

# Theology on the Web.org.uk

*Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible*

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

---

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

[https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles\\_churchman\\_os.php](https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php)

## Book Reviews

JOHN WESLEY.

By V. H. H. Green. (Nelson.) 168 pp. 25s.

The fascination of the life, character and teaching of John Wesley still brings many books from the pens of those who recognize his unique contribution to eighteenth century life and thought. Dr. Green has already given us other informative studies of Wesley's early life, and of the Oxford background to his ministerial training, and is therefore well fitted to write this biography in the "Leaders of Religion" series, edited by Professor C. W. Dugmore. But this is no mere popular study, once again travelling a familiar and well-worn path. The Oxford period is enlivened by extracts from hitherto unpublished diaries, while the disillusionment of the Georgia mission, and the Sophy Hopkey affair receive more careful and critical attention than usual. The "conversion" is neither over-dramatized nor underrated; whatever interpretation is given to this momentous event, at least it is regarded as decisively co-ordinating Wesley's vocation and previous spiritual experiences.

But how to explain that within ten years Wesley had become a national figure? Here Dr. Green rightly points out that conditions prevailing at the time must be taken into consideration. For example, the rural character of the country made it possible to ride from one small town or village to the next in a way that would have been impossible fifty years or so later, with the industrial revolution making for a greatly increased urbanization. Again, there was the novelty of open-air preaching; the deep interest in religious controversy; the popular character of Methodist sermons; and an extending reading public, which bought and read much Methodist literature. But this is not to underestimate Wesley's genius for organization, and his remarkable faith, determination, and steadfastness of purpose. The sad chapter dealing with the Calvinistic controversy over election and justification shows Wesley at his best, not involving himself more than was absolutely necessary, being conciliatory as far as possible, and showing remarkable restraint under great provocation. But the battle left its mark on the evangelical movement for many years to come.

The closing years of his life are sympathetically dealt with, not least the controversial "ordinations", and the "consecration" of Thomas Coke to superintend the work in America. It is important to recall that this last action provoked the strongest condemnation from Charles Wesley, who prophesied (correctly) that this, more than anything else, would make inevitable a separation from the established Church.

This book is not only valuable as an introduction to the life and work of the founder of Methodism. Within a small compass, it compresses a remarkable character study of a highly complex personality. From a moderate High Church upbringing, Wesley became the leader of the

Evangelical movement; the academic intellectual was transformed, with Pauline fervour, into the apostle of the untouched masses of the people. Politically a Tory, his followers and spiritual descendants adorned the Labour movement. Basically suspicious of innovation in religion, Wesley's traditionalism was not permitted to interfere with his prophetic vocation, while his humanitarianism made him one of the first notable critics of the slave trade. To make a living character out of such apparent contradictions is no mean feat, yet Dr. Green makes the subject of his study both credible and attractive. John Wesley lives in these pages; what could be asked more of any biographer?

COLLISS DAVIES.

### SHAFTESBURY.

*By G. F. A. Best. (Batsford.) 139 pp. 18s.*

Dr. Best is the first biographer of Shaftesbury to make full use of his manuscript diaries since Hodder, who produced his three-decker biography in 1886. Dr. Best hopes his own book will be "useful as a supplement and, sometimes, a corrective" to Hodder's which he considerably admires. Readers will be interested to find the incident of the pauper's funeral at Harrow relegated to a footnote with the explanation: "There is no evidence of its having had the profound influence he came to read back into it, nor of his having had any first-hand acquaintance with London's slums before he was forty" (p. 114). While Dr. Best in no way minimizes the effect that his nurse, Maria Millis, had on the future earl, he would not date Shaftesbury's conversion to "full-blown Evangelicalism" till about 1834, and avers that "his first distinctively Evangelical association was the Church Pastoral-Aid Society" of which he was President from 1836. A third corrective is evidence of Shaftesbury's strong anti-clericalism and his distrust of episcopacy; his recommendations of bishops to Palmerston was more to keep ritualists and rationalists out than to put Evangelicals in; "few", comments Dr. Best, "were personal friends of his" (p. 59). Dr. Best's book shows, even more clearly than Hodder does, Shaftesbury's real distaste for all his fellow-rank politicians other than Palmerston to whom he was devoted. He also brings out the dilemma of the yearning for office and the vow not to accept office till the Ten Hours Bill was on the Statute Book. Dr. Best alters Hodder's priorities, considering Shaftesbury's work for lunacy reform and public health of greater significance than factory and mine reform. This is of course a matter of opinion.

The book is confined in its scope and objective, but is all the more perceptive because it sharpens the reader's vision of Shaftesbury's character and work. An opening chapter on childhood, marriage, and family is followed by one on church, state, and empire (the section on empire has some new insights). The account of Shaftesbury's social achievements is mainly restricted to lunacy and factory reform and his work to combat evils of many kinds in the Victorian industrial city; here the ragged schools and public health receive most attention. The Mines Act receives only a page, the chimney boys only a sentence.

Possibly the main value of Dr. Best's book is that he has worked out

in some detail the double-sidedness of Shaftesbury's character to which Canon Charles Smyth drew attention in a broadcast entitled, "The Evangelical Discipline". Dr. Best says of Shaftesbury in the Epilogue, "He was in some ways, in some moods, an awkward, disagreeable man proud, impetuous, self-righteous, vain, violent, censorious. . . . Yet however necessary it must be to insist that Shaftesbury was not the simple, genial, pious, soft-hearted philanthropist of popular legend and much popular writing, no truths will ever be discovered about him that can conceivably lessen his stature as one of the greatest Victorians, and, in however curious a manner, one of the best" (p. 126).

If this excellent and lively book has one weakness it lies in the failure of the author to bring out how fully Shaftesbury's belief in the Second Coming influenced all his attitude and work. That he held the doctrine strongly is mentioned but that it affected his sense of his accountability to God has been missed. Shaftesbury once wrote: "Visited Peckham Asylum. Visiting in authority today, I may be visited by authority tomorrow". This conviction increased his good works for he intended to be found "watching" and working when the Lord returned. At seventy he still kept up a day of engagements planned almost to the minute, starting early, finishing late, for he realized that "the night cometh when no man can work".

MICHAEL HENNELL.

CHURCHMAN MILITANT: GEORGE AUGUSTUS SELWYN, BISHOP OF NEW ZEALAND AND LICHFIELD.

*By John H. Evans. (Allen & Unwin.) 298 pp. 40s.*

There have been a number of biographies of this great nineteenth century figure, one of whose monuments is Selwyn College, Cambridge. The author justifies another volume because none has dealt with Selwyn's life in detail, or assessed his significance to the church today. Selwyn was certainly ahead of his time and curiously at one with our time. Both as Bishop of New Zealand at the age of 32, and as Bishop of Lichfield twenty-seven years later, he began with revolutionary plans for reorganization which inevitably aroused resistance. His upbringing and his extended time at Eton bred in this masterful personality a dominating spirit which made it natural for him to impose his reforms with an unthinking assurance that they must be right. In primitive New Zealand this might be justified, but to initiate an upheaval in the first six months and then depart to New Zealand to say farewell, and be absent for another six months, is difficult to justify in an English diocese. The author judges his mistakes to be those of "inexperienced enthusiasm". But it led him into "the five great controversies of his New Zealand life"—his dispute with the Methodists, his quarrel with Henry Williams, his disagreement with the C.M.S., the criticism of his activities in the Maori Wars, and the Jenner controversy. It would be quite wrong, however, to think of him as a ruthless reformer determined to create the machinery of dictatorship. He thought the monarchical idea of the episcopate to be "foreign to the Gospel". He introduced synodical government to New Zealand and was disappointed that the Lambeth Conference showed little interest, "the precious time

being so frittered away". In many ways he resembles the great Evangelicals of his own day. His one dominating urge was to proclaim the Gospel. On one of his journeys in New Zealand he travelled 2,685 miles—1,400 by ship, 397 by boat, 126 on horseback, and 762 on foot. This is the story of a great and lovable man of immense spiritual power and devotion. The author, obviously a great admirer of Selwyn, is scrupulously fair, and has given us an absorbing picture of a man whose great concern was to pioneer the Gospel in New Zealand, and in this country to win back that "half" (!) of the population which was "alienated from the Church".

TALBOT G. MOHAN.

### JOHN WILLIAM COLENZO : BISHOP OF NATAL.

By Peter Hinchliff. (Nelson.) 199 pp. 25s.

Among the controversial figures of last century, John William Colenso runs John Henry Newman a close second. It is revealingly symptomatic of the great reversal that has taken place at the level of ecclesiastical officialdom over the past hundred years that the orthodoxy which the bench of bishops then sought to maintain is now no less commonly condemned than were the views of Bishop Colenso which they pronounced as heretical, while these latter views are now commonly treated as orthodox. In other words, what was regarded as heretical a century ago, and indeed for eighteen centuries before that, has become today's orthodoxy. This would seem to pose some awkward questions for those who value their continuity with the past. How is it that the classical doctrine of the authority and authenticity of Holy Scripture which was *semper, ab omnibus, et ubique* acknowledged and taught is now unacceptable? Is it possible that the Church during all those preceding centuries was terribly in error? or that the Holy Spirit was asleep? Dr. Hinchliff's biographical study of Colenso makes absorbing reading and it will add considerably to his reputation as an ecclesiastical historian. He writes with real understanding both of the man and of the times in which he lived. The portrait he presents is of a personality that is far from unattractive—in his words, "courageous, adventurous, prickly, obstinate, and kind".

A Cornishman by birth, Colenso proved his mathematical ability by passing out from Cambridge as second wrangler and was appointed to the teaching staff of Harrow by the headmaster, Dr. Longley, who some thirty years later (in 1867), as Archbishop of Canterbury, was to call the first Lambeth Conference with the purpose, in part, of removing the scandal which had been occasioned by Colenso's critical views of the Bible. When still a young man, Colenso was strongly influenced by the writings of F. D. Maurice. By the time he was consecrated bishop of the largely missionary diocese of Natal in 1853, he had come firmly to the belief "that all the heathen were already redeemed by Christ and that the prime job of the missionary was not to convert but to teach the heathen to enjoy the fruits of their redemption". Robert Gray, the high-church Bishop of Cape Town, who had enthusiastically selected Colenso for the Natal post, would not have approved of the latter's universalistic and critical views then any more than he did

later ; yet, as Dr. Hinchliff points out, " the editor of Mrs. Colenso's letters has shown very clearly that Gray cannot have been entirely ignorant of Colenso's ' heretical ' opinions ". This being so, it reflects seriously on Gray's subsequent attitude to Colenso.

The indefatigable manner in which the new bishop tackled the challenge of his diocese can only draw forth our admiration, but the years were marred by a variety of personal conflicts and in particular by the unrelenting animosity of Dean Green who, as Dr. Hinchliff observes, was a Tractarian of the most advanced kind. The main storm burst, however, with the publication in 1861 of a commentary on the Epistle to the Romans from Colenso's pen. It was felt that in this book Colenso had struck at the very roots of the doctrine of the atonement. Interestingly enough, it was in this same year that the volume entitled *Essays and Reviews*, which had roused 8,500 clergymen to petition the Archbishop of Canterbury to institute proceedings against the authors, was condemned by the bench of English bishops. Colenso's position was not improved by the publication the following year of the first part of his *magnum opus* on the Pentateuch and Joshua. All that followed is ably told by Dr. Hinchliff : Colenso's excommunication by Gray ; the vindication of his title to the bishopric of Natal by the Privy Council ; the consecration and sending in, none the less, of a rival bishop (an uncomfortable fact, surely, for those members of the CPSA who have criticized the appointment in recent years of Bishop Morris by the CESA as the invasion of another's territory) ; and the last tragic, though not pathetic, years at his home at Ekukanyeni, still as always labouring selflessly for his beloved Zulus. Now, by an irony of history, the heterodoxy of Colenso has become the " orthodoxy " of Gray's successors.

PHILIP E. HUGHES.

THE LETTERS AND DIARIES OF JOHN HENRY NEWMAN :  
VOL. XV : THE ACHILLI TRIAL, JANUARY 1852 TO DECEMBER  
1853.

*Edited by Charles Stephen Dessain and Vincent Ferrar Blehl.*  
(Nelson.) 568 pp. 84s.

The impeccable standard of editing and production achieved in the volumes that have already appeared, is fully maintained in this latest addition to the sequence. The two years covered by Volume XV were anxious ones for Newman. There was, in the first place, the protracted delay in bringing the Achilli case before the judge. It was only on 21 June 1852 that the trial opened in London. Meanwhile the considerable cost of keeping the witnesses who had been brought to England to corroborate Newman's charges against Achilli was a cause of worry ; and there was the constant danger that these witnesses would grow weary of doing nothing and return to their homes, which was the effect designed by the delaying tactics of Achilli's lawyers. On 24 June the verdict was given against Newman. The conduct and outcome of the trial met with strong criticism in the press, however. In a leading article in *The Times*, for example, the question was asked : " Who can hope to be believed when such a mass of evidence has been flung aside as worthless ? " Under the circumstances Newman had

every justification for concluding that he and his cause had won a moral victory: "You must bear this in mind", he wrote to F. W. Faber, "viz., that we *always* thought the verdict would be unfavourable—and relied on the *moral effect* of the evidence—now the article in today's *Times* is sufficient to prove that we have attained the *moral effect*". The sentence, a nominal fine of £100, was not pronounced until the end of the following January, a plea for a new trial having been rejected.

