

# Theology on the Web.org.uk

*Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible*

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

---

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

[https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles\\_churchman\\_os.php](https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php)

# Book Reviews

## THE THEOLOGY OF KARL RAHNER

G. J. C. MARCHANT reviews

### FOUNDATIONS OF CHRISTIAN FAITH:

An Introduction to the Idea of Christianity

KARL RAHNER translated W. V. DYCH

first published in Germany 1976

Darton, Longman and Todd 1978 470pp £14.00

ISBN 0 232 51406 2

The titles to this latest of Rahner publications are intended to point to its general plan and purpose. It is designed for readers of some education who are prepared to 'wrestle with an idea'; to grapple with a presentation of an argument that is conducted above the level of the catechism, but does not attempt to deal with the complex of questions arising from the various philosophical, theological and historical disciplines that would have to be taken into account in a more thorough treatment for specialists. Rahner calls it 'a first level of reflection' which attempts to 'situate Christianity within the intellectual horizon of people today'; in which, within its accepted limitations, it gives an intellectually honest justification of Christian faith. Of 'Christian faith', not so much *the* Christian faith; that is to say, for Christian believing, as well as what is believed. The two will, of course, be seen to interrelate one with another.

The book, we are told, is the result of courses of lectures on the main theme given while Rahner was professor in Munich and in Munster, and it is also apparent that topics from previous writings, notably the *Theological Investigations*, have been to some extent incorporated into this work. Most of Rahner's writing has been in the form of fairly short compositions. Here, in a work of nearly 500 pages, he has brought together the main thrust of his teaching over forty years, and has presented what it means for him to believe as a Christian, as a Roman Catholic, and as an honest thinker and teacher. He enlists our sympathy in attempting this in the compass of a book of this size, in which, as he readily admits, some matters have been dealt with more briefly than some might find acceptable. He also draws attention to the almost entire absence of Scriptural reference, although this does not imply that he has not given attention to exegesis and biblical theology. But he also warns us not to look on this book as a final summary of all his previous work.

### Rahner's approach

A glance at the Contents will immediately alert the reader to Rahner's special theological approach, indeed the specific theological method he has made his own. The first four parts are entitled 'I: The Hearer of the Message', 'II: Man in the Presence of Absolute Mystery', 'III: Man as a Being Threatened Radically by Guilt', and 'IV: Man as the Event of God's Free and Forgiving Self-Communication'. These, with 'V: The History of Salvation and Revelation', in fact form one section, which is basic to the thinking of the whole work and which takes up more than a third of it. Its point of departure in Man is the important indicator to Rahner's method, which we will examine later. The next actual section of the book is 'VI: Jesus Christ', which takes up almost

another third of the book. This is followed by three parts: 'VII: Christianity as Church', 'VIII: Remarks on the Christian Life', and finally 'IX: Eschatology'. There is an epilogue in which Rahner explores possibilities of expressing his basic theological approach in types of 'modern creeds' which might suit different areas of the church—mainly in parts of the western world—and a more extended and detailed 'Contents' ends the book.

It is noteworthy that the title of the first part—'The Hearer of the Message'—is so very close to his book published in 1941. *Hearers of the Word* embodied fifteen lectures given to the Salzburg summer school in 1937, and expounded Rahner's philosophy of religion, which still remains very much the same. But although given when Rahner was living in Innsbruck, the thinking reflects his experience in Freiburg when he was studying for his doctor's degree, and where he sat under Heidegger, then rector of the university. At that time he had been deeply involved in the study of Thomas Aquinas; especially in terms of controversial struggle with the philosophy of Kant, to whom nineteenth-century German philosophy continued to relate, as Hegelians or otherwise. But in the thinking of Heidegger, Rahner met one who had been a student in a Jesuit seminary and had been himself a student of Aquinas, but had shifted towards a non-religious stance and been influenced by a previous notability at Freiburg, Edmund Husserl. From Husserl, Heidegger derived the phenomenological method, exploring the significance of human experience, which he adapted to his own work, especially in *Sein und Zeit* (1927) [*Being and Time* (1962)].

All this lies behind Rahner's own basic approach; indeed, some have recognized in *Hearers of the Word* a Thomistic dialogue with Heidegger, from whom he had learnt that approach, but which, in terms faithful to Thomist thinking, he adapted in his own way. The approach taken by him is no doubt referred to when he mentions at the very beginning of this book his intention to 'situate Christianity within the intellectual horizon of people today.' He is rightly aware of intellectual movements in philosophy, in literature—strengthened by sociological and psychological insights—and in theological thinking, that look for meaning by penetrating the significance of the human situation. Nevertheless, it would be a mistake to label this as an attempt to provide a philosophy, or a kind of natural basis, on which to mount a theology. A true Thomist would recognize that the rational and intellectual structure of fundamental theology—that which explores the nature of the divine—is, as with Anselm earlier, Christian *fides quaerens intellectum*: faith seeking understanding. Thus, Rahner warns at the outset: 'We are presupposing here the existence of our own personal Christian faith' which, however, demands effort, sometimes tedious and always patient, in order to understand. But in so doing he strikes out a line in contemporary thinking within an intellectual tradition that includes not just Augustine and Aquinas, but Luther, Kierkegaard and other Christian thinkers.

These and the more recent influences lead to a different exploration of existence than that which occupied St Thomas: not so much the existence of the whole, but the significance of the human subject's consciousness, his capacity for self-transcendence, the phenomenology of man's reach to further horizons when in freedom he responds dynamically to his historical situations. This is not just an intellectual exercise. With a kind of borrowing from the views of Duns Scotus, it is also a total personal response which must involve love in some way.

Rahner's thought here has been given the titles of 'philosophical anthropology', 'transcendental anthropology', and 'ontological anthropology'. The anthropological emphasis reflects the existential influence of Heidegger; but while this opens up insights into dimensions of human existence in actual earthly conditions of history, so some of the questions it raises invite inter-

pretation from the Christian understanding of God, of the mystery of transcendent being which is his, and from insights into the meaning of divine grace which holds humanity in the very condition from which all such exploration is meaningful. Heidegger never got as far as this. Rahner takes up this path, not only because he wishes to speak in the terms of many thoughtful people today, but because he is acutely aware that the older scholastic theology no longer can find a hearing in the present and developing situation; and also because he sees theology as only able to be 'genuinely preached to the extent that it succeeds in establishing contact with the total secular self-understanding which man has in a particular epoch.'

### **Basic Problems**

The Introduction, which makes preparatory clarifications to this approach, has some pages on 'Some Basic Epistemological Problems' which are also involved. Rahner draws attention to the basic unity in human existence between non-conceptual self-awareness and our knowing anything. In knowing objective reality of any kind there is also—'behind the back of the knower'—a non-conceptual subjective consciousness. If the knower turns his reflection on this consciousness, as well as on the object of his thought, the same kind of non-conceptual awareness behind this cognitive activity is again present. It is this non-conceptual subjectivity of men in their various knowings, cognitive or emotional, which is the total self that determines what range of capacity is there. It also forms a kind of vast hinterland of subjective possibility 'behind' the actually recognized or conscious experiences. Thus it knows or recognizes limits and finitude, but in so doing shows itself as transcending those limits, in an openness to 'being as such' which cannot be denied (conceptually) without at the same time affirming it non-conceptually.

All awareness of limitation and conditioning is in itself a transcending of this awareness; and this raises the question about the source and destiny of such a subject in its knowledge and freedom. Rahner indicates here that this will lead to a similar non-conceptual awareness that is actually an awareness of God, not as an object, but as a dimension of this transcendence. This he explores further in the following chapters, but meanwhile calls attention to the self-evident nature of this structure of human subjectivity. It goes deeper into ultimate mystery, which is glimpsed when one looks beyond concrete knowledge and experience, along the line of our self-transcendence, to that openness to horizons that recede into mystery which is also holy. Rahner here awakens echoes of Otto's 'Idea of the Holy', Tillich's 'ground of our being', or Tennyson's poem 'The Higher Pantheism'.

### **The structure of human experience**

The first four parts or chapters work out this thesis in detail. At the very beginning of 'The Hearer of the Message' Rahner poses the question in terms of 'existential ontology'; the theoretical structuring of human experience; what it must mean for men to be able to hear the ultimate message of Christianity. Reformed theologians like Barth and Bultmann have stressed the recreative power of grace in the proclamation of the Word of the gospel, enabling men to respond. But this leaves us still with man in his response or non-response; either with a selectivity of grace, or with a kind of autonomy of man, or with some kind of universalistic view of prevailing grace. Heidegger had pointed to a view of conscience: that, in man, which calls him out of his fallen conformity to the inauthentic tangle of worldly relations that reduce the individual to a meaningless existence, and which makes it possible for him to affirm a genuine authentic human being. One cannot go further into this particular aspect of Heidegger, with all its problems, but Rahner, in an

oblique fashion, and with Thomist correction, explores within man a kind of *capax infiniti*, a transcendence that is open to further horizons in a non-explicit fashion, and which the Christian message by its call both presupposes and creates into an understanding response. Such a self-transcending capacity is not a separable 'soul' or 'spirit', over against the reductionist account of man that is sometimes based on the empirical sciences. Rather it is the apprehension of the total person and subject. Indeed, Rahner urges that it involves a 'pre-apprehension' of an infinite horizon of 'something' rather than 'nothing' (here, against Heidegger); as a *hope*, even in the experience of emptiness and inner breakdown. But the very reference, unreflective as it may be by the personal subject, towards the 'something' of the further horizon, is not a creation of its own, but rather an awareness of approach, the receiving of a manifestation of being, which enables man in his own finitude to experience this freedom as a 'grace'.

All this lies in the background, even behind and greater than any metaphysical conceptualization, and at most apprehends in a tangential fashion the infinite reality, only partially objectivized in thinking. Nevertheless, it is this that makes man responsible for himself and in that sense free; free in a way that the views of anthropology, sociology and psychology cannot touch. It is interesting to note here a parallel view by Professor Donald Mackay (*Christianity in a Mechanistic Universe*, IVP 1965) towards the end of a discussion on 'Man as a Mechanism', when he says:

Current descriptions or predictions of any man's brain, if they go into sufficient detail, can in the end be said to be valid only from the partial viewpoint of the observer. In the very strongest sense they are invalid for the agent, and hence have no exclusive claim to be the 'real truth' about his situation . . . He would be right to believe that he has a decision to make, that it will not be made unless he makes it, and that he will be responsible for the way it is made . . . It depends, not on a physical gap in the chain of cause and effect observable in his brain, but on the logical impossibility of deducing from such physical evidence a detailed prediction of its present and future states that he can accept as 'certain'.

### The concept of God

From this point, Rahner develops the anthropological thesis to meet the theological one in observing that the transcendental openness to 'something' which is a non-reflective apprehension of a far horizon, a mystery, is to be allowed to enter consciousness and to be reflected upon in terms summed up by the name 'God'. Rahner devotes some care to pointing out that, in itself, the word 'God' denotes nothing specific, and this is appropriate to the term for denoting the ineffable One who cannot be named as one of a type; as self-existent the term 'God' can have no comparison and therefore no other reference. Yet without God as his transcendent reference, man would be lost in the manifold data of empirical existence and cease to be what he is. Although man's transcendental openness orientates him Godward, Rahner carefully preserves himself from the kind of ontologism that affirms a mystical, unitive and direct intuition of God, in a kind of knowledge born of sense experience. The discussion traces out with care what is implied by the 'original', non-reflective, fundamental orientation towards the transcendent mystery of the divine, as this is stimulated through living experiences in life and with other people; and the conceptual kind of knowledge, which in seeking objective understanding is a much more limited matter. Rahner is not much interested in Catholic 'schools' theology and its idea of 'natural theology'; in fact he is providing a variant approach. The so-called 'proofs' of God's existence are themselves attempts to rationalize the transcendent, non-reflective apprehension. God is to be known as the holy mystery in himself; known as

'personal' because the analogy of the personal, which is part of our own self-understanding, has a genuine meaning because we ourselves exist in the ground of our own being which is this holy mystery. As such a ground, God is absolutely different from us: we have the unique relation as creatures, in contingency and dependence; responsible, yet entirely at his disposal.

