

# Theology on the Web.org.uk

*Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible*

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

---

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

[https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles\\_churchman\\_os.php](https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php)

## Book Reviews

THE CAMBRIDGE HISTORY OF THE BIBLE : THE WEST FROM  
THE REFORMATION TO THE PRESENT DAY.

*Edited by S. L. Greenslade. (Cambridge University Press.)*  
590 pp. 45s.

We must hope that the expectation that this will be but the first of a series of companion volumes will not be disappointed. Originally only two volumes were envisaged : this one and another, to be edited by Professor G. W. H. Lampe, covering the period prior to the Reformation, and both limited in scope to the western world. Now, however, the preparation of further volumes relating to other aspects and other areas is under consideration. This present volume is admirably conceived and beautifully produced. Apart from the essays contributed by a galaxy of competent scholars, there is a section of four dozen pages of photographic plates illustrating the history of the Bible during the Protestant era.

Dr. Roland Bainton's chapter on the Bible in the Reformation is thrown out of balance by his preoccupation with the views of Luther. It is astonishing that he gives no attention to the writings and sermons of the English Reformers. His assertion that, "of all the parties of the Reformation, the Anabaptists were the most scriptural" is open to serious misconstruction, since to be woodenly literalistic is not the same thing as being scriptural. Moreover, to speak of the Reformed viewpoint as one "which looked upon the Scriptures as the container of the Word of God" is misleading, since the Reformers customarily taught and treated the Scriptures as being (rather than containing) the Word of God.

One of the outstanding chapters of the book is that contributed by the Rev. Basil Hall on Biblical Scholarship : Editions and Commentaries, in which he learnedly surveys the wonderful flowering of biblical studies mainly during the sixteenth century—the activities of the newly invented printing presses and the immense labours of grammarians, editors, translators, and commentators. One corner of the picture he paints is incomplete, for he omits to mention that the reflorescence of Hebrew studies was due primarily to Pico della Mirandola (1463-1494) whose enthusiasm for the Jewish Cabala, in which he hoped to find a complete vindication of the Christian religion, fired the imagination of his time and caused many scholars to acquire a knowledge of the Hebrew language. Among the latter was Johann Reuchlin, who took up the study of Hebrew after he had passed his fortieth birthday and became the leading Hebraist of his day.

Seven different scholars write more briefly on the Continental versions to c. 1600 (German, Italian, French, Dutch, Spanish, Slavonic, and Scandinavian). Professor S. L. Greenslade writes on English Versions of the Bible : A.D. 1525-1611. His praise of William Tyndale is particularly felicitous. "England," he says, "was

fortunate to have in William Tyndale the man who could do what was wanted, a man of sufficient scholarship to work from Hebrew and Greek, with genius to fashion a fitting English idiom, and faith and courage to persist whatever it cost him". "Scripture," he says again, "made him happy, and there is something swift and gay in his rhythm which conveys his happiness. In narrative he has had no superior."

Another posthumous writing from the pen of Dr. Norman Sykes (who originally was closely associated with the planning of the project of which this volume is the firstfruits) is an unexpected bounty. His chapter is on the Religion of Protestants, as defined in William Chillingworth's famous declaration: "The Bible, I say, the Bible only, is the religion of Protestants". With characteristic virtuosity he describes the unique position and influence of the Bible in England during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, evidenced not only in the numerous vernacular versions produced and the distinctively biblical character of the sermons preached during this period, but also in the spheres of literature (Bunyan, Milton, Herbert, etc.), politics ("biblical phraseology and diction moulded parliamentary oratory"), and the home ("In private devotion heads of households, whose duty in earlier centuries had been interpreted as the teaching of their families the Apostles' Creed, the *Pater Noster*, and the *Ave Maria*, now profited by the vernacular Bible to read passages from it, with expositions drawn from favourite commentators or with readings from *The Whole Duty of Man*").