During these months Newman was preparing and delivering in Dublin the Discourses on the Scope and Nature of University Education, and this too he found a severe burden. "What tries me most," he confessed to J. D. Dalgairns in a letter of 23 July 1852, "is, at my age, the difficulty of keeping up the *steam* . . . these Lectures lie like a tremendous load on me". On 22 October he tells another correspondent (Sister Mary Imelda Poole) of the agony which literary composition almost invariably occasioned him: "The first book I wrote, my 'Arians', I was almost fainting daily, when I was finishing it—and (except my Parochial Sermons) every book I have written, before and since I was a Catholic, has been a sort of *operation*, the distress has been so great. The Discourses, now (thank God) all but finished, have been the most painful of all". Again, to T. W. Allies, on 2 November: "My University Lectures have taken out of me, no one can say how much, and I am fit for nothing but to lie on a sofa".

The holiday he longed for did not come till mid-December, when he went up to Scotland and spent six weeks at Abbotsford in response to an invitation from James Hope, who had married Sir Walter Scott's granddaughter Charlotte Lockhart. Yet, though treated with every consideration and surrounded by congenial and distinguished fellow-guests, Newman was restless. "The House itself is dark and the rooms low," he writes to John Joseph Gordon on 7 January 1853, ". . . I dare say when you see me, you will say that the change of air has freshened my face. Otherwise I have no reason to think I am better—I have the anxiety of being from home—and now this Achilli business, like a bad tooth which for a while has ceased to ache, is making itself felt again. . . . Hope anticipates every want of mine—gives me the easiest seat. . . . Never was a party which got on so well together". Newman, however, goes on "at a jog-trot through the day, seeming very merry and cheerful to everyone, but with an aching heart". Nevertheless he appears to have been good company! Thus Ambrose St. John wrote to him from London on 17 January: "Badeley gives a very nice account of you, says you are so cheerful and so jolly—and tell such good stories".

The period covered by this volume also saw the death of Newman's sister, Harriet Mozley (in July 1852), by which he was deeply affected, and the death of John Joseph Gordon at Bath, another severe loss to him (in February 1853); the occurrence of serious internal problems among the English Oratorians, including the misbehaviour of one of the Birmingham members and the threat of a rift between Newman and Faber in London, subsequently mended in a moving exchange of letters; and at last, in October 1853, the long awaited call to inaugurate the Catholic University in Dublin, of which he had been designated

Rector two years previously. It can only strike us as highly ironical that Newman should have criticized Faber's choice of Brompton as the location for the London Oratory: "It is essentially a suburb", he wrote to Faber on 18 September 1852, ". . . I mean, it is in a neighbourhood of second-rate gentry and second-rate shops . . . it is nearly halfway to Fulham. . . . It seems to me in no sense London". So rapidly do things change! Today it would be impossible to find a central situation in London which is more desirable or more fashionable!

PHILIP E. HUGHES.

#### A STUDY OF GREGORY PALAMAS.

*By John Meyendorff. (Faith Press.) 245 pp. 40s.*

This is one of the most considerable works yet to appear in English from the pen of an Orthodox theologian. The author deals lucidly and ably, first with the life and historical circumstances of Palamas (1296-1359) in the Byzantine world, as monk, as polemical and political figure, and as archbishop in Thessalonica; and then more closely with the thought of Palamas the theologian.

The first part of the book serves to enlighten the Westerner on many counts. First we find that the Greek humanism, which is supposed to have fed the Western Renaissance from Byzantine sources, was not the staple diet of the Byzantine civilization itself. Contending with the pagan implications of pure humanism was "hesychasm", a mystical and somewhat individualistic form of monasticism. Meyendorff attempts to explain the function of Eastern monasticism in terms which could not easily be transferred to the Latin Church in the fourteenth century: "The monk is not an ordinary Christian, but a prophet who announces, by his peculiar way of life, the presence here below of the Kingdom of God which transcends all the values of this world" (p. 31). One or two incidents mentioned, however (e.g., p. 35), suggest that this prophetic emphasis was largely a special characteristic of some "hesychasts" while most Easterners still expected monks to withdraw from the world, following a path of personal salvation. We find also that the life of Palamas comes into contact at some interesting points with the heretical sect of the Bogomils; and the part which he played in political affairs during the civil war of 1341-47 reveals a far more complex relationship between church and state in Byzantine society than the caricature normally offered by Western worshippers of Hildebrand.

The Palamite doctrines, which Dr. Meyendorff shows to have been a development in the mainstream of traditional Orthodox theology, and confirmed as such by the Council of 1351, prove to be a fine example of that profound philosophical consideration of the Divine Being, which is the consuming interest of so many of the Greek Fathers. "Hesychasm" provided a way of meditation leading to inner illumination which was liable to misunderstanding without a clear explanation of the relationship between the divine "hypostases", essence, and energies. But Gregory's thinking on this subject had repercussions in other directions, and it was the nominalist philosophy of Barlaam which first led him into public controversy. Dr. Meyendorff



draws out several valuable parallels in the intellectual condition of both East and West; and it is true that Barlaam's nominalism finds a parallel development in Western scholasticism led by William of Ockham. But he makes a questionable assertion when he declares that the latter "established the doctrinal foundations of the Protestant Reformation" (p. 237). He overlooks the subsequent revival of Augustine in the West, stimulated by Thomas Bradwardine, a strong opponent of Ockham, which influenced both Wyclif (a formidable realist) and later led Luther to reject Ockham at the fundamental point of his doctrine of man. It is therefore difficult to agree with Dr. Meyendorff that Palamas saved Orthodoxy from the disintegrating forces which led in the West to Protestantism and secularism, although one would not doubt the part he played in enabling the Eastern Church to survive the Turkish conquest.

J. E. TILLER.

### MONKS AND CIVILIZATION.

*By Jean Decarreaux. (Allen & Unwin.) 400 pp. 50s.*

How are we to interpret the stories of the saints? Are they history? or poetic saga? or pious fantasy? Where does faith end and credulity begin? The author of this scholarly work recognizes the problem but does not resolve it. "One must accept the situation that the historical period with which we are concerned has been to a large extent worked over by the hagiographer and laden with doubtful 'miracles' . . . Careful though we may be to retain only the truth, despising all exaggeration of it, we should nevertheless not forget that legends form part of our subject matter. We cannot, therefore, altogether refrain from presenting our heroes as they appeared at a given moment in their history, in the eyes of their hagiographers, who bear witness, not only to the facts, but to a certain method of presenting them". Thus, the stories are related, with a wealth of picturesque detail, as they have been handed down. Occasionally the author allows a note of gentle scepticism to intrude: "No doubt Martin's ship has flown over the waves . . . or so we are told by Gregory of Tours, whose memory we know was occasionally extremely good".

In the introductory chapter, the author discusses the fundamental question of prejudice and truth. "It would be false," he rightly observes, "to present history surrounded by a conventional halo, as if it were the subject of a stained-glass window. In the great story of our past there are shining pages, but also black ones. The former may cause the latter to be forgotten, but they will not suppress them. Linked together day by day, they form an interlocked whole of which the historian must take account. To isolate or stress certain episodes because they are of a flattering nature, whilst ignoring or blotting out others that may be embarrassing, is not the way to deal with history, and such a procedure would only discredit those who adopt it and the end they claim to have in view". "A lie", he insists, "whether pious or impious, however qualifying, is still a lie. In history, as in apologetics, honesty is always the best policy". "In the fifteenth century", he points out, "the humanist Lorenzo Valla stated that 'the Church has not to protect falsehood'. In the same way but in a

different sense Leo XIII wrote in 1883 that ' the first law of history is not to dare to lie ; the second, not to fear to tell the truth. In addition, the historian must not be suspect either of flattery or of animosity ' ”.

We must ask to what extent the author succeeds in being loyal to his own expressed convictions? At times one is conscious of a pious desire to extenuate if not excuse. " Jerome's character ", he frankly admits, " was such that too often his behaviour was anything but saintly, yet however much noise his vehemences made in the world, and however much they indeed upset him, they did him no lasting harm. On the contrary, just because they created such a stir, they were an intrinsic element of his unceasing striving for saintliness . . . His struggles, harder than those of any other mortal, only gained the greater glory thereby". We are bound to ask in what respect his struggles were greater " than those of any other mortal "? Is not an exclusive claim of this kind extravagant exaggeration ?

" The Church ", he observes, " is served by men redeemed, yet fallen, and thus, at varying degrees, by sinners, all of whom, however, are expected to imitate Christ and participate in His holiness ". " The greatest of the saints ", he adds, " do not escape the laws of human nature ". This is an unexceptionable statement of the truth, which, however, is qualified by what follows. " Grace ", he says, " produces them, and it is they who save the rest of humanity ". At once we are bound to ask another question : What does this mean in relation to the redemptive work of Christ? In what sense do the saints " save the rest of humanity "? What does this mean theologically ?

This book is a splendid contribution to our understanding of early monasticism in its various forms, both in the East and in the West. The author deftly hides, under the polished phrase, the magnitude of his labours. He is to be congratulated on an impressive achievement.

STUART BARTON BABBAGE.

#### THE ' ADAGES ' OF ERASMUS : A STUDY WITH TRANSLATIONS.

By Margaret Mann Phillips. (Cambridge University Press.)  
418 pp. 50s.

" My little trifles " was how Erasmus described his *Adages* in a letter to John Botzheim in 1523. But, as Mrs. Phillips reminds us in her admirable study, Erasmus's collecting of adages was far from a trifling occupation : it was a sort of literary hobby at which he worked steadily and seriously over the years. The first edition, with the title of *Collectanea* and published in Paris in 1500, contained 818 proverbs with brief comments. Eight years later the Aldine Press in Venice brought out the *Adagiorum Chiliades*, in which the number of proverbs had grown to 3,260 and the comments had increased considerably in size. In 1515 a new edition was published by Froben in Bâle. When Erasmus died, in 1536, the total number of sayings was 4,251. The *Adages* had become, as Mrs. Phillips says, one of the world's biggest bedside books. The felicities of the Erasmian style, with which of course the work is distinguished, have on the whole, been well reproduced in the translations which she includes in this volume.

The *Adages* bear eloquent testimony to the extensiveness of Erasmus's erudition and also to his desire to produce a synthesis of classical and Christian thought; nor are they deficient in purple patches of denunciation of the corruptions of his day. We could wish for no better guide to them and through them than Mrs. Phillips, to whom they are clearly familiar and congenial territory. "There is really considerable artistry in the seemingly artless arrangement," she writes; "like is grouped with like just sufficiently for one adage to throw light upon another, and before the dominant idea becomes wearisome it gives way to the next. The effect is like that of a skilfully managed conversation". And she rightly observes that everything that Erasmus stood for is represented in the *Adages*: "here is the fearless scholar, the familiar friend of Plutarch and Horace, the loving disciple of Jerome, the clear-eyed satirist of deceit and hypocrisy, the indignant protector of the weak". Her study of the character and growth of the *Adages* is full and authoritative. The fascination of the work is heightened by the fact that so many of these sayings from the ancient past are still part and parcel of our everyday speech; thus, to cite but a few of the thousands collected and expounded by Erasmus, we find proverbs like the following: "There's many a slip 'twixt the cup and the lip" (*Multa cadunt inter calicem supremaque labra*), "Let the cobbler stick to his last" (*Ne sutor ultra crepidem*), "God helps those who help themselves" (*Dii facientes adiuvant*), "To call a spade a spade" (*Ligonem ligonem vocat*), "To look a gift horse in the mouth" (*Equi dentes inspicere donati*), "One swallow doesn't make a summer" (*Una hirundo non facit ver*). Happily, Mrs. Phillips' book is not the only swallow in what promises to be a new summer of Erasmusian studies.

PHILIP E. HUGHES.

#### THE CHRISTIAN CENTURIES: VOLUME ONE, THE FIRST SIX HUNDRED YEARS.

By Jean Daniélou and Henri Marrou. Translated by Vincent Cronin. (Darton, Longman, & Todd.) 522 pp. 50s.

In the General Introduction to this series, which is intended to cover the history of the Christian Church over the centuries, Professor M. D. Knowles tells us that Belgian, English, Dutch, French, German, and Russian scholars are co-operating in its preparation. This first volume has been prepared jointly by two distinguished French scholars of the Roman Catholic Church. The conception of Christian history here set before us is praiseworthy, for the authors are concerned not merely to recount the conflicts of the Church, with its setbacks and advances, but also to describe its influence on art and literature and culture in general. There is indeed a great deal to admire in this volume. But taking it as a whole one can only confess to having found it a disappointing work.

For one thing, the history in its pages fails to come to life. It is, in the main, dispassionate and dull. Surely good history writing should stir the imagination, and especially the history of the Christian Church. But this book seems to be signally unsuccessful in this respect. For another thing, the authors are not always true to their stated purpose

of adopting a method of interpretation which does not go further than the evidence warrants. Thus the reading of a distinct monarchical order of episcopacy into the New Testament must be criticized as tendentious. The Apostle Paul is portrayed as guilty on occasion of unworthy compromise and insincerity. There is, to give another example, the quite extraordinary statement that with the Council of Nicea, which "recognized as fruitful the purely theological attempt at elucidating revelation", the Church "resolutely entered on the path which would eventually lead, in modern times, to such 'definitions' as the dogmas of the Immaculate Conception, Papal Infallibility, and the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary". There is no evidence to show that these dogmas have any relation either to revelation or to the thought of the Christianity of the early centuries. Again, it is an egregious case of special pleading, unsupported by proof and placing a burden of interpretation on a patristic text which it will not bear, to affirm that Barnabas "corresponded to the ἄνδρες ἐλλόγιμοι (*andres ellogimoi*) later referred to in the *Epistle of Clement* (XLIV, 1-3), who had sole authority to establish ministers, that is, to confer ordination". Whence comes the strange transliteration "higoumens" for ἡγουμένοι? Also, throughout, Achaia is spelt as "Achæa". The responsibility here is doubtless the translator's, as is also the giving of the terms Christian and Christianity sometimes with a capital, sometimes with a small, initial letter.

