

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php

Book Reviews

THE BIBLE IN ITS WORLD: Archaeology and the Bible Today **K. A. KITCHEN**

Paternoster Press 1977 168pp £2.20

ISBN 0 85364 211 7

Though he does not say so in this book, I believe the author was provoked to write it by Magnus Magnusson's TV series on biblical archaeology. Though very disappointed by those programmes, I am glad they succeeded in persuading Dr Kitchen to put his ideas on paper and thus make them available to a much larger audience than those who are able to hear him lecture.

Like his earlier volume, *Ancient Orient and Old Testament*, this is a polemical work challenging many of the assumptions of OT scholarship. These, Kitchen argues, rest on outdated nineteenth-century evolutionary theories rather than on the more objective comparative data that have emerged through the work of near-eastern archaeologists who have taught us what the world of the Bible was really like. In the past, unfortunately, the shrillness of Kitchen's critiques has deafened some scholars to the soundness of his arguments. The tone of this volume is more charitable, and it may therefore be hoped that its originality will be more widely appreciated and its arguments fairly evaluated.

After an initial chapter pointing out the limitations of archaeology, Kitchen reviews in turn the main periods of biblical history and discusses what light has been shed on the various books of the OT by other near-eastern texts. For example, in chapter 2 he observes that the basic sequence of events in Genesis 1-11 finds several parallels in Mesopotamian works.

Chapter 3 summarizes the discoveries from the Syrian city of Ebla, so far as they have been published. Ebla promises to be the most significant excavation for biblical studies since the discovery of the Dead Sea Scrolls. An archive of more than 16,000 tablets has been found, dating from the late third millennium BC. Many of these tablets are written in a language akin to Hebrew and contain biblical-sounding names. Popular press reports about Ebla are not always reliable, while the more scholarly treatments are inaccessible. Dr Kitchen has therefore put many in his debt by producing a sober synopsis of the scholarly publications about Ebla with a full bibliography for those who want to pursue the subject further.

Those familiar with Kitchen's earlier works will find fewer surprises in the succeeding chapters, but there are some new lines such as the literary affinities of the patriarchal narratives, the reliability of oral tradition and literary parallels to the book of Proverbs. In each case Kitchen argues that comparison with near-eastern parallels supports the basic integrity and trustworthiness of the books of the OT. Thus, while biblical scholars will profit from the new ideas in this book, the ordinary layman will also have his faith strengthened by

CHURCHMAN

reading it. It is just the sort of book the minister ought to have on his shelves ready to lend to members of his flock worried by the sceptical views the media love to air.

GORDON WENHAM

DOES BIBLICAL STUDY STILL BELONG TO THEOLOGY?

JAMES BARR

Clarendon Press: OUP 1978 17pp unpriced

ISBN 0 19 951513 1

Professor James Barr devotes his inaugural lecture to an important question of method, the relation of biblical study to theology. There is much to be said for a separation of the close link between the two. University courses in biblical studies independent of Faculties of Theology and not specifically connected with ministerial training have developed in recent years, and biblical scholarship as practised today uses wide-ranging sources and tends to become increasingly autonomous in character. Yet, while pleading for autonomy in this lower sense, he acknowledges a higher sense in which the traditional link can and must be maintained.

H. E. W. TURNER

UNDERSTANDING THE OLD TESTAMENT

A. H. J. GUNNEWEG

(first published in Germany 1977)

SCM Press 1978 265pp £7.00

ISBN 0 334 01727 0

Professor Gunneweg of Bonn opens this survey with the empire-staking claim that the hermeneutical problem of the OT is 'the problem of Christian theology'. Then, after a historical survey which concentrates on the approaches to this problem within the NT and on the treatment of the OT since the Reformation, he takes up three major foci of discussion: the OT as law and as a book about the covenant, as the document of an alien religion, and as a history book (salvation-history, typology, and prophecy and fulfilment come here). He sees none of these approaches as offering more than partial answers, and himself stresses that one must listen to the text itself rather than impose on it some scheme, that the 'God-talk' of the OT is the presupposition of the New, and that the OT is indispensable because it provided the very language in which the Christian proclamation had to express itself. I found the last chapter which includes these points difficult to follow (like the work of German writers on hermeneutics, which is reflected here) but appreciated the input from a different angle which it offers.

The book is chiefly a conducted tour through German scholarship; I looked in vain for reference in the text to Anglo-Saxon writers such as Barr or Childs, who have made significant contributions to this debate (and whose views offer interesting points of contact and contrast with Professor Gunneweg's). The chapter on the NT's

approaches would benefit from setting its topic in the context of contemporary Jewish biblical interpretation (another largely non-German field), and there is considerable overlapping between the opening historical surveys and the later topical treatment. Not all the English translations of continental works are noted (I noticed Westermann's *The OT and Jesus Christ*, van Ruler's *Christian Church and the OT*, TDOT, and von Rad's essay 'Offene Fragen . . .' in his *Theology II*).

JOHN GOLDINGAY

THANKSGIVING FOR A LIBERATED PROPHET

R. N. WHYBRAY

JSOT Sheffield 1978 184pp hardcover £5.25 ISBN 0 905774 09 4
 paperback £2.75 ISBN 0 905774 04 3

REDATING THE EXODUS AND CONQUEST

J. J. BIMSON

JSOT Sheffield 1978 351pp hardcover £7.45 ISBN 0 905774 10 8
 paperback £4.95 ISBN 0 905774 03 5

THE STORY OF KING DAVID D. M. GUNN

JSOT Sheffield 1978 164pp hardcover £5.45 ISBN 0 905774 11 6
 paperback £2.95 ISBN 0 905774 05 1

These three books are part of a major series of supplements to the newly established *Journal for the Study of the Old Testament*. They are the fruit of advanced research, and will be best appreciated by those with some technical competence in the areas concerned. Each in its own way offers a challenge to widely-held beliefs, and will have to be reckoned with accordingly.

Whybray offers a provocative interpretation of Isaiah 53. He raises two central questions: 'Does the Servant die?' and 'Is his suffering vicarious?' On both counts Whybray answers in the negative. The presence of theologies of the atonement has been assumed rather than proven. The undeserved suffering is 'shared' and not vicarious. The conclusion of the song speaks of restoration and not resurrection.

An investigation of form suggests that the passage is an individual song of thanksgiving (cf. e.g. Psalm 118). Whybray believes that the Servant is the prophet himself. He had suffered imprisonment because of his work, but has now been restored to the exiles. The author of the song returns thanks.

There is little doubt that the book offers a tenable and even likely exegesis of the issues concerning 'death' and 'vicariousness'. It is less clear, however, that this is inconsistent with a 'national' view of the Servant (e.g. the exiles themselves), and that question must remain open.

Bimson's work on the conquest is an admirably thorough argument for a fifteenth-century date, a view widely rejected in recent years in favour of the thirteenth century. He accepts the fundamental historicity of the biblical tradition, some will think too easily, though he

allows here and there for a degree of simplification (cf. e.g. pp 17, 68). He argues that Exod.1:11 is not a decisive pointer to the thirteenth century, and observes, as have others, that there is nothing definite to link the destruction of thirteenth-century Palestinian cities with Joshua's invasion. He finds that Old Testament chronology generally is easier to understand with a fifteenth-century conquest.

The crux of the argument, however, is Bimson's attempt to extend the end of the Middle Bronze Age from the sixteenth to the fifteenth century. A destruction of Palestinian cities in the fifteenth century is thus secured, and one better attributed to invading Israelites than to hypothetical Egyptian activity. The experts will clearly have to decide whether such a major realignment of accepted chronology is feasible. If it cannot be sustained then the state of the debate will remain much as before.

It has to be added that Bimson does not really contend with those who find 'conquest' a less than satisfactory description of the settlement. Until general agreement is reached on how the biblical material is to be evaluated, it is hard to see much progress being made in this area.

Gunn provides a wide-ranging study of the Succession Narrative (usually identified as 2 Sam. 9-20; 1 Kings 1-2). He concludes that the genre is not history-writing, nor propaganda for the Solomonic succession, nor didactic wisdom, and that the commonly accepted Solomonic date is far from certain.

Gunn's view is that the narrative is a 'story told for the purpose of serious entertainment.' It derives from Israel's story-telling tradition. He also suggests that a major part of 2 Sam.2-4 should be included. There are stylistic grounds for this, and the narrative is given a better beginning. Assumptions that 'succession' was the central theme have led to the neglect of this possibility.

Clearly 'Succession Narrative' is unacceptable on Gunn's view of the chapters. He sees them as essentially an exploration of the interaction between David's private and political worlds.

There is much that is illuminating here, though the possibility of a didactic dimension to the story should not be underestimated. There are many proverbs which are not direct 'moralizing'.

PHILIP BUDD

**THE NEW INTERNATIONAL COMMENTARY ON THE
OLD TESTAMENT: Joel, Obadiah, Jonah and Micah**
LESLIE C. ALLEN

(first published by Eerdmans USA 1976)
Hodder and Stoughton 1978 427pp £5.95

ISBN 0 340 21679 4

For value in sheer pages and printing this commentary would be hard to beat at today's prices; it is even better value in terms of the thorough research which the author has put into it. Is there any commentary or scholarly paper on any of these books which does not

receive mention somewhere in its pages?

The full introductory sections are not stereotyped but deal with subjects appropriate to each work; in every case, however, there is particular attention to literary structure which in each of these books witnesses to remarkable care in composition. The theology of each author is also given a separate section.

In his translation of the text Allen has incorporated a number of insights from recent articles but without wholesale adoption of emendations. Each unusual (and sometimes usual) meaning is documented. He achieves some striking turns of phrase and the poetry would come over meaningfully and with power if read aloud in worship. I noted particularly Obadiah 5-13. The commentary on the text is often memorable too. After the manner of the prophets he slips in allusions which evoke whole scenes: 'God's Nuremberg trial' (p 110), 'the Hiroshima blast of judgement' (p 121) and 'God's demolition team' (p 320). Occasionally a section of commentary becomes hard going and the style involved, but the message of the book of Jonah, for example, is lucid and compelling, its application clear: 'A Jonah lurks in every Christian heart, whimpering his insidious message of smug prejudice, empty traditionalism, and exclusive solidarity.' This concern with application is one of the most noteworthy features of the commentary. As an example I would take Allen's exposition of Micah 3:5-8, where the prophet turns to 'colleagues of his who betrayed their calling', 'despicable renegades grovelling in the dirt for dishonest pennies!', 'Christians can see around them many "a prophet of materialism, a seller of dreams that perish."' Upon them falls the mantle of Micah to see through the flimsy webs of a materialistic society and valiantly to help their neighbours toward divine reality.' On Obadiah (p 172) he points out the need to see the modern Israel in the light of the teaching of the NT.

All in all this is a commentary both for the scholar and for the preacher. To meet the needs of both is an unusual achievement.

JOYCE BALDWIN

AN INTRODUCTION TO THE APOCRYPHA

BRUCE M. METZGER

(first published 1957)

OUP 1977 274pp £2.50 Library of Congress catalogue card no. 57-11636

In the good/bad old days, evangelicals regarded the Apocrypha in much the same way as Anglo-Catholics regarded nonconformists. The Apocrypha was of so little worth in comparison with the Bible that it was not worth reading, except for exams. Besides, it was included in the Roman Catholic Bible, and—*horribile dictu*—it could be used to justify prayers for the dead. The most that could be said for it was said in Article VI. Today it turns up in modern translations,

and it is not so easy to turn on Protestant charm in the bookshop and to ask for 'A Bible without the Apocrypha, please!'

So to find out something sensible about it we cannot do better than turn to Bruce Metzger's book, which has been an excellent hardback guide for a number of years. Naturally there is a detailed introduction to each book, but there is remarkably good additional material on the Apocrypha and the canon, the allusions to it in the NT, its status in the Christian church, and a most unusual chapter on its influence on literature, the arts, and on some of our hymns. An unexpected bonus is a chapter on the NT apocryphal books, about which the average Christian cannot easily obtain information.