An interesting chapter is contributed by Dr. F. J. Crehan, S.J., on the Bible in the Roman Catholic Church, though his arguments in favour of the equal devotion and veneration with which the Council of Trent decreed that Scripture and tradition should be treated, and in defence of the authenticity of the Vulgate as over against the original texts and vernacular versions, beg more questions than they answer. The modern growth of Bible study in Roman Catholic circles gives cause for the expectation of new developments. Dr. W. Neil's survey of the Criticism and Theological Use of the Bible, 1700-1950, includes a somewhat angry justification of Darwinism and the higher criticism that accompanied it. In defining the task of biblical scholarship as now being "to recover the right approach, in the light of the mass of new knowledge, to such problems as the nature of biblical authority and revelation, the unity of the Bible, and the function of the Bible in the Church", he concludes that "the basis of such study may be expressed in some words of P. T. Forsyth, which crystallize the transition from Chillingworth's position to that of twentieth-century biblical scholarship: 'The Gospel, and the Gospel alone, is the religion of Protestants'".

Of the remaining chapters (which discuss Continental and English versions since 1600, the Bible and the missionary, and the printed Bible, and to which the Editor adds an Epilogue) there is room only to mention the weighty contribution by Dr. Alan Richardson, on the Rise of Modern Biblical Scholarship and Recent Discussion of the Authority of the Bible. There are things he says which we would wish to query, or from which we would dissent; but surely it is an admonitory

admission that among the losses resulting from the new historical control of biblical exegesis " must be reckoned the gradual decay of the ordinary Christian's sense that he can read the Bible for himself without an interpreter and discover its unambiguous meaning ". Sound exegesis based upon a careful study of the original text within its literary and historical setting is, of course, indispensable for the healthy life of the Church, but also indispensable is the instinctive and spontaneous approach of the individual believer to the Bible as the Word of God addressed to him and declaring the message of the Gospel to him. The impression that the Bible is a book for experts, comprehensible only after elaborate training in linguistic and historical disciplines, has indeed, as Dr. Richardson acknowledges, contributed to the decline in personal Bible reading. And surely Dr. Richardson's affirmation that " the prophetic and apostolic understanding of the meaning of the events of the biblical history is entirely due to the revealing action of God ", that " revelation is a mystery, like all the miraculous works of God ", and that " it is God alone who can open the eyes of faith, whether of the prophets and apostles of old or of those who read or hear the biblical message in subsequent generations ", will be welcomed as a focal point of agreement and co-operation by all true Christians.

PHILIP E. HUGHES.

#### 6,000 YEARS OF THE BIBLE.

*By G. S. Wegener. (Hodder & Stoughton.) 352 pp. 35s.*

Two adjectives at once spring to the mind on reading this book : fascinating, and lavish. A third follows them unbidden : inexpensive, for here is a beautifully printed volume, packed with information, and superbly illustrated in a most varied and often unexpected manner. Reproductions of the Dead Sea Scrolls are, of course, all too plentiful nowadays, but here are also photographs of palimpsests, of beautiful 10th century synagogue scrolls, and of early papyrus. Examples of early printing also abound, and an assortment of illustrative material from the patristic period that borders (sometimes) on the fantastic : Ambrose of Milan being summoned by the Holy Ghost to be a bishop ; Cyprian, in his heathen days, surrounded by magical implements.

The author, who is director and editor of the Protestant Press service of the church of Kurhessen-Waldeck, sets out to tell the story of the Bible from the birth of writing through the canonical periods of Old and New Testaments to the discovery of printing, the work of Bible translators, and the finding of the great manuscripts by Tischendorf and others. The very magnitude of the task sometimes betrays him into an indiscreet generalization (" parts of the prophetic books were not written down during the lifetime of the prophets concerned ") or an overstatement (" Isaiah 40-55 is known to have been written by another prophet "). Sometimes the pressure of writing a popular book has led to a wrong judgment as to what is important (pp. 134-138 are on apocryphal stories like that of Paul and Thecla). But, speaking largely, the book is a great achievement finely executed. The attitude towards the Bible reflects the best of modern liberalism : the completion of the Pentateuch about 330 B.C. ; the Maccabean origin of Daniel. On the whole the author seems more at home when he

emerges into the period of church history, and writes his best material on one or two strange by-ways of biblical interest : his account of the work of Tischendorf is a masterpiece, and also his sketch of notable forgers of manuscripts. This book should be specially useful to teachers, in both Sunday and day schools, who would find its illustrative material invaluable.