It is in the world of things, of people, of our history, that our personhood—as grounded and related to God—is realized. Rahner, in true existentialist fashion, emphasizes this in a long section. Although the whole existence has its ground in God, God does not appear within it as absolutely differentiated from it. We do not have to 'make room' for him, but there are oblique forms whereby he is mediated. Before proceeding on that consideration, the existential situation of sin and guilt in man form a prior issue; certainly because Christianity makes it a central topic; and also (although Rahner does not say so) because it forms a dominant problem in the modern intellectual world among existentialist authors, and such a philosopher as Heidegger. Rahner notes, however, that people are not much bothered about salvation. But he explores the possibilities of men in their personal responsibility making responses of 'yes' and 'no' to God, both in their non-reflective orientation and in the actualities of intentional living. Even if, in saying 'no' to God, one is in fact affirming the reality of God so rejected, it can be possible for this to be a final 'no' and must be faced in all seriousness. It can also be that in the manipulative forces of our actual life, certain necessities work upon men to impose negative attitudes; but nobody can take refuge there. Indeed Rahner understands the significance of original sin as the total universal condition—a social solidarity in which even the best aims enter, in practice, into this conditioning whole; and which has a different sense of 'sin' than what is meant by personal sin as a free possibility. It also determines our history by guilt, but the effect of this is that God's approach to man is in the historical terms of Jesus Christ. And, says Rahner, it is only in the experience of forgiveness that a man can be aware of what that guilt is which has to be forgiven. It is, therefore, in terms of historical, understanding experience that we know salvation.

### **God's presence as salvation**

Salvation is seen as God's self-communication in grace, and Rahner develops this in penetrating detail, which cannot be summarized here but which follows the approach already described, interpreting the human existential in theological terms. It refers to God's presence, not only as ultimate mystery but as closeness in grace, so that an accepting response is itself an event of grace. It is of course the divine prerogative to give himself in this way, and is the action of his sovereign love. Rahner takes this to refer to 'absolutely all men' as a fundamental condition of their existence, at least as an offer which is real and inescapable. Response to that offer is itself borne by God himself in his self-communication, which itself cannot at this level be distinguished in experience from the structures of human transcendence. It is this contention that enables Rahner to posit the existence of the 'anonymous Christian' who responds in a way that may not be explicitly religious. But salvation is neither an inner mysticism nor a timeless philosophy; in the Christian gospel it is given historical form, the terms of revelation in the actual experience of men. Rahner points to the problem of why such a historic revelation is necessary, given what has been already said of God's general self-communication to all men. His answer is already provided by existential approaches: man's self-transcendence is necessarily mediated through historical conditions and it enables experience and reflection about itself to come about thereby. Indeed, the divine existential already considered has a history of revelation and salva-

tion. In one way, because the divine existential is related to all men, then world history is this history, including what is often known as 'natural revelation'. The OT is seen as being aware of this, and there is also the suggestion that in the NT reference is made to faith other than through the Gospel witnesses. Within all this, the special revelation recorded in Holy Scripture is the full realization of what is more generally given; but it is also important to see this as having similar elements in other religions too. Only in the person of Jesus Christ have we the ultimate criterion.

### Jesus Christ

The section on Jesus Christ points out, at the beginning, that Rahner intends to explore the meaning of an 'ascending Christology' even though it will tend to mingle with the usual form of the 'descending Christology'—of the divine Word becoming man. Hence the 'incarnation of God' is the final term of a process that begins with encounter with Jesus of Nazareth. But even before that, Rahner has to test the ground to see if a proper understanding of humanity can make the idea of the God-Man a serious one. Recent Christological controversy around the *Myth of God Incarnate* makes a foil to this discussion. In the setting of an evolutionary view of the world and of mankind, Rahner examines the relation of matter to spirit. This finds its resolution in the way the material existence of a biological entity reveals a selfhood and, in that, a self-transcendence, which is to be recognized as the dimension of the spiritual. As such it also constitutes an awareness of the divine—of God. In fact, it is a response to divine approach, to the deeper awareness that its apprehension is made possible only by God. Furthermore, this relation between man and God points to a fulfilment in what is termed 'glory' and, to that goal, there is given an absolute guarantee in the 'hypostatic union' between man and God in Jesus Christ. Rahner therefore speaks of him as the 'absolute saviour'. He sees the incarnation of the Word as the goal of the world's reality, because it is understood both in terms of the bestowal of grace to all spiritual persons and the condition of it. The event of the incarnation is thus one with the self-transcendence of the world into God through God's grace—his self-communication.

In this way Rahner meets the problem of 'the scandal of particularity' by removing its particularity and, in effect, making Jesus the focus of human sanctity, even while describing him in terms of 'the unique fulfilment of human potentiality'. But 'Grace in all of us and hypostatic union in the one Jesus Christ can only be understood together.' Yet it is such a union between God and man, such a communication by God to the human reality so graced in an absolute way, that it belongs to God, and becomes in Jesus the offer to us: 'an irrevocable kind of union between this human reality and God . . . which eliminates the possibility of separation between proclaimer and proclaimed.' In the light of this Rahner then opens the question which began his whole work, now in a Christward sense: How is the transcendent openness towards the ultimate, which is God, able to be orientated to an historical mediation, which is in fact Jesus of Nazareth? He wrestles with the problem of God's immutability, yet being able to know change in something else. In a sense this has already occurred in God's creating man, and indeed his history. The absolute difference between God and man is not absolute opposition.

### Faith and history

The section on Jesus Christ pushes into further questions as to the relation of

faith to historical events, particularly the historical event of Jesus Christ. We, in fact, enter into the experience of those who from the first have grasped these historical events—this historical person—as the mediation in history of the grace-given communication of God to man's transcendent openness in this absolute sense; and, in this context, the conceptual understanding that is itself saving knowledge comes about. In this, the resurrection of Jesus mediates the Saviour in his totality. There is much on the life, ministry and miracles of Jesus. An existential approach is made to Jesus' death and resurrection: his resurrection is the historical mediation and confirmation of our own hope of resurrection, arising from the ultimate problem of our death. This, of course, is not to blur the difference in significance between his resurrection and ours, which Rahner further explores. His death is seen as a kind of sacramental cause of what it signified: the saving will of God. Thus, in relation to the universal activity of the Holy Spirit, incarnation, cross and resurrection are 'the final cause' (in scholastic terms) of the universal self-communication of God; in relation to which Rahner has much to say regarding personal relationship to Jesus Christ by both Christian and non-Christian.

### Concluding sections

The later sections must be treated very briefly: 'Christianity as Church'; 'Remarks on Christian Life'; and 'Eschatology'. The importance of the church is based on the essential interpersonal nature of human existence, and the fact that salvation and religion relate to the whole of life. Rahner now argues in explicit Roman Catholic fashion—for example, the Petrine office is more assumed than argued—and in pressing the historicity of the church (quite rightly) he deals little with the problems of criteria for its true development. Nevertheless, Rahner holds that any Christian has the right to regard his own church as legitimate, and that the RC church is having to face that fact. At the same time there is the need to seek for the closer historical connection with the church in its original form, so that he is no upholder of ecclesiastical relativism. He further argues that the great Reformation terms *sola gratia, sola fide, sola scriptura*, are all affirmed now in Catholicism, and in this he pays tribute to the effect of the Reformation. He deals with the doctrine of Scripture and tradition, of the magisterium, and of the Marian dogmas (in which the significance is so universalized as appertaining to all Christians, that one wonders why they were ever made dogmas and why there was so much internal upset about them!). The final section on the place of (canon) law leads into the consideration of 'freedom' at the beginning of 'Remarks on Christian Life'. This makes some general observations on ethics and then deals with the seven sacraments under 'The Sacramental Life'.

The final section on 'Eschatology' has some good things to say about the need for corporeal resurrection, in terms of the whole person as understood by Christian anthropology; of eternity, heaven and hell. But he finds problems with purgatory, as implying a time process which he has already ruled out as a possible way of thinking about eternity, and desperation seems to set in when some recourse is had to doctrines of 'transmigration of souls' and 'reincarnation'.

\* \* \* \*

The length of this article does scant justice to the full contents of the work, but enough has been written to highlight the architectonic thinking that informs it. All the while, latent if not explicit, there is a many-sided theological debate going on with many kinds of thinkers. But it is not an easy book to read either in style or argument, even though the translation is almost entirely good. However, the format, the inherent interest—and an excellent



## CHURCHMAN

photograph on the back of the dust-cover—urge one on to a satisfied finish of an outstanding contemporary systematic theology.

G. J. C. MARCHANT is Archdeacon of Auckland in the diocese of Durham, and Chairman of the Editorial Board of *Churchman*.

## HOLY BIBLE New International Version

*first published in the USA by the International Bible Society, New York 1978*  
*Hodder and Stoughton 1979 1440pp hardcover £4.95 ISBN 0 340 23702 3*  
*paperback £3.25 ISBN 0 340 23710 4*

The translators of the Old Testament in the New International Version are to be congratulated on the promptness with which they have completed their taxing assignment. Now that the whole Bible lies before us it makes a very favourable all-round impression.

This is designed to be an entirely new translation from the original texts (like the NEB), not a revision of earlier versions (like the RSV). Yet it is much more in the RSV category than in that of the NEB. This is largely due to the translators' decision 'to preserve some measure of continuity with the long tradition of translating the Scriptures into English.' The NIV thus maintains a flavour of 'Bible English', and is none the worse for that: it achieves the ideal of 'dynamic equivalence' more successfully than one or two other recent versions which make this claim for themselves. In one respect it is more modern than the RSV and NEB: the pronoun 'thou' is jettisoned altogether.

In other respects, too, the translators give evidence of a reasonable conservatism. The first clause of Genesis stands as an independent sentence instead of being subordinated to the following clause, as in the NEB. It is 'the Spirit of God' and not 'a mighty wind' that 'was hovering over the waters' in Gen. 1:2. The first clause of Gen. 2:4 is treated as the heading of the narrative which follows ('This is the account of the heavens and the earth when they were created'), not (as would be preferable) as the colophon of the narrative which precedes. In Gen. 3:4 the serpent continues to speak in Bible English: 'You will not surely die.' In Gen. 4:8 we have one of the few, but justified, departures from the Massoretic text: Cain says to Abel, 'Let's go out to the field' (as in the Septuagint, Samaritan and Vulgate reading). The colloquial 'Let's' stands out oddly in what is for the most part a literary version.

In Ps. 2: 2,7, the use of initial capitals in 'against his Anointed One' and 'You are my Son' implies the messianic interpretation; the rendering 'Kiss the Son' is retained in verse 12 and again the capitalization indicates that the Son is identical with the one addressed in the oracle of verse 7.

In the fourth Isaianic Servant Song, the Servant is to 'sprinkle many nations' (Isa. 52:15) and to be 'with the rich in his death' (Isa. 53:9). There the Massoretic text is followed: there are minor deviations from it in Isa. 53:10, 'though the LORD makes his life a guilt offering'; and in Isa. 53:11, 'he will see the light of life and be satisfied' (the Septuagint reading 'light' is confirmed by the evidence of two Hebrew manuscripts from Qumran).

In Dan. 9:27 the relevance of 'wing' is brought out by the added words 'of the temple'—'one who causes desolation will place abominations on a wing of the temple.'

The translators deserve our thanks for the responsible way in which they have fulfilled their task. We hope that their version will be widely circulated and used.

F. F. BRUCE

## OLD TESTAMENT THEOLOGY IN OUTLINE WALTHER ZIMMERLI

T. and T. Clark 1978 258pp £5.80

ISBN 0 567 02353 2

Gerhard von Rad's monumental *Old Testament Theology* (English translation 1962, 1965) inaugurated a new era in OT theology by presenting the divergent theologies of the various literary strata and authors within the OT rather than by offering an account of OT theology that was organized thematically. Since that time many have wondered whether it would ever be possible again to construct a unified OT theology that did full justice to the variety of outlook within the OT and did not impose on its diversity an artificial homogeneity. Two recent works by J. L. McKenzie and R. E. Clements have proved the enterprise to be worth undertaking, but Zimmerli has produced the most brilliant and sympathetic overview of the whole range of OT theology, thematically arranged but scrupulously sensitive to the distinct sources and the history of traditions.

The plan of the work is uncomplicated, though the author's personal stamp is evident in some interesting juxtapositions. Under 'I: Fundamentals', discussion of Yahweh's name and functions as God of the fathers, creator, etc., leads into the concept of Israel as Yahweh's elect. In 'II: The Gifts Bestowed by Yahweh' we meet with war and victory, the land, and the charismata of leadership (priest, prophet, wise). 'III: Yahweh's Commandment' develops from the foregoing as the 'summons' that always accompanies Yahweh's gift (p109). The response of Israel ('IV: Life before God') in obedience, prayer (the Psalms), and the mastery of everyday life (Proverbs), is also part of OT theology: the response of those addressed by God is a mirror image of God. The whole biblical history can then finally be summed up in 'V: Crisis and Hope', a chapter that moves from the primeval history through the historical narratives to the prophetic writings and apocalypticism.