Since Professor Metzger was chairman of the RSV Bible Committee, he naturally includes the names and methods of translators of the Apocrypha from Elizabethan times to the present day.

J. STAFFORD WRIGHT

THE DOCTRINE OF THE TRINITY: God's Being is in Becoming EBERHARD JÜNGEL

Scottish Academic Press 1976 110pp £3.25

ISBN 0 7073 0115 7

This book, by the promising young German theologian Eberhard Jüngel, has a double *sitz-im-leben*. On the one hand, it seeks to address the contemporary issue of meaningful speech about God in the light of Barth's theology. The author can refer to his book as a paraphrase of Barth's thought. On the other hand, provoked by Gollwitzer's failure to draw out the implications of the Trinity in his book, *The Existence of God as Confessed by Faith*, the author wants to stress and expound the fundamental hermeneutic implications and function of the doctrine of the Trinity for understanding the character of, and possibility of correct speech about, the true and living God.

Most evangelical readers will want to allow a larger place to general revelation than Barth allows. Many will question whether it is wise to make the 'Revelation of God as Lord' the sole root of the doctrine of the Trinity. Even with these serious misgivings, all will benefit from the concentrated call to test all speech about God by his saving revelation of himself in his Word—Jesus Christ—in whom he discloses himself to be the Triune God. Further, the stress on the concrete, dynamic, relational and loving character of the Triune Being of God is worthy of a great deal of reflection.

The book is not easy reading. Its style is deeply frustrating for those who are used to simple and straightforward speech. One also misses the frequent exegetical studies found in Barth's *Dogmatics*. Still, if one can get by the style, even a general reading of this book will give the reader many insights about the wonder of God's Triune Being and hence about how we may and should think and speak of the Triune God.

JOHN H. RODGERS Jr

THE DOCTRINE OF GOD HERMAN BAVINCK

translated, edited and outlined W. HENDRIKSEN
(first published in English by Eerdmans USA 1951)
Banner of Truth 1977 407pp £3.50

ISBN 0 85151 255 0

Dr Herman Bavinck died in 1921 in his sixty-seventh year, having been professor of theology at Kampen and then at the Free University of Amsterdam. He was a member of the Dutch Royal Academy of Sciences and from 1911 a member of the Upper Chamber in the Dutch Parliament. This book was his most mature work, as a part of his 'Reformed Dogmatic', a four-volume work first issued in 1895-99; the translation here is from the third edition, reprinted from the second in 1918. Professor Hendriksen saw in it an important work from modern Reformed theological circles and translated it, reduced the source-references to the more important, and provided page-headings and summarizing captions to break up the text and make it more serviceable to readers. It was published previously in 1951 in the United States.

The book is divided into seven main sections: The Incomprehensibility of God; God's Knowability (!); God's Names; God's Incommunicable Attributes; God's Communicable Attributes; The Holy Trinity; God's Counsel. There is a detailed foundation laid upon biblical exegesis, in the original languages and with reference to the versions; there is a wide reference to the history of doctrine (patristic, medieval, Reformation) and to the continental theological and philosophical debate from the period of the Enlightenment to the author's own time. In all this Bavinck stands as the continuation of the developed Calvinism that had become established in the Dutch Reformed Church and of course has parallels in this country and in the United States. The present volume is described on the dust-cover as one for a Students' Reformed Theological Library, and as such it will put the reader into a clear understanding of that theological position as at the end of the nineteenth century. It will not of course take into account the developments in all aspects of thought in theology since that time: in biblical language study, theology and exegesis, critical studies, historical theology, and dogmatics and philosophical theology; but bearing that in mind, the discriminating student will find valuable material here. As so often with these editions, we have to complain of lack of indexes of any kind, a considerable drawback in a book of this nature.

G. J. C. MARCHANT

**THE MYSTERY OF THE INCARNATION
NORMAN ANDERSON**

Hodder and Stoughton 1978 160pp £3.50

ISBN 0 340 23265 X

One special ministry of the lay theologian, the well-clued amateur, is to shine the light of common sense into places where professionals have been blinded by their own science. Straightforward down-to-

earthness, and the devastating subtlety of the plain man, are thus his highest virtues, and the more he brings of these the better he serves us. Outstanding examples during the past century have been literary folk like G. K. Chesterton, C. S. Lewis, D. L. Sayers and Harry Blamires; and with them stand those two legal eagles, the Andersons, the late Sir Robert of Scotland Yard and Sir Norman of the London University Institute of Advanced Legal Studies. I do not know if they were related, but if not they ought to have been. Both combine resolute devotion to the living Christ with the advocate's clear-headed thrustfulness and the cross-examiner's suave deadliness. Sir Robert was, and Sir Norman is, a formidable person to meet in the dark night of debate.

Here, Sir Norman plunges into current controversy concerning the Word made flesh, spelling out historic incarnational Christology in his own lucid way and challenging the *Myth*-men, along with John Knox, J. A. T. Robinson and Geoffrey Lampe, over the incoherent, unplausible and impoverishing features of their own 'inspirational' alternative to it. Starting from positions prepared by such authors as H. E. W. Turner, E. L. Mascall, C. F. D. Moule and the unjustly forgotten Frank Weston, and armed with an historical apologetic of which Jesus' well-attested resurrection is the hinge, he bears down on these 'novelists', as the seventeenth century would have called them, in a way which will persuade many that their scepticism is arbitrary and the questions with which they struggle are far from shrewd. It is compelling advocacy, in both its constructive and destructive aspects, and very effective.

Sir Norman's own restatement does not break new ground, but is a stimulating rethink of old paths. His key thoughts are that the incarnate Son depended wholly on the Father, experienced everything through his human nature, and could and did suffer pain. He expounds these notions with clarity and good judgement, building up one of the most impressive declarations of full-blooded Chalcedonianism that our generation has seen. Weighty and warm-hearted, it merits high praise from every standpoint. I could wish that the historical review had been less perfunctory and that the nettle of the cultural relativity of Greek philosophical thought-models (*hypostasis*, etc.) had been more firmly grasped; nonetheless, these lectures add up to an altogether outstanding vindication of the Christology of the creeds.

J. I. PACKER

CHRISTOLOGY AT THE CROSSROADS

JON SOBRINO SJ

(first published in Spanish in Mexico 1976)

SCM Press 1978 434pp £4.95

ISBN 0 334 00223 0

This able book by a Latin American Jesuit presents a radical form of Christology in the context of liberation theology. It is clearly set out

and thoroughly argued, though most readers will find it convenient to read the concluding chapter first as well as in its proper place. He is chiefly indebted to Karl Rahner, Pannenberg and Moltmann, though his extensive demolition work is inspired by Bonhoeffer's 'religionless Christianity'. If pietism and Pentecostalism are excluded, his own tradition does not pass unscathed. Natural theology and the way of analogy must go, and there is a real danger that Jesus should be turned into a cult deity and that the doctrine of the Mass may impair the centrality of the cross. The concept of the Incarnation as a divine descent or an epiphanic manifestation of God (but how orthodox is the latter phrase?) are excluded, yet he claims that his Christology from below is a legitimate reinterpretation of classical Christology.

Throughout the book his preference is for the concrete, the historical and the relational, as against the abstract, the static and the metaphysical. His starting point is the historical Jesus, the man completely surrendered to God and in a unique relationship to him. He was the man of faith and on rather slender evidence the two great commandments are reduced to the love of neighbour. The cross is seen in all its starkness and the 'cry of dereliction' treated with the utmost seriousness: 'Jesus died in complete rupture with his own cause'. Yet the Father is both present and absent at the cross. It is the sheet-anchor of the concept of the 'crucified God' (Moltmann), not because God died but because he suffers the death of his Son. Jesus came not to reveal the Father but the Son. It is the resurrection which reveals God. His treatment of the resurrection is relatively conservative. It is an event verified by the tradition of the appearances and the new-found faith of the disciples. It denotes a radical change in terms of promise and fulfilment and opens up a new history, but only insofar as we find this ourselves through radical discipleship of Jesus.

Christology proper begins after the resurrection. The sonship of Jesus, first at the *parousia* or the resurrection, was fed back first to the baptism or the virgin birth and finally to the eternities. This recalls some liberal Protestant theories of the last century. Rather we should hold together the Servant of God and the Lord under the title 'the Son of God'. He concludes that Jesus became (not is) the Son of God.

Two options remain open for Christology. The one concentrates on Jesus as the exalted and risen Lord, the other keeps closely in touch with the historical Jesus. The church has often fallen into the danger of breaking with Jesus in the name of the risen Christ. This would leave open the way for a natural theology, a political religion of the Constantinian type and the conversion of Jesus into a cultic deity. The total Christ (presumably the historical and risen Christ) is certainly present through the Spirit but this must always be understood as the Spirit of Jesus and not some vague abstract Spirit which is no more than a sublimated embodiment of the aspirations of the natural 'religious' man.

The classical Christological formulae are of universal significance

but need to be recontexted or reinterpreted. They reflect a Greek understanding of the gospel and their direct or metaphysical statements about Christ can only be understood indirectly and set in a relational context. They combine historical and doxological statements (Karl Rahner) which involve a leap of faith verifiable by discipleship alone. Orthodoxy is doxology and praxis (conduct). The appropriate model for the divinity of Christ is his complete self-surrender to the Father. Here the author replaces the concept of a person as an inalienable something by a view which finds its essence in self-abandonment. But surely both the inalienability of the essential self and its capacity for deep personal relationships must be held together. The parable of the talents is relevant here.

The author claims that his doctrine of the Trinity confirms its significance as a cardinal Christian doctrine. The Father is transcendent, nameless (why then does Jesus call him Father?) and non-manipulable. The Son is the historical appearance of the Father who makes it clear how we are to respond to God. The Spirit of God is interiorized in, and revitalizes, the believer and the community of believers. Jesus reveals not the Father but the Son and becomes the Son, yet his historical reality is part of God. Much here is obscure. Is the Son the Second Person of the eternal Trinity or an extrapolation from Jesus as pointing the way towards God? There is a marked subordination of the Son to the Father which recalls some aspects of Arianism. The Father cannot be directly intuited. The Son shows us how to respond to God: Jesus points the way towards God, yet he does not reveal God and cannot therefore be called the 'sacrament' of God. The author speaks of the Trinitarian process and commends the interpretation of Hegel. The Trinity is linked closely with history. God is the absolute future, but can the God of history have a 'history' of his own? The author's approach is strongly operational but his own tradition could have taught him that 'operation follows being'.

He rightly reminds us of the importance of praxis, conduct and discipleship, following the historical Jesus, but this can hardly be either the principle of verification of the classical dogmas or the sole means of access to the Father as he often seems to imply. It is a corollary rather than a springboard for Christian faith. He rejects the evangelical concern for salvation as merely a quest for personal security and any interpretation of the cross in terms of a mystique of suffering. Discipleship must mean an active involvement in historical human affairs. Certainly, but there is a latent ambiguity in the recurrent adjective 'radical'. Surrender to Christ cannot be equated with a single form of political activity in the present. Nor should concern with the cause of the oppressed in many parts of the world and under different political systems lead to a full-scale reinterpretation of the Christian faith.

There is much of value in this book. The integrity of the author is beyond question. The success of his reconstruction is more arguable.

H. E. W. TURNER

CHRIST PRESENT AND COMING
RUDOLF SCHNACKENBURG

(first published in Germany 1976)
SPCK 1978 72pp £1.50

ISBN 0 281 03625 X

This book by a leading Roman Catholic theologian was based on a series of Advent sermons delivered to a student audience in Germany. It is in the best traditions of applied theology, faithful to the NT message and yet keenly alive to the problems of the present. At a time when hope is probably the most difficult Christian virtue to practise, the author underlines the place of teaching about the future in the NT. Two sermons are devoted to the gospel tradition. The third on St Paul is a brilliant study of endurance or stamina in the light of the apostle's own experience. The last sermon is devoted to the Johannine perspective in which the tensions in St Paul's treatment of hope are replaced by a calmer and less troubled approach embodied in the theme of abiding. For Schnackenburg, hope is no narcotic but must be worked out in decisive action. His argument is tightly packed with material but presented in a clear and simple style. He has been admirably served by his translator. This is a book to read, to ponder and to use.