Having expressed a sense of disappointment, however, it is only fair to add that the volume is a mine of information, made all the more graphic by the inclusion of a considerable number of photographic plates which help to illustrate the theme of the book. These illustrations have been selected and annotated by Peter Ludlow. There is also a most useful chronology of principal events which sets out in separate columns the political and religious events, with a third column of dates in the centre.

PHILIP E. HUGHES.

#### THE CHRISTIAN PURSUIT.

By *Henri Marduel*. (*Burns & Oates*.) 229 pp. 18s.

#### OBSERVER IN ROME : A PROTESTANT REPORT ON THE VATICAN COUNCIL.

By *Robert McAfee Brown*. (*Methuen*.) 255 pp. 30s.

#### THE LETTER ON APOLOGETICS and HISTORY AND DOGMA.

By *Maurice Blondel*. *Texts presented and translated by Alexander Dru and Illyd Trethowan*. (*Harvill Press*.) 301 pp. 30s.

It never ceases to be a mystery to the reviewer : Who buys all the theological books which pour from the presses month by month? Occasionally something appears that is brilliant and basic. But the appeal of most books seems to be rather limited, whether in scope or treatment, or both. These three books (each in its different way connected with Roman Catholicism) belong to the latter category.

*The Christian Pursuit* is a translation of Henri Marduel's *Perspectives Spirituelles*. It is a collection of twenty-five addresses given at what

appears to have been the French Roman Catholic equivalent of an evangelical house party. Here is much good bread-and-butter Christianity. The author's aim is to give his readers solid, biblical, orthodox teaching which will feed both heart and mind. His book underlines the point that the believing Catholic and the believing Protestant really are *separated brethren*. Both words are operative. Here is much that will warm the heart of the evangelical—as well as correct and challenge him. But at certain crucial points he will find himself confronted by Roman Catholic dogma like a theological iron curtain.

Books on the Vatican Council are now almost so common that we could do with a *Which?* guide to tell us the best buy. Unfortunately, the reviewer is in no position to provide one. Moreover, as the Council plods on, all the books are dated as soon as they appear. *Observer in Rome* deals with the last session but one—and there is still one more session to come. Anyone who wants a complete account will have to wait another year or two. In the meantime, *Observer in Rome* is an account of the second session (29 September to 4 December 1963) with a difference. It is written by a Protestant.

Dr. Brown (who teaches at Stanford University, California) attended the Council as the North American representative of the World Alliance of Reformed and Presbyterian Churches. The bulk of his book takes the form of a lively day-to-day diary, written each night while the day's events were still fresh in his mind. It is prefaced by a brief survey of the first session and the steps that led up to it. It concludes with a "Preliminary Assessment" of the session's achievements and three appendices. The first contains a handy glossary of Latin terms which anyone needs to grasp if he is to make sense of the Council. The second gives the text of Bishop DeSmedt's speech on religious liberty. The third is an obituary for Gustave Weigel, S.J., who did much to pioneer Catholic ecumenism in the United States.

Dr. Brown writes as one deeply sympathetic to the Church of Rome, but not entirely uncritical. What is good for Rome is good in the long run for all Christendom. He admits that he came to Rome filled with a buoyant optimism; he left with a chastened optimism. The two epithets, *buoyant* and *chastened*, sum up the tone and outlook of the book. Dr. Brown sees signs of hope in the sincere interest of many bishops in the ecumenical dialogue and the permission of the vernacular in certain parts of Catholic worship. Significant too is the fact that the new *schema* on Mary is to be incorporated in that on the Church. At least it means that the Virgin is to be seen in the context of the Church, and not *vice versa*. Even more important for the ecumenical situation is the fact that the Council has committed itself to a doctrine of the *collegiality* of bishops, balancing the one-sided papal claims of the first Vatican Council. Finally, there is ground for real hope in the genuine concern of many Catholic bishops over the state of the world and their desire for an official statement of the Council supporting full religious liberty for all men, whether Catholics or not.

On the debit side, there is the Council's failure to give formal expression to this latter desire. There is the sinister fact that this and other measures were effectively thwarted by a reactionary minority group. The decree *On Instruments of Social Communication* (which

constitutes half the Council's public achievement to date) is banal and disappointing. Dr. Brown sees in it sections which imply justification of censorship, boycott, news management, and Catholic cultural ghettos. Finally, there is the fact that for many Catholic leaders ecumenical dialogue is just another way of saying the conversion of non-Catholics.

Doubtless other Protestants would want to add other items to the debit column. When all is said and done, the new Catholicism seems to be only a streamlined version of the old. If Rome and the Protestant churches are nearer today than they were three hundred years ago, it is not so much that Rome has changed, but because the Protestant churches seem to have forgotten what they were protesting about.

Maurice Blondel is a name which probably means little to most Protestant and Catholic readers in this country (apart from those who have read B. M. G. Reardon's lucid introduction in *Theology*, September 1958). But this omission is repaired by the editors of *The Letter on Apologetics* and *History and Dogma*, who see Blondel as a father-figure behind the reforming movement which has culminated in the Vatican Council.

Blondel was born in 1861. His active life was spent largely as a lay philosopher at the University of Aix. Blindness compelled his retirement in 1926. Thereafter until his death in 1949, his work depended on the service of readers and amanuenses.

To some extent Blondel's obscurity was self-imposed. He addressed himself chiefly to Catholic intellectuals who, he trusted, would disseminate his thought throughout church and society. His style consciously matched his expressed aim. Often it is involved, laboriously wrestling against ambiguity and misunderstanding. But equally often he refrains from spelling out for the non-philosopher the main steps of his argument.

In some ways Blondel was an existentialist before the existentialists. But at times his thought recalls William Temple's *Nature, Man, and God* in his concern for the real and the way he claims that philosophy and theology point to each other. Blondel was, in fact, rejecting both modernism and veterism (the traditional scholastic synthesis of faith and reason). He was seeking a new Catholic apologetic and philosophical theology, compatible with modern thought.

Blondel's main work was his Sorbonne thesis on *Action*, which first appeared in 1893. But for the present volume the editors have chosen two essays dating from 1896 and 1904 as being shorter, easier and, despite their age, much to the point today.

Those who are pleading for a new natural theology may well find grist for their mill here. But the book is of interest to others who (like the present reviewer) think that natural theology is a blind alley, and that the task of philosophical theology is to elucidate the methods and presuppositions of both Christian and non-Christian thought with a view to understanding and presenting the logic of the Christian faith. At the very least, both the text and the introduction (which forms nearly half the book) throw light on important areas of recent Catholic thought and history.

COLIN BROWN.

THE GENERAL ASSEMBLIES OF THE CHURCH OF SCOTLAND  
1560-1600 : THEIR ORIGINS AND DEVELOPMENT.

By Duncan Shaw. (Saint Andrew Press.) 261 pp. 42s.

"Take from us the freedom of Assemblies," cried John Knox, "and ye take from us the Evangel." Dr. Shaw's account of the institution so highly prized by the Kirk covers forty years from the Reformation, and is the first systematic study of its kind. Crammed with footnotes which testify to the author's diligence and erudition, this volume is arranged with admirable precision: the chapter headings have the rare merit of telling the reader what is discussed. There is an excellently-documented and most valuable section on the subject and interrelation of superintendents and bishops, and the problem of the "Twa Kingdoms" is closely examined with the growth of the General Assembly as a power separate from the state. The circumstances surrounding the sending of royal commissioners to the General Assembly (a practice still current) are fully treated. English parallels are cited where applicable (see, for example, the extensive footnotes on pages 89 and 92), and the Anglican editor who consistently refers to that non-existent pundit, the "Moderator of the Church of Scotland", might see the error of his ways if he studies chapter 15.

On page 187 the vague reference to "the Archbishop of St. Andrews" seems inadequate in view of the very critical footnote, and he should have been identified as George Gledstones who had been translated that same year (1606) from the see of Caithness. This superb book is marred here and there by a careless approach to minutiae, particularly in footnotes and in the 18-page bibliography. The date given as part of the title in C. S. Meyer's book (p. 243) should be 1559, not 1599; the second date in the Lockie title (p. 241) should be 1580, not 1560; and Laing's edition of the *Wodrow Miscellany* (footnote 5, p. 5) was published in 1848, not in 1884. On page 95 "Polland" should read "Pollard", and on page 244 "Ormond" is "Omond". Apart from a few more conventional misprints, the printer has four variations on "*Diurnal of Occurrents*", and on at least four other occasions the name or initials of authors are wrongly given.

J. D. DOUGLAS.

TEMPORAL PILLARS : QUEEN ANNE'S BOUNTY, THE ECCLE-  
SIASTICAL COMMISSIONERS, AND THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND.

By G. F. A. Best. (Cambridge University Press.) 569 pp. 65s.

In his preface, Dr. Best says that little has yet been written about the subject of this book. With this volume he more than makes good any such omission. If it is likely to be read more by students of history (for it is extremely detailed) it none the less stands as a model of reference books and as a valuable contribution to the story of the Church of England in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries in its relations with the state. The author has specifically set his account of Queen Anne's Bounty and the Ecclesiastical Commission in the context of church/state relations, for the vicissitudes of those bodies were too intimately interwoven with the then prevailing current affairs not to be

so portrayed. As a consequence the value of this book is considerably enhanced.

The book's appearance is particularly timely for these are not days when well-tried institutions necessarily continue to enjoy favour by reason of their proven worth. The Church of England is not showing as much inclination to retain systems, which however anachronistic they may appear and however chequered their past fortunes, are undertaking their work responsibly and beneficially. What in fact the Church owes to the Church Commission (the offspring of Q.A.B. and E.C.) is beyond telling and should remind us that certain of our Church of England institutions are unique.

The numerous appendices in the book and the twelve pages of bibliography serve to underline the immensity of the task accomplished by the author. Dr. Best has an interesting story to relate, and this he does clearly and admirably, so that the reader catches something authentic of the spirit of the times, both ecclesiastical and secular, and of the aims and endeavours of generations of trustees. The Church of England would be immeasurably the poorer, in more ways than one, without the work of the institutions embodied in this book.

MALCOLM MCQUEEN.

## THE CHRISTIAN IN INDUSTRIAL SOCIETY

*By H. F. R. Catherwood.* (Tyndale Press.) 126 pp. 12s. 6d.

Mr. Catherwood is an evangelical Christian. He is also a managing director. He has recently become Chief Industrial Adviser to the Ministry of Economic Affairs, of which the Deputy Prime Minister is the head. It is therefore refreshing to find that Mr. Catherwood asserts the Christian faith in its fulness in this book. He is not a trimmer and he is not a theologian of the new morality. His standpoint is biblical, and for that reason, and because of his practical experience, Mr. Catherwood is worth reading. He insists that the Church has a duty not only to preach the Gospel but also to preach the moral law. The moral law is not a face with a nose of wax. It is written on tablets of stone and is plain to all who read the Bible in the faith of its author Jesus Christ. The moral law is also unchangeable, although it needs constant re-interpretation in the light of changing conditions. This is what Mr. Catherwood sets out to do, and he may be said to have succeeded where others have failed. He is not afraid to point out that covetousness is idolatry. He is prepared to accept the principle of the tithe for the individual as it is expounded in the Bible at a time when the Church of England, in its official publications, is half-hearted. He is prepared to discuss the meaning of usury. It is to exploit a monopoly position to secure a financial reward unjustified by cost or risk. It may well be that this doctrine of usury could with profit be applied to the activity of industrial monopolies, including monopoly bargaining by Trade Unions. The Bible has a strange way of showing itself to be unexpectedly topical.

Mr. Catherwood is presumably a Socialist, but he is frank to point out the dangers of state ownership. He does not think it wise for too much power to be in the hands of the state. He believes rather in the



diffusion of economic power and sees advantages in maintaining a competitive economy. He points out that employees have a right to freedom from their employer's particular religious philosophy. This is well said. We tend to assume that because a thing is good, even essential, we have a right to stuff it down the throats of people who find themselves in our power. This God does not do. We must, like our Lord, respect other people's freedom. If management behaved in a Christian way, Mr. Catherwood thinks evangelists and chaplains in industry would be unnecessary. This view may be only part of the truth but it is a valuable corrective to over-enthusiasm in the complicated social context of industry. Mr. Catherwood is biblical in regard to Sunday, saying that "the method of observance may be open, but the obligation to observe it is absolute". He stresses the duty of hard work as the practical praise of a loving Father, without applying the doctrine to a member of a Trades' Union which puts power first. This leaves Mr. Catherwood in a weak position when he comes to discuss the right of professional associations to strike for higher pay. Surely no Christian can justify making the community suffer for the sake of righting a supposed wrong. Two wrongs don't make a right, and this is a lapse. But in spite of it Mr. Catherwood is everywhere sensitive to the problem of applying the law of God to our society and on the whole very successful in showing its relevance to our society.

GEORGE GOYDER.

#### ENCOUNTER WITH MODERN SOCIETY.

*By E. R. Wickham. (Lutterworth.) 125 pp. 6s. 6d.*

Bishop Wickham has throughout his ministry been involved with the problems of the Church in modern industrial society. Wartime chaplain at the Royal Ordnance Factory No. 5, he became in 1944 Diocesan Missioner to Industry in the diocese of Sheffield, where he established the Sheffield Industrial Mission. As Bishop of Middleton he has, it seems, been in considerable demand as a speaker on subjects related to the work to which he has given so much thought. Eight of his addresses given since 1959 are assembled in the present paper-back.

Such a volume must be expected to have certain weaknesses consequent upon the method of its compilation. There is no development of theme or progress of thought from chapter to chapter, and the book has no unity of structure. But, on the other hand, all its parts are concerned with one central problem—how the Church can best bring its message to this technological age.

