

## INDEX OF REVIEWS

AHARONI, <i>The Land of the Bible</i> , (J. E. Goldingay)	61
BAKER (ed.), <i>The Works of John Wesley</i> , Vol. 25, (J. Pollock)	72
BALLARD, <i>A Christian Perspective on Violence</i> , (F. Bridger)	81
BILL, <i>The Queen Anne Churches</i> , (K. White)	75
BLAIKLOCK (trs.), THOMAS A KEMPIS, <i>The Imitation of Christ</i> , (J. Cockerton)	84
BROMILEY, <i>Children of Promise</i> , (M. C. Bell)	68
CAMPBELL, ROGERS, <i>Mississippi</i> , (J. D. Douglas)	73
ESKEW, McELRATH, <i>Sing with Understanding</i> (R. A. Leaver)	91
GOUDZWAARD, <i>Capitalism and Progress</i> , (B. Griffiths)	80
GREEN, HOLLOWAY, WATSON, <i>The Church and Homosexuality</i> , (M. Chave-Jones)	83
GUNDRY, <i>A Survey of the New Testament</i> , (S. Motyer)	64
GUNSTONE, <i>Commentary on the New Lectionary</i> , Vol. 2, (D. H. Wheaton)	87
HAYBURN, <i>Papal Legislation on Sacred Music 95 AD to 1977 AD</i> , (R. A. Leaver)	88
HOEKSTRA, <i>Evangelism in Eclipse</i> , (J. A. Kirk)	74
HOPKO et al., <i>God and Charity</i> , (J. Simpson)	84
HUNTER, <i>The Fifth Evangelist</i> , (F. F. Bruce)	65
KIRK, <i>Liberation Theology</i> , (G. Dow)	69
LUCAS, <i>Fullness and Freedom</i> , (D. H. Wheaton)	66
MCDONALD, <i>Kerygma and Didache</i> , (S. S. Smalley)	64
METZ, <i>Faith in History and Society</i> , (G.J.C. Marchant)	67
MILSON, <i>Political Education</i> , (J. Ellis)	79
MITCHELL, <i>Morality, Religious and Secular</i> , (P. Helm)	77
MOLONEY, <i>Disciples and Prophets</i> , (P. Seddon)	85
MORGAN (ed.), <i>Understanding Religion and Culture</i> , (D. Davies)	76
OTZEN, GOTTLIEB, JEPPESEN, <i>Myths in the Old Testament</i> , (G. Wenham)	62
RAHNER, THÜSING, <i>A New Christology</i> , (G. J. C. Marchant)	67
RAMSEY, <i>Ethics at the Edge of Life</i> , (R. Gardner)	82
RANDALL, <i>Church Furnishing and Decoration in England and Wales</i> , (K. White)	76
REUTER, <i>The Greatest Englishman</i> , (A. Rogers)	71
ROSE, <i>Elizabeth Fry</i> , (J. Pollock)	73
ROUTLEY, <i>A Panorama of Christian Hymnody</i> , (R. A. Leaver)	90
<i>An English-Speaking Hymnal Guide</i> , (R. A. Leaver)	90
<i>Church Music and the Christian Faith</i> (R. A. Leaver)	92
SALIBA, ALLEN, <i>Out of the Depths Have I Cried</i> , (J. Simpson)	84
SIDER, <i>Christ and Violence</i> , (F. Bridger)	81
SLADDEN, <i>Boniface of Devon</i> , (A. Rogers)	71
SMYTH, <i>Paul</i> , (A. T. Lincoln)	70
STOTT, <i>God's New Society</i> , (D. H. Wheaton)	65
SZÖVERFFY, <i>A Guide to Byzantine Hymnography</i> , (R. A. Leaver)	89
TORRANCE (ed.), <i>Belief in Science and in Christian Life</i> , (H. Silvester)	77
WALTER, <i>A Long Way from Home</i> , (J. Gladwin)	78
WALTON (ed.), <i>A Basic Introduction to the Old Testament</i> , (G. Hylson-Smith)	63
<i>A Basic Introduction to the New Testament</i> , (G. Hylson-Smith)	63
WESTERMANN, <i>What does the Old Testament say about God?</i> , (E. Ball)	61
WILLIMON, <i>Worship as Pastoral Care</i> , (A. Baker)	86