H. E. W. TURNER

SMOULDERING FIRE: The Work of the Holy Spirit
MARTIN ISRAEL

Hodder and Stoughton 1978 191pp £4.75

ISBN 0 340 23068 1

This is neither an exhaustive nor a magisterial study of the work of the Holy Spirit in general, but rather an attempt to 'chart the work of the Spirit in man from the birth of spiritual awareness to the ultimate confrontation with evil that brings with it personal death and the rebirth of a new person.' Dr Israel's combination of medical and clerical experience result in a good deal of penetrating insight and discussion of personal renewal and growth. Unfortunately, however, it is combined with considerable confusion and a failure adequately to distinguish the spirits at work in various non-Christian religions, teachers and sects, which is naive indeed in one who is the chairman of the Churches' Fellowship for Psychical and Spiritual Studies. In many respects the perspective is not sufficiently biblical, and in fact any detailed exposition of Scripture is conspicuously lacking as the basis of his study. This is a pity, since it would have given a much richer and truer dimension to a treatment of the Holy Spirit's work, and avoided major omissions, false ideas and the misuse of biblical and Christian terms. Add to this the exceedingly ponderous style which makes the book somewhat difficult to read, and one is left wondering how the various glowing estimates quoted on the dust-jacket were arrived at! There are many better and more reliable guides and treatments of the work of the Holy Spirit and of personal spiritual renewal than this, and several cost less.

JOHN BAKER

THE HEART OF THE CHRISTIAN FAITH

DONALD COGGAN

Collins 1978 94pp 75p

ISBN 0 00 625501 9

GLORY UNDER YOUR FEET MICHAEL MARSHALL

Darton, Longman and Todd 1978 137pp £2.95

ISBN 0 232 51306 6

The Archbishop of Canterbury has presented in paperback form a series of talks he originally recorded for broadcasting in America. It is quite a *tour de force* to compress the substance of the Christian faith into less than a hundred pages in language which would be meaningful to the ordinary listener in America, and Dr Coggan has done it with remarkable success. The strain does tell from time to time and one is sometimes conscious that the ordinary listener is being talked down to.

The Archbishop covers all the great fundamentals, including morals as well as theology proper. It is surprising that he has so little to say about the social relevance of the faith. Perhaps his evangelical approach shows most clearly here. I was disappointed that in his account of the NT images for the church he left out the most basic of all; the church as the people of God, an image which has special relevance in a post-Christendom era. He does also give an unbalanced picture of our Lord's own teaching when he plays down so very much the eschatological dimension in it. But all in all this is an effective piece of work.

In *Glory under Your Feet* the Bishop of Woolwich has in effect given us a modern Anglo-Catholic presentation of the Christian faith. There are many good things in it: 'When a man ceases to believe in God and in his moral laws he does not cease to have a moral code but instead he creates his own moral code with a censorious self-hatred . . . which far exceeds even the sternest Christian apologists.' (p 33) And 'the churches are so often peopled with outraged good people when they should really be full of forgiven bad people.' (p 44) This approaches prophecy. And I liked his emphasis on p 91 on the dangers of an indigenous ministry.

But the bishop is sadly weak in theology: he has a violent prejudice against what he calls 'university theology', by which apparently he means any theology but that of his master Professor Mascall. He shows no signs of having read very much of the theology which he criticizes: for example, his attempt to dismiss Tillich's phrase about God as ultimate ground of being (not 'ground of my being' as he quotes it) only makes one suspect that he has not read Tillich. He doesn't even begin to understand why Tillich made the attempt to express Christian theology in non-traditional language. On p 68 he commits himself to the ridiculous statement: 'Since Descartes, philosophy in the western world has found no place for the metaphysic.' Has he never heard of Hegel, not to mention Leibniz and Berkeley? If the renewed Anglo-Catholicism for which he hopes is to be true to the tradition of the older Anglo-Catholicism represented by Gore, it will have to show rather more knowledge of theology and philosophy than that.

Marshall constantly speaks in approving terms of the orthodox doctrine of the incarnation, and on p 86 criticises 'much modern contemporary theology' because of 'its quest for a purer Christology behind Chalcedon.' But he does not, it appears, understand fully the Christology which he thinks he is defending, for he writes on p 71 that God 'could only present himself to our senses by becoming a man somewhere. It is important to note that he became a man and not mere humanity.' This is strictly incompatible with the Chalcedonian Christology; the bishop does not seem to understand the difficulties which many moderns find with Chalcedon. He also evinces a rather ignorant bias against the Reformed tradition. It is absurd to accuse the Reformers of creating 'a schizoid world-view' (p 69), and Calvin never used the phrase 'total depravity' (p 75). This is out-of-date Anglo-Catholic cant. Marshall's views on the ecumenical movement, expressed at the end of his book, can only be described as Bourbon.

In a word, the Bishop of Woolwich has imbibed all the weaknesses and none of the strength of his theological master Dr E. L. Mascall.

ANTHONY HANSON

BIBLICAL REVELATION: The History of Salvation **J. SALGUERO OP**

Christian Culture Press: Virginia USA 1977 202pp US \$8.95

In the preface and introduction, the author, the dean of the theological faculty of the Pontifical University of St Thomas Aquinas at Rome, indicates that the aim of this book is to expound the biblical message of salvation.

Does the author succeed in giving us a clear, faithful and succinct picture of revelation in the Bible? The answer must be a qualified 'yes'. The main biblical marks and emphases are present. The study gives a fine survey of the view of revelation in the various usual groupings of the biblical writings. The insights of much past and present biblical scholarship are gathered together. A section on the Inter-Testamental period has been added. By far the largest space is given to discussing the view of revelation expressed in the various writings of the NT. These are all commendable characteristics.

There are some serious weaknesses as well. The author, seeking to write an inspiring book, often expresses himself in an imprecise manner and one is not certain how seriously to take certain statements. He seems to let historical facticity float too easily out of his view of the biblical author's intention. The sterner aspects of God's attributes and the place of wrath and judgement in the history of revelation do not get adequate emphasis. Here and there a note of unbiblical humanism seems to colour the presentation, i.e. 'Men have not corresponded at all to the revelation of God manifested in creation, and have fallen into error, becoming guilty . . . The Bible suggests however that latent in this error is the search, the desire to

CHURCHMAN

find the true God, the truth.' (p 23) The stance of the book on introductory matters is that of the main-line 'biblical theology' movement.

Does the author relate this biblical view of revelation critically to the traditional views of revelation held by the Roman Church? No, the 'accepted' line is taken that Scripture and tradition always agree in content. The author does, however, stress the personal, dynamic and fiduciary aspects of revelation and faith to counter-balance a scholastic tendency to over-intellectualization in Roman dogmatics. The author also adds a most helpful section on what contemporary Roman documents and theologians are thinking about revelation today.

Lastly, for whom was the book written and who would profit from reading it? The book does not break new scholarly ground. It is written to inform those doing the work of preaching and teaching in the Roman Communion. Non-Roman clergy would also benefit both from the positive contributions of the book and from the chance to become better acquainted with how a sister communion is presently thinking about revelation, a topic of fundamental importance.

JOHN H. RODGERS Jr

MAN, WOMAN, AND PRIESTHOOD

edited PETER MOORE
SPCK 1978 181pp £2.95

ISBN 0 281 03655 1

WHY MEN PRIESTS?

SCM Press 1978 24pp 30p

Man, Woman, and Priesthood is a symposium representing many-sided opposition to the ordination of woman. Roman and Anglo-Catholic, a conservative evangelical and a member of the Orthodox Church all find common cause here, as well as an orthodox Jew.

Peter Moore, on the very first page, puts his finger on the major issue: 'The Church of England is nearer *de jure* recognition by traditional Catholic Churches than ever before . . . Why should this be put at risk by an act which firmly aligns the Church of England with the Protestants?' This view is endorsed by E. L. Mascall, when he quotes 'The decision to ordain women must be a move towards Protestantism' (p 13). The doctrine underlying these statements comes sharply into focus in the Orthodox contribution by Kallistos Ware, who, while holding that women to an equal degree with men are created in God's image (*pace* Roger Beckwith) and are in every respect members of the royal priesthood, nevertheless could not in a public and authorized way represent Christ in the eucharist. This is because the priest there becomes the very 'icon' of Christ, so making Christ present. Therefore it is imperative to preserve the symbolic correspondence between Christ as male and the ordained priest. To have the point spelled out so fully makes for welcome

clarity. In an intriguing chapter Susannah Herzel writes of essence, myth and mystery. I read this a second time in an effort to understand. Perhaps my difficulty arose in part from her starting point: 'We forget the extent to which the Christian priest is a direct development of the Jewish high priest . . .'

Finally, two contributions come from churches which have ordained women—the Episcopal Church of the USA and the Church of Sweden. In both, for different reasons, the issue has been stormy. No mention is made of the part played by ordained women in the German Church ever since the Second World War, nor of other parts of the Anglican Communion in more recent years, without any unseemly controversy.

Even though it represents only one side of the debate this is a book to be read by those who want to understand the issues at stake.

Why Men Priests is a semi-serious pamphlet in the style of *Punch*, and as humorously illustrated. It deals almost exclusively with clerical domination and how this can be overcome, and achieves its goal by showing up ludicrous arguments and anomalies. Having knocked down the edifice, the writers want to rebuild by setting up an Ecumenical Feminist Trust.

JOYCE BALDWIN

CONFIRMATION THEN AND NOW

J. D. C. FISHER

Alcuin Club/SPCK 1978 173pp £4.95

ISBN 0 281 03666 7

The first nine chapters of this book are a valuable collection of patristic evidence about confirmation and its relation to baptism and first communion, arranged according to geographical areas. The author has written two earlier works of importance about the history of initiation in the western church, and has further put us in his debt by this third work, which is probably the fullest and clearest survey of its field to date. He devotes special attention to the vexed question of the Syrian initiation rite, and wisely follows the view of contemporary experts in Syriac literature, such as S. P. Brock, that the Syrian pre-baptismal anointing (like the post-baptismal anointing, or laying-on of hands, elsewhere) was associated with the gift of the Spirit. He could have re-inforced this conclusion by pointing out that all Origen's references to baptismal anointing, and its association with the Spirit (pp 66-8), date from his Palestinian and not his Egyptian period—the Palestinian and Syrian churches being so closely linked. The writer is at his weakest on the Jewish background. There is a curious instance of this on p 120, where two mutually exclusive views of the origin of the Testament of Levi are combined.

Though sympathetic to earlier Anglo-Catholic works on confirmation, and unsympathetic to the exclusive claims put up for baptism by Lampe, Whitaker etc., the writer refrains from making any extreme claims for confirmation. He is doubtful whether or not it

can be found in the New Testament, and sees the majority of the Fathers as teaching that it conveys the Holy Spirit in association with baptism, not in isolation from baptism. He evidently regards their view as normative for present-day thought and practice, and in his final chapter proposes that laying-on of hands, anointing and first communion should be united with baptism at an early age, while the personal profession of repentance and faith, which is the other element in present-day confirmation, should remain at the age of discretion.