Several features of this volume make it an exceptional representative of its genre. The style is direct and plain, the prose often invigorated with a trenchant, well-turned or provocative phrase. There is a well-judged amount of reference to other scholars (predominantly German, unfortunately). Above all, Zimmerli is a master of the art of quotation: the text of the book is in immediate touch with the text of the OT, and one can never forget that the subject of the book is the OT itself and not the author's theological reconstructions.

This is an almost exclusively descriptive account of OT theology. There are no laboured methodological discussions, the problem of 'history' is ignored, and the relation of the OT to the NT is an unopened question. Divergent theologies within the OT are never allowed a dialogue with one another; Zimmerli is content to expose the 'great variety of forms' the OT uses to express its faith in Yahweh (pp80,115). A more discriminating enthusiasm, which involved the author in theological engagement and judgement, might have been even more stimulating.

Zimmerli's volume has, I believe, outclassed the works of Eichrodt, Jacob, von Rad, and Vriezen as the essential textbook in OT theology. Apart from the 37 errors in the Hebrew type in the first 80 pages, it is to be commended warmly as a direct, comprehensive, warm exposition of the message of the OT in its manifold variety.

DAVID J. A. CLINES

CHURCHMAN

**THE BOOK OF DANIEL** ANDRE LACOCQUE

*first published in France 1976*

SPCK 1979 302pp £11.50

ISBN 0 281 03595 4

**DANIEL: An Introduction and Commentary**  
(Tyndale Old Testament Commentaries)

JOYCE BALDWIN general editor D. J. WISEMAN

IVP 1978 210pp *hardcover* £3.35

*paperback* £2.65

ISBN 0 85111 631 0

ISBN 0 85111 832 1

USA ISBN 0 87784 961 7

Here are two top-flight commentaries on Daniel. The former has been well translated from the French by David Pallauer, with a further revision by the author. Its presentation in general resembles that of the International Critical Commentary of Montgomery (1927). Briefly, the plan is to take the book of Daniel a few verses at a time. An English translation is followed by critical notes, which reproduce Hebrew or Aramaic words for comment where necessary. Then comes a commentary, which may include quotations from, and references to, authors and literature, with an explanation of allusions in the passage. There are between three and eight footnotes on each page of the commentary. The extensive bibliography shows how much material needed to be digested before this book could be written. There is, however, no mention of conservative writers such as F.F. Bruce and E.J. Young.

Thus we have here a very full up-to-date work. As a literary-critical approach this is, of course, all that can be desired. But, unlike the second author, Lacocque has not the slightest interest in the possible historical genuineness of the book. When the present reviewer wrote a substantial set of notes for Scripture Union, he looked into the alleged difficulties and found they had sensible solutions. Lacocque starts off on the wrong foot by finding a discrepancy of dating in 1:1, without realizing, as Joyce Baldwin has done, that the solution lies in the difference between Babylonian and Jewish methods of dating. Naturally the date of the book is taken to be shortly before the death of Antiochus, without considering how Qumran may now affect this conclusion.

Joyce Baldwin's book is also scholarly and well documented, and is in the excellent series of Tyndale Commentaries. The introduction is fuller than Lacocque's, although the latter apologizes for restrictions on length imposed by the original French edition. She gives her reasons for taking the book at face value, and her quotations and copious footnotes show that she is no ostrich with her head in the sand.

Since she accepts predictive prophecy, she is able to date the book during the life of Daniel, and to see the predictions covering the four empires of Babylon, Medo-Persia, Greece, and Rome, culminating in the Messiah. I would not leave the impression that, since this is a work of scholarship, it is, like Lacocque's, for top theological scholars only. Joyce Baldwin writes in a style that can be well understood by any intelligent Bible student.

I have one criticism. In considering the identity of the Darius of 5:31, she rightly gives the sensible theories of Wiseman (namely, Cyrus himself) and Whitcomb (Gubaru), but does not mention Cyaraxes, who seems to be supported by Xenophon and also by Josephus, the latter saying that Daniel was taken to Media by Darius (NB. Daniel is by the Tigris in Media in 10:4).

So Lacocque for higher theological degrees and Joyce Baldwin for good degrees and personal edification.

J. STAFFORD WRIGHT

**DANIEL** (Geneva Series of Commentaries)  
**EDWARD J. YOUNG**

first published in the UK 1972  
Banner of Truth 1978 330pp £3.50

ISBN 0 85151 154 6

**THE LORD IS KING: The Message of Daniel**  
**RONALD S. WALLACE**

IVP 1979 200pp £2.65

ISBN 0 85110 589 0

This well-known evangelical commentary, first published in 1949, had already become a classic when it was first republished by Banner of Truth. It is good that it continues to be available at such a reasonable price. At the period when biblical studies were only just beginning to recover from war-time setbacks, E.J. Young brought his considerable scholarship to bear on the problems of the book of Daniel. Not only did he retranslate the text and comment on it in detail, verse by verse, but he also explored, in an appendix of fifty-three pages, eight relevant topics. These are followed by a bibliography and two indices.

Dr Young's commentary is strong on historical and linguistic considerations. Though near-eastern studies have developed in the last thirty years and further texts with a bearing on Daniel have come to light, the conclusions reached by Dr Young continue to command respect and they need only to be supplemented, not replaced. This commentary is primarily intended for the student rather than the preacher, but it lays important foundations without which the expositor might well flounder.

*The Lord is King*, by contrast, is a book in 'The Bible Speaks Today' series, which aims to be expository as opposed to exegetical, and seeks to relate the book of Daniel to contemporary life. The author brings to this task the mature reflections of a scholar and pastor who has pondered and worked at its message over many years.

The introductory section deals in a general way with historical background, date, unity and kindred questions in order to set the scene, but Dr Wallace does not claim any special expertise here, nor would space be available for such subjects. His reasons for taking a conservative stance are sufficiently indicated; he concludes that the book is intended for people living in an alien culture—'in other words, not in a Maccabean-type situation but in a Babylonian-type situation' (p21). Here they needed a new theology and a new policy so that they could fit in without being swallowed. Daniel had to decide where to draw the line (chapter one) and so does the contemporary Christian. 'Daniel's resolve to say No! was no less miraculous a work of God than his survival in the lions' den.'

Expositors differ in their estimate of the detail necessary to make the application of spiritual truth effective. Dr Wallace does not hesitate to expand on parallel situations in current affairs, often drawing on other parts of Scripture in the process. His treatment of chapter six is particularly telling, with its headings 'murder under the system!', and 'the law-and-order trap', which immediately suggest modern applications. Occasionally the application is a little laboured, and generalizations such as 'far too many of us' and 'we can imagine that' tend to weaken the impact of the message; I thought I detected some antipathy to 'counselling' and an overuse in a later part of the book of the word 'absurd'. But these are details, and in general I marvel at the amount of sermon material Dr Wallace finds in the book of Daniel. Those who preach much may well find ideas here, and those who want devotional reading will enjoy the humble and sincere directness of these studies.

JOYCE BALDWIN

**GOD'S ULTIMATE PURPOSE: An Exposition of Ephesians 1**  
**D. M. LLOYD-JONES**

*Banner of Truth* 1978 447pp £4.50

ISBN 0 85151 272 0

This latest of volumes from the pen of Dr Martyn Lloyd-Jones differs from previous collections of his sermons in that these were never published in the *Westminster Record*. This is therefore the first time we can read them since they were preached in 1954. They form an exposition of Ephesians 1. No one who has ever launched into this magnificent chapter could fail to emerge excited, enlarged in spiritual vision, and moved to worship. These sermons catch the mood and delight heart and mind. The style is familiar: the same attention to detail, repetitive emphasis and firm dogmatism. The author uses the AV, as we would expect. One wishes he had taken time to rewrite the sermons for the New International Version. Many will have to dust down their AVs to follow the exposition, particularly in those places where the AV verse numbering is so different. As it happens, the Doctor has himself to refer to modern versions to explain the AV he uses ('peculiar people', etc.).

There are minor quibbles: was adoption not known to the Jew? (p109: see IVP Bible Dictionary). Is his explanation of the three heavens correct? (p70) And what does he mean when he writes that 'The very lowest stage of true Christian experience is that stage in which you are conscious of just that conflict' (i.e. between the flesh and the Spirit)?

But the most controversial section is five chapters devoted to the 'sealing with the Spirit' (pp243-300). Here his position will be unacceptable to many. He affirms that the sealing is identical to the baptism of the Spirit (pp249, 264), is 'a special blessing' (p261) subsequent to believing (p250), definitely to be known in the experience of heart, mind and emotion. It is not regeneration, sanctification, assurance or fulness (though later [p283] he equates it with assurance). He states: 'It is God's action, in which he bears witness that we are his children, that he is our Father, and that we are "heirs of God and joint-heirs with Christ"'. It is God's authentication of the fact that we really belong to him.'

Those who have engaged in the modern charismatic debate will find it fascinating to follow the course he charts over well-worn Scriptures. But this reviewer remains unconvinced that 'sealing' is not part of 'regeneration'. There is nothing new in the Doctor's stance, of course, and he gives a heart-warming selection of the spiritual experiences of Goodwin, Wesley, Jonathan Edwards and others, all of which he identifies as the sealing of the Spirit. Perhaps others, while not denying the reality of their spiritual experiences, would wish to refer to them as 'times of refreshing' (Acts 3:19) rather than 'sealing with the Spirit'.

KEITH WESTON

**A COMMENTARY ON THE EPISTLE TO THE HEBREWS**  
**PHILIP EDGE CUMBE HUGHES**

*Eerdmans* 1977 623pp US\$15.95

USA ISBN 0 8028 3495 7

'Magisterial' is the adjective which comes to mind when exploring this commentary by a former editor of *Churchman*, who is now visiting professor of New Testament at Westminster Theological Seminary. The scale of the work enables him to consider in depth the many exegetical problems found in this epistle, in doing which he shows himself equally at home with the Fathers, the medieval schoolmen, the Reformers, and modern commentators

and theologians. For instance, the crucial passage 6: 4-6 receives systematic and exhaustive treatment over sixteen pages, where the argument is set out that the author is referring to the very real possibility of apostasy on the part of those who 'through identification with the people of God have been brought within the sphere of the divine blessing' (p217).

As well as detailed verse-by-verse commentary, there are several notes on exegetical points, and four excursuses, of which the third, on 'the blood of Jesus and his heavenly priesthood' (pp 329-54), has particular relevance to the current debate on the meaning of eucharistic sacrifice in ecumenical circles. The closing section of this, on our Lord's high-priestly activity in heaven as consisting of representation, benediction and intercession, is especially helpful. Among all the authorities cited, it would have been good to be reminded of Dr A. J. Tait's *The Heavenly Session of our Lord*, which contains a lot of material of value in the present discussions.

On the question of authorship, Dr Hughes endorses Origen's well-known dictum that 'The truth God alone knows' (p21), but his introduction sets out an attractive hypothesis, based on the latest evidence of the beliefs and practices of the Qumran community, that the letter is addressed to Hebrew Christians who 'had in one way or another encountered and felt the attraction of the teachings' not just of that community but the much larger and more widely spread movement of Essenism (pp14-15).

There have been several commentaries on Hebrews published in recent years of varying value: this is definitely one to obtain if you wish to study the epistle in depth and to spiritual profit.

DAVID WHEATON

## THE CROSS: Tradition and Interpretation HANS-RUEDI WEBER

first published in Germany 1975  
SPCK 1979 162pp £2.50

ISBN 0 281 03660 8

Just as some people are unjustifiably suspicious of any book that bears the imprint IVP, so I tend to be suspicious of anything that emanates from the WCC. The present book is by the director for biblical studies at the WCC, and represents the first four chapters of a study of the cross which originally contained a further three chapters on the presentation of the message of the cross in the varied cultures of the modern world. What we have here is the biblical section of the book. The first chapter presents the historical facts about crucifixion and a discussion of the historical value of the biblical crucifixion narratives. The author finds a mixture of fact and interpretation in the Gospels, but believes that the essential basis of the passion stories is historical; he is unnecessarily sceptical about the possibility of Jesus having been tried by both Jews and Romans. Chapter two looks at the earliest traditions of the crucifixion, tracing how it was interpreted in the light of the OT and came to be seen as a death for us. Chapter three examines Paul's interpretation of the cross, showing how it becomes the criterion for understanding oneself and the world in 1 Corinthians and the means of justification in Galatians. The fourth chapter examines each of the Gospel passion accounts to see how they interpreted the tradition. And there the book stops for all practical purposes. There is a brief synopsis of the Gospel accounts of the crucifixion, and an extensive bibliography which would have been improved by including references to English translations of German works and which does not quite atone for the total lack of footnotes.