But what is the Church's message? The Bishop rejects equally what he calls "the theocratic concept"—the view that God's will is obeyed "to the extent that the world is held within the confines and orbit of the Christian Church"—and what he calls "the sect concept"—the view that the world is lying in complete darkness. (One wonders what he makes of 1 John 5: 19.) He complains that each of these views fails to take seriously the life of the "secular" world. In his view the Church "exists to colour the world, to stain it, to subject it to appropriate critiques of the truth". (It would not be easy to reconcile John 17 with this.)

Side glances at the Scriptures from time to time do not remove the suspicion that Bonhoeffer rather than Bible is the ground of such theology, and it is hardly surprising to find the Bishop discounting "the evangelism . . . often conceived in narrow terms of church membership or personal 'conversion' that in fact can ignore the world except as a pool for fishing converts". This despite the fact that the phrase "fishers of men" has the highest authority!

Similarly, the worship of the Church is subject to discount. The Bishop appears to accept without question the claims of F. Houtart that the more urbanized society has become the less it attends church. Even if such claims could be proved beyond question, to argue that, therefore, urbanization is the cause of decreased church attendance is to fall into the fallacy of *post hoc, ergo propter hoc*. Not that decreased church-going worries the Bishop. Public worship (placed in inverted commas) apparently is no asset to the mission of the Church, for "inevitably the Church becomes a collection of individuals contracting out of their culture-pattern to conform week by week with the minimal influence rendered consequently upon the secular society".

On the credit side, there are points of real value in the book—the author's emphasis that the Gospel is for the whole man; his demonstration that, so far from the Church having lost "the working class", in fact it never had "the working class"; his true appraisal of the very limited success of ordinary evangelism; his stress on the active part to be played by the laity in the mission of the Church; his kindly, but trenchant, criticism of the worker-priest movement; and his constant reiteration of the truth that the Christian faith must be worked out in daily life, and that Christians must be shown how to do that.

It may be the Church's responsibility to "elucidate what goodness means" in our modern society. But is this, as the Bishop seems to argue, the only, or even the most important task of the Church? And if the aim is in dispute, are the methods proposed reliable? The recent admissions from the Rector of Woolwich are not reassuring.

H. J. BURGESS.

## RELIGION AND MODERN SOCIETY.

*By J. Chiari. (Herbert Jenkins.) 215 pp. 25s.*

Canon Raven set his seal on some improbable books. This must be one of the strangest. He admits in his foreword that he is "often out of his depth on the author's account of philosophies past and present". But how he could claim that he was "haunted by the brilliancy of the phrasing" passes understanding. For M. Chiari's book—which was apparently written in English and cannot therefore be excused as suffering from an unhappy translation—is almost unreadable: Kant seems lucid and poetic by comparison. And to add to the paradox of Raven's praise is the fact that M. Chiari is said to be a French poet and man of letters who is also a public servant and man of affairs. It is all very odd.

The theme of the book was more familiar thirty years ago. To reduce it to its simplest terms: man by nature loves God, all religions have a good deal in common, therefore why should we not all work

together to bring about the good society here on earth? From these premises it is not surprising to find it stated that the Christian Heaven, like the Buddhist Nirvana, implies the abolition of the self and its merging into the whole : self-extinction, according to M. Chiari, is for all the major religions a source of unity and bliss. Again, the doctrine of original sin is not unexpectedly regarded as a Pauline aberration which is quite inconsistent with the conception of a loving God. The opacity of the style makes it extremely difficult to follow the arguments, and perhaps these bald statements do not do justice to them. But they are indicative of the drift of the book. And the book drifts on and on until it is finally becalmed in sentences like this : " The world is unfailingly moving towards a form of socialization which is the outcome of the conjunction of faith and reason working towards the dominion of spirit on earth ".

Enough will have been said to convince most readers of this journal that even if the book were more readable there would be little profit in reading it.

DEREK TAYLOR THOMPSON.

#### RELIGION AT OXFORD AND CAMBRIDGE.

By V. H. H. Green. (S.C.M.) 392 pp. 42s.

Dr. V. H. H. Green, in this fascinating history of *Religion at Oxford and Cambridge*, traces the stages by which the ancient universities, both religious foundations, have become progressively secularized. " The design here," Dr. Green explains, " is to see what happened at Oxford and Cambridge, to analyse the strength and weakness of their religious history, to evaluate the movements which originated there, to study the human setting in all its richness and poverty, to explain and elucidate the function which the Christian religion, for good or ill, has played in the history and development of England's two ancient universities ". Dr. Green ably fulfils his ambitious purpose. What he gives us, in effect, is a history of English Christianity as played on the stage of Oxford and Cambridge. " At all times," he notes, " they occupied a central position in English religious life ".

Dr. Green achieves a remarkable measure of objectivity. Concerning the evangelicals generally he observes : " The more obvious defects of the Evangelicals, then and later, were their instinctive conservatism, which made them fight shy of radicalism in politics or religion, and, although they numbered some able minds, their intellectual poverty ". It is difficult to deny the justice of this conclusion.

His strictures on nineteenth century evangelicals are, perhaps, a little severe. He speaks of their " distinctively antiseptic view of pleasure ", their censorious condemnation of those with whom they disagreed, their neglect of the social dimensions of the Gospel. " Even their jocularity could possess a rebartative brightness, and their charm appear synthetic." Nevertheless, he freely recognizes the contribution which evangelicals made to the missionary cause and the notable part which Shaftesbury played in the passage of the Factory Acts.

Concerning the situation today, Dr. Green finds little ground for optimism. There is, he notes, an almost complete divorce between the university and religion. Scientific humanism is the dominant influence

within the university, although a few residual religious activities are still to be found. If a professional don seeks to integrate his field of study into a religious apologetic he is regarded with suspicion. "C. S. Lewis," he comments, "for long a fellow of Magdalen, Oxford, and latterly the Professor of Mediæval and Renaissance English Literature at Cambridge, though very highly regarded as an English scholar, lost some respect in his own university for his work in Christian apologetic."

Dr. Green is sceptical about the efficacy of traditional methods to effect a rehabilitation of the Christian faith. He has little faith, however, in the radical methods of the so-called "Cambridge school". He gloomily concedes that the signs of interest, such as they are, are "unlikely to stem the steady process of dechristianization". It is not for the historian, he adds, to act as the prophet or the moralist. Nevertheless, he believes that there is ground for sober hope. "The story of religious movements within the universities has revealed a process of conscious adaptation and re-interpretation, a theological mobility which has fashioned anew the never-changing core of the Christian message." He insists that the Christian churches, within a university that is in shape and form fundamentally secular, could still be "an influential and significant leaven".

This illuminating study will have served its purpose if it punctures the bubble of our self-complacency and promotes the task of salutary reflection.

STUART BARTON BABBAGE.

## THE WORLD OF JOSEPHUS.

*By G. A. Williamson. (Secker & Warburg.) 318 pp. 36s.*

Mr. Williamson, a classical scholar with an evident enthusiasm for the ancient world, has done well to present the general reader with a very readable and often lively account of the extraordinary character of Josephus and the dramatic story of the Jewish War. At one time Whiston's translation was a popular book: a kind of supplement to the Scriptures and therefore suitable for Sunday reading. Whiston's style is no longer tolerable, the sabbatarianism which supplied a motive for reading him has vanished, and Josephus has become an author for specialists. The present book should at least stimulate curiosity about his own life and about the tragedy of the fall of Jerusalem. Mr. Williamson is fortunate, too, in the coincidence of the publication of his book with the current excavation of Masada and the wide publicity that this has received. He is perhaps less lucky in the pricing of his book, which is distinctly high for what is essentially a straight narrative for the general reader and not an advanced study for scholars.

Mr. Williamson begins with a general account of the Roman Empire in the first century, Palestine and its people, and the Herod dynasty and its achievements; to all this there is appended a short description of the religious condition of the country and of the mission of Jesus and the rise of Christianity. The second part of the book is concerned with Josephus himself, and the story of the Jewish revolt and the triumph of Titus. The author gives a very fair, if excusably ironical, account of Josephus. The question is left for the reader's decision whether he was simply an unusually unpleasant collaborator with his people's enemies,

or whether he was a moderate and high-principled advocate of that policy of peace and submission which alone held out any hope of national survival. No doubt, however, is left about his colossal self-satisfaction, and it is on this note that the book ends, with Josephus busy, under the good fortune of imperial patronage, industriously justifying himself through his books in all directions: a man who, "not lovable, not estimable, barely tolerable, remains an enigma, but a fascinating one".

It would be unfair to criticize a book which succeeds admirably in its aim of telling a good story well because it does not at the same time discuss details of specialist scholarship. It is, however, a pity that difficult questions of particular interest to students of the New Testament are passed over. Thus the writer assumes that the census of Quirinius referred to by Luke was the second which that governor had conducted. This would avoid the chronological problem but there is no evidence for such a solution. To postulate another Theudas besides the one mentioned by Josephus, in order to resolve the difficulty of Gamaliel's speech, is also too easy. Mr. Williamson does not pause to ask whether the Christian picture of the Baptist as a conscious forerunner of Jesus is likely to represent John's own understanding of his mission; nor does he take account of the doubt which van Unnik has cast on the traditional idea of St. Paul as "brought up outside Palestine . . . and trained at a university". In his description of the Jewish situation he does not allow enough weight to the Maccabean tradition of martyrdom, despite the dramatic example of its influence at Masada which he relates. The matter of Josephus's sources is briefly discussed but there is no mention of the possibility that Nicolas of Damascus may have been responsible for the passage concerning Theudas and the confusion about it in Acts. More might profitably have been said about the problem of the Slavonic Josephus.

In general, however, this is a useful book, enhanced by a satisfactory map and a very necessary genealogical tree of the Herods.

G. W. H. LAMPE.

## PALESTINIAN JUDAISM IN NEW TESTAMENT TIMES.

By *Werner Förster*. (Oliver & Boyd.) xiv+247 pp. 30s.

A revival of interest in the Old Testament generally and a quickening of curiosity of what lies behind the New Testament, caused by the Qumran and allied discoveries, have led to a steady increase in demands for information on the inter-testamental period and New Testament background. The present volume, though it does not cover the whole field, will go far towards meeting the need. The author is Professor of New Testament at the University of Munster in Germany, and it is a translation of the first part of his *History of New Testament Times*. The chief gap is, as the title indicates, in the treatment of the Hellenistic Jew, though he does not remain without mention.

The author sees clearly that to understand the New Testament background in Palestine we must first study the inter-testamental period from the return from the Babylonian exiles onwards; it is this part of his work that will raise most questions among his readers.

Only some of these can be indicated. Some are Old Testament problems such as the date of the Priestly Code, of the Wisdom literature, and of the Psalms. Clearly one's interpretation of early Judaism must be strongly influenced by one's answers to these questions. Then he has the most interesting suggestion that already by the time of the return from exile the pious had, for the most part, given up hope of national independence until the day of God's final intervention and salvation. It is questionable, however, whether his evidence is sufficient to prove his case.

His treatment of Qumran is stimulating, but very many will question his identification of the apocalyptic writings found in the caves with the Dead Sea sect. That it was sympathetic to these pseudonymous writings need hardly be questioned, but that does not make them their sole authors. The view is objectionable both in the date forced on these writings and in the picture given of an inner decline in the sect.

The treatment of the actual New Testament background is normally first class, and there is often a refreshing willingness to tread fresh paths. It is, however, a pity that Dr. Förster is unduly ready to find anachronisms in the New Testament and even worse errors. The footnote on p. 94 is inadequate to support the affirmation that Herodias' first husband was not Herod Philip.

Paul Winter's book *On the Trial of Jesus* was published after the German edition of this book. But since the former finds mention in a footnote here, some additional note should have been added to deal with his argument that the Jews had the full right to inflict the death sentence.

Apart from one or two ambiguities, the translation has been well done, though footnote 3, p. 147, is incomprehensible. "Indict" (p. 89) is wrong, as may be seen from Josephus; the references should read XIV. 15, 5 and 9, 2-5. It is, however, a very great pity that there could not have been added, where possible, a reference to standard rabbinic anthologies in English alongside those to Strack-Billerbeck, which is available only in German. It looks as though the remainder of the prophetic books had dropped out after Isaiah (p. 150). The use of "God" for YHWH on p. 183 is probably due to a slip.

H. L. ELLISON.

## THE NEW TESTAMENT AND THE JEWISH LECTIONARIES.

*By Leon Morris. (Tyndale Press.) 78 pp. 6s.*

The detection of Jewish lectionary backgrounds to the documents of the New Testament is not a scholarly exercise of merely recent origin; academic sleuths have, in fact, been marshalling the liturgical evidence and spotting lectionary clues for several years. Their leading suggestion is that a pattern of synagogue lessons lies behind parts of the New Testament, notably the Gospels, and forms an illuminating substructure to which conscious appeal can be made from the writer to the reader. P. P. Levertoff has applied this theory to Matthew, P. Carrington to Mark, and A. Guilding to John.

It is the last work (A. Guilding, *The Fourth Gospel and Jewish*

*Worship*, Oxford 1960) that is subjected to particular scrutiny by Dr. Leon Morris in his latest monograph. But he is not only concerned with the Fourth Gospel, or with Professor Guilding's treatment of it in "lectionary" terms. Rather, he is concerned to challenge the basic assumption that is made by the lectionary experts when examining *any* New Testament document in this way; namely the hypothesis, according to the truth of which the theory stands or falls, that a single Jewish lectionary existed in the first Christian century early enough to be used in this way, and that dependence upon it by the New Testament writers can be sufficiently demonstrated. In the words of Dr. Morris himself, this book is "an attempt to distinguish between what we know and what we surmise".