Had the writer devoted more attention to the Jewish background, to the fact that the earliest patristic evidence is against giving communion to children, and to New Testament theology, he might have arrived at a different conclusion. The question of the age of confirmation is a theological as well as a liturgical one. The New Testament does not tie the gift of the Spirit, chronologically, to particular liturgical 'moments', whereas it does posit a strong causal connection between the gift of the Spirit, baptism (with or without the laying-on of hands), and personal repentance and faith. If infant baptism is biblical, which it is, and has a clear Jewish background, which it has, baptism can certainly be divorced chronologically from personal repentance and faith, though theologically it remains as closely linked with them as in adult baptism. Why, then, if there has to be this chronological gap in the case of infant baptism, must the laying-on of hands accompany the baptism, rather than accompanying the personal repentance and faith? Moreover, if the laying-on of hands should precede first communion (as the writer strongly urges, against Rome), and if the church in the earliest period did not give communion to children, why should the traditional Anglican sequence of baptism in infancy, followed by personal repentance and faith, laying-on of hands and first communion at years of discretion, not continue? There is everything to be said in favour of combining baptism, laying-on of hands and first communion in the case of adult candidates, where practicable, but to do the same in the case of infant candidates is to forget that they are infants.

ROGER BECKWITH

**THE LOVE OF LEARNING AND THE
DESIRE FOR GOD: A Study of Monastic Culture**
JEAN LECLERCQ

(first published in France 1957 and in the USA 1961)
SPCK 1978 397pp £4.50

ISBN 0 281 03599 7

**MIRACLES AND PILGRIMS: Popular Beliefs in
Medieval England** RONALD C. FINUCANE

Dent and Sons 1977 248pp £6.95

ISBN 0 460 12019 0

THE CHURCH AND POLITICS IN FOURTEENTH-CENTURY ENGLAND: The Career of Adam Orleton c 1275-1345
ROY MARTIN HAINES

CUP 1978 303pp £12.50

ISBN 0 521 21544 7

This collection of books on medieval church history illustrates clearly the three main preoccupations of ecclesiastical historians today: theology and the history of ideas; what may be called the social practice of religion; and administrative structures.

LeClercq's pleasant volume started as a series of lectures first published in France in 1957 and translated into American in 1961. What we have here is a first 'English' edition (though Americanisms still abound) in paperback.

The original subtitle indicates more clearly its theme: 'An introduction to monastic writers of the Middle Ages' (*initiation aux auteurs monastiques du moyen age.*) It is concerned with monastic literature. The central problem is whether 'learning' and spirituality (especially the monastic spirituality, concerned as it is with personal salvation) may be reconciled? Can one be both a monk and a scholar? 'These two elements are the two constants of western monastic culture: on the one hand, the study of letters; on the other, the exclusive search for God, the love of eternal life and the consequent detachment from all else, including the study of letters'; 'on the one hand, learning is necessary if one is to approach God and to express what is perceived of him; on the other hand, literature must be continually transcended and elevated in the straining to attain eternal life.' LeClercq's theme is that the two are interdependent; that men like St Benedict, St Gregory and St Bernard combined both because of the origins of western monasticism and the Carolingian and (rather later) the twelfth-century cultures in which it arose and flourished. 'Medieval monastic literature is, in large part, a literature of compunction, whose aim is to possess, to increase, and to communicate the desire for God.' He examines the scriptural basis, the tradition of eastern monasticism ('which is to monasticism what apostolic tradition is to the faith of the church') and the classical literature, all of which influenced the great monastic writers of the early and high Middle Ages.

LeClercq idealizes medieval monasticism ('All the monks', he says, 'were readers', an over-assumption to judge by other writers). Only once, in an illuminating section on the liturgy, does he take us into the life of the monastery. But he highlights the fact that monastic writers and scholastic writers were different and explores these differences sensitively. It is good to have this book so cheaply available in this country.

Finucane's book is important—not just to historians but to practising ministers in the church today. Here are the 'real people' of the medieval church—and indeed of today—going on pilgrimage or seeking 'faith healing' at home. Perhaps it comes as something of a shock to read that 'More saints have been canonized by the papacy in the twentieth century than during any previous century, including

the Middle Ages.' What Finucane has done is to examine the records of several shrines (especially seven English ones and two French) to see what 'miracles' were attributed to the relics there in the process of canonization. Here is popular religion in the raw.

At first the church was hesitant (or perhaps ambivalent) about cures effected by prayers to saints and especially by relics. Finucane explores briefly the non-Christian origin of such pilgrimages and the attitudes of leading theologians to them. But his main concern is with the people. He looks at the emergence of the popularity of the shrines, of the trends in pilgrimage (for some 20 years from the locality; for another 20 years or more from a wider field, and then a decline in favour of a newer cult centre). He examines who went, how Simon de Montfort and Becket before him attracted upper-class men, how William of Norwich drew clergy, and Godric of Finchale and Frideswide of Oxford largely women. He reveals an inner dynamic in each cult. He discusses in detail medieval health, medicine and cures, and the balance between 'home cures' followed by pilgrimage to the shrine to give thanks, and 'shrine cures' (a relative rarity, unlike Lourdes today). All this is spiced with humour and contemporary allusions to serious studies of faith-healing which make his book not merely compulsive reading but relevant to contemporary religious practice. Are we dealing here with a pre-Christian survival, a sub-Christian pattern of behaviour, or a genuine outburst of Christian faith and piety?

His analysis of the later Middle Ages is less satisfactory. The 'new devotion' to the Virgin Mary and to Christ in his human form led to new cult centres (Our Lady of Walsingham; the Holy Blood at Hailes); but, in general, pilgrimages and cult centres seem to have become more localized. The Reformation changed the form of the impulse, as Keith Thomas has shown us (*Religion and the Decline of Magic*); but to suggest that pilgrimages in search of health were replaced by visits to spa centres is straining credibility too far. Finucane is at his best in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, for then the healing and charismatic ministry of the church is revealed with all its blemishes and dangers. Here is a book which must be read.

Adam Orleton, Bishop of Hereford (and later of Worcester and Winchester) was no saint and he left no shrine, even though he was involved in the canonization of his predecessor Cantilupe (discussed by Finucane in detail). He was a lawyer and diplomat, self-seeking, betrayer of Edward II. Haines seeks to whitewash Orleton (not too successfully); the best that can be said is that 'Orleton emerges as an able and courageous man, as well as a skilful polemicist, a person who in more settled times might have gained a reputation for intelligence, practical ability and even loyalty.' But piety and saintliness?—never.

For those who wish to see what a medieval bishop did, here is a very readable account. He is politician, administrator and judge. Very little (as Haines admits) emerges of his role as pastor; and nothing at all of his beliefs. How did he reconcile his political activities with his episcopal responsibilities?—or did he not try? Perhaps

we shall never know. Partly this is because of the limits of the sources; but it is due also to the fact that this book is an example of a genre by now too standardized. It concentrates too much on itineraries and administration without seeing that attitudes can be seen in *acta*, that either one was or was not a reformer. And Orleton wasn't; he was a politician who in any other age would have chosen any career other than the church.

And this is the dilemma of the medieval church. With bishops like Orleton, with monks writing for monks, with laity in search of the miraculous, how was the 'faith' kept alive? And did the Reformation reform, or did it kill? Perhaps we need to start again to look at religion in the Middle Ages anew.

ALAN ROGERS

THE THOUGHT OF THE EVANGELICAL LEADERS:

Notes on the Discussions of the Eclectic Society,
London 1798-1814

edited JOHN H. PRATT

Banner of Truth 1978 534pp £4.50

ISBN 0 85151 270 4

In listing characteristic evils of our age, some would suggest: disdain of authority; misuse of civil liberty; an extravagant life-style; workers united against management; crippling taxation; pornography on open sale; and the baneful effect of immigration. 1979 has, however, fewer unique problems than we think, for the above subjects were cited at an Eclectics meeting in 1812.

Some 280 other meetings are here recorded of a society formed in 1783 'by a few of the London Clergy, for mutual religious intercourse and improvement, and for the investigation of religious truth.' Fifteen years later (when the Notes covered by this book begin), participants included John Newton, Henry Foster, Richard Cecil, Josiah Pratt, John Venn and Charles Simeon. The range of topics is staggering, and many of the reports make riveting reading.

Doctrine is extensively covered, but so too are practical issues. How do you cope with juvenile delinquency, levity in the pulpit, punctuality? ('Appointment is a debt. I owe you punctuality. I have therefore no right to throw away *your* time, if I do my own.') Should you keep a diary, fast, go to the theatre, use anonymous letters, enforce family prayers, visit where there is infectious disease (some surprises there)?

There is a timely word on the personality cult: 'A bigoted attachment to certain ministers is an error. Christianity would soon look as if the Gospel were only the Gospel as ministered by certain persons.' And this word on how the offence of the cross is unnecessarily increased by evangelical preachers who conduct the devotional part of the service in such a way as to say: 'We don't mean anything by this. Have patience, and you shall hear *me*.'

This book was first published in 1856 (not 1865 as the cover says), but its truths are timeless. Open it where you will, and you will be convicted, stimulated, edified, encouraged. And there are sermon ideas and illustrations literally on every page.

J. D. DOUGLAS

DAVID LIVINGSTONE: The Dark Interior
OLIVER RANSFORD

John Murray 1978 332pp £8.50

ISBN 0 7195 3492 5

The centenary of the death of Livingstone, observed on 3 May 1973, led to a spate of books about him. I judge this work, published after a delay of five years, to be the only important one among them. Apart from an extensive acquaintance with all the writings, published and unpublished, of this 'compulsive correspondent' (p 2), Dr Ransford has many qualifications for writing about Livingstone—medical training, a long residence in Africa, and familiarity with almost all the scenes of Livingstone's African years, some of them hardly ever visited by Europeans since his day.

Many of the more recent writers have been at pains to show that Livingstone was not quite the plaster saint of Victorian hagiography. Dr Ransford calls his book 'the dark interior'. I have been surprised that some of these writers present this as though it was something new and strange. I have been familiar with this dark interior ever since, more than sixty years ago, I read as a schoolboy the life of Stewart of Lovedale. There it all is: Livingstone's moods of dark withdrawal, his secretiveness about his plans, his vindictiveness towards those who had offended him, the unforgiving spirit which could keep a vendetta alive for years. At the time of the centenary, Tim Jeal wrote a debunking book which seemed intended to reduce Livingstone to a good deal less than half-size. Dr Ransford is not a debunker. He shows us plainly this less pleasant side; but he never loses sight of the real greatness of the man—his love for Africa and Africans, his deep hatred of the slave trade, his concern for the spread of the gospel, the immense services he rendered to Africa. He does not forget to record Stanley's comment on his 'endless fund of high spirits, which now and then broke out in pearls of hearty laughter' (p 284). Incidentally, all the world knows that when they met, Stanley greeted Livingstone with the words, 'Dr Livingstone, I presume' (p 275); Dr Ransford gives Livingstone's answer as 'Yes, that is my name'. But I have for many years understood that Livingstone actually said, 'Shoorely!' What else would a boy from Blantyre say? Perhaps some redaction critic can clear up this little textual problem for me.

Dr Ransford's most original contribution is his attempt to use his medical knowledge to analyse the apparent contradictions in Livingstone's character. These he attributes to the medical condition called *cyclothymia*, more commonly known as the manic-depressive state.

He may well be right. Much more medical knowledge than I possess would be required for a competent judgement to be made. I can only say that he has not completely convinced me. Africa does strange things to people. In my brief residence of four years, I came across things said and done by missionaries of which, if recorded in plain print, the reader would be inclined to say, 'This could not possibly have happened; you must be wrong.' This does not alter the fact that these things did happen. It is all too often forgotten that the early missionaries were hardly ever well. Livingstone's own catalogue of ills is formidable: from a shoulder chewed up by a lion to malaria and dysentery, and bleeding piles, not to mention much more ordinary ailments such as dyspepsia and headaches. That the missionaries accomplished anything at all under such hindrances is remarkable; that they achieved all that they did is a miracle. Perhaps we need not go beyond such considerations in trying to understand Livingstone.

I have not found it necessary to revise my opinion, formed many years ago, that the two great men of the nineteenth century were Abraham Lincoln and David Livingstone.