The value of the book lies in the way in which it tries to bring out the varying emphases in early interpretation of the death of Jesus. It rightly recognizes the element of vicarious redemption as one of the main strands of interpretation, and it is thoroughly positive in its efforts to bring out the message of the NT. But it is unfortunate that it looks only at part of the NT evidence. Some important aspects of the pre-literary evidence are passed over in silence, and a treatment of Paul which virtually ignores Romans 3 and 2 Corinthians 5 (to say nothing of other passages) is bound to be ultimately unsatisfying. It is odd that Mark's crucifixion narrative is not seen in the light of the pointers to its meaning in Mark 10:45 (mentioned only in passing) and 14:22-25. In short, then, there is no reason for an evangelical reader to be at all suspicious of this book; he can rather be glad that the message of the cross is here being carefully studied, but at the same time he will regret that the treatment was not more comprehensive and he will want to question various points of detail. Theological students will find this a useful introduction to an important topic.

I. HOWARD MARSHALL

**EXPLORATIONS IN THEOLOGY 4**

**MAURICE WILES**

SCM Press 1979 115pp £3.50

ISBN 0 334 01974 5

Half these essays have already been published elsewhere. They offer various suggestive insights: on the Holy Spirit as God who is absolutely other yet who enters most intimately into communion with men; on the need for diversity of forms for the eucharist to express its different aspects; on the way the Bible (and other holy books) function, positively and negatively, to facilitate respect for antiquity, escape from subjectivity, and a focus on community.

But more interest will attach to the previously unpublished essays on 'critical theology' and its application to Christology and to Christianity's attitude to other faiths, where Professor Wiles emphasizes the need to re-examine traditional Christian beliefs, to re-state Christology, and to learn from other religions. I have two comments on these. The first is that while the questions raised about traditional Christological formulations are very far-reaching, the alternative understandings offered are at best sketchy and at worst look like reversions to approaches which were well known at the time of (say) Chalcedon and were consciously rejected by the church during those centuries. It is not surprising if, like the occupants of a big Victorian house urged to allow their home to be demolished pending the completion of a new one whose mere foundations are hardly yet visible (yet which threatens to be more functional but less roomy than their present one), many Christians prefer to concentrate on refurbishing the old until there is more evidence that the new will be as well built and lasting a structure.

I think Professor Wiles oversimplifies Christology (one aspect of what is unsatisfying about Chalcedon, that it is so difficult to comprehend, is also one aspect of its strength). I also think he oversimplifies what Christianity itself is about. He is concerned with Jesus as an ideal of manhood and a revelation of God; Christianity is a set of insights about God and man. And if this is how one sees the essence of Christianity (as two of his foils for his thinking, Wolfhart Pannenberg and John Baker, also do), then his approach to the relationship between Christianity and other faiths is entirely appropriate. But the traditional understanding is that this set of insights is the framework for, or deposit of, a piece of news: that God reconciled man to himself in Christ

through certain events in a particular country at a particular time. If Christianity is thus fundamentally a gospel, Professor Wiles' approach to history and to other faiths won't do.

Lest those with an aversion to modern theology should be deriving mistaken glee from the fact that so far each of the volumes of *Explorations in Theology* has been shorter than the previous one, I am able to report that Volume 5 (by Donald MacKinnon) reverses the trend. It has more body in it, too.

JOHN GOLDINGAY

## ART AND THE CHRISTIAN INTELLIGENCE IN ST AUGUSTINE      ROBERT J. O'CONNELL SJ

Harvard UP USA 1978

USA ISBN 0 674 04675 7

Basil Blackwell UK 1978 251pp £10.00

ISBN 0 631 19170 4

Robert O'Connell is a philosophy professor at Fordham University and the author of two earlier books, *St Augustine's Early Theory of Man* and *St Augustine's 'Confessions': The Odyssey of Soul* (1968, 1969), which have provoked considerable discussion among students of Augustine without succeeding in winning much assent to their main thesis. The present work discusses Augustine's early intellectual development from another angle but presupposes, and on occasions argues afresh, this controversial thesis (whose critics O'Connell has sought to answer elsewhere). O'Connell claims that Augustine's anthropology was largely a transcript of Plotinus' theory of the fall of the pre-existent soul from eternity into the world of time and matter. That the Christianity of the converted Augustine had a strongly neo-platonic colouring is not in doubt, but whether that colouring was a deep-dyed and extensive as O'Connell alleges is at best unproven.

O'Connell's latest book begins with an analysis of Augustine's aesthetic theory in his early writings up to his only formally aesthetic work, *On Music* (391), a theory which O'Connell believes reappears substantially unchanged in *The Confessions*. This theory, too spiritual to be truly Christian, reflects Augustine's estimate of man as 'soul using a body' and his constant ascent from the visible to the intelligible, from the realm of sense and symbol to the sphere of pure, unchanging truth. Because Augustine conceived of this eternal order in terms of numerical perfection, earthly beauty—the beauty of 'the relation of the parts of the beautiful object to each other and to the whole'—is discerned essentially in 'the symmetrical arrangement of architectural elements, the rhythmic movements of the dance, the measures and harmonies of musical sounds.'

Yet such an intellectualized aesthetic, marked by a 'tendency to make the perception of beauty the exclusive province of mind or reason', seems strangely at odds not only with the dazzling artistry of *The Confessions*, which O'Connell illustrates to impressive effect, but also with the import of other, specifically Christian, themes in his thought, such as the resurrection of the body, creation from nothing and love for the neighbour.

Although O'Connell cannot show that these factors fundamentally transform Augustine's theory of art, he is encouraged by them to attempt a sketch of a more truly Christian contemporary Augustinian aesthetic.

This is a book for experts to wrestle with. Its language has idiosyncrasies such as 'enmattered' ('deprecation' is a repeated slip for 'depreciation') and its argument is close and demanding. Rarely are Augustine's texts quoted to



## CHURCHMAN

enable the reader to assess the validity of O'Connell's interpretation. His delineation of Augustine's aesthetic is broadly acceptable but he ascribes its formation too narrowly to Plotinian influence.

DAVID F. WRIGHT

### THE TRIAL OF LUTHER DANIEL OLIVIER

translated JOHN TONKIN

*first published in France 1971*  
*Mowbrays 1978 194pp £4.95*

ISBN 0 264 66230 X

This book is a popular and racy account of Luther's life from 1517-22, and is hardly an account of the trial of Luther, as the title claims. Had the author kept the title in mind he would have given far more weight to the Disputations of Heidelberg (1518) and Leipzig (1519), and to the final confrontation at Worms in 1521.

It is not acceptable to write an account of such momentous events without offering a single source, or reference, or note. The book is even without an index. It is just not good enough to make statements such as 'in a book which arrived just then . . .': why not name the book, and give the reference? Without references and sources the reader is in the intolerable position of never being able to assess the authority of the opinion expressed, and where these views (over very grave matters) are expressed in a jaunty, jocular journalese, their authority is impugned. For whom was such a book written?

The style further has the effect of obscuring truth and expressing error. (Olivier's French is highly idiosyncratic and there are obscurities in the English translation.) It is surely a mis-statement to think of Luther's recantation as 'a gesture': Luther never believed in gestures. It is surely a misunderstanding of Luther to think of him (e.g. on the matter of usury) as 'trying to run with the hare and hunt with the hounds': Luther never did. Luther's views on usury are clear: such matters fall into the area of law, not gospel. It is surely wrong to say that Luther lacked a good theology of the church at Leipzig. It was there that he dumbfounded Eck by basing his doctrine on the Bible and the Greek Fathers.

The author sees Luther as the prophet in confrontation with the pontiff, and argues these as the confrontation of two intransigent positions. That may well be, but is that all there is to be said? Was it not the confrontation of a de-theologized, de-Christianized, secularized institution by a humble believing scholar who took God at his Word, and yearned for a true church? Many Catholic scholars contemporary with Luther saw this, and Luther was described at Trent as a rod from God on the back of the church. The institution refused to face the evidence; hence a divided Christendom. After all, the greater part of Christendom deserted Rome to follow Luther (and the later Reformers). It was the church that was on trial rather than Luther.

I do not think this popular piece of journalistic writing will do much to open men's eyes to the real issues, then and now.

JAMES ATKINSON

### ST TERESA OF AVILA STEPHEN CLISSOLD

*Sheldon Press 1979 272pp £8.95*

ISBN 0 85969 148 9

Teresa of Avila will always fascinate students of Christian spirituality because of the way in which there were combined in her an extraordinary

degree of detachment from the world with a down-to-earth aptitude for business. Stephen Clissold's engagingly-written account shows these two sides very well. He describes the ecstasies, visions and locutions which crowded in upon Teresa for many years (often to her embarrassment), and tells the story of her unremitting labours for the reform of the Carmelite order and the establishment of the 'primitive rule'. The book is especially good in presenting to the reader a thoroughly 'human' person, full of warmth, humour and good sense. The background of sixteenth-century Spain is excellently conveyed, so that one gets a clear picture of the environment in which Teresa did her work. The only major disappointment is that so little is said about the saint's spiritual teaching which, on any showing, is historically very significant. One could not indeed ask for anything like a full exposition in a book of this kind, which is meant to be biographical and popular, but even a cursory treatment would have better indicated where Teresa laid the prime emphasis in her own spiritual pilgrimage—not on supranormal experiences but on a steady, unflinching obedience to the revealed will of God.

There is a useful list of the main characters in the story, a chronological table, six illustrations and three pages of notes giving the chief sources of the material in the text.

JOHN COCKERTON

### SERMONS (The Yale Edition of the Works of Samuel Johnson, Vol. XIV)

edited JEAN H. HAGSTRUM and JAMES GRAY

Yale UP 1978 354pp £16.20

ISBN 0 300 02104 6

Boswell's *Life of Dr Johnson* recounts the unhappy story of William Dodd, sometime chaplain-in-ordinary to George III, who in 1777 forged a bond, was committed to Newgate, and hanged at Tyburn. Johnson wrote for him to preach to his fellow-prisoners the celebrated 'Convict's Address to his Unhappy Brethren', the best known of the twenty-eight sermons in this scholarly production (which includes a title page of the first edition, marked in Johnson's hand).

None of these sermons was delivered by Johnson; most were written for money (two guineas a time) and many were for his friend John Taylor, prebendary of Westminster. Johnson claimed: 'I myself have composed about forty sermons. I have begun a sermon after dinner, and sent it off by the post that night.' Often, however, the customer would copy the MS in Johnson's study (the better to read it in the pulpit) and Johnson's original would forthwith be burnt—hence the dozen or so missing addresses.

The *Life* alone makes it clear that Johnson was a devout Christian, and his sermons belong (in the words of the introduction) 'to the central homiletical tradition of established Christianity.' They are clearly (given their period) as much a branch of literature as of religion; and this book is accordingly of more literary than religious interest.

Language and thought are alike exalted, but pages pass with no mention of the name of Christ and no personal reference to the Lord. Perhaps it is significant that only one of the twenty-eight texts is from the Gospels (John 11: 25,6).

TIMOTHY DUDLEY-SMITH

**WILLIAM CAREY      MARY DREWERY**

*Hodder and Stoughton 1978 224pp £4.95*

ISBN 0 340 23277 3

A new life of the 'founder' of modern Protestant missions is long overdue: S. Pearce Carey wrote the last nearly fifty years ago. Some twelve years back I contemplated him, but the present publisher's predecessor dissuaded me on the ground that Pearce Carey had said the last word. In a sense this remains true, for Mary Drewery has not unearthed any new evidence or papers of importance. If she has, I apologize for not noticing, but a criticism must be that her book provides no list of sources and her references make no clear distinction between printed and manuscript authorities.

Otherwise her book is timely. She puts flesh on the humourless Carey and retells his story with charming simplicity from a standpoint of general sympathy with his outlook: she shares his faith in Christ. She sets him in the context of his age, though here and there her touch is not too sure: she thinks the BFBS was an *Anglican* body. Wilberforce, who suffered much from the bishops for its sake, would not thank her for downgrading the first truly inter-denominational society. Another oddity is to use Carey's Indian spellings (e.g. Kally for the goddess Kali) without comment.

That is a carping criticism. Mary Drewery is to be congratulated on rediscovering Carey for the general reader. His rise was extraordinary: from Northamptonshire cobbler to professor of Sanskrit; from a lone youth, pleading with fellow Baptists for the heathen, to the honoured doyen of missionaries. He had a mental wife and a scallawag first colleague; a hostile East India Company and, at first, no certain financial support; much of his literary labour was lost in a fire; one of his sons betrayed him (but was reconciled later); yet he never gave up. Thorough, patient, totally devoted to Christ, Carey deserves his fame and is happy in his new biographer.