It is a careful and scholarly examination, modest in approach and essentially readable in character, which arrives convincingly at the conclusion (devastating for the theory in question) that the evidence for the existence of the lectionary which is posited, let alone its use, is entirely insufficient to warrant its supposed appearance behind the New Testament writings. Dr. Morris respects the scholarship of those whose work he examines, but clearly reveals the extent to which they argue from unsupported evidence, and constantly resort to desperate devices (such as Professor Guilding's "double" cycle of readings, since one will not work) in order to fit the material to the presuppositions. Almost at every point we are met by uncertainty. We cannot even be sure that the synagogue existed sufficiently early for this hypothesis to stand; we certainly have no evidence that one triennial lectionary, following the same calendar, was in use by the required date, so that appeal to it could be made without fear of confusion; it is not established that the Septuagint was used in the way that the lectionary theory demands; and in any case there were significant differences between the Jewish synagogue and the Christian Church.

The second half of this monograph is taken up with a consideration of the work on the Fourth Gospel already mentioned; and here Dr. Morris draws out the deficiencies in much of Professor Guilding's methodology. We are cogently reminded that there are other ways of using the Old Testament than the one in question, and that John is less concerned with the liturgy of "festivals" in general than with the meaning of Passover in particular. Dr. Morris might have made the further point that this theory seems to demand a primarily *Jewish* audience for the Fourth Gospel, which is possible but by no means certain.

This book is a timely and immensely important warning to those who seek to understand the New Testament; for so far as the lectionary theory is concerned we must think again, and think hard.

STEPHEN SMALLEY.

#### ESSAYS ON NEW TESTAMENT THEMES.

By Ernst Käsemann. (S.C.M.) 200 pp. 18s.

Ernst Käsemann is one of the leading New Testament professors in Germany today; he is also one of the most attractive and scintillating lecturers of any theological faculty. At Tübingen he draws some 500 students to his lectures. It is all the more surprising, therefore, that

his work has not been translated into English before this, and the S.C.M. Press are to be congratulated on their enterprise.

What is Käsemann's theological position? An erstwhile pupil of Bultmann, he is a very proper occupant of the chair at Tübingen, for he is a radical to his fingertips. So radical is he, that he could not remain satisfied with the mixture of form-criticism, demythologizing, and existentialism that is Bultmann—and he rocked the theological world in 1953 by producing at a reunion of Bultmann's old Marburg students (of all places!) his famous lecture on "The problem of the historical Jesus". This lecture (the first essay in the present volume) is extremely critical of his old master, whose christology he is inclined to dub docetic and whose scepticism he deems to a considerable degree unwarranted.

Käsemann is faintly reminiscent of a Labrador—combining weight, versatility, vivacity, and an extraordinarily sharp nose! He is expert at sniffing out Enthusiasm and Catholicism in the most unlikely places in the New Testament. And, being an avowed enemy of both, he pounces upon them when he finds them, with no small relish. Paul he regards as having spent his life fighting a losing battle against Enthusiasm, while Luke appears to him, not as a historian, but as an imaginative and creative theologian dedicated to the establishment and justification of Catholic order.

It is a fascinating volume of essays. His aim is avowedly to question every accepted answer given to New Testament problems, and he achieves it. Provocation leaps out at the reader from every other line. On ministry, he takes somewhat the same line as Brunner and E. Schweizer; on the objectivity of the Gospel he refuses the path, both of orthodoxy and of the Enlightenment and stresses instead the need of response to the kerygma. He will not allow the Word of God to be imprisoned either in the canon of Scripture or in the pronouncements of the Church. The essence of his understanding of Paul's eucharistic doctrine is that Christ's doctrine of the Lord's supper is part of his christology, and springs from an adapted Gnostic myth of the archetypal Man. "By claiming our bodies sacramentally for service in His body, Christ emerges as the Cosmocrator, who in our bodies takes possession of the present world as its Lord, and in His own body inaugurates the new world" (p. 135). He is one of the few modern writers to pay serious attention to 2 Peter. I disagree with almost every word he says on this subject, but am delighted at the way he says it.

Like Hume, the author does not take himself too seriously. Brilliance, pungency, credulity, tendentiousness, a fantastic misuse of evidence, and an authentic Christian devotion lie cheek by jowl in these pages. Käsemann expects to "afford particularly strong and extensive provocation to the English reader". I hope you will put yourself in the way of being provoked.

E. M. B. GREEN.

#### THE ART AND TRUTH OF THE PARABLES: A STUDY IN THEIR LITERARY FORM AND MODERN INTERPRETATION.

By Geraint Vaughan Jones. (S.P.C.K.) 248 pp. 35s.

This is an exceptionally interesting book, demanding close attention as it is read, and careful reflection afterwards. One would like to know



a good deal more about the author, but as the reviewer knows only what emerges from the page of the book, this at least can be summarized. He is a man entirely at home in the world of modern European literature and philosophy, with a special interest in "existentialism", not so much as an abstract school of philosophy, but as "a way of life", a way of looking at things. He is an accomplished literary critic. Something has made him address his attention to the gospel parables, and he has brought to his study of them his own particular expertise. Then he has become aware of all that modern biblical criticism has had to say about them. He has "mastered" all this, far better than many parsons or theological scholars have done. All the same, that kind of study remains "external" to his mind—to use his own jargon, to him it is not existential. The net result, however, of his literary insights and his acquired biblical study, is of great interest, and the reviewer feels enriched by what has been put together in this unusual book.

The book is in two halves. The first contains a full and clear description of all the important modern studies of the parables—including those by Jülicher, Jeremias, and Dodd. The author has obviously "learned a lot" from these writers about what the parables originally meant, how they are related to one another, how their use in the Church has modified their form, and how, down the centuries they have been made the vehicle of successive doctrinal formulations of the Church's teaching. When, however, these writers receive their final evaluation from Mr. Vaughan Jones, they turn out to be, for the most part, "unprofitable servants".

Why is this? It is because of something which this reviewer himself feels (and as I have said elsewhere; see *Studia Evangelica*, Vol. III: New Testament Studies in the service of the Pastoral Ministry). The more closely the parables are related to the eschatological crisis of the first century, the harder it is to relate their message to those who live in other ages and in other places. Mr. Vaughan Jones, feeling this very strongly, embarks on a study of the parables as works of art, miniature stories or dramas, which by their economy of words, and insight into the human predicament, have a timeless quality, and the power to "speak to the condition" of all men everywhere.

The last part of the book consists of a detailed study of the parable of the prodigal son from this point of view, and some comments on how preachers should handle the parables in general. Space forbids detailed comments on his thesis. May I say that I am very much looking forward to my next opportunity of preaching on Luke 15, and let readers draw their own conclusions!

RONALD LEICESTER.

## GOD'S RULE AND KINGDOM.

By *Rudolf Schnackenburg*. (Herder—Nelson.) 365 pp. 42s.

It is good to have a large scale work on one of the central themes of the New Testament from a front rank Roman Catholic scholar. Rudolf Schnackenburg, who is Professor of New Testament Literature and Exegesis at the University of Würzburg, has provided us with a volume which is important in its own right but specially interesting

as showing the way in which the Continental Roman Catholic biblical scholars are working in this generation.

The book begins with a full survey of the idea of the reign of God in the Old Testament. The author shows considerable sympathy for the Kingship, Myth, and Ritual School. He goes on to trace how the ideas developed in later Judaism in the rabbis and in the apocalyptic writings. The main part of the book deals with the nature and coming of the Kingdom of God as it is found in the New Testament. The author weighs the various schools of interpretation and comes down in favour of an inaugurated eschatology. "Even if the kingdom of God is now present only in an initial and scarcely discernible form, it will one day arrive in all its glory despite every obstacle; consider the parables of growth. The *basileia* that Jesus heralds has both a 'present' and a 'future' significance, and this should be indicated by the distinction between 'reign' and 'kingdom'. The preaching of Jesus cannot be separated from His person. He is conscious of Himself as possessing from God the full authority of Revealer and Saviour, as well as the status of 'Son of man', with whose advent in glory the perfect kingdom will be inaugurated." Dr. Schnackenburg then goes on to discuss the relationship between the Kingdom and the Church. We should not identify the two. The Church "is His foundation for the interval between the dawn of God's rule and the advent of the perfect kingdom. In it the powers of God's kingdom are already operative. . . . But the earthly community includes many who are unworthy and who will be cast out at the final judgment: it cannot yet be identified with the community of the redeemed in the future kingdom".

While there are a number of interpretations where the author may be criticized, the book as a whole is one which will in very few ways grate upon the Protestant reader, as so many Roman Catholic works are inclined to do. He knows and uses fairly his theologians of all persuasions, Continental and English-speaking. But why must we have *metanoia* sometimes rendered as "conversion" and sometimes as "penance"? And the use of "Osee", "Paralipomenon", etc., makes us long for the day when the Roman Church starts using the RSV!

R. E. NIXON.

## ORIGINS OF THE SYNOPTIC GOSPELS.

By N. B. Stonehouse. (Tyndale Press.) 198 pp. 12s. 6d.

Any work by the late Professor Stonehouse commands respect. He represented what was best in the American tradition of conservative scholarship. He is always thorough and painstaking, if at times a little dull. He always seeks to be fair to and to understand those with whom he disagrees, but he is ready to show quite clearly how utterly wrong he often considers their presuppositions to be. The book under review represents an expansion of the 1962 Payton Lectures delivered at Fuller Theological Seminary not long before his death.

The author tells us in the Preface that he was reluctant to lecture on the subject of Synoptic origins for a number of reasons. Amongst them was the feeling that "the Synoptic Problem cannot, as many

discussions seem to suggest, be treated as an isolated and rather narrow question, but rather that it involves one necessarily in a wide range of New Testament studies including general and special introduction and historical and theological interpretation. Ultimately one is confronted here with nothing less than decisions regarding the relationship between the Gospels and Jesus Christ". Accordingly his approach had to be highly selective and he chose four subjects, to which he devotes two or three chapters each in this book, namely, authorship, order and interdependence, apostolic tradition, and ultimate origin.

It must be said with regret that the result is a rather unsatisfactory hotch-potch. He works thoroughly through the relationship of Matthew and Mark, concluding that Mark came first and that the statement of Papias about Matthew was meant to refer to the First Gospel and was mistaken. He provides sensible criticism of some of the work of Dodd and Riesenfeld, but in another chapter jumps rather awkwardly from a consideration of Schweitzer to one of Bultmann. But for the scholar who is prepared to search for it there is a great deal of wisdom and sense on many of the major issues of New Testament criticism.

R. E. NIXON.

#### THE STRUCTURE OF LUKE AND ACTS.

*By A. Q. Morton and G. H. C. Macgregor. (Hodder & Stoughton.)*  
155 pp. 21s.

#### CHRISTIANITY AND THE COMPUTER.

*By A. Q. Morton and James McLennan. (Hodder & Stoughton.)*  
95 pp. 5s.

The common denominator linking these two books is the fact that the Rev. A. Q. Morton is a joint author in each of them, and I think it is safe to say that he is the moving spirit behind them both. Mr. Morton is a minister of the Church of Scotland. He seems to have formed a poor view of organized Christianity and also of most professors and teachers of the New Testament. He has allowed this sense of isolation to mar much of his written work. Often one is more conscious of his bad temper than of his good scholarship. This is a pity because he has some interesting things to say.

*Christianity and the Computer* is valuable because it contains detailed tables which give the findings of a computer in connection with the language of the Epistles commonly attributed to St. Paul. In particular he attests the frequency of the word *kai*. It comes out very plainly that the relative frequency of *kai* in Romans, Galatians, and 1 and 2 Corinthians is more or less stable, whereas once you go outside these four books a very different count (number of *kai*'s per page) reveals itself. Students of New Testament criticism will at once remember that F. C. Baur, more than a hundred years ago, came to the conclusion that these four Epistles were genuinely Pauline and that the rest were not. It is at least of interest that the computer should have come up with the same decision. All the same it must be remembered that Paul's style could have changed or that he might have made more use of secretaries in compiling the later books. What Mr. Morton

has found out will, however, have to be taken into account in future critical studies of the writings of St. Paul.

Most unfortunately, instead of calling his book *The Computer and St. Paul* he called it *Christianity and the Computer*, and attaches to his literary finds a violent diatribe against organized Christianity, in most of its known forms. I do not hesitate to state that nine-tenths of the value of this book is to be found in the tables of information appended to it. The writer's facts are interesting. His views for the most part are unimportant.

*The Structure of Luke and Acts* is given an air of respectability by some modest and dignified contributions by the late Professor Macgregor, much respected in theological circles. He acts in this book, however, I think, as a foil for Mr. Morton, who tries out on him some very wild theories about Acts. Having accepted Streeter's theory on proto-Luke, Mr. Morton assumes that, without any known reason, Acts also was written in two stages. He then struggles with the aid of his computer to work out how Stage 2 could have been fitted on to Stage 1 without taking up too much space in a limited manuscript. It seems strange to this reviewer that, if the writer of Acts was in any way short of space, he should have reported the conversion of St. Paul at least three times, and also told the story of the conversion of Cornelius twice over.

It must further be said that for your 21s. you get only 53 pages of Morton and Macgregor. 100 are a reprint of Luke and Acts, ingeniously paraphrased to fit in with Mr. Morton's theory.

RONALD LEICESTER.

BY WHAT AUTHORITY? STUDIES IN THE RELATIONS OF SCRIPTURE, CHURCH, AND MINISTRY.

By G. D. Yarnold. (Mowbray.) 160 pp. 21s.

What happens when a careful examination of the concept of authority in the gospels is applied to current questions about the Church and the ministry? This is the question which Dr. Yarnold asks, and his own answer to it is thoughtful, in many ways fresh, and at times provocative. The first five of seven chapters lay the theological foundation of the study, while in the remaining fifty pages the author applies his theological conclusions to contemporary questions about reunion, and in particular about the unification of ministries.