STEPHEN NEILL

THE RHINE FLOWS INTO THE TIBER:

A History of Vatican II R. M. WILTGEN SVD

(first published in the USA 1967)

Augustine Publishing Company 1978 304pp £3.00 ISBN 0 85172 721 2

This British edition of a book first published in the United States in 1967 tells the back-room story of the Vatican II Council, now ten years or more after that great gathering has passed into history. As a *catena* of extracts from reviews, placed at the beginning of the book, suggests, it has been well received in America and in other parts of the world, particularly by Roman Catholic journals; and it merits a paper-back edition for this country, if for no other reason than to indicate how the Council was influenced in a more 'liberal' direction by the well-marshalled and extremely busy efforts of the hierarchy living in the countries bordering the Rhine. Hence the title. The author is well-skilled in journalistic presentation, and what could be a somewhat tedious account of the politicking inside and outside the Council, turns out instead as a fascinating if not altogether creditable story of the twists and turns of anti-Curial strategies and the obstinate 'stone-walling' of the pro-Curial 'conservatives'. Anyone who wants to know what the inside of RC ecclesiastical relations and management is like, and the actual workings of the central magisterium, will get a vivid insight here. But also there is to be found here the kind of background that gives an interesting context for the reading of the final statements of decrees and constitutions.

It provides therefore a useful addition to the literature on the Council available in this country, especially for those who have an interest or a responsibility in being as well informed about it as possible.

G. J. C. MARCHANT

CHRISTIAN RELIGION IN THE SOVIET UNION
CHRISTEL LANE

Allen and Unwin 1978 256pp £10.00

ISBN 0 04 301084 9

This important book is the first comprehensive sociological treatment of the contemporary complexion of Christianity in the Soviet Union. Every Christian sect or church is dealt with, from the Orthodox Church to the illegal Jehovah's Witnesses. Dr Lane uses facts and figures culled from western and Soviet sources to assess such features as the strength of the religious body in question, its status in the eyes of the Soviet regime, and the nature of the believers' faith. Though packed with statistics, the book is easy to read and the author's hope is vindicated that non-sociologists will understand the book and find it valuable.

One truth which Dr Lane believes her book will illustrate is that sociological expectations derived from western models about the rise and decline of religious bodies will not necessarily be borne out in totalitarian regimes of a militantly atheist character. This truth is tellingly demonstrated in, for example, the case of the *Initsiativniki*, a sect which broke from the Baptist Church in 1961. These new sectarians are not, as might have been expected from western precedents, the more economically disadvantaged and less well-educated members of the Baptist community; in fact, most of them come from urban industrial centres and have had Soviet cultural and political education. The fact that the product of such education has in this case 'not been a new socialist man but religious man' is as interesting to western sociologists as it is embarrassing to Soviet writers on religion.

Dr Lane uses sociological categories as tools of analysis. In analysing the nature of faith she makes very useful distinctions between the *content* of belief and the *consequences* of this belief for the believer in society, pointing out the error of assuming that a description of the former will necessarily be relevant to an assessment of the latter. In describing the nature of religious groupings, she distinguishes profitably between 'churches' and 'sects'. She also makes use of the concept 'denomination', but her description of this term (on page 21) is marred by serious misprints, and it is not entirely clear what the sociological significance of a 'denomination' is. Despite this regrettable flaw, Dr Lane's scientifically objective evaluation of a surprising variety of Christian organizations provides a much more clearly focused picture of religion in the Soviet Union than that which has been given by many committed Christian writers.

In her conclusion, Dr Lane states that 'around 30 to 35 per cent of the total Soviet population are religious'. Whatever the reasons for

this remarkable persistence—Dr Lane is of course concerned with providing sociological reasons—the facts presented in this book cannot but impress anyone interested in the fate of religion under communism.

PHILIP WALTERS

THE INTEGRITY OF ANGLICANISM STEPHEN W. SYKES

Mowbrays 1978 117pp £2.50

ISBN 0 264 66485 X

Here is a call to a renewed concern for an integrated doctrinal exposition of what Anglicanism means today—in an attitude of open and genuine honesty, of real integrity, as opposed to a continuously muddling reference to ‘comprehensiveness’. Its seven chapters review the effects of ‘liberal’ theology over the past century, and by no means omit to notice the recent implications of such reports as *Christian Believing*, together with the other works from the same quarter that have created increased uncertainty. Professor Sykes submits to stringent criticism a number of supportive slogans to the increasing amorphousness of Anglicanism—such as ‘creative tension’ or ‘a common pattern . . . of thinking’ (in *Christian Believing*) that neither shows what it is nor how it works; or again, more recent vauntings of the fact that the Church of England has no specific systematic theology parallel to ‘systems of Catholic and Protestant theology’ (cf. Temple’s Introduction to the Report *Doctrine in the Church of England*, 1938). But he also calls into question those who would endeavour to stabilize the position by making belief in the Incarnation the Anglican *articulus*, or perhaps filling this out by the dogmatic tradition of the church to 451AD, or even that of ‘the undivided church’. He does this by calling attention to the critical questioning of modern scholarship, both biblical and patristic. What then happens to the traditional referent—the ‘three-fold cord’ of Scripture, historical tradition and reason—as the Anglican ‘method’? The thrust of the argument, in these terms, seems to be a protest at a situation resulting from a process that has to be accepted.

But there is another positive affirmation coming through. The book calls attention to the limits involved in the liturgies and in canon law. Professor Sykes certainly shows how, for example, the new Preface to the Declaration of Assent can be ‘bent’ to imply a very wide latitude indeed—even if it may be questioned as to whether the actual wording of the Declaration itself is so elastic. He must also be aware that, for instance, Canon A 5 is open to challenge in terms of his arguments as already outlined; while liturgies, which certainly ‘teach’, are now many and various, and the church member can take as much or as little of their meaning as he wishes. Can one seriously use the views of some modern scholars to undermine attempts to formulate a dogmatic position, and then criticize the same scholars and others for not writing with an eye to the church’s standpoint, expressed in its

liturgies and canons? Is it possible to denounce the Church of England for tolerating so much theological diversity, while enforcing a doctrinal inheritance through its formularies, without indicating more clearly where some firmer criterion may be seen by which formularies, legitimate limits, and scholarly responsibility may be judged? All this is accentuated when the book ends with a favourable reference to the 1948 Lambeth Conference pronouncement as to Anglicanism's 'dispersed authority' whereby, within episcopal and liturgical guidelines, all church members are able to have a share. But, as is here recognized, this implies the possibility of ongoing controversy, and the controversy will not be reduced, it seems, by better theological education, if 'better' in this context is given a standard by the theological scholarship that apparently is most responsible for promoting that controversy.

'The cat' having thus been 'put among the pigeons' and the 'feathers made to fly', where are we? Is this the theological elaboration of the rather anxious questioning of the last three papers of the 1978 Lambeth Conference preparatory articles, each in its own way asking: What does it mean to be an Anglican today? Professor Sykes, in the Preface, urges a greater concern for systematic theology, but—even here—what he is really after is not clear. If it is for 'the presentation of Christian theology in the context of a philosophically systematic understanding of the world', that is not necessarily going to have any particular Anglican identity. If a modern system of Anglican doctrinal outlook is desired, doubtless our inheritance (cf. the Preface to the Declaration of Assent) should occupy a place of some importance. But reference, say, to the 39 Articles, and the expositions of them in the past, is tepid in these pages, and there is no mention at all of such typically Anglican works as Gore's *Reconstruction of Belief*, or Quick's *Doctrines of the Creed*. Perhaps it is enough at this point to have sounded an alarm: it will be for those who take up the responsibility of answering the call, to provide Anglicans with clearly Christian theological structures that are consistent and meaningful, and which may also bear those distinctive traits that remain as a continuing Anglican understanding of the faith.

G. J. C. MARCHANT

TAIZE: Brother Roger and his Community REX BRICO

Collins 1978 220pp £3.95

ISBN (USA) 0 529 05621 6

ISBN (UK) 0 00 215284 8

This is by far the best popular account of Taizé that has come my way. The author is a journalist who has come under the spell of the life and work of Roger Schutz and who writes with sympathy and insight. The book is attractively written and beautifully produced, with some striking photographs to aid the text.

Here is the story of Taizé from its beginning in 1940 to the present time. Several features stand out. First, the very fact of the establishment of a religious community of this kind by people standing within the Protestant tradition. Secondly, the remarkably rapid growth of its influence in recent years through the Council of Youth which brings annually to Taizé over 100,000 young people from all over the world. Thirdly, the identification of the community and its adherents with the cause of the poor and under-privileged throughout the world. The author returns to these themes again and again as he tells his story.

The one big disappointment of the book is that it does not open up the theological work which, often informally, has been part and parcel of the community's life since its inception. Especially in the realm of spirituality, Taizé has made an important contribution to the thinking of the church, and the influence of that contribution may be greater in the future than in the past as Catholic-Protestant dialogue gathers momentum. The author does give extensive quotations from the writings of the founder and has a fascinating chapter towards the end of the book in which he records a conversation between himself and Brother Roger, but it would have been helpful to have had some discussion of the theology which has emerged from the interaction of Taizé with Christians and others from all parts of the world.

J. C. P. COCKERTON

PERSONS AND LIFE AFTER DEATH

HYWEL D. LEWIS

Mowbrays 1978 197pp £6.95

ISBN 0 333 23496 0

Throughout Professor Lewis's long and distinguished career (he has recently retired from the Chair of History and Philosophy of Religion at King's College) he has striven through numerous writings to defend, on philosophical grounds, the idea of the soul's survival of the death of the body. The latest of these writings, *The Self and Immortality*, has now been followed by an interesting collection of articles, lectures and dialogues on the same theme. Where Professor Lewis includes his contributions to philosophical symposia he has wisely given us the contributions of his co-symposiasts.

Professor Lewis holds that the self is immortal. Each one's awareness of his own self is an ultimate unanalysable fact. This for Lewis answers the problem about how a post-mortem self is to be identified from other such selves. Bernard Williams, in one of the discussions, poses some acute questions about the nature of this self-knowledge which are parried rather than answered.

Although the evidence of psychological research might provide evidence for survival, Professor Lewis's own reasons for thinking that we survive death are essentially religious. But he does not, as might be expected, invoke the doctrine of the resurrection of the dead. To do this is, in his view, a 'bad mistake'. This dismissal of

the relevance of resurrection makes his tenaciously-held views somewhat vague in content.

In a collection of writings such as this, there is inevitably repetition and disconnectedness. Anyone wishing to look at a full-length exposition of Professor Lewis's views would be better going to *The Self and Immortality* or to an earlier work, *The Elusive Mind*.

PAUL HELM

POLITICAL THEOLOGY AND THE LIFE OF THE CHURCH ANDRÉ DUMAS

(first published in France 1977)
SCM Press 1978 148pp £2.95

ISBN 0 334 01274 0

David Edwards reviewed this book as 'purely and brilliantly theoretical'. So it is. It utterly exposes itself to the charge of liberation writers that the western political theologians prefer their critical analyses to concrete political options in the struggle for a better world. Nevertheless, in the esoteric struggle for rigorous political theology this penetrating analysis is not without value.

The hermeneutic problem is solved in an unacknowledged similar manner to Bonino, who is similarly a Barthian Protestant. Meta-textual is Dumas' designation for the approach: the texts *with us*, through which the divine word illumines our situation by *analogy*. This method is closer to evangelical practice than we care to admit!

Dumas is concerned for the church to be speaking this word in political life and not to be pushed to the periphery of society. To this end he offers a Christian critique and adjustment of secular political models such as the classless society and the common good. But his most distinctive contribution is to offer the biblical model of fraternity as the realistic and constructive model for political theology. It is both conflict and reunion, as is seen in many OT examples. It avoids both the idealistic future of the Marxist-based theories, and the metaphysical sanctioning of equality found in theories based on the common good. In a situation of injustice it may sanction revolution, but it also drives the politician in an underlying commitment to reunion and reciprocity.