JOHN POLLOCK

**THIS IS THE DAY      MICHAEL HARPER**

*Hodder and Stoughton 1979 160pp £2.95*

ISBN 0 340 23737 6

Michael Harper's aim is clear: 'This book is a plea that the journey (towards reconciliation between evangelical, catholic and charismatic) should be completed whatever the cost. . . . The penalty for our failure is the continued weakness of the body of Christ on earth, the impairment of its witness in the world, and the delay of the return of its Lord.' (pp 112-3)

To this end he recounts his own personal pilgrimage, and the recent history of the three streams which for him make up ecumenism (though aware that there is a fourth stream in Orthodoxy which he has yet effectively to meet). He sees three foundations necessary for a true unity; the Bible and fundamentals of biblical faith; evangelism and world mission; and belief in the supernatural.

Towards this position he quotes David Watson as saying: 'Evangelicals have rediscovered the work of the Holy Spirit, the importance of worship, and the church as the body of Christ. The Roman Catholics have rediscovered the Bible, conversion and evangelism. . . . I feel the charismatic renewal is God's own sort of ecumenical movement.' (p 39)

But the main sections of the book are an historical analysis, and of particular value are those dealing with the world scene in renewal. Much of the anxiety and danger involved in the shepherding-discipleship-submission controversy in the States in the mid-70s passed us by in Britain. It is import-

ant, nevertheless, to see what was at stake, and how reconciliation took place in the 1976 Leaders' Conference.

The author is, as always, extremely open to the need for strengthening the theological aspects of renewal. He writes: 'Charismatics are often not their own best friends and can sometimes jump to the defence of their position with the most ungainly and inadequate intellectual weaponry.' (p 55). When leaders are thus self-aware, there is every hope for this side of the movement. An appendix prints the joint CEEC/Fountain Trust statement: 'Gospel and Spirit'.

JOHN POULTON

## THE CHURCH IN OUR TIMES RUPERT E. DAVIES

Epworth Press 1979 132pp £1.95

ISBN 0 7162 0317 0

Rupert Davies played a leading role from the Methodist Church angle in many of the events he describes here. It is to that extent an 'inside' story, though with few of the personal flashes that would have cheered it along.

This is a carefully constructed history of the ecumenical movement in Britain over the last eighty years. Inevitably, therefore, it covers the British share in getting things going (Edinburgh 1910 and what led up to it) and at climactic points like Amsterdam 1948 (the establishing of the World Council of Churches).

The latter part of the story is not so much to our credit, of course, as the author traces what has happened here, particularly since Nottingham 1964. The Anglican-Methodist discussions, and the eventual failure to unite, lead on into the period of 'Talks about talks' and the Ten Propositions. You cannot avoid picking up signs of disappointment and weariness in the account.

'Conferences, councils, negotiations and schemes are all necessary, and it is not high-minded but unrealistic, and sometimes arrogant, to despise them. But they are useless unless the Spirit of God has been allowed to implant in the minds and imaginations of those who take part in them the vision of the holy catholic church made visibly one, not by human ingenuity, but by divine love and power, and possessing a holiness beyond human ability to conceive or create.' (p 125)

JOHN POULTON

## THE CLOCKWORK CHURCH CHRISTOPHER WANSEY

Becket Publications/Mowbrays 1978 138pp £1.95

ISBN 0 7289 005 X

It is difficult to describe this book. It is severely autobiographical, complete with photographs of the author at critical moments in the story. It is a survey of the main points of church discipline and church-state relationships over the past few decades. It is an attempt by wit and humour (complete with cartoon drawings) to describe the perils in which the established church would see herself were she not quite so satisfied with the *status quo*.

Christopher Wansey was for twenty-five years an independent proctor elected by the clergy of Chelmsford diocese to the central councils of the church. Reforms he attempted to gain support for included the church's appointing her own bishops, the use of believers' baptism, and the marriage in church only of committed Christians. This book recounts his own practice

## CHURCHMAN

as incumbent as well as his reforming efforts on the national scene. He comes across as a persevering gadfly, but with the heart of a true pastor when face to face with people.

This comes through in a particularly moving way when he recounts how he has occasionally given a certificate to people desiring to be *rid* of a church connection (e.g. wishing they had never been baptized as an infant). This is the sort of pastoral situation most would avoid with a laugh and a refusal to take things seriously. But Mr Wansley takes all things seriously, and above all the mission of the church to the unchurched. They must be taken for the people they are, and neither sentimentally welcomed as Christians when they are not, nor treated by the book when a little extra care might bring them into a new relationship with God. A moving testimony.

JOHN POULTON

## ECUMENISM AND CHARISMATIC RENEWAL: Theological and Pastoral Orientations (Malines Document 2) CARDINAL SUENENS

Darton, Longman and Todd 1978 109pp £1.95 ISBN 0 232 51430 5

This is a useful balance to so many experience-based testimonies in the field of charismatic literature. Cardinal Suenens writes clearly from personal experience and conviction, but he is also deeply concerned with existing problems and repercussions inside the established ecclesial communities, problems that have arisen as a result of the Renewal.

He sees Renewal as a Gulf Stream sent to warm the shores of reunion. Tracing the movements of modern ecumenism and of charismatic renewal, he spends most of his pages suggesting how the two are intended to interact. But this is in no sentimental way: 'We must not give way to a euphoric ecumenism which, in the joy of rediscovering Christian brotherhood, would overlook difficulties yet to be resolved.' (p 45)

These difficulties he lists. The relation between the Spirit's action in sacramental structures and human activity. Faith and the faith. The doctrine and practice of eucharist and of eucharistic ministry and intercommunion. He urges the need for clear thinking in these areas upon leaders in charismatic renewal (and notes with approval the journal *Theological Renewal* in this country). He has a very down-to-earth section on the ambiguities of language and suggests, e.g., what the words 'baptism of the Spirit' mean in various religious sub-cultures.

The book ends with a renewal plea for Pentecost to be adopted across the denominations, in as many cities as possible, as a time for annual celebration of what the Spirit is doing to bring God's people together—'that the world may believe'.

JOHN POULTON

## ENGLISH CHURCHYARD MEMORIALS FREDERICK BURGESS

first published by Lutterworth 1963  
SPCK 1979 326pp £7.50

ISBN 0 281 03662 4

It might be thought that here is a book about gravestones—and because of the vast collection of such memorials, a book which could only outline the subject.

Nothing could be more wrong. Mr Burgess deals not only with *churchyard* memorials but also with those inside the church; he deals not only with their visual qualities of material, ornament and inscription, but brings to bear a considerable archaeological scholarship and a thorough grasp of ecclesiological history. All this is comprehensively illustrated with line drawings and 32 pages of photographs. The end-of-chapter notes are very detailed; there is an index of monumental carvers and a well-chosen glossary. The index in two parts, 'Places' and 'General', is particularly useful in a work which may not only be read with pleasure but used as a reference book.

Originally published in 1963 by Lutterworth, this paperback edition by SPCK fulfils a need at a time when memorials in churchyards are being moved (or removed) to allow more open landscaping or church extensions, a process occasionally leading to the loss of important pieces. The book has not been updated in regard to counties and bodies which have changed their name, but this matters little because the litho from the original has been well done.

It would be easy to search the book for mention of one's favourite memorials and, because they are not included, complain about omissions; but in searching, one will discover so many new treasures that one's own experience is vastly augmented.

From the origins and growth of churchyards and cemeteries, the book proceeds systematically to analyse types of monuments from 2500BC to this century, including mediaeval brasses. The elements of design (symbolism, ornament, lettering, etc.) are thoroughly reported and this leads on to the training of monumental masons, carriage of their work, costs and wages. All this is presented from comprehensive source material.

Here is a good companion to Pevsner's 'Buildings of England' series and an aid to several A-level subjects.

KENNETH WHITE

## DISCOVERING CHURCH ARCHITECTURE: A Glossary of Terms MARK CHILD

Shire Publications 1979 64pp 70p

ISBN 0 85263 328 9

Of the *Discovering* . . . series from Shire there can be no end. They are deservedly popular, as this booklet demonstrates; it was first published in 1976 and here is a reprint.

It would be churlish to say that the best thing about it is the bibliography (which is excellent) because the aim of the piece is to 'help break down the mystique that surrounds ecclesiastical architecture and acts as a barrier to the enjoyment of a wider public . . . Used in conjunction with the guide-book it will enable you to see a church through new eyes . . .'

Within this restricted purpose the pocket book is useful, especially as the author has provided over 300 little sketches. The definitions are economical to the point of terseness and are generally as commonly agreed. An exception is: 'Communion table—wooden table which was used in the place of an altar in Elizabethan and Jacobean times.' Yet 'Crucifix' is omitted. Otherwise the glossary is comprehensive and perceptive (e.g. 'Low side window', a feature of chancels which was much discussed by Camdenians who called them lynchosopes, although Mr Child resists such detail).

This booklet must surely help people to appreciate church architecture and therefore it is to be welcomed back.

KENNETH WHITE

**HANS ROOKMAAKER      LINETTE MARTIN**

*Hodder and Stoughton 1979 187pp £3.50*

ISBN 0 340 23958 1

When Hans Rookmaaker died in 1977, aged 55, a friend commented: 'It is wonderful how God can use someone so human.' This superb biography of a man whose legacy is the now flourishing Christian arts scene reveals both the delightful humanity of Rookmaaker and God very clearly at work in his life.

A teenager in Nazi-occupied Holland, he was arrested for distributing underground papers. It was while in solitary confinement that he read a Bible and was converted. Later, he decided to study art as a Christian and became professor of art history at the Free University of Amsterdam.

Hardly a prepossessing figure (stocky and always conservatively dressed in suit and waistcoat) and exceptionally shy (he was a man who longed for close relationships but who found them hard to cope with), he nonetheless influenced students throughout Europe and America.

Hans Rookmaaker is presented fully, warts and all. So we read of his egotistical motivation for being a Reformed Christian professor of art—he wanted to shine where no other man had struck a match. But, of course, his favourite theme was God's hand in history, and here Linette Martin avoids stating philosophy in huge indigestible chunks of type, but instead sets it in the context of cut-and-thrust debate.

'I give you two reasons to make a work of art', Rookmaaker often said, 'That you love God and that you love your neighbour. Remember where the problems of your own age of history lie. Then go to work.'

He saw Protestants as unwilling, even unable, to look at beauty for its own sake. But, as he used to say with some vehemence, 'There is no criticism of culture in the Bible. Solomon had people from the pagan world to help him build the Temple. The people were always reminded not to follow pagan gods but that was something different. They could make use of skills and workmanship to make their Temple beautiful for the Lord.' He didn't mind the blunt approach, either. His popularity took a knock on the occasion he showed slides of Rubens nudes at a church conference!

Rookmaaker liked to ask many questions, the like of which made his hearers 'dig deep into their heads'. He did not so much tell you things, recalled one student, as make you reflect on the nature of things. Linette Martin's achievement is to convey just how Rookmaaker did this so ably. And her readers, in their turn, are drawn to reflect on the man, on his beliefs, and on the God who inspired them.

DAVID COOMES

**AN HUMBLER HEAVEN      WILLIAM REES-MOGG**

*first published by Hamish Hamilton 1977*

*Collins Fount 1979 99pp 95p*

ISBN 0 00 625154 4

William Rees-Mogg, editor of *The Times* since 1967, here gives us his Christian testimony. It is an absorbing (and in these days of trite publishing, welcome) picture of an intellectual finding faith in God through hard evidence and the writings of Evelyn Underhill, Pascal and St Augustine.

Near the end of the book—first published two years ago by Hamish Hamilton—he sums up his beliefs: that a man is by nature a religious animal, that the ground of all religion is love, that the most highly defined and highest truth in religion is Christian, that human society can never be perfect, that

without religion human society must degenerate, that our western society has so degenerated. However, because he is no pessimist, he adds that in his opinion the decline is not irreversible: man even now is beginning to see the falsehood of the claimed triumph of science.

Mr Rees-Mogg is most attracted to Johannine Christianity because 'it has the strongest emphasis on the positive, on affirmation, on saying yes.'

'In a time of hatred, John gives us the Christianity of love; in fear, hope; in distress, joy; and always he gives us Jesus and the Holy Spirit.'

Mr Rees-Mogg, a Catholic, writes honestly of his quest. He is often profound, always stimulating. *An Humbler Heaven* is highly recommended.