The beginning of Dr. Yarnold's cumulative argument is that "whereas the authority of God as known is absolute, yet our knowledge of the authority of God is not absolute" (p. 9). Everything belonging to human life possesses some degree of relativity, whether we are thinking of the Church's use of the Scriptures (chapter II), or the status of theology (chapter III), or the strength of ecclesiastical tradition (chapter IV). A major thesis of this book is that authority in the Church, or indeed the very existence of the Church, can be recognized not by what the Church *possesses*, but by what it *does*. This is confirmed by the author by his conviction that in the New Testament "true authority declares itself by ministry. Self-giving ministry is the hall-mark of authority" (p. 99). (Dr. Yarnold is so concerned

to press this point that he feels obliged to question whether the apostolic refusal "to serve tables" in Acts 6: 1-6 was not in fact an apostolic *faux-pas* of the first order, the beginning of the slippery path which leads to the evils of prelacy.) Applying this principle to the present discussion, he argues that "ministerial authority is to be recognized in the last analysis not by pedigree but by activity" (p. 143). To regard episcopal ordination as a mark of superiority, he concludes, is "a theological falsehood, a psychological blunder, and a grotesque failure in humility" (p. 145).

On the other hand the author puts forward a powerful case for the episcopate. Here he not only stresses the familiar points about continuity, unity, and pastoral oversight over the presbytery, but also expresses without critical discussion the equally familiar but more controversial view that "the meaning of the bishopric is expressed most clearly in the liturgical setting, where the Church meets around the one table to break the one bread" (p. 117).

The contrast between the two previous paragraphs highlights a general characteristic of the book. The *via media* seems to represent Dr. Yarnold's favourite position. Behind his book lies the belief that "The particular vocation of the Anglican Communion in ecumenical discussion is to act as a bridge between Catholic and Protestant" (p. 149). Critics might suggest that the author always prefers grey to either black or white, as when he insists, for example, that we must neither over-rate nor under-rate the Scriptures, and that we must pay neither too much attention nor too little attention to tradition. On the other hand those who are convinced will describe this as sheer realism, and they will have on their side the fact that Dr. Yarnold is no mere pragmatist. His conclusions are closely and carefully argued from theological premises, while at the same time constituting a valuable practical contribution to the contemporary discussion.

ANTHONY C. THISELTON.

## THE ARTICLES OF THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND.

*Edited by H. E. W. Turner (Mowbray.) 113 pp. 8s. 6d.*

The theme of the conference of the Evangelical Fellowship for Theological Literature at Oxford in 1963 was the Anglican Articles, and the lectures then delivered by J. C. de Satgé, J. I. Packer, H. G. G. Herklots, and G. W. H. Lampe have now been published as a Star Book paperback. The subjects of the lectures are the composition, status, history, and revision of the Thirty-Nine Articles, and Dr. Turner tries in some sense to tie the contributions together in an introductory essay.

The first essay, by Mr. de Satgé, is disappointing, for, even though the author is limited in space, he provides very scrappy and not always accurate information on the historical background. Thus he ignores the important ubiquitarian controversy, obscures the role of Jewel, fails to give due weight to the kinship with the Reformed churches (especially in eucharistic teaching), imports irrelevant disputes (limited atonement, doctrinaire views of church order), and betrays an inadequate grasp of Reformation confessions in his attempt to show the

uniqueness of the Anglican structure. These are serious defects in so short a compass.

In the closing essay, Dr. Lampe, who is prepared to ascribe only historical significance to the articles, plainly rejects their basic theological conception, and is thus unable to enter into any fruitful discussion with them. Hence he naturally suggests, not their revision, but their complete abolition as a confession, and their replacement by the Creeds, the Prayer Book, a doctrinal commission, and ultimately a new and broader confession. The result could only be the further disintegration of true theology in the Anglican world.

By contrast, Canon Herklots gives a fine account of the real significance of the articles in times and areas where they have been accepted with proper loyalty, and he leaves us in little doubt that the intrusion of false trends has in fact produced the present indiscipline and confusion. Dr. Packer, with the sound scholarship and acute dogmatic discernment we have come to associate with him, discusses the past and present status of the articles, and he brings us to the convincing conclusion that they still have, and ought to have, a true function and authority in the church. The fact that this conclusion differs so radically from that of Dr. Lampe is an illustration of the deep rift which unfortunately exists in modern Anglican Evangelicalism, and it holds out little hope that there will be any concerted Evangelical action on the pastoral, liturgical and doctrinal issues facing the Church of England in our day.

G. W. BROMILEY.

### THE ANGLICAN SYNTHESIS.

*Edited by W. R. F. Browning. (Peter Smith.) 159 pp. 21s.*

The intention of this book—greater understanding between evangelicals and “catholics”—is good, though its execution is disappointing. The editor’s introduction is more in line with current fashions rather than helpful, and his practical suggestions are unrealistic since they obliterate distinctions between truth and error. Professor R. P. C. Hanson’s essay on the authority of the Bible represents the usual modern liberal line, ending with a ferocious footnote (also in keeping with a good deal of liberal intolerance of non-liberals) part of which reads: “I emphatically deny that Mr. Beckwith’s account of inspiration is either really biblical or anything but utterly incredible”. As Mr. Beckwith at least tries to argue his case biblically, which is more than Dr. Hanson does, one does not know if this note reflects his considered judgment or professorial arrogance and irritation. Certainly such an attitude is unlikely to help mutual understanding.

Benedict Green contributes an irenic essay on eucharistic sacrifice from the Anglo-Catholic side, but it does not show any real grasp of Protestant objections as opposed to those of pseudo-Protestants like Max Thurian. John Stott gives an essay on baptism which combines biblical and Anglican historical evidence. Amand de Mendieta writes the final essay on the theme of symbiosis to synthesis. He is an ex-Roman Catholic monk, and, as his autobiography showed, he has unfortunately not yet discovered that the Church of England is Protestant rather than a Gallican version of Rome. He was thus a

singularly unhappy choice for the essay. He makes the astonishing statement that the Reformation contains no essentially anti-Catholic element. This is untrue and bad history. His solution is to plead for the Church of England as the dialectical centre of western Christendom holding forth an ideal of comprehensiveness (of a Roman *not* a Reformed kind); but he gives his game away in his final section by suggesting that the bigoted extremists (O blessed way of dismissing all awkward customers with consciences and doctrinal beliefs!) be treated without tolerance. Has de Mendieta really joined the Church of England or merely, as his autobiographical writings suggest, found it a haven for his vigorous rejection of Roman (and all other) authoritarianisms? This and Dr. Hanson's essay tell us why the book fails. The liberal nigger must be extricated from this particular woodpile before progress can be made. Liberalism and revealed Christianity are fundamentally incompatible. What is required in the evangelical-*"catholic"* debate is an honest focusing of *real* agreements and *real* differences on all the key issues. I am thankful to say that already groups on each side are at work on just such a project. Alas, ecumenical diplomats are—unwittingly—the major stumbling-blocks, for they always want to stress agreements (not always real ones) and minimize the opposite. Their intentions are good but the results are disastrous and theologically debilitating for the Church.

G. E. DUFFIELD.

#### PARTNERSHIP IN MINISTRY.

*Edited by Trevor Beeson. (Mowbray.) 148 pp. 9s. 6d.*

#### PREPARING FOR THE MINISTRY OF THE 1970s.

*By H. G. G. Herklots, James Whyte and Robin Sharp. (S.C.M.) 140 pp. 7s. 6d.*

The first book consists of nine chapters by different authors in which each describes some new experimental form of ministry involving partnership either between clergy and laity or between clergy and clergy. The symposium is written by "progressives" who have the enthusiasm of reformers, but they give us interesting surveys of experiments as yet in their early stages. These vary from town and country group ministries to the Lee Abbey story, and suggestions vary from some passionate advocacy for Mr. Paul to David Paton's conviction that the rural deanery is the unit of the future.

The second symposium, which is edited by David Edwards, provides three essays on ministerial training from Church of England, Church of Scotland, and Free Church traditions. Canon Herklots writes with charm and his usual eye for the right quotation (especially from that admirable old warrior, Dean C. J. Vaughan), though as one who was put off from the ministry, I cannot say I found his analysis of why many do not go forward to ordination very convincing. His first reason is the Thirty-Nine Articles, and that smacks of 1920-ish anti-dogmatic liberal prejudice! Professor Whyte of St. Andrews ought to venture south to teach the Canon and other Anglicans to take theology seriously. Though marred by occasional digs at closed-minded fundamentalists,

he makes an admirable case for retaining the great Presbyterian tradition of a theologically educated minister. His castigation of Presbyterian clericalism is no less admirable, and probably of application in any church. Many of us will breathe a quiet amen to Mr. Sharp's dig at the useless information we acquired in preparing to answer gobbet questions in our exams. Without being earth-shattering, this is a useful little symposium with Professor Whyte's contribution a particularly valuable dissuasive from fashionable attacks on theology proper.

G. E. DUFFIELD.

### CALLED TO SERVE.

By Michael Green. (Hodder & Stoughton.) 95 pp. 3s. 6d.

This small volume in the "Christian Foundations" series is a careful study of the ministry in the New Testament with a well balanced statement of the doctrine of the Church's ministry which follows therefrom. Mr. Green writes in an eirenical spirit and succeeds in traversing the familiar battle-ground of Catholic and Protestant controversialists with fair-mindedness and sometimes with a fresh approach.

His study wisely begins from the starting-point of *diaconia*. This is the essential work of Christian ministry, for in all its forms it must, if it is to be Christ's own ministry, reproduce the pattern of the Servant. The keynote of the ministerial commission is to be found in the Lord's command to imitate His action in washing the feet of His followers. Within the general call to self-denying service the New Testament writers trace the rise and development of the various particular ministerial functions which corresponded to the needs of the Christian mission. In the primitive Church it is function rather than office or status which receives most attention; and this is in accordance with the Lord's explicit warning against the preoccupation with status and succession which bedevilled the rabbinic schools. Since the function which the Church's ministers perform is Christ's own ministry, there must be no place either for clerical domination or for any disparagement of ministerial authority: the minister is a servant of the Church only because he is first a servant of the Lord who has commissioned him.

In later chapters Mr. Green sketches the development of the ministry in the primitive Church. He makes the good point that "oversight" is an attribute of God Himself, who delegates it, without surrendering it, to the whole Church, which in turn delegates it, without surrendering it, to particular ministers. On this basis the Eastern Church has retained, more effectively than the West, the ancient pattern of a bishop as a leader who is called to serve his people—"a pastor who knows, loves, teaches, and suffers with his flock". More dubious is the speculation that Cyprian's *presbyteri doctores* may reflect, not an African peculiarity but a primitive distinction between types of presbyter which would give colour to Calvin's institution of ruling and ministerial elders.

An excellent discussion of apostolic succession drives a few more nails into the coffin of the *shaliach* theory of Dix, enlisting the aid of Gilbert Sinden's remarkable article in *S.S.M.* (March, 1964). The



author is probably right in saying that those who accept and those who reject the idea that ministers in apostolic succession can be Christ's plenipotentiaries have, in the last resort, different conceptions of God.

Mr. Green's practical programme for scriptural reforms includes the multiplication of dioceses and the restoration of the bishop's office to true pastorate and oversight over a reasonably small flock; the recovery of the New Testament conception of the presbyter as teacher, pastor, leader, and servant, with the abandonment of our attempts to commend priesthood to nonconformists on unscriptural and un-Anglican grounds; and the recovery of a genuine diaconate. Much less satisfactory to some readers will be Mr. Green's insistence (at variance with his concession that Andronicus' partner as an apostle might have been a woman, Junia) on a subordinate role for women in the ministry. This accords ill with his general picture of the Christian community and appears to rest on the belief that a natural unfitness for leadership must relegate twentieth-century women to a ministry not unlike that "gossiping of the Gospel in the home, at the laundry, and to her friends", which he describes as their role in the primitive Church.

G. H. W. LAMPE.

#### THE BODY OF CHRIST: A NEW TESTAMENT IMAGE OF THE CHURCH.

By Alan Cole. (Hodder & Stoughton.) 90 pp. 3s. 6d.

Some books are able to kindle an interest which before was non-existent. Others perform the more pedestrian but equally important service of answering the questions of those already stimulated elsewhere. Most readers will probably find that this book, No. 3 in the *Christian Foundations* Series, (like its subject) falls fairly and squarely into the latter category. As an attempt to win the interest of un-theological laymen, parsons, and bishops, the opening chapters seem to set off on the wrong foot first by issuing a warning against pressing the image of the body too far, and then by asking how the metaphor arose. Although these questions are logical, and Dr. Cole's answers are good, they are hardly the most urgent and stimulating for the general reader presented with a book on the Church.

The picture of the Church as the body of Christ is basic in Paul (Rom. 12 : 5 ; 1 Cor. 6 : 15 ; 10 : 17 ; 11 : 3 ; 12 : 12-27 ; Eph. 1 : 2ff. ; 4 : 15f. ; Col. 1 : 8 ; 2 : 19). But where did Paul get the idea from? The concept does not appear in the Old Testament or, on the face of it, in the Gospels or Acts. Indeed, the Synoptics seem to picture Jesus set off over against the embryonic Church. But though the term is absent, the basic ingredients are there. In Acts the Church is presented as a believing fellowship under the headship of Christ, whose members really belong to each other, indwelt by His Spirit. Moreover, the idea is implicit in the teaching of Jesus. "He that receiveth you, receiveth me" (Mt. 10 : 40 ; Jn. 13 : 20 ; Lk. 10 : 16 ; cf. Mt. 18 : 5 ; 25 : 40). It becomes almost explicit in Jn. 2 : 19ff. But the root reason why the body idea seems so foreign to the Synoptics is that they are primarily concerned with Christ in the flesh. Paul, on the other hand, is concerned with the post-resurrection, post-

pentecostal Christ in the Church. Before Pentecost the term would hardly mean anything. After Pentecost it is indispensable. All this and much more is presented in a way which is most illuminating for those who come to the book with the problem on their minds. But it might well leave cold the untheologically minded.