The ground of this reciprocity is the faith of the cross, and here, in company with Moltmann, the author finds his greatest difficulty and his greatest meaning. God's redemptive act, to bear violence in himself, makes reunion possible instead of vengeance. To Moltmann's suffering with the abandoned must be added the defiant silence, giving the cross a more 'active' construction in the conflict and reunion.

The analysis will perhaps give increasing clarity to the theological understanding of politics but I doubt that it will provide the word to strike relevantly into the heart of secular political life. It lacks the immediacy with which national prophets speak.

GRAHAM DOW

THE SCOPE OF POLITICAL THEOLOGY

edited ALISTAIR KEE
SCM Press 1978 184pp £3.25

ISBN 0 334 01463 8

BLACK THEOLOGY, BLACK POWER ALLAN BOESAK

(first published in Holland 1976)
Mowbrays 1978 185pp £2.95

ISBN 0 264 66508 2

Approximately four years ago, Alistair Kee published an anthology of readings on subjects closely related to the debate about the political implications of theology and vice versa (*A Reader in Political Theology*). In his new book he has supplied the interested student with a further selection of readings in broadly the same area of theological concern.

The first book reflected certain theologians' recent discovery, round about the mid-60s, that political revolution posed an important challenge to Christian thinking. It was arranged in such a way as to highlight the chronological progression of the ensuing theological discussion.

The present book differs from it in two particular ways. Firstly, the approach is spacial rather than temporal. The geographical representation of the authors is much wider. The first book concentrated on European and Latin American authors. This time there are extracts from India, Japan, Korea and the Philippines as well. Secondly, and more significantly, Kee's working definition of political theology is much wider than before. This is partly due, no doubt, to the appearance in the last five years of a colossal avalanche of literature on Christian social involvement, representing nearly every shade of theological belief. Be that as it may, along with Moltmann, Metz and the liberation theologians, Kee now includes readings from the Pentecostal and Renewal traditions, from the feminist liberation movement, and from those writing out of concern about life-style and a sustainable world economic order.

As in his previous anthology, Kee has written some judicious introductions to each of the eight chapters. Often these include valuable personal insights on the debate in question. On the whole, he shows a thorough grasp of a complex and expanding subject. One serious omission, I feel, is that of any discussion of the political and revolutionary implications of non-violence from a Christian perspective (Daniel Berrigan or John Yoder?). Perhaps Kee might dedicate a further volume to the specific issue of militarism and resistance?

The book by Boesak, a black South African minister of the Dutch Reformed Church, has already been published in English in Holland. The original title was *Farewell to Innocence*, a much more revealing and imaginative title than the present one. The main purpose of the book is to show how and why black Christian thinkers in the South African situation have ended their innocent acceptance of white theological norms as either universally valid, objectively true or socially neutral.

Boesak's study invites comparison with North American black theology. Indeed, the author deliberately discusses his understanding of theology in a black context in conjunction with the theology of James Cone and others. Though there are clearly many similarities—especially in their mutual rejection of the assumptions of white theology—I am, personally, more struck by the differences. Firstly, the context is different: in South Africa the black races are in a majority and can hope, at whatever distance, eventually to exercise power in their country. Secondly, the social traditions are distinct: the black South African has not been forced to react so violently to the threat to his self-identity as the American black whose history has been largely made up of legal or illegal slavery. Thirdly, the ideology is different: in South Africa black people speak less of black power and more of black consciousness as their most pressing need. Finally, the theological perspective—at least in Boesak's case—is different: the Reformed background gives his study, in my opinion, more biblical depth and his theological framework more consistency than, say, in the case of Cone's.

All these and other issues are discussed in an open and readable manner. The book is an excellent guide to the kind of questions which theology in South Africa is bound to raise and is a fine example of the method to be adopted for any pertinent Christian thinking in a complex social context. There is a useful selected bibliography and author index at the end.

J. ANDREW KIRK

THE ONTOLOGY OF PAUL TILlich ADRIAN THATCHER

OUP 1978 196pp £8.50

ISBN 0 19 826715 0

Dr Thatcher has provided a closely-reasoned, thorough and critical account of Tillich's thought. Although he modestly regards himself as taking up only one aspect of Tillich's work it is a major one, and Dr Thatcher's criticisms reverberate throughout the whole building. For Tillich regarded himself as providing a reinterpretation of Christian theology in terms of ontology, a non-theological account of theology in terms of the broadest and most basic categories of thing.

By attention to various ontological traditions in western philosophy, Dr Thatcher endeavours to reveal the source or sources of Tillich's thought. His chief finding, convincingly documented, is that his ideas are an eclectic collection—farrago would not be too harsh a term—of ideas from classical Greek philosophy, Augustinianism, Boehme, Schelling and Hegel. This eclecticism lands Tillich in considerable difficulties, as Dr Thatcher shows in some detail. And Tillich is often guilty of simple confusion, as when he attempts a reinterpretation of the doctrine of the Trinity in terms of the Hegelian dialectic. This has the consequence that one of the persons of the Trinity must be negated, a consequence Tillich does not seem to

acknowledge.

The author's own attitude to Tillich is somewhat ambivalent. He regards himself as something of a theological underlabourer, he thinks that Tillich ought to be spoken of with humility and respect, and yet his criticisms are so telling that they raise the question of whether Tillich is worth serious study. At one point Dr Thatcher promises to answer this very question. But he does not do so, as far as I can see. Instead, in the last chapter, he has an interesting yet unsatisfactory discussion on the relation between theology and metaphysics in which he rightly points out that Christian theology has metaphysical implications. The chapter is unsatisfactory because there is no clear distinction between the metaphysical implications of theology and the possibility of theology being translated into metaphysical terms. But all in all this is a high-level treatment of Tillich which leaves one with the unfortunate impression that maybe it was not worth all the effort.

PAUL HELM

SCIENCE, CHANCE AND PROVIDENCE DONALD MACKAY

OUP 1978 67pp £3.50

ISBN 0 19 713915 9

Those who know Professor Donald Mackay will know what to expect in this little book: faithfulness to Scripture, a deep sense of responsibility to the God of truth, fairmindedness to opponents, and a razor-sharp analytical faculty. To these might be added a great gift for finding apt and telling analogies.

The book consists of three Riddell memorial lectures delivered in the University of Newcastle in March 1977. This is apologetic in the best tradition. It seeks to reconcile biblical Christianity and the scientific world-view. It does not, however, start with the latter and ask: How can Christian faith be held reasonably in the circumstances? It starts instead with biblical faith (particularly in connection with its affirmations of God in creation and providence) and asks the converse question: What does this imply for the scientist? He shows, I think compellingly, that both science and technology (in the mood of responsible stewardship) follow at once as right, reasonable and rewarding pursuits for men: 'Biblical theism . . . so far from limiting or opposing the scientific enterprise . . . actually provides the most coherent basis for its integration with a humane and whole view of reality.' This approach surely takes the stick by the right end, for it is 'in thy light that we see light.'

Points I particularly enjoyed were the devastating reply to Jacques Monod's misplaced and misconceived arguments about chance (*Chance and Necessity*), and his discussion of the dynamic relationship between the Creator and his creation.

Strongly recommended as a book to be given to a scientific-philosophical Nicodemus.

DOUGLAS SPANNER

SALT TO THE WORLD A. N. TRITON

IVP 1978 64pp 60p

ISBN 0 85110 235 2

This is a tract designed to encourage Christians to take their social involvement seriously. It works through a number of propositions which lead from arguing God's plan for us to be in society, through what such action will involve, to the sort of aims Christians should have when fulfilling this part of their vocation.

The author argues from a creation ethic towards the nature of involvement. Other approaches—kingdom ethics, Trinitarian ethics, incarnational ethics—are not without relevance. However, the doctrine of God as Creator and Preserver of the world is the basic doctrine for this subject.

The good thing about this booklet is the way it argues for positive involvement and for going on to see the need for political action as part of that activity. Sensibly, the author reminds us of the difficulties of reaching anything but compromised decisions in this sphere, and for not allowing this to deter Christians from pursuing the aim of working for the health of society after the pattern God has given to us in creation and in his law.

Others will want to argue from a different theological starting-point. It would have been better had the author recognized the need to hold to both creation and kingdom in working out a Christian ethic for society. However, this is in no way to detract from a succinct, clear, and hard-hitting call to involvement contained in this booklet. It is to be warmly recommended for young Christians, students and, indeed, for any who need a sharp prod towards taking their social responsibilities seriously.

JOHN GLADWIN

BRITAIN TODAY AND TOMORROW
TREVOR BEESON

Collins 1978 284pp £1.50

ISBN 0 00 625126 9

The author of that excellent analysis of Christianity in Eastern Europe, *Discretion and Valour*, has produced a similar type of book on *Britain Today and Tomorrow*. Like the first, this book is a reduction and write-up of material produced by group research. In this case each chapter is the product of a separate group study. Once again, Canon Beeson's skills have been well deployed. He has written a racy and eminently readable book, and by all accounts has been unfailingly faithful to the work of the groups themselves. No mean accomplishment!

If the method employed in producing the book is one of popularizing, in the very best sense of the word, study done elsewhere, the method of Christian reflection done in the groups is clearly inductive. It begins with an area of contemporary experience in our society, analyses it, and works on the central theological questions at stake

in the particular field of work. It exhibits the strengths of inductive work—detailed attention to the actual situation—and falls foul of some of the weaknesses—a failure to be imaginative and prophetic at a number of key points.

In this programme of study on *Britain Today and Tomorrow*, the BCC have tried to cover a comprehensive range of subjects: aid and development to the Third World, poverty, unemployment and work, the welfare state, the problems of democracy, power and powerlessness, education, culture etc. The study is completed by an attempted theological framework for coping with the issues.

Inevitably, the work is of uneven quality. Canon Beeson points to the weakness of the work on law, freedom and justice. That whole chapter on poverty and plenty makes for pedestrian reading. The section on violence hardly succeeds in covering up its failure to come out with a clear theological response to the violence/non-violence issue. Overall, apart from an excellent chapter on development, 'Lady Bountiful Bows Out', the book tends to be parochial and fails to set the particular issue in the context of the stresses and strains on justice in the world as a whole. However, it will be of great help to church groups and lay people in any study which they intend to do on the context of their mission in our society. There is much here which is incisive and easy to grasp, and which lays bare the essential issues for Christian theological and ethical judgement. It will serve to broaden Christian concerns and knowledge.

It is a great pity, therefore, that the theological work at the end of the book leaves a lot to be desired. Not that those who come from other traditions have much to boast about in this respect. We all have much to do to arrive at some clear and relevant statements of Christian belief in relation to the social context of our society today. Sadly, the statements in this book will not do the job for us. When it is suggested (pp 262-3) that different contexts require different images of the gospel and that these images, including those of the NT and church tradition, are distorted and can only be revised by comparison, theology has collapsed as a handmaid for Christian action. If there are no proper tests of truth, no reliable reference points for Christian thinking, then serious communication between Christians who use theological statements differently has broken down irreparably. I cannot see how, with this framework, we can pass any but an arbitrary judgement on people like those of the Afrikaaner section of the Dutch Reformed Church who have their own images of the gospel. This tendency to use the language of images can be destructive of the unity of the church and its message—a rather shallow device for coping with pluralism in the modern world. In the sense in which it is given, the closing slogan of the book, 'a pluralist message and a pluralist church for a pluralist society', is a disturbing and disappointing ending to a penetrating analysis of *Britain Today and Tomorrow*.