DAVID COOMES

## **INTERPRETING RELIGIOUS EXPERIENCE**

PETER DONOVAN

Sheldon Press 1979 120pp £1.95

ISBN 0 85969 154 3

What is a 'religious experience'? Does the phrase refer to a species of cognitive or emotional experience? What part does interpretation play within and outside the experience? What is the relation between certain allegedly religious experiences and accounts of those experiences in words?

Peter Donovan raises such questions carefully and sympathetically, and assesses the place of religious experience as a validator of theological claims in the light of them. He argues that the proper place for religious experience is within an overall religious system and not as the foundation for such a system.

Further support is given to this view by an examination of the claims of H.P. Owen and H.D. Lewis that there is a unique, intuitive apprehension of God. He gently criticizes this position and shows the dangers of thinking of religious experience as a kind of perception.

The final sections look first at the views of different philosophers of religion such as Wisdom and Hick, and argues against them that there is more to religious experience than a certain interpretation of 'the facts' in that religious experience may bring an apprehension of new facts. Donovan then considers attempts to reduce religious experience to exclusively physiological or psychological categories.

The book succeeds in raising a wide range of questions in a clear way, while taking a distinctive (though not original) line of its own. The discussion fails occasionally due to a conflating of many different cases, e.g. visions, emotional reactions, interpretations and mystical experiences, as cases of 'religious experience'. But the book admirably fulfils its aims.

PAUL HELM

## **SHADOWS AND THE DARK: The Problems of Suffering and Evil**

JOHN COWBURN

SCM Press 1979 134pp £2.95

ISBN 0 334 01498 0

This smartly written treatment of the problem of evil, by a New Zealand Jesuit, contains a large number of apt quotations which sent me scurrying to the back of the book for the references. On the question of natural evil, evil



that is not brought about through human choice, Mr Cowburn adopts the view made popular by Teilhard de Chardin, that natural evils are growing pains. But could not God have ordained things differently? As far as I can see, Mr Cowburn's answer to this is incoherent. He says that things could logically have been different but could not possibly have been other than they are (p 24).

What, then, about moral evil—the evil of human choices? Most of the rest of the book is taken up with this. Moral evil is not (*pace* Irenaeus and John Hick) a growing pain, since moral evil involves choices known to be evil. But where does this leave evils due to inadvertence?

What is the relation of God to moral evil? Despite scriptural evidence to the contrary (p 75), God neither directly nor indirectly wills evil. Rightly wishing to emphasize human responsibility, Mr Cowburn does so at the expense of divine sovereignty. On this scheme, God neither foreordains nor foreknows moral evil but creates a universe not knowing what will happen to it. Although Mr Cowburn invokes Augustine as providing the explanation for moral evil, he makes Augustinianism unrecognizable by rejecting any theory of the imputation of sin and by adopting views of divine foreknowledge which Augustine explicitly rejects. The author is so far from the Augustinian position that, unlike classical Jesuit writers, he can find no place even for the 'middle knowledge' of Molin.

The last section, 'The Remedy for Moral Evil', has an interesting discussion of repentance and forgiveness, containing many excellent things. But there is a strange silence over divine forgiveness, and especially the ground of divine forgiveness, and a readiness to identify harm and guilt.

PAUL HELM

## JESUS CHRIST THE ONLY WAY

edited PATRICK SOOKDHEO

*Paternoster Press* 1978 159pp £2.40

ISBN 0 85364 236 2

Part one of this book places before us the rather obvious fact that Britain is now a multi-racial nation and that the church needs to face the realities of this situation. Sadly, our churches still require basic help in understanding other religions and cultures in order to prepare us for right relationships with our immigrant neighbours and for a more effective witness. Patrick Sookdheo has attempted to meet this crying need by editing *Jesus Christ The Only Way*. The two key sections have chapters on 'A Christian Approach' and 'They Speak for Themselves'. In the former, basic principles of relationship with adherents of other faiths are followed by specific discussion of a Christian approach to Islam, Jews and Oriental faiths. In the latter, we are given an apologetic for Buddhism, Hinduism, Islam, Judaism and Sikhism by leaders of those faiths.

In 150 pages we could hardly expect much depth from a book which attempts to cover vast subjects. Perhaps it reflects the abysmal ignorance of our churches that this sort of book is needed! Actually the chapters vary considerably. Some are well written and do contain considerable content (e.g. Kenneth Howkins' chapters on 'Christianity, Truth and Dialogue' and 'Non-Christian Religions: some biblical guidelines'), but there are also several rather weak contributions which would have profited from more professional editorial assistance.

All in all this is a useful book in our current situation. May it be read by many and so lead to fruitful mission to all races in Britain!

MARTIN GOLDSMITH

## THE IDEA OF JUSTICE IN CHRISTIAN PERSPECTIVE JAN DINGERINK

Wedge Toronto 1978 59pp Ca \$2.95 Canadian ISBN 0 88906 102 5

There are many names with which to conjure in this learned little book, *Multum in parvo*, it is an offering to the unwary, tempted to quote pre-digested summaries of demanding original works.

The author, professor of Reformed philosophy at the universities of Utrecht and Gröningen, observes a totalitarian tendency in increasing government and lawmaking power, not only in established communist states and emerging Third World countries, but also among western democracies. Coupled with an abrogation of state responsibility for penal or moral offences such as abortion, we see advocates of freedom regarding government as the organ to guarantee it by lawmaking. With totalitarian tendencies go anarchistic views of society, and so we are faced in principle with the New Testament 'man of lawlessness', wanting to be a law unto himself. Technocrats and social planners have the final say in the resulting bureaucracy, and the true idea of justice disappears. He sees these conceptions emanating less from Marx than from Rousseau and his Social Contract.

He traces the idea of justice from pre-Socratic sophistry to Plato and Aristotle via Socrates to the Stoics and Seneca. His historical overview then bypasses the ancient post-classical period and the Middle Ages altogether, and goes on to the Renaissance and western humanistic thought. He sees the concept of natural law in Grotius, Locke, Rousseau and Kant as moving social justice in a totalitarian direction, entirely without help from Marx.

He discerns justice in Christian thinkers in relation to the idea of a divine, created order, save in what is to him the uncharacteristic thought of Barth and Ellul. His basis is Augustine's sovereign God of creation, and he gives considerable space to Thomas Aquinas and his acknowledgment of a timeless, unchangeable natural law. He concludes with Brunner's relativizing of creation ordinances, wherein he sees the influence of Gnosticism.

Finally, there is a section on justice in a pluralistic society, to see if we can arrive at a more cohesive homogeneous conception of justice in its inexhaustible structural diversity. Since this remains God's world, though threatened with destruction through the Fall, Christians can make an essential contribution to this quest; because of Christ's reconciling work, God's world moves towards a new destiny, via the last judgement.

This seminal essay delineates the basic components of a Christian conception of justice, in the light of the philosophy of the Amsterdam school. It should trigger off further constructive thought, in an emancipated age of self-determination and equality—which cries out for justice, yet teeters on the edge of 1984.

JACK WALLACE

## A CHRISTIAN UNION IN LABOUR'S WASTELAND

edited EDWARD VANDERKLOET

Wedge Toronto 1978

Norfolk Press UK 1978 139pp £2.95

Canadian ISBN 0 88906 101 7

UK ISBN 0 85211 031 6

This book is not what it seems at first glance—a description of the activities of

Christians in factories. It is instead a collection of essays celebrating the founding of a Christian Trade Union in Canada twenty-five years ago. The Christian Labour Association of Canada (CLAC) was set up in 1952 to accomplish social change which its founders believed was not possible either by individuals acting alone or through 'other agents of normative social change'. Its supporters (judging from the essays) have a number of other motives for pursuing what appears to be a forlorn cause. Among them are 'to present a witness to his Name in the adversary system of Canadian Labour'; 'to be a movement alongside the existing Labour movement'; 'an agency of Christian cultural activity'; 'an archetype for the manifold Christian organizations that must yet come'; and so on.

The essays are in praise of the institution which has attracted some support among secular construction workers in Canada—largely, one suspects, as an alternative to the rather ruthless 'teamster' union. There is a lot of scriptural quotations about the Christian role in society, and I suppose one must not be surprised at the preponderance of names with Dutch origins among the essayists as the theological outlook of the union and its supporters is based on the writings and teaching of Dooyeweerd. His notion of the alternative institution as the principal method for Christians to fulfil their obligations for being salt and light in society has some support among Anglicans—our schools bear testimony to this—but the more orthodox approach is to encourage Christians to excel in their callings and work through the existing institutions, reforming their structures and preserving those values which are consistent with Scripture.

This is a rather expensive 139 pages, but it is good to have on record the experiences of others in one of the really difficult areas of national life.

SIMON WEBLEY

## HUMAN SCIENCE AND HUMAN DIGNITY (London Lectures in Contemporary Christianity) DONALD MACKAY

*Hodder and Stoughton 1979 126pp £2.95*

ISBN 0 340 23264 1

The advance of human biology and computer technology especially have thrown up, for the Christian, a number of questions of a potentially very troublesome kind about the nature of man and about what it means to be human. Has this advance debunked man, and taken from humanness the dignity it has always been considered to have? Do we now know that man is 'nothing but' a very complex computer? Are mental processes linked so closely to physiological events, themselves subject to physico-chemical laws, that we can no longer believe in free will and moral responsibility? Are foreseeable developments from modern break-throughs in knowledge—genetic engineering, cloning, the artificial manipulation of behaviour—so alarming that work in these directions ought to be halted at once? These are some of the questions that are troubling serious minds. Here is a book that deals with them, and does so at the highest level of scholarship, integrity and sympathetic understanding.

Professor Donald Mackay is Granada Research Professor at the University of Keele. He is an eminent physicist and the head of a team working on the information-processing mechanisms of the brain. He has an excellently informed and a keenly logical mind, and moreover, what is very unusual in a scientist of his standing, a large and reverent understanding of the Bible. It is this latter which he uses to stimulate, guide and inform his approach. There

is nothing obscurantist, evasive or makeshift in his apologetic; no special pleading, no smokescreens, nor, so far as the reviewer could see, any questionable steps in logic. The biblical presuppositions are openly acknowledged. This is a most rewarding book and, as I remarked on a previous occasion, one for passing on to any scientific or philosophic Nicodemus. It abounds in happy and telling analogies. One that will long remain with me is that of the two air-conditioners sharing a room but with unequal control settings. Alas, they end up each flat-out in opposition to the other, and with a result satisfying neither. Give them both the same 'goal': the threat of 'overwork' vanishes, and all is harmony and success.

DOUGLAS SPANNER

### **GUILT: Curse or Blessing**

**ARTHUR H. BECKER**

*Augsberg 1977 144pp hardcover US \$7.95  
paperback US \$3.95*

USA ISBN 0 8066 1599 0  
USA ISBN 0 8066 1588 5

Dr Becker is an American professor of pastoral care and ethics, and has served as a parish pastor, hospital chaplain, and supervisor of clinical pastoral education.

In the foreword Dr Becker states that his aim in writing this book is 'to relate the ministry, teachings, death and resurrection of Jesus Christ to the resolution of guilt. Our concern is to understand the divine creative intent in the phenomenon of guilt feelings and how the gospel resolves guilt.' He says that guilt, like pain, is agonizing, but has its positive side—it alerts us to the fact that we have endangered a relationship that is important to us. The whole thrust of this book is that constructive guilt is rooted in love.

Dr Becker's wide-ranging coverage of the theological and psychological implications begins with an analysis of guilt. He continues his definition of the dynamics of healthy guilt with its counterbalancing fear of rejection and hope for reconciliation. There is a particularly stimulating chapter on conscience: its development from the static position (a closed system of inherited customs that are cherished as inviolate) to the enlightened position (operating on the basis of self-discovered and tested values). Dr Becker lists six lively and thought-provoking characteristics of the enlightened conscience—for instance, the creative aspect: 'The creative conscience is willing to entertain the question and struggle for a decision rather than simply asserting the rule . . . it is willing to be counter-cultural when occasion calls', i.e. confronting contemporary culture by creative values (e.g. 'Are we simply using each other in the sexual encounter?').

Inevitably Dr Becker has to examine guilt feelings which lead to repentance, and destructive guilt feelings which lead to inability to feel forgiven and to forgive oneself.

I would recommend this book wholeheartedly as an excellent study for personal reading, and for help in pastoral situations. Its Americanisms are fairly innocuous. I do hope some British publishing house will soon recognize what an asset this would be in our Christian bookshops.