From here Dr. Cole proceeds to range over a wide variety of problems connected with the Church. There are the perennials like the relationship of faith and baptism, and sacrifice. There are such current hot topics as Pan-Anglicanism, secession, and valid ministries. What Dr. Cole has to say is vital and needs to be said. But it is a pity that he didn't allow himself to write a book twice or even only half as long again. The result would still have been a handy paperback, comparable in size with Hodder's *Prayer Book Commentaries*. At the same time, he would have had room to grasp firmly these ecumenical nettles. He might have been able to give adequate treatment to MRI, current Roman trends in the light of *Mystici Corporis*, and the notion of the Church as the extension of the Incarnation, instead of just tossing out pointers as to how he would treat them. Perhaps a re-written second edition might fill this needy gap. In the meantime we can be grateful for this useful introduction to the doctrine of the Church.

COLIN BROWN.

#### AFTER DEATH: A SURE AND CERTAIN HOPE.

By J. A. Motyer. (Hodder & Stoughton.) 95 pp. 3s. 6d.

This fifth book in the "Christian Foundations" paperback series published under the auspices of the Evangelical Fellowship in the Anglican Communion, exhibits both the strong and weak points of that series as it has appeared so far. The strong points are that these books treat basic, topical, and controverted subjects in a way that is relevant, reverent, and biblical, and which shows awareness of current scholarship and thought, especially within the Church of England. The weakness is that they attempt to cover great subjects on which there is often a considerable area of disagreement in the Church, in a compass of less than 100 pages; the result is that seldom is any topic covered in sufficient detail or depth either to help the informed evangelical, or to answer all the difficulties of brethren from different traditions. It is also noticeable that nearly all the works cited in them are by British authors, or at least Western ones. One is bound to wonder how far this will hinder the series from achieving its declared aim. In spite of these generalizations, anyone wanting a basic biblical introduction to these subjects and the differing views on them will find them helpful.

The present work is a remarkable attempt to cover the whole field of Individual Eschatology, of death and the after-life, with reference to both Christians and unbelievers. The author sets it clearly in the context of the whole Christian doctrine of God's Salvation of Man (chapters 1 and 8), and studiously avoids getting embroiled either in General Eschatology or in controverted issues not strictly germane to his subject. But the controversial teachings which do bear on it are fairly and squarely faced, and discussed reverently, delicately, and biblically, though in varying fullness. The book abounds with

scriptural references, and even when controversial, the author remains primarily and warmly biblical, clear where Scripture is clear, but reverently agnostic where he holds it is not so. In short, a lucid and refreshing little book with some very practical applications.

J. P. BAKER.

### TRUTH AS ENCOUNTER.

By Emil Brunner. (S.C.M.) 210 pp. 22s. 6d.

*Truth as Encounter* is really two books. The first, which is a plea for a Christian philosophy going beyond Barth and Bultmann, is new. The second is a new version of *The Divine-Human Encounter* which first appeared in English in 1943. Together they constitute a classic summary of Brunner's dialectical theology. The former sets it in the context of the history of ideas. The latter is not just an essay on revelation but a miniature dogmatics.

There is much in Brunner that the immanent theology of the past decade seems to have forgotten or ignored. Christianity is not just existential self-understanding but encounter with the living God. To be more precise and to use Brunner's own words: "Fellowship with the living God who is present with us: this is what faith in Christ in the New Testament means".

But for all his forcefulness, apparent clarity, and concern for vital, personal religion, there is something about Brunner which is reminiscent of the schoolboy who knows the answer to Pythagoras, but has to cook the theorem to get it out right. In trying to avoid the pitfalls of objectivism and subjectivism, Brunner manoeuvres himself into indefensible positions. To Brunner, faith and objectivity are ultimately incompatible, because God is above objects. Hence, God is inhibited from revealing facts. He never discloses factual truth, but only Himself. In other words, Brunner teaches a Protestant, mystical pietism. Whereas in the Bible God reveals facts and Himself in and through them, in Brunner facts are the dispensable husk enclosing an ineffable kernel. What Brunner fails to point out is that, on this basis, there is no reason why we should believe Brunner any more than anyone else, since the essence of revelation cannot be put into words, and his form of words is no nearer the truth than anyone else's.

If this is so, it is difficult to see how Brunner can offer us a more satisfactory alternative to Bultmann and Barth. It happens that his account of certain doctrines is more biblical than Bultmann's, but it is equally vulnerable in its own way. It is true that his thought is easier to digest than Barth's, but it is still wide open to the objections which led Barth to abandon it forty years ago. Even so, Brunner is still essential reading for anyone concerned with the truth of Christianity, if only because of his challenge to face up to what is involved in the Christian faith.

COLIN BROWN.

### SUICIDE AND THE SOUL.

By James Hillman. (Hodder & Stoughton.) 191 pp. 25s.

This is a book to set you thinking. It is written by a psycho-analyst (director of studies at the Jung Institute in Zürich) with a bent for

philosophy. As a psychological study the reviewer is in no position to judge it. But it is a good deal more than this. It begins with a discussion of suicide, in which the author insists on the necessity of trying to see the suicide's problem realistically from his own point of view, and discusses and dismisses the objections to suicide raised by the sociologist, the theologian, the physician, and (until recently) the jurist. This discussion raises for the author certain big questions: Why should the physician want to cure disease and so postpone death? Why should the psychotherapist adopt the aims of the physician? These questions occupy him for the rest of the book. The author considers that since, for the psycho-analyst, the most important thing is the individual soul, when the urge to suicide genuinely comes from within, the psycho-analyst ought to let it find expression.

It will have been sensed by this time that the author does not share the Christian outlook on life and death. The fact that he thinks people should be encouraged to follow the urges of their souls is a sufficient indication of this: all manner of horrible sins could follow from such a maxim. His manner of dealing with the sociologist, the physician, the jurist, and the theologian is another indication: he psycho-analyses them and then dismisses them. (It does not seem to occur to him that the psycho-analyst could be treated similarly.) The sociologist is primarily concerned with promoting society, the physician with promoting physical life, the jurist with promoting law and order, and the theologian with promoting the church; but at the bottom of all these aims lies the dread of death. This definition of aims is particularly inept in the case of the theologian, whose outlook is manifestly very far indeed from being bounded by this life; and the other aims mentioned, if kept in their proper relations, are defensible in theological terms. The author also thinks that he can answer the theologian on his own ground, but he is here superficial and confused, and ends up by claiming that there is no objective authority in religion.

This book makes the reviewer wonder whether the removing of crimes from the statute book is not just the first step towards denying that they are wrong at all.

R. T. BECKWITH.

#### A HUNDRED YEARS' WAR: THE SALVATION ARMY 1865-1965.

*By Bernard Watson. (Hodder & Stoughton.) 318 pp. 25s.*

Two movements, very different from one another, yet both owing their origin most clearly to the same Holy Spirit of God, are celebrating their centenary in 1965. Actually it was in the same month—June 1865—that William Booth, founder of the Salvation Army, was “down the Mile End Road among the weak and wicked of the slums . . . when he first spoke in the open-air service before The Blind Beggar public-house” (p. 16), and Hudson Taylor, unable to worship with hundreds of others in the churches of Brighton, because his heart was burdened for millions in China without the Gospel, paced the sands until he yielded to the constraint of God, and became the founder of the China Inland Mission! Except that both men emerged from Methodism, and had the same “burning love for souls”, they could hardly have been more different, and I have found no evidence that

their paths ever crossed. Certainly in June 1965 both organizations will not merely "raise their Ebenezer", praising God for a hundred years of His faithfulness, but they will look forward with confidence and a renewed dedication to those greater things which God may yet accomplish through them. Thus the dust cover of the *Hundred Years' War* reminds us that, "though the Army's early development is sketched, this is not a history of the Army, or its Founder". Rather it "is concerned with the present and future of the Army, its willing involvement for Christ's sake in human need and problems wherever they be found". The author, Bernard Watson, is himself an officer in the Salvation Army. As he travelled all over the world seeking material for this book, he was convinced "that the Army wages war on new frontiers with the same passion as it did in former times". There are, of course, Salvationists in every Continent, engaged in every variety of social service, but never shifting from their central purpose of winning the poorest, the most degraded, those who have sunk the lowest, for God. Here in this book are fascinating stories, for example, of Kurön in Sweden, the Island of Hope which is a sanatorium for alcoholics, or of its counterpart, Roto Roa, 30 miles off Auckland, New Zealand, or Gloucester House, near Swindon, in this country, and many another centre where miracles are happening. Failures, of course, there are—but as Mr. Watson puts it, the attitude of a social service officer of the Salvation Army can be summed up in the words, "Let them all come—*some may be saved*".

There are a few misprints; and there is an unjustifiable slur on Calvin who, we are told, enforced religious austerity "with stake and flames at Geneva" (p. 33)! The present General of the Salvation Army, General Frederick Coutts, contributes a useful Foreword.

FRANK HOUGHTON, *Bishop*.

#### ALBERT SCHWEITZER: THE MAN AND HIS WORK.

*By Werner Picht. (Allen & Unwin.) 288 pp. 45s.*

As his name suggests, the author is a German, and this book, which first appeared in 1960, has been translated from the German by Edward Fitzgerald and published here in England in 1964. One would imagine, from one's scanty knowledge of German, that it is a good translation, but in view of the voluminous literature concerning Schweitzer already in print, the question naturally arises whether yet another book of 288 pages is really required. Mr. Picht answers this question by assuring us that "it is certainly not another attempt at a biography", but rather "an attempt at an adequate elucidation of the phenomenon Schweitzer" (p. 10). The word "phenomenon" is not too strong when applied to a man of whom it can be said that "the theologian, the philosopher, the preacher, the musician, the doctor, and the colonizer are all one and the same man" (p. 26). The reader must decide for himself how far the "elucidation" is successful. Obviously one cannot withhold admiration from the man who at the age of 90 continues his healing ministry in the jungles of Equatorial Africa at Lambarene. That he has won the hearts of hundreds of Africans is very clear, even though he holds strongly to the view that the relation-

ship between himself (and all other Europeans) and the "natives" ought still to be that of elder brothers to younger brothers. Thus he regrets the "abolition of all traces of the former patriarchal system" (p. 161)—though one hastens to add that intellectually he is essentially forward-looking.

One wonders whether readers of *The Churchman* will follow Schweitzer in his extraordinary emphasis on "reverence for life" (p. 106), which came to him "like a flash of lightning" in 1915. And there are other theories and assertions which many of us would contest. But the question, "Is Schweitzer a Christian?", which the author raises several times, can hardly be answered with anything but a strong affirmative when one reads the sermon printed on pp. 257-260, entitled "Jesus the Lord".

FRANK HOUGHTON, *Bishop*.

#### AT ANY COST : THE STORY OF GRAHAM ROY ORPIN.

By *Mertis B. Heimbach*. (*China Inland Mission. Agents, Lutterworth Press.*) 110 pp. 6s.

News of many lives laid down in north-east Congo, including Congolese Christians as well as missionaries, is a reminder of the cost which may be involved in obeying Christ's clear instructions—"Make disciples of all nations". In the year when the China Inland Mission is celebrating its centenary this little book provides evidence that men and women who have counted the cost are still joining its fellowship, and Roy Graham Orpin is not the only one who has been called to lay down his life "for Christ's sake and the Gospel's" since the Mission, compelled to evacuate the mainland of China, began to thrust its workers into areas largely unreached "from Thailand to Japan".

Roy Orpin, a New Zealander, and his fiancée, a nurse from England, were both trained at the Auckland Bible Training Institute, and sailed for Singapore in April 1959. They were designated to a tribal area in the far north of Thailand, and Mrs. Heimbach, an American worker who, like her husband, has done splendid service amongst the tribes (first in China and now in Thailand), describes in simple, vivid language how after their marriage Roy and his wife "settled"—but the word is not very accurate!—in primitive quarters amongst a people who had never heard of the Gospel. Their first baby was well on the way when in May 1962 he was first robbed and then shot by three Thai bandits while travelling to one of the villages where a small group from amongst the White Meo tribe had professed faith in Christ. He died a few days later. Mrs. Orpin and her little son, Murray Roy, are in that same area still. "The cost to make Christ known," she writes, "has been a life laid down—the dearest treasure He could ask of me. *But He is worthy. . . .*"

FRANK HOUGHTON, *Bishop*.

#### PRAYING WITH SIMPLICITY.

By *Guy Mayfield*. (*Darton, Longman, & Todd.*) 180 pp. 12s.

The author of this book writes in a devout spirit from inside the life of prayer. He has the practical purpose of trying to help people to pray more simply. He therefore discusses the doctrines, problems, and methods of prayer, calling in the saints of the Western Church and

endeavouring to interpret them in terms of Anglican spirituality. Much of this is completely unknown to our people, whether they are the nominal Christians who like the poor are always with us, or the warm-hearted evangelical who prays in the intimacy of the faith once for all delivered to the saints.

There are sound statements with which we cordially agree. "Prayer necessitates reading the Bible, for it is the living Word of God." The author has some shrewd observations: "With the quietist, prayer becomes the substitute for action. With the activist, activity and the display of energy within the organizations of the Church become the substitute for prayer." He sees the helpfulness of literary beauty but is not blind to the risk that some prayers may be æsthetically satisfying without leading us to God.

Yet I wonder if "simplicity" will be attained. It all seems so involved. I should like the author to write a second book on the subject of prayer after steeping himself in some other materials. Apart from a whole literature of Free Church piety and of Puritanism (did the Puritans really believe that matter is evil?), an examination of the New Testament evidence for the doctrine of assurance and the experience of gratitude and joy, and a fresh consideration of the difference between Christ's cross and our cross: all this, allied with the Archdeacon's undoubted cultivation of the spiritual life, would give us a book which might drive us to our knees in exultation, not for the duty of prayer but for its delight.