CHURCHMAN

THE CHARACTER OF CHRISTIAN ETHICS:

John Coffin Memorial Lecture 1977

HELEN OPPENHEIMER

Athlone Press 1977 28pp 75p

ISBN 0 485 16211 3

WHAT DOES THE LORD REQUIRE

CHRISTOPHER J. H. WRIGHT

Shaftesbury Project 1978 24pp 45p

ISBN 0 903452 08 1

Oppenheimer's lecture is a *tour de force*. It examines Christian ethics from its starting point in repentance, through its similarity and opposition to humanist ethics, to an ethic of objective demand of response to man and to the glory of God, and of mercy—not simply human but also divine. This is a lucid piece examining key emphases in Christianity: the religious and the humanist. The first leads to legalism and heteronomy, the second to antinomianism and autonomy. She seeks to describe an ethic which is humanist (in the fullest sense) and yet faithful to the nature of God. It is not always easy to follow, but for those looking for some amalgam of the creation ethic with the redemption ethic, here is one fascinating attempt presented with intellectual vigour and gentle passion.

The Shaftesbury Project have brought together three articles from *Third Way*, by Chris Wright on a much neglected theme of the ethics of the OT. He examines the authority and relevance of the ethical message of the OT. His plea is to use *all* the material of the OT and to give proper weight to the context of Israel's experience of redemption. In chapter two, he applies his hermeneutical method to the laws of the OT to understand and then to look for their significance today. Finally, he applies his method to the institution of the Jubilee. A good 45p's worth, but we need more from Chris on this method—to establish its validity.

E. DAVID COOK

ETHICS AND BELIEF PETER BAE LZ

Sheldon Press 1977 118pp £1.60

ISBN 0 85969 110 1

As joint editor of the 'Issues in Religious Studies' series, Peter Baelz has produced a 'guide to the territory to which morality and religion both seem to put forward a claim.' He is particularly concerned with the possibilities of conflict and co-operation between the two. The level is that for students embarking on a course and has an introductory flavour. He begins with general questions about morality, ethics, subjectivity, objectivity and relativism. The book then has, in fact, two sections. The one examines moral judgements and arguments: the moral act, the nature of the moral agent and his motivation. Then Baelz offers an analysis of conscience, starting from Butler and arriving at the importance of persons. The link between the first part and the second is the question 'Why be moral?'. Is

this self-interest or is it an expression of belonging? The second part looks at the relation between morality and religion in terms of conflict and dialogue. This is set in the context of the discussion of the will of God expressed in kingdom and love. He concludes with an analysis of love and sets this firmly in the context of freedom, obedience and responsibility.

The book is clear, largely non-technical, and well presented in easily digestible chunks. Each chapter has a few discussion questions. These could have been even more helpful if some idea of the approach to the answer had been included. A good book for the beginner.

E. DAVID COOK

PROPOSALS FOR A NEW SEXUAL ETHIC **JACK DOMINIAN**

Darton, Longman and Todd 1977 90pp £1.50

ISBN 0 232 51379 1

A Catholic layman counsellor writes for and to his church as it struggles with sexual morality. We are really onlookers. Fascinated by the internal debate, we realize that the issues and themes are vital for Christian sexual ethics. Dominian wishes to move from a biological and reproductive emphasis on sex to a person-based sexual minority stressing wholeness, mutuality and authentic love. He examines sexual pleasure, masturbation, pre-marital and intra-marital sex in the context of his description of love. Sex is not just for procreation, but may also be for pleasure. He looks at this from psychological and sound insight and applies these to the traditional views. The key is the concept of a person—defined in terms of wholeness and growth. Personal love refers to the experiences of sustaining, healing and growth which require certain contingencies of permanency, continuity and predictability. While alert to the dangers of masturbation, he takes a positive view of it as part of the growth process and in discussion of fornication we have a true summary of his overall stance: 'What really matters is the encounter of persons and the presence of love.' (p 58) Yet he knows all too well that 'The evil of our day is disposable relationships . . .' (p 70), and that 'the man-woman sexual relationship is primarily directed towards forming a continuity of life which is permanent and exclusive.' (p 75)

Here is an honest attempt to revalue and alter Catholic teaching on sexual morality. His attitude may be loving, his search indeed for truth, but has the baby gone with the bath water?

E. DAVID COOK

TOWARDS A THEOLOGY OF GAY LIBERATION

edited MALCOLM MACCOURT

SCM Press 1977 113pp £1.95

ISBN 0 334 01687 8

Presented as a contribution to a 'theology of human sexuality' and

'gay rights as a civil liberties issue', the collection of papers is designed to help Christians clarify their thinking on 'gay relationships', to help church leaders 'to overcome their fears of themselves, their families and friends' and to interest 'gay' people who find rejection from many Christians. The first section sets the scene towards a theology of homosexuality from M. Macourt and D. Blamires. Its aim is to identify the question from the challenge of gay liberation to the church. Section two is in the form of a debate between R. Norton on 'Homophobia' and J. Martin as an OT scholar, replying to show that Norton has not done his biblical work properly. Norton's rejoinder begins with the accusation that man has a 'transparently heterosexual bias'. Any book which claims to further the debate on homosexuality must go beyond such name-calling. Sections three and four examine the gay challenge to traditional notions of sexuality and attempt to discover some new theological perspectives on some sex relationships. N. Pittenger, G. Hibbert and M. Keeling look in turn at what it means to be human, gay liberation and Christian liberation, and a Christian basis for gay relationships.

The book is uneven in context and tone. The editor's idea of a common conclusion seems not to be borne out by the variety of the authors' stances. It will not add much that is helpful to the debate, though section four is important, if only for the standing of the contributors.

E. DAVID COOK

LIFE IN OUR HANDS: A Study in Human Values

C. G. SCORER

IVP 1978 160pp £1.95

ISBN 0 85110 585 8

The jacket, a splendid photograph of a thumb-sucking babe holding its mother's hand, makes you pick this up; a wise thing to do.

Scorer uses two basic key ideas: relationships and 'the love of life'. This latter idea he introduces to hold together the tensions of personal freedom and the good of the community. 'Love of life' is not a concept which at first sight appeals to me, although I have been baffled to better it. However, he quickly strips off its impersonal veneer—God is always dealing with men and women as individuals. Finally he moves through love to respect, to reverence, to awe—'God has given a special task to one particular life.'

Against this background the author examines the threatened values in human life. 'Man has vast brain capacity and also very skilful and sensitive hands.' Only a surgeon would have written that. It is because Jim Scorer is not only very widely read in ethics but is a medical man of great experience that this work is so practical.

He starts with marriage: the primary relationship in life, and displays it in all its high splendour. 'Agreement to share life together is the essence of marriage'; its three aspects—companionship, coitus, pledged faithfulness—stand together. He has no time for serial polygamy: 'We are guilty of attacking the very soul of child-

hood by encouraging easy divorce.' Scorer is not blind to the tensions in marriage but, like Bonhoeffer, claims that it is marriage that supports the love, not the other way round; quoting Thielicke to good effect. The present reviewer could have wished that the author had unpacked his phrase 'They are and remain one in God's eyes till death separates them', rather than leaving it unexplained.

Then follow sections on conception and contraception; the initiation of life; population control; human life as an ecological threat; induced abortion; the destruction of unborn life. Anyone wishing a sensible guide to these problems will find it here. The medical dilemma of whether to prescribe the pill for the unmarried teenager or wait for her to return requesting an abortion, is not glossed over. There is sound advice: 'If certain actions and attitudes are unthinkable, there is the end of the matter; the imagination does not play upon them.' He is, however, a little too sweeping in maintaining that requests for abortion arise only because the relationship between the man and the woman has gone adrift at some point; failed responsibly-used contraception is to blame in a sizeable minority of my patients.

Scorer's chapter on euthanasia is outstanding. You will not find a better brief but totally adequate examination of the issues.

Despite its unambiguous stance—man is separated from God and in rebellion against him—the evangelistic element is low key. This work is therefore recommended for personal reading and lending, but also for use among students. Make sure it is on the bookstall.

REX GARDNER

THE VIOLENCE INSIDE · PAUL TOURNIER

SCM Press 1978 202pp £2.95

ISBN 0 334 01740 8

In his discursive style, Paul Tournier has added another thought-provoking contribution to the library of psychological and philosophical writings.

In his consideration of the ambiguity between legitimate and illegitimate violence he quotes from the orderly world of animal violence, the unconscious conflicts hidden in the human psyche, the ritual sacrifices of anthropology and the 'sacred' violence of mythology and the Bible. (When is violence the will of God?) He tries to draw a distinction between aggression which is not a necessary evil, and destructive violence. He concludes that the key to the problem of man's inordinate violence is the thirst for power which creates violence, and he supports this by evidence from international, economic and domestic examples. Even God stands in man's way to power. There is the question of hidden, as well as overt, violence, both in the church, the home and the lives of individuals which is the result of the power drive. The restraining instinct in animals has been replaced by reason in man, but man has lost his wisdom.

Tournier concludes the book with a moving appeal for people who

CHURCHMAN

will live in small groups of mutual care—'God's poor'—and who have rejected the lust for power. (Strangely, there is no mention of the family here.)

The statement in this book is not tightly argued so there are obvious gaps. Tournier is not a rigorous theologian, and seems to take biblical quotes out of context. He is a self-confessed universalist. (Is he struggling with the ultimate concept of violence?)

MYRA CHAVE-JONES

PRINCIPLES OF PASTORAL COUNSELLING

R. S. LEE

SPCK 1978 135pp £2.50

ISBN 0 281 03565 2

Dr Lee has had a long and influential career as curate at St Martin-in-the-Fields, organizer of Overseas Religious Broadcasting, Vicar of the University Church, Oxford, and Chaplain at St Catherine's & Nuffield Colleges. He is a classical Freudian and this book is built on the basic assumptions and methods of psycho-analytic structure.

It is written 'for the guidance of general pastors' (but a good deal of it is spent in describing processes which, he admits, are inappropriate for the general pastor to use). He writes very clearly about the growth and development of personality and the factors which operate to constitute a person's attitudes to himself and the external world. The chapter on confession, counselling and forgiveness is particularly helpful in this connection, with its distinction between the emotions which constitute repentance and guilt. Dr Lee has some searching things to say about the pastor's attitude to himself and his own motivation. He examines the use of responsibility and authority in the pastoral situation. I was sorry that his remarks are addressed exclusively to clergy, although, in fact, pastoral counselling is done by many lay men and women.

I found the division of sin into categories of actual, formal and original was unhelpful. Dr Lee's tacit denial of an historical fall and the description of original sin as 'a condition of rising' seems to be perverse. There is no suggestion of 'original' sin in the sense of the corporate identity of the whole human race, no mention of the transcendent becoming immanent, and no reference to the supernatural work of the Holy Spirit.

Although the book has some good, stimulating, and enlightening things to say, I was left with the impression of the complexity of man without a balancing view of the greatness of God, and that psychology is the answer to the human dilemma rather than theology.

This book is published under SPCK's Care & Counselling series—not to be confused with the separate organization Care & Counsel.

MYRA CHAVE-JONES

**CHRIST AND THE HUMAN PROSPECT:
The Unity of Existence Here and Hereafter**
JOHN DE SATGÉ

SPCK 1978 145pp £3.75

ISBN 0 281 03631 4

This is a stimulating book by an Anglican author from an evangelical tradition who has already become well known through his work on the place of the Virgin Mary in the doctrine and spirituality of the church (*Mary and the Christian Gospel*). In his latest book, whose general theme is well indicated by its title and sub-title, he makes a plea for a due recognition in Christian thinking of a supernatural realm and argues that man himself cannot properly be understood in his God-given character if his heavenly destiny is lost sight of. The main thrust is therefore heartening to anyone who holds to a traditional view of the relationship between this world and the next. There are, however, nagging questions which the book does not satisfactorily answer, when the author comes to matters like Mariology, prayers for the dead, and the relationship between Scripture and tradition. The first of these he has arguably dealt with in his earlier major work; the last is probably the one that most needs resolving.