MYRA CHAVE-JONES

### **EROS DEFILED JOHN WHITE**

*first published in USA by IVCF 1977  
IVP 1978 168pp £1.25*

ISBN 0 85110 407 X

IVP and John White are to be congratulated for grasping the prickly nettle of

sexuality in the modern setting and producing a down-to-earth, wholesome and biblical approach to the all too often embarrassing questions of sexual behaviour. John White has a clear standard for Christian sexual behaviour in mind, and brings the whole variety of sexual behaviour to that bar in a loving, pastoral way. He is true to the whole gospel of love and forgiveness at the same time as upholding God's standards for mankind.

The author's style is easy and he uses examples well. He does not duck any of the 'hard' questions and looks at many different biblical passages. The book is a blend of morality, psychiatry, practical counselling, and a biblical attempt to look at the issues. He examines the nature of sex and sexual pleasure, premarital and marital sexual activity, adultery and homosexuality. The concluding chapters are a stirring Anabaptist call to discipline in the life of the church. This requires careful and serious attention at a time when the immorality of the present age and the force of renewal within the church are both calling for strict discipline in the church. There is one unease about his argument. White makes some use of 'what is natural' in relation to the rejection of homosexuality as a pattern of sexual life, and against masturbation and other sexual practices which stop short of the normal sexual act of intercourse. This reliance on what is 'natural' may prove too much for him. If taken literally, it must exclude all forms of birth control except 'natural' methods. What is natural has a part to play in the deciding of norms for sexual morality, but we need to be clear how we arrive at the content of 'natural'.

The book, however, is a must for every pastor and counsellor.

E. DAVID COOK

## **IS THE HOMOSEXUAL MY NEIGHBOUR?**

L. SCANZONI and V. R. MOLLENKOTT

SCM Press 1978 159pp £2.95

ISBN 0 334 00724 0

Part of SCM's continuing series of publications on the theme of homosexuality, the latest offering claims to be a biblical treatment of the subject, taking seriously the traditional arguments against the practice of homosexuality. It begins by asking 'Who is my neighbour?', and then seeks to show how the homosexual person is the modern day Samaritan. Bringing together insights from literature, sociology, science, religious studies and the recent debate in the USA on this subject, the two ladies offer a powerful apologetic for allowing and accepting homosexuality as an alternative pattern of sexuality within the church. Indeed, the last chapter is devoted to an attempt to propose an homosexual ethic for the Christian.

The uncertain basis for much of the argumentation, which is all too often proffered as certain fact, is summed up by a purple passage on pp 5-6, where the writers move from a statistical account of homosexuality (5 to 10 per cent of the population) to the 'possibility' that in any congregation of two hundred, there will be at least sixty people who are affected by the issue of homosexuality, including relatives, etc. This kind of fallacious 'sociologizing' calls in question other of the swashbuckling attempts to make out a case. The major flaw is their reliance on an unexpressed premise—that homosexuality is natural and normal. As it stands, it is used to dismiss most of the 'hard' biblical passages as irrelevant.

The book is more in the tradition of the pamphleteers than of serious academic study. This is a pity. Their love and compassion for Christian homosexuals need to be shared by many more.

E. DAVID COOK

**THE DYNAMICS OF RELIGION: Process and Movement in  
Christian Churches** BRUCE REED

*Darton, Longman and Todd 1978 235pp £3.90*

ISBN 0 232 51424 0

Over the past decade Bruce Reed has been associated with the Grubb Institute and before that with the Christian Teamwork Trust. This book is a basic introduction to the ideas generated by the Grubb Institute.

We have here a study of Christian religion and behaviour 'not from the believer's standpoint, but from that of the human sciences—primarily psychology, anthropology and sociology' (p 2). These sciences are then used to develop an 'oscillation theory of religion' which, it is maintained, is relevant to all religions, including secular varieties. We 'oscillate' between 'S-activity' or periods of disengagement from work, facts etc. in a concern for value, meaning or rest; and 'W-activity' or periods of engagement with work, facts etc. This 'process' is universal in societies, groups and institutions and is to be distinguished from a 'movement', which is more the rationale behind a 'process'.

It is not an easy book to read and certainly not a book for those who are irritated by jargon. However, there are case studies freely employed to illustrate points. We are told, for example (p 163), of how a young curate came to realize that the thriving daughter church—where there were '50 leaders of children's groups and youth groups', 'a strong sense of fellowship' and 'real enthusiasm'—was, if the truth be known, unhealthily providing for the inadequacies and insecurities of its members by offering opportunities for being accepted and belonging; while the old parish church where nobody was involved in anything or with anyone was, in reality, 'a stable centre of community life, standing for the enduring values of the old community'! Perhaps.

In a similar vein, there is the partially true but misleading generalization (p 213) that 'the fastest-growing churches in both Britain and the United States are the fundamentalists who specifically repulse any compromise between themselves and their environments.' This is followed by the conclusion that as, allegedly, there is no real interaction between these churches and society at large, such wasteful 'hyperactive behaviour' should be terminated. But as among the fastest-growing churches in Britain are evangelical Anglican churches, often with a competent social ethic and hardly 'fundamentalist' in a narrow sense, and as in the United States the Southern Baptists—who are the fastest-growing 'main-line' denomination—have produced the current President, these and similar ideas surely need modification.

DAVID HOLLOWAY

**CHURCHES AND COMMUNITIES: An Approach to Development in the Local Church**

GEORGE LOVELL and CATHERINE WIDDICOMBE

*Search Press 1978 218pp £2.95*

ISBN 0 85532 387 6

This book is a careful and thorough report of a five-year project in which an ecumenical team (forerunner of AVEC, the present service agency for church and community work) worked with sixteen North London churches on their local development problems. Its great value lies in the fact that it is a painstaking record, in an objective way, of what actually happens when the non-directive approach to community work is played consistently at all levels. It is

## CHURCHMAN

not a theory book, nor is it biased apart from the obvious conviction of the authors that the approach works. Thus failures are objectively recorded, and the fact that offers of help are not taken up is examined. Some of the projects are set up with very few people—five mothers who want creative education for themselves, twelve church members having problems over visiting. And some are only for a very short term, recognizing and meeting a short-term need and then finishing, rather than doing what the church usually does and setting up grand schemes which have to go on for eternity. The report describes work with the clergy fraternal, individual clergy and churches, the YMCA (on its internal structures and relationships), a good neighbour scheme, etc.

The very fact that this is not a record of achievements—of things still existing which the team can point to and say, 'We did that'—but rather a record of the teaching and use of methods (particularly approaches to problem-solving and the use of diagrams to analyse relationships, for instance) makes it an invaluable source of material for any who wish to examine and discuss the use of the non-directive approach. I would like to see such a discussion taking a good look at the theological assumptions underlying this approach and at the way in which theological resources can be fed in in a way that does justice to the authority of God's Word. The discussion on pp 125-7 on whether non-Christians can be effective witnesses to Christ as road stewards in a church 'good neighbour' scheme raises in a very open and unjudging way a whole series of such issues. This is a good, honest, provocative book which should have an influence on the way the church of the future relates to its community.

TREVOR LLOYD

## TRAINING FOR COMMUNITY MINISTRIES

8 booklets by various authors, including visual aids

*Collins Liturgical 1978 Inclusive price £7.00*

I can't imagine there are many parishes in England now engaged in training for parent meetings (i.e. training ordinary parishioners to conduct the preparation for infant baptism), training assistant ministers of the eucharist, training sacristans, training hymn-leaders, training readers, training preachers, training those who will lead the community service in the absence of an ordained minister, and training funeral leaders. More's the pity! We tend to think that such activities are either too exalted or too humble to need the simple and practical training suggested by these booklets. Those who read them are sure to benefit from their positive thinking about 'every-member ministry', and the realistic attempts at self-help in the absence of ordained clergy that they encourage. They have been written (and illustrated) to meet the needs of Roman Catholic parishes in central Africa and would be difficult to use as they stand in England, but they contain plenty of common sense, and could be adapted.

In fact, a specifically English edition would have deprived them of their character, for it would never have included sections on 'training ministers who are illiterate' (distinguishing between those who have a good memory and those who don't), or 'ancestor beliefs and the Christian faith'. In this way a point that can never be overstressed is made obliquely: we must begin where people are, and we must not overwhelm them with theological and liturgical technicalities. The approach here is very gentle. After the first

training session with future baptismal leaders they are to be asked, 'Who talked most at the meeting? The leader? Why not?' If this simple, almost naive, but extremely practical, teaching can produce such exemplary behaviour in the trainers it must be worth developing!

NICHOLAS SAGOVSKY

**THE BOOK OF COMMON ORDER (1979)  
CHURCH OF SCOTLAND**

Saint Andrew Press 1979 182pp £3.50

ISBN 0 7152 0391 6

The 1940 *Book of Common Order* of the Church of Scotland began with 'Preparation for Worship' and 'The Order of Public Worship'—a series of orders for (non-eucharistic) morning and evening worship, together with three orders especially for children. All that has virtually disappeared from the 1979 *Book of Common Order*, which gives a mere two pages to the briefest outline of 'the main Sunday Service when the Lord's Supper is not celebrated' and promises a companion volume with sixteen sets of prayers for morning worship and other liturgical material relating to the Christian year. The new volume contains: The Divine Service (three orders for Holy Communion, outline for non-eucharistic worship, outline for abbreviated Holy Communion), Christian Initiation for both infants and adults, including a composite order for Holy Baptism, Confirmation and Admission to the Lord's Supper, two orders for the Celebration of Marriage, two for Funerals, and one for the Ordination and Admission of Elders, together with a lectionary for Sundays on a two-year cycle (in effect, that of the Joint Liturgical Group), two sets of collects ('thou' and 'you' form) and one set of ten proper prefaces for the Christian year ('thou' form). The outstanding change, then, is that the three orders for the Holy Communion now take pride of place.

The first order follows the broad outline of the first 1940 order, but with certain significant changes: the major sections of the rite are clearly indicated; the *Gloria in Excelsis* is introduced after the collect; the sermon follows the gospel, and the creed may be said directly after the sermon; the intercessions come in two places, the more personal and particular intercessions being placed at the end of 'the prayer of consecration' (*sic*); the words of institution are now included in this prayer, a change which leads in effect to their threefold (and, if the optional 'warrant' is used, fourfold!) repetition in the order. The second order is a radical revision of the 1940 second order and an abbreviated form of the first, with variations such as intercession in litany form and, for some reason, no congregational response to the epistle. The third order has the 'you' form and follows the ICET texts for the creed, *Sursum Corda*, *Sanctus*, etc., but is at times startlingly gauche:

Your Son Jesus Christ is to be thanked and praised for his gifts and, above all, for that holy mystery which he instituted, who, on the night of his betrayal, took bread, and after giving thanks to God, as we have done, he broke it and said . . . [p 36]

One section is simply called 'The Action'!

All three orders (and the other forms of service) show intriguingly diverse influences. The 1940 order for the Communion is followed at 'we offer to thee this bread and this cup'; we find 'holy things for holy people' and 'The Great Entrance'. Only when elders are ordained does the alternative of old and new forms fail: there the 'thou' form alone is suggested. However, a new reading (Mark 10: 42-45) replaces the rather stern charge 'not to fear the faces of the wicked'.



We are reminded in the introduction that 'in the publication of any liturgical material in the Church of Scotland . . . we eschew in the main definitive forms and provide only models', so perhaps the more awkward expressions in this new book will be worn smooth in use.

NICHOLAS SAGOVSKY

**THE WAY OF THE PREACHER SIMON TUGWELL**

Darton, Longman and Tadd 1979 200pp £3.95 ISBN 0 232 51366 X

Two themes are here interwoven: the practice of preaching and the early history of the Dominican Order. There is much in the author's treatment of the former which will be familiar to evangelicals called to the preaching ministry, but there are also ideas which are not met with as frequently as perhaps they ought to be. In the chapter on 'The Grace of Preaching' we find an emphasis upon the divine gift. Preaching skills can be acquired only by hard work, but at the end of the day 'it is only by God's gift that a man has the ability to preach.' Again, in a subsequent chapter on 'The Dependence of the Preacher', the helpful point is made that the preacher grows into a richer and more complete human being himself as he preaches to others. In this way the preacher will find that 'preaching is indeed a school of spirituality for the preacher.'

In regard to the history of the Dominicans, the author tries to show how the life of the preacher relates to the rest of his experience as a Christian and as a member of a religious order. This is a variation on the theme often treated by religious in these days: how do particular aspects of the monastic way of life fit in with the total picture of what it means to be a Christian? The Dominicans made preaching their emphasis and would let nothing interfere with it. The author presents this as a bringing into focus of the whole calling of the Christian by a single-minded dedication to one particular ministerial task.