RONALD A. WARD.

## THE QUESTION OF CHRISTIAN STEWARDSHIP.

*By James Mark. (S.C.M.) 168 pp. 7s. 6d.*

The Central Board of Finance of the Church of England invited Mr. Mark to examine the principles of the Christian Stewardship movement in the light of conditions in Britain. The book under review is the result. The author is a civil servant with special qualifications for his task. He is concerned with finance professionally and has a knowledge of economics and theology, and he has had first-hand experience of a parochial stewardship campaign. The book is not an official publication though the Board maintains a friendly interest in it. Though Anglican in origin, it will be of service to non-Anglican churches.

The impact of the Christian Stewardship movement on the parishes is considered and the criticisms faced. The biblical material is reviewed, both Old and New Testament. The theology of the movement leads on to questions of the aim and scope of stewardship. Is it concerned with money only or with material things generally? Are we to think of the manner of getting as well as of thoughtfulness in giving? Is the method of the campaign correct? Are "church funds" in the widest sense to have priority or must other charitable claims come in? Is the believing man first and foremost a steward or a son?

Such are the questions, and others follow. Stewardship must not be considered in the abstract but in the light of the setting of our lives, economic and sociological. The "affluent society" is not forgotten.

This may not be the last book on this subject but it is undoubtedly

an important one. It raises questions which some enthusiasts will not have thought of and is to be commended to the parishes for serious study.

RONALD A. WARD.

### SONS OF ANAK: THE GOSPEL AND THE MODERN GIANTS.

By David H. C. Read. (Hodder & Stoughton.) 208 pp. 18s.

The author of this book of sermons is a minister who has been a Chaplain to the Forces (and a prisoner of war), Chaplain to the University of Edinburgh, and Chaplain to Her Majesty the Queen. He is now the minister of the famed Madison Avenue Presbyterian Church in New York. These facts help us to assess the sermons. When a Scot accepts a permanent position as preacher in America, we expect his sermons to be a blend of theology and topicality. So it has worked out here. There is a deceptive simplicity of language which might lead the undiscerning to miss the theological foundation. But it is there, and some Greek Testament into the bargain with *chronos* and *kairos*. Dr. Read's congregation obviously knows the modern world of nuclear physics, of George Orwell and the Big Brother of 1984, and it is aware of Mark Twain's recently published attack on belief in God. The preacher *addresses* his people, speaks their language, knows their questions and answers them. He is not afraid to use the first person, singular as well as plural, and thus there is a due measure of personal *testimony*. He *illustrates* his points and at times vividly draws on his experiences as a prisoner of war. In an engaging manner he will tell of a conversation overheard in a train or of the remark made by a guest at a wedding; he will state their criticisms and before you know where you are he is answering them in a disarming apologetic. He thus *defends* the Gospel, as St. Paul did.

Dr. Read has the gift of speaking to people in their own language and of putting ancient truth in a new way. There are ultimately only two denominations, he tells us: the Church of the Dead Sea and the Church of the Living Spring. And who could resist the friendly tilt at some contemporaries in this: "the agnostic is the religious bachelor—uncommitted"?

The setting is America but the Gospel is universal. We can all derive stimulus from this book.

RONALD A. WARD.

### HOOKER AND THE ANGLICAN TRADITION.

By J. S. Marshall. (A. & C. Black.) 180 pp. 25s.

If there is a copy of Hooker on your shelves (allow me to say that I hope there is), where does it stand? In the section on Anglican principles and practice? Dr. Marshall wants to persuade us that the *Laws of Ecclesiastical Polity* should go in rather with the systematic theologies. And he has a good case.

This may sound paradoxical, for we all know that Hooker's great work was conceived as a tract for the times, vindicating the Elizabethan settlement against the assaults of angry young Puritans, who by handling the Bible in the manner of modern Brethren had extracted from it a Presbyterian platform of church order. Hooker wrote, not to



provide a theological textbook, but to show that "the present form of Church-government, which the laws of the land have established, is such as no law of God nor reason of man hath hitherto been alleged of force sufficient to prove they do ill, who to the uttermost of their power withstand the alteration thereof", and that the proposed alternative "is only by error and misconceit named the Ordinance of Jesus Christ, no one proof as yet brought forth whereby it may clearly appear to be so in very deed" (Pref.I.ii). Hence the *Polity* was arranged as a detailed reply to the Puritan theses that Scripture is a complete and exclusive rule of practice, and that it prescribes one constant form of church government of which the Elizabethan establishment fell culpably short through retaining popish superstitions, diocesan bishops, and the royal supremacy. But Hooker had an organic mind which could never rest, nor let others rest, short of first principles, and he saw that in order to do his job thoroughly and conclusively he must discuss the disputed issues in the light of a total view of the nature and much of the content of the Christian revelation. Dr. Marshall here expounds this total view, exhibiting the non-controversial expository sections of the *Polity* as an Anglican *summa theologica*, in the tradition of Aquinas and owing a particular debt to Luther's famous opponent, the leader of the sixteenth-century Thomist revival, Cardinal Cajetan.

Dr. Marshall's detailed placing of Hooker in the history of sixteenth-century theology is perhaps the most valuable feature of his book. From other standpoints, it has limitations. First, it suffers from an error of method. That books I, V.l-lxxxii, VII, and VIII for "a Summa which follows the general outlines of that of St. Thomas" (p. 66) is true, and Dr. Marshall does well to point it out. But, since Hooker is only expounding so much basic theology as he needs to make his points on church government, it is unwarrantable to treat these sections as embodying his total position. This, however, Dr. Marshall does, and so is able to ascribe to Hooker a "catholic" doctrine of salvation through sacramental union with the manhood of Christ, into which, one would gather, Christ's atoning sacrifice, the imputing of His righteousness, God's covenant, faith in the promises, and the saints' perseverance, do not enter in any significant way. How wrong this impression of Hooker is will appear to anyone who reads his magnificent sermons on the certainty and perpetuity of faith in the elect, and on justification through faith without works. But these Dr. Marshall simply ignores.

At several points, his exposition makes Hooker appear as a theological blood-brother of Dr. Pittenger or Professor Mascall. Thus, he ascribes to the great Elizabethan a "catholic" doctrine of apostolic succession which, had he held it, would have obliged him to hold that no non-episcopal clergy can have true ministerial authority. (And what a fine stick that would have been to beat Travers with, in their pulpit battle at the Temple! But Hooker could not avail himself of it, for he did not believe it.) Dr. Marshall also credits him with maintaining that clergy "aid in the mediatorship of Christ" (p. 149)—which Hooker did not say, nor would have said. He was not a child of the Anglo-Catholic movement.

Also, Dr. Marshall's acquaintance with the details of the Protestant scene during the century after the Reformation is imperfect. He reproduces again and again the unhistorical caricatures of fifty years ago. His Calvin is a philosophical determinist (p. 144, etc.). His Puritans are all men of the same sort, anti-cultural, destroyers of art, music, and drama, anti-historical, with no idea of the theological relation between the two Testaments, opposed to any idea of sanctification as endangering belief in justification, and with no notion of natural light or common grace. "Their method was that of proof from texts severed from their contexts" (p. 16). Well, well, well. One can only regret such a display of ignorance. Names like Scholes, Miller, Knappen, Haller find no place in his bibliography—needless to say.

Dr. Marshall's exposition of Hooker on God, law, the natural order, and the Christian state, is excellent—clear, terse, accurate. But the rest wants watching.

J. I. PACKER.

## TWENTIETH CENTURY CHURCH MUSIC.

By Erik Routley. (Herbert Jenkins.) 244 pp. 30s.

Dr. Routley never fails us. Here is the same happy conjunction of erudition, precision of judgment, zest, and fluency which makes all his books on music a pleasure and an education to read. The pleasure meets you on the first page, with its evocation of the Victorian days which just saw the twentieth century in, and seldom leaves you in the course of travelling with the author into the sixties and peering into the fascinating if musically "perilous" country ahead.

Part of the readability of the book derives from the author's skilful marshalling of his vast subject-matter (the bibliographical index of composers and their works runs to eighteen pages). He finds, convincingly, four main movements in the period, chronologically overlapping, of which the first can be seen in the work of those church composers, who followed the lead of Vaughan Williams and Holst towards a cleaner and stronger musical vocabulary without making a sharp break with the past. The second belongs to those who have refreshed church music by using the idioms of the main stream of contemporary composition, many of them being composers well-known in the secular field. Benjamin Britten is the obvious centre-piece of this group, and his genius is acknowledged; yet Dr. Routley is cautious enough to remind us that he is still probably in his "middle period", and that to some eyes he looks unprogressive. (Since then Britten has reassured us that he writes for people, not posterity; and so we may hope that his third period will not, so to speak, take him from us.)

The third and fourth sections of this book come to grips with two utter extremes of contemporary music: the *avant-garde* and "pop". Here are perhaps the most illuminating chapters of all. The author is both acute enough and sympathetic enough to explain what these are trying to do, and what may be their distinctive strengths as well as their weaknesses. The machine-like intricacy of serialism, with its unconcern over the small matter of how it will sound, is its own protection against the temptation to pile on the emotional pressure;

it may well turn out an excellent medium of church music, in Dr. Routley's view. Whether we share that view or not, we can at least see it. As for religious "pop", the author has gone to the trouble of listening hard to it and of comparing different styles of writing and rendering it. He makes the interesting observation, after saying that its value is in mission, that "it impresses those who are the senders of the mission a good deal more than those who receive it". He is also prompted by it to discuss the idea that there may be a place for "disposable" church music, humbly utilitarian and not for hoarding.

Like Dr. Routley's previous volumes, this is well indexed, well furnished with musical examples, full of ideas, and a book to meet a standing need supremely well.

DEREK KIDNER.

### STAINED GLASS WINDOWS.

*By Victor Beyer. (Oliver & Boyd.) 72 pp. 30s.*

The focus is on the Middle Ages: 53 out of the 60 illustrations take us up to 1547, then nothing until 1954. Were those missing four centuries so unproductive? There is something reminiscent of Pugin's medievalism in the claim that the art of stained glass came to be regarded as the most truly Christian of all the arts. Perhaps here lies a clue to the barren period? As for medievalism, it is a little too sweeping to say—without qualifications—that the Middle Ages had a more profound conception of art and greater creative power than we have today.

The book is prefaced by four short essays: the historical and technical sides of the art are particularly well handled and simplified, but the essay on the schools of craftsmen contains information that is condensed almost into a catalogue of people and places. However, it is the illustrations and their readable expanded notes that form the greater part of the book. They are beautifully reproduced in colour, and even the quality of the glass comes across. It is a pity, though, that there is no tie-up between the essays and the illustrations. For example, the distinguished role of the English craftsmen is discussed in the text, but not a single illustration is provided. Could we not have one from York minster?—or perhaps even a Pre-Raphaelite window? The latter would have helped to close that four century gap. Again, the work of Rouault is singled out of the contemporary scene, but we are given no illustration. In fact out of the blue there is an example by a Singhalese artist from a very different tradition to any discussed in the text.

This is one of a series of small books on more specialized aspects of art, with an emphasis on their illustrations. Certainly the windows at Chartres and Bourges provide us with illustrations that in themselves amply justify the present volume.

R. J. CASTLE.

### THE PERMISSIVE MORALITY.

*By C. H. Whiteley and Winifred M. Whiteley. (Methuen.) 143 pp. 15s.*

This book is clearly the product of a deep concern. "The permissive society," the authors accuse, "treats us all as capricious

children, whereas what we need for a life worth living is to be encouraged to grow into full adults." If we are not careful, they believe, we shall find that we have created a society ominously like Huxley's *Brave New World*. This book is primarily descriptive. It enumerates some of the changes which have taken place in the life of our society during the successive decades of this century, and the manner in which a permissive has progressively replaced a prescriptive morality.

In a chapter entitled "Gains and Losses" the authors comment: "It is still possible to doubt whether people in general are any happier than under the old dispensation. It was hoped that with the relaxation of demands, with a gentler attitude to human imperfections, strain and tension would be reduced, far fewer people would be troubled by neurosis, *joie de vivre* would be more in evidence. The idea was that the main source of mental stress was the over stern demands made on human nature by a strict and exacting morality, and that a more permissive attitude, more tolerant of ordinary human nature, would bring about a marked reduction in neurosis". "Unfortunately", they continue, "the evidence does not support this claim". "Perhaps", they gloomily remark, "we are not much less frustrated in the end than we were at the beginning".

The authors of this timely and percipient study recognize that the cult of permissiveness has made more difficult rather than easier the development of maturation. "The mixed-up kid is often mixed up because he is not clear what the rules are and how seriously they are to be taken. Thus neuroses of frustration are replaced by neuroses of bewilderment". "When the rules are relaxed", they point out, "I know neither what other people will do nor what they expect me to do". "A vague and general goodwill is no adequate substitute for definite moral principles".

The writers of this study are convinced that young people "want a faith to live by, a cause to serve, a star to hitch their wagons to; without it they suffer from a sense of not being at home in the world, of being dressed up with nowhere to go".

The answer to our present predicament is not to be found, they insist, in the "uncritical acceptance of the permissive morality", nor is it to be found, they add, in the existentialist cult of revolt. Rather, it is to be found in a moral ideal "which puts emphasis on self-discipline and the acceptance of standards". "The social system we hope for", they affirm, "is one which provides encouragement and opportunity for those things".

This book is not a Christian tract. For that very reason its arguments carry the more weight. The male member of the partnership is Reader in Philosophy in the University of Birmingham.

STUART BARTON BABBAGE.