The intention is obviously to work on the frontier of the Catholic and evangelical traditions of theology and spirituality, and the author's sensitive mind and extensive knowledge of literature, theological and other, makes him well suited to the task. He has taken on board for his own personal use some important features of Catholic spirituality and this enables him to write from the inside, as it were, about certain pieces of Catholic teaching which have always appeared strange to evangelical Christians. This is itself a useful service to perform, and people who are interested in promoting understanding between Catholics and Protestants will highly value his book as a sane, lucid and charitable attempt to further the process. Perhaps in some future work he will treat us to a more thorough discussion of controversial issues.

J. C. P. COCKERTON

LISTENING WITH THE HEART
DAVID FORRESTER

Burns and Oates 1978 95pp £1.95

ISBN 0 86012 066 X

There is much here to enlighten and encourage the Christian who wants to know more about the practicalities of prayer. That is not to say that the author has ignored principles, but that he has set himself the task of giving down-to-earth help to people who long to get further with their praying.

The movement of thought is straightforward. Human love gives us an analogy of the relationship which we ought to have with God, but the pressures of modern life tend to stultify that relationship unless

we can come to the point where we trust in God alone—as did the ‘poor in spirit’ of Bible times. The practical answer, in terms of prayer, is to cultivate the habit of being silent before God, but this will not be fruitful unless it rests upon a disciplined life of ‘formal and communal prayer’. There follow excellent little chapters on prayer in the context of growing old and of experiencing loneliness, and the book rounds off its main theme with a treatment of God’s work in history—the foundation of all prayer.

A delightful book containing much more solid spiritual wisdom than its mere 95 pages would suggest.

J. C. P. COCKERTON

CONSIDER YOUR CALL: A Theology of Monastic Life Today DANIEL REES and others

SPCK 1978 447pp £10.00

ISBN 0 281 03609 8

A very good book indeed for those who are interested in the question of the relevance of Christian monasticism to modern church life. Produced by specially appointed commissions of the English Benedictine Congregation, it has some of the drawbacks of most documents emanating from a group rather than from an individual, but it scores heavily in terms of its authoritativeness and its thoroughness. The people who wrote it know intimately the matters they are discussing and they have taken great pains to think through the significance for modern times of age-old practices. No major aspect of monastic life is omitted and throughout the book one is conscious of a sustained intention to tackle the really difficult issues. One finds excellent chapters on subjects which deeply concern all Christians whether they are monastics or not—prayer, authority and corporate responsibility in the church, sexuality, poverty, and so on. At the outset it is plainly stated that the purpose is to show that monastics are wrestling with problems which today are agitating the mind of the whole church.

The treatment is careful, scholarly and devout. Those whose responsibility it was to ‘write up’ the final version from the documents contributed by the various study groups have done their work admirably. The result is a book easy to read and to cross-reference, and which leaves an impression of deep sincerity and Christian ‘balance’. It is to be warmly recommended as contributing to a better understanding of current issues in the church, quite apart from giving a valuable, contemporary interpretation of the Benedictine Rule. It contains at the back a short bibliography and extensive notes covering 63 pages.

JOHN COCKERTON

THE WORLD IS A WEDDING: Explorations in Christian Spirituality A. M. ALLCHIN

Darton, Longman and Todd 1978 173pp £2.95

ISBN 0 232 51405 4

This essay on Christian spirituality is a collection of Canon Allchin’s

published articles. His reference points are Eastern Orthodoxy, seventeenth-century Anglican writings and some Welsh writers and poets—with Thomas Merton for good measure. The introduction with the first two chapters, here published for the first time, map the position taken up and form the crux of the argument. The rest is comment and illustration.

Spirituality is the Christian faith actually lived and prayed; it is the way Christians understand and handle material things in the light of Scripture and tradition. The author is concerned with attitudes and moods, not techniques. He asks us to consider the holiness of matter: to perceive a meeting of time with eternity, a wed-*ing* of heaven and earth. Only glimpses of this interlocking of planes may be caught up but the linkage is always potential. 'Heaven and earth are linked in a single bond, and the world is a wedding.' (p 22)

The theological basis of such spirituality is expounded in terms of incarnation, transfiguration and celebration. Canon Allchin relates this way of looking at matter to such issues as the practicalities of pollution politics. He sets it firmly in a context of worship and suggests it is fuelled by contemplation and achieved in the communion of saints. The unusual use of Welsh illustrations is interesting but less than compelling. Eastern Orthodoxy, seventeenth-century Anglican divines and Thomas Merton are more recognizable resources.

It is good to be faced with Eastern Orthodoxy in this way and to have parallels drawn with Anglican tradition. But does perception of the world as transfigured happen by just looking? Is man *such* a priest of matter? Is this creation's 'wait with eager longing' of Rom.8: 19? Or is there some recreative and redemptive work in the natural order itself, analogous to the work of sanctification in the believer?

PETER R. AKEHURST

THE LITURGY TODAY AND TOMORROW JOSEPH GELINEAU

Darton, Longman and Todd 1978 123pp £1.85 ISBN 0 232 51377 5

Fr Gelineau is well-known for his modern translation of the Psalms and a new way of singing them. He now puts us in his debt in another field. Writing what he claims is no more than an essay in the light of changes experienced in the Roman Catholic Church over the past decade, he takes what he needs from other disciplines and sciences without claiming to be expert in any. He is concerned with the way liturgy is done rather than with its origins, development or revision; he focuses on the pew-level dynamics of what actually happens.

He sees the danger of liturgy celebrating a mystery which is no longer being made available to people through the celebration. The answer he offers is not further reduction of a text to present-day words or idiom, but careful attention to what the words and actions evoke in the participants, and to clarity in the 'production'. First he

discusses the needs of people in assemblies for worship, the ways in which they associate for worship, and how buildings and space facilitate this. Next he examines the sense of community and the ways in which this can be expressed and realized. He calls for the scaling up in significance of some occasions of worship, to balance the scaling down to intimate worship in small groups which is the experience of many today. Helpful chapters follow on ministry, words, music (very interesting in the light of Protestantism's heritage of hymnody) and symbol. He concludes with a most valuable piece on what he calls the 'transparency of the gospel'.

Most useful as an exercise in listening to the brother in Christ thinking through his problems and needs, rather than for slavish copying of a prescription.

PETER R. AKEHURST

**EEN COMPENDIUM VAN ACHTERGROND INFORMATIE
BIJ 491 GEZANGEN UIT HET LIEDBOEK VOOR DE
KERKEN** (A Compendium of Background Information to the
491 Songs from the Hymn Book for the Churches)
G. VAN DER LEEUW-STICHTING

Amsterdam 1977 1418pp unpriced

What began as an attempt by the Dutch Reformed Church to revise its metrical psalter in 1951 grew into an exciting ecumenical hymn book, published in 1973 as the *Liedboek voor de Kerken* (Hymnbook for the Churches). The collection of 491 hymns was compiled by the representatives of the Reformed, Re-Reformed, Baptist, Mennonite and Lutheran churches in Holland. The book is now being used by other denominations including the Roman Catholic Church (for the background, see *The Hymn Society Bulletin*, Vol. 8, No. 8, Nov. 1975, pp 134-37).

The present volume is a handbook to the *Liedboek voor de Kerken*, giving the hymnological background to its hymns, their authors, translators, composers etc. The title is somewhat misleading. A *compendium* is a volume which deals with its subject matter briefly and concisely. There is little concise about this large volume. One wonders whether there has been a semantic slip on the part of the editors: they used *compendium* in the title but meant *companion*. Certainly the English equivalents of this Dutch book are *companions* to their respective hymn books: see, for example, *Companion to Congregational Praise*, London 1950; *Historical Companion to Hymns Ancient and Modern*, London 1962; and *The Baptist Hymn Book Companion*, London 1967.

The *Compendium*, which is the work of some 42 contributors, has four major sections. The first is a collection of six essays on historical hymnody, one of them being a brief survey of the development of the English hymn. The second section, which is the major part of the volume, comprises notes on the text, music, author and composer of

each of the hymns. Some of the information can be found in other reference works, but the *Compendium* has the advantage of noting (albeit somewhat sparingly) recent relevant hymnological literature. This section is particularly valuable for details of modern Dutch hymnwriting which cannot be found elsewhere. The third section collects together alphabetically biographical studies of the more important authors and composers. It is particularly strong on contemporary Dutch writers and musicians, though it sometimes leans more to hagiography than to strict biography. The final section traces the origins of the *Liedboek voor de Kerken*.

The volume is fully indexed and superbly illustrated. One index lists what appears to be almost one hundred English hymns which are included in the Dutch hymn book. But a closer examination reveals that it includes English translations of Latin, German and other foreign-language hymns. Thus the index demonstrates not the original English hymns which have been included in translations: rather it shows the hymns sung in common by both Dutch and English Christians. The careful detective, however, will discover that translations of 31 English hymn texts are to be found in the Dutch collection.

ROBIN A. LEAVER

ENGLISH CHURCH MUSIC 1978

edited LIONEL DAKERS

The Royal School of Church Music 1978 64pp £1.70

English Church Music 1978 is the sixteenth annual collection from the Royal School of Church Music. As with any collection of essays, it is difficult to review each contribution adequately. Many of these ten essays were originally given as sermons, addresses or lectures. John Taylor, Bishop of Winchester, is represented by his sermon given at the Opening Service of the Three Choirs Festival 1977 on Luke 15:25 — 'He heard music'—and the Dean of St Albans, Peter Moore, considers the work and witness of cathedrals in the contemporary world. John Rowntree surveys the use of the organ in the Roman Catholic liturgy since Vatican II; Arthur Hutchings discusses Schubert's church compositions; Lionel Dakers offers a profile of John Rutter; and Herbert Byard's 'Thomas Hardy and Church Music', which originally appeared in *Musical Opinion* in 1971, is given a welcome reprint. Of particular interest are Stanley Thompson's account of St Michael's College, Tenbury, and Watkins Shaw's valuable survey of periodicals in which discussions of English church music may be found.

Two of the essays raise a fundamental question in suggesting that the artist/composer in working for the church need not necessarily be a committed Christian or understand Christian theology. In 'The Arts and the Church', Walter Hussey rightly states that the church in every age needs the artist to express its truths and help it to express its worship. He notes, again rightly, that modern artists have generally 'lost the religious habit in which many of the early generations

grew up.' Hussey concludes, therefore, that the church must make overtures to the secular artist to encourage him to express the Christian faith. He says: 'The church must go after him, remembering, as Henry Moore once said, that it may be only through his art that he can come to understand the church's theology.' But can the secular artist adequately re-present what the church of Jesus Christ wishes to convey in its worship and witness? What validity has a work of art produced for the church by the secular artist who nevertheless remains uncommitted himself to the doctrines he has been asked to express? Is not the church, when commissioning a work from a secular artist, guilty of undermining the integrity of his art, because it is asking him to express something he does not himself believe? Unfortunately such questions are not considered by Mr Hussey.

A similar secular approach can also be seen in Arthur Wills' review of the challenges and opportunities facing the composer who writes for the church today. Wills believes that there should be more experimental music in church, arguing that as theologians have been allowed the freedom to think what they like, and express those thoughts, so composers for the church should be allowed their head to do their own thing. He asserts that 'the existence of such books [as *The Myth of God Incarnate*] would appear to show that Bach's God, as expressed in the seventeenth/eighteenth-century doctrines and liturgies, cannot be the same God for us.' Wills sees the main challenge as 'that of making an attempt to bridge the gap between the exciting advances made in secular music over the last decade and the church music which should at least mirror all this activity.' Does the author really mean that fifteen hundred or more years of Christian music is therefore no longer valid for the worshipper of today, and that the anthropocentric chaos and nihilism of much modern music should become the norm of contemporary church music? Surely the need is for composers—and theologians, for that matter—who share Bach's theocentric and biblical foundations, and who are also able to interpret them to the contemporary world?

ROBIN A. LEAVER