J. C. P. COCKERTON

**A BOOK OF CHRISTIAN PRAYER**

LESLIE F. BRANDT

Kingsway 1978 96pp £1.10 ISBN 0 86065 015 4

In his preface, the author tells his readers that his own prayers are 'personal talks with God in everyday words', and that this book is 'a sampling of how twentieth-century Christians might verbalize their feelings in conversation with God.' The prayers are divided into sections: morning, work, difficult times, special people, relationship with God, praise and thanks, nation and world, evening. They are very much geared to the everyday needs of everyday people (fairly literate ones, that is). Individual prayers have titles like 'Success is not Necessarily Important', 'When it's difficult to Love', 'When at Odds with my Partner', 'Pick up the Broken Pieces'.

If anyone discovering this book had not realized that they could present such ordinary needs to the Almighty, then Brandt's prayers should encourage them. They are humane and homely, and they cover a wide range of experience and need. Since Michel Quoist first published his *Prayers of Life* there has been a wave of popularity for such collections. But, whereas Quoist

clearly scored with his keen pictorial style, Brandt uses few word pictures. Consequently, I found the style pedestrian, with little colour or life. And although the topics he chooses are comfortingly everyday, he does little, I found, to lift his readers into those aspects of the character of God in which our earthly needs are most likely to undergo the transformations we hanker after.

ANNE LONG

**TURNING TO PRAYER** RICHARD HARRIES

*Mowbrays 1978 142pp £1.25*

ISBN 0 264 66492 2

Richard Harries, a London vicar and writer, aims here to answer people's questions about prayer and to offer practical suggestions as to how to pray.

Why do we block our inclination to cry out to God? This is his starting-point, and he challenges those attitudes which often prevent us from discovering personal dependence on God. He then looks at different facets of prayer: thanksgiving, praise, self-examination which leads to an understanding of sin and its confession. He investigates the dynamics of intercession in quite a philosophical way, and recommends moving beyond the shopping-list kind of intercession to 'a continuing attempt to pray according to the mind of Christ'. (I wish he had explored this in more detail.) He considers the place of feelings in prayer, and helpfully suggests that the whole range of our feelings, positive and negative, be brought into prayer. The place of spiritual reading, body position and stillness are included. And he makes a plea for integrating our newspaper reading and viewing into our discipleship by holding news items before God.

I found this book rather plodding at first; it became more interesting as he progressed. His apologetic for prayer, though well considered, felt rather laboured, whereas for me, at least, his suggestions on the practices of prayer were more helpful. It made me wonder what sort of readership he had in mind.

He uses a whole range of literary extracts in each chapter: 'Waiting' by R. S. Thomas (p 139) is a gem. It is a pity there are several printing errors.

ANNE LONG

**SOMEONE WHO BECKONS**

TIMOTHY DUDLEY-SMITH

*IVP 1978 135pp £1.75*

ISBN 0 85110 587 4

In this attractively produced paperback, the author records 'some of the talks I have had with God, and the way what I read shapes the prayers I say.' Under various themes, he juxtaposes a Bible reading with some fragment of reading he has enjoyed, and then writes his own prayer arising out of these. He advises the reader against rushing through them, but to try one a day or one a week for reflection, using them as a springboard for his own prayers.

There is no particular sequence of themes, but they cover an interesting variety of biblical passages and topics. 'Seeds in Springtime' focuses on creation and new life. 'Stern Love' combines a reading from Jeremiah with an extract from Michael Burns' *Mr Lyward's Answer*. The author's prayer reads thoughtfully on God's stern love. 'To Bear his Cross' includes a cameo from the biography of Charles Simeon. 'Telling Jesus', on intercession, combines

## CHURCHMAN

the miracle at Cana with a commentary on it from Hallesby. The author, in his prayer, asks that his intercessions move from being 'soft-centred' to something more intelligent and obedient.

The literary extracts used are varied in viewpoint and style. He quotes from C.S Lewis, Tournier, Rose Macaulay, Francis Schaeffer, John Newton, John Stott—a rare medley! But they all provide good food for digestion. The author's prayers are marked by sensitivity, humility and reverence. He sometimes expresses theological truths in illuminating ways (e.g. p 41 on sin). Sometimes his vocabulary is rather heavy and prosaic, but this is an imaginative book which could help many to pray more reflectively and resourcefully.

ANNE LONG

### A HANDBOOK OF CHURCH MUSIC

edited CARL HALTER and CARL SCHALK

Concordia, St Louis 1978 303pp US\$14.95

ISBN 0 570 01316 X

### KEY WORDS IN CHURCH MUSIC: Definition Essays on Concepts, Practices, and Movements of Thought in Church

edited CARL SCHALK

Concordia, St Louis 1978 365pp US\$14.95

ISBN 0 570 01317 8

These two books, though available separately, are designed to complement each other. The *Handbook* deals with specific areas of church music, such as the music of the congregation, the music of the choir, the use of instruments, etc., whereas *Key Words* is more historically orientated, giving, as the subtitle states, 'definition essays on concepts, practices, and movements of thought in church music.' The *Handbook* is valuably cross-referenced to the essays in *Key Words*, and *Key Words* has a comprehensive system of cross-referencing for its own entries. The two books are 'intended as tools for practising church musicians and all who care about the musical life of the church at worship' (*Handbook* p9).

These beautifully produced volumes, with their musical examples, illustrations (one unfortunately printed upside-down!), reading lists, suggestions for practical performance, etc., are a substantial contribution to the understanding of the nature and function of church music today. I have no hesitation in commending them as the finest of their kind to have appeared in the English language to date, even though they do not quite rival the fourth volume of *Leiturgia: Handbuch des Evangelischen Gottesdienstes—Die Musik des Evangelischen Gottesdienstes*, Kassel, 1961. Much of the writing on church music in English has confined itself to the music itself, and not enough attention has been given to its function as a vehicle for the worship of the people of God. We have had many historical surveys which analyse and evaluate church music as music but which say little about its liturgical use. Similarly, there are many books and booklets which clearly outline the musical qualities and abilities a church musician should have, but are silent on the question of the spiritual qualifications required and on the question of his place in the ministry of the local church. Here, at last, are such important matters given their rightful place.

Most of the essays are written by the contributing editors of the much respected semi-annual *Church Music*, published by Concordia Publishing House, St Louis, since 1966, or by those who have written substantial articles for the journal. The perspective, as one would expect, is Lutheran, but much, if not all, of what is written has a wider significance.

The *Handbook* begins with a masterly 'Affirmation' on music in worship which briefly examines the context and spiritual function of church music. Then follow seven substantial studies: Eugene L. Brand writes on the liturgical life of the church; Carl Schalk offers an historical survey of Lutheran worship in Germany and America; Louis G. Nuechterlein considers the music of the congregation; Carlos R. Messerli, the music of the choir; Herbert Gotsch and Edward W. Klammer, the use of instruments; A.R. Kretzmann, the relationship of pastor and church musician; and Richard Hillert, a leading American composer, gives an appraisal of the state of contemporary church music. Again it needs to be underlined that although the contributions are written from an American Lutheran point of view, there is much to learn from them, especially as English Anglicans and American Lutherans share common liturgical roots in that the Book of Common Prayer was a unifying influence for American Lutherans as they changed from their many European languages to English in the latter part of the nineteenth century (see *Handbook*, p47f).

The contributions are often provocative and may challenge us to take stock of many things taken for granted. Neuchterlein: 'In the later 19th century John B. Dykes, W.H. Monk, Arthur Sullivan and others wrote tunes almost totally devoid of melodic content or interest, depending instead for their popularity on exploiting harmonic possibilities. The increasing use of chromaticism gave them a sweetness which made them immediately popular, but they were lacking in musical substance.' (*Handbook*, p116) 'It is not the function of the organist to entertain, to provide meaningless meanderings at their keyboard, or to fill every quiet moment with music.' (*Handbook*, p23) Hillert: 'Music for its own sake, whether hymnic, choral, or instrumental, is misplaced when it is used [in worship] merely as a programme filler.' (*Handbook*, p237)

The great strength of these studies is that the spiritual purpose of church music is never allowed to be pushed into the background. Neuchterlein: 'The music of the congregation, like all other music of the church, is God's own gift to his people. It is a gift mediated through the talents of composers, arrangers, and parish musicians; yet its true source is God's own Spirit, who inspires the exercising and sharing of musical talent for the glorification of God and the edification of God's redeemed family.' (*Handbook*, p106) Messerli, in enumerating the qualifications a choir leader should have, puts at the head of his list: '1) A strong Christian faith that expresses itself naturally in word and deed.' (*Handbook*, p134) Kretzmann: 'Each worship service should begin with the assurance that both in the pulpit and in the music there has been preparation, consideration, understanding, true love of the gospel, and true co-operation.' (*Handbook*, p219f)

The recurring theme of the *Handbook* is the need for contemporary church music, however forward-looking, to have its roots firmly planted in the soil of the church's experience over the years. In general, the contemporary issues are presented in the *Handbook* and the wider historical perspective is given in *Key Words*. *Key Words* is a programmed book of 86 essays in which a topic can be pursued from any starting-point of the reader's choosing. It does mean that if the book is read from cover to cover, there is some repetition of material. But it is designed as a reference work and the repetition is a strength rather than a weakness. Topics range from 'Anthem' to 'Voluntary', 'Anglican Chant' to 'Performance Practice', with substantial contributions on 'Church Music History', 'Hymnody', and 'Theology of Church Music'. This last is particularly important since there is, as the author points out (*Key Words*, p351), very little written in English on the subject. Each essay has a brief reading list appended. There are signs that some of these lists were not compiled as carefully as they might have been. Under 'Moravian Music' one

would have expected to find a reference to J.T. Müller, *Hymnologisches Handbuch zum Gesangbuch der Brüdergemeine*, Herrnhut, 1916 (reprint Hildesheim 1977). On p151 the wrong edition of Jacobi's *Psalmodia Germanica* is referred to: the American edition of 1765 (not 1756) was a reprint of the 1765 London edition, not of the London edition of 1722. Under 'Passion' only the first edition of Basil Smallman's *The Background of Passion Music* is noted, rather than the second, revised and enlarged, edition, New York, 1970, and reference should have been made to two basic works: Otto Kade, *Die Ältere Passionskomposition bis zum Jahre 1631*, Gütersloh, 1893 (reprint Hildesheim 1971); Werner Braun, *Die mitteldeutsche Choralpassion im achtzehnten Jahrhundert*, Berlin, 1960; and perhaps also Andreas Glöckner, 'Bach and the Passion Music of his Contemporaries' in *The Musical Times*, July 1975, Vol. 116, pp 613-16 (recently reissued in a much expanded form in *Bach-Jahrbuch*, 1977, pp 75-119). But these are small blemishes. The two volumes will do much to improve our understanding and practice of church music if those responsible for the ministry of music and the ministry of the word in our worship make the effort to study them and put into practice the principles here clearly set out.

ROBIN A. LEAVER

## CORRECTION

We are sorry that one of the book reviews in our last issue was almost unintelligible! This was due to a typesetting error at the last moment. We apologize to our reviewer, our readers, and the publishers, and reprint the review below.

### WHAT IS A GOSPEL? The Genre of the Canonical Gospels

CHARLES H. TALBERT

first published by Fortress Press USA 1977

SPCK 1978 147pp £3.50

ISBN 0 281 03628 4

Scholars have argued for years about the literary genre of the four NT Gospels. If a consensus has been reached, it is that they represent a unique type of writing—the *kerygma* is narrative form—but are *not* biographies. Now Professor Talbert has reopened this debate by claiming that, after all, they *are* biographies—although not in the modern sense.

The case on which scholars such as Bultmann base their judgement that the Gospels exemplify a unique literary form—their mythical, cultic and world-negating features—is first challenged. Talbert argues that these elements *also* belong to certain types of Graeco-Roman biography (such as those by Diogenes Laertius and Philostratus); and that, while the evangelists told their story of Jesus in a distinctive manner, they followed three of five distinguished conventions belonging to this kind of ancient literature.

Professor Talbert's provocative thesis is advanced with clarity and impeccable scholarship. He displays an easy familiarity with a wealth of material, both biblical and classical, and his case is well argued. Certain questions, however, remain. For example, are Bultmann's criteria for deciding the nature of a Gospel the only ones? If the background of the evangelists (including the fourth!) was essentially that of Palestinian Judaism, were they likely to have been so strongly influenced by Hellenistic literary forms? What are the implications of the term 'mythical' as used in this discussion? And so on.

Professor Talbert has not spoken the last word on this important subject. But he has broadened our biblical horizons, and opened up a refreshingly new line of enquiry into the nature of the Gospels which New Testament specialists cannot now ignore.

STEPHEN S. SMALLEY