J. A. MOTYER.

#### THE POLITICAL AND SOCIAL IDEAS OF ST. AUGUSTINE.

By H. A. Deane. (Columbia University Press.) 356 pp. \$7.50.

This is by no means such a large or exhaustive work as the price might suggest ; but it is an excellent concise introduction, well documented and readable, to Augustine's conception of the state and its place in the divine ordering of the world.

Professor Deane, who is Professor of Government at Columbia University, is a student of political theory with a good grasp of Augustine's fundamental theological tenets and the ability to collect and explain the relevant passages from his works, to elucidate them for the general reader, and to demonstrate their importance without making the mistake of trying to draw direct morals from them for our own very different age. He is not content simply to refer the reader to the *City of God*. On the contrary, he has succeeded in bringing together most of the more significant passages on the organization of human society from the whole corpus of Augustine's writings, and he has rightly paid special attention to the anti-Donatist works and the development of Augustine's ideas on the duty of the state to coerce heretics and schismatics. Hence, although this is a somewhat compressed study of a very wide subject, it covers much more ground than the well known work by J. N. Figgis on *The Political Aspects of St. Augustine's 'City of God'*.

Professor Deane devotes his first two chapters to a discussion of Augustine's views on the theology of the Fall and the psychology of fallen man. This provides the right setting for an examination of the concept of the two "cities", and enables the author to demonstrate the grounds on which Augustine constructed his "pessimistic" theory of the function of civil government as the restraint and coercion of fallen humanity's conflicting and disorderly impulses of selfishness and lust : the state is the divinely ordained punishment and remedy for the chaotic sinfulness of fallen man. His firm grasp of this central theological principle enables Professor Deane to take issue with those, such as Combès in *La doctrine politique de saint Augustin*, who have tried to interpret Augustine's ideas in something like Thomist terms. He lays stress on the negative character of the state's function : it cannot attempt to make men good or virtuous, but can seek only to restrain its citizens from performing certain kinds of harmful and criminal acts. He emphasizes, too, the paternalistic character which Augustine ascribes to the ruler. Whether he be Christian or pagan, good or bad, the citizen has no rights against him. He is God's agent ; his duty is to regulate, and preserve from total disintegration, a society in which those who are subjects of the city of God are never more than a small minority ; and obedience is due to him unless he commands what is directly forbidden by God's law. Even then, disobedience

must always be passive, involving the acceptance of punishment. Subjects may not resist. Professor Deane convincingly answers the opinion of Combès that in Augustine's view civil law is null and void if it conflicts with the law of God.

Professor Deane discusses Augustine's acceptance of the duty of the subject to fight in just wars, and his refusal to allow private judgment to pronounce on the justice or injustice of a particular conflict. He also offers a fairly full, though not particularly original, survey of the argument that the repression of heresy falls within the ruler's duty to maintain order.

A somewhat repetitive concluding chapter reviews the whole subject and compares Augustine's theory with those of Luther and others, and especially Hobbes. One could wish for a fuller examination of the reasons for, and the consequences of, Augustine's failure to assign to the city of God a redemptive mission towards the social and political structure of this world, as distinct from the gathering of the elect out of the present order.

G. W. H. LAMPE.

### JOHN ALLEN FITZGERALD GREGG : ARCHBISHOP.

*By George Seaver. (Faith Press.) 342 pp. 40s.*

While unflattering, it is probably true that the great majority of English churchpeople have little or no knowledge of, or indeed interest in, their sister church across the Irish Sea. Yet this ancient church has a great history, and for the past century has been working under considerable difficulties. To anyone wishing to learn of activities in the Church of Ireland in the last sixty years the biography of Archbishop John Gregg is indispensable reading.

Dr. Seaver has produced a book which not only gives a vivid picture of its subject, but also deals most successfully with the many facets of Irish ecclesiastical structure, and with the political upheavals of this period. His portrait of the Archbishop is kindly yet critical. "The Marble Arch" was not easily approachable, and always found it difficult to unbend; yet behind a somewhat grim manner, there lurked a tenderness and sensitiveness unsuspected except by his few intimates. The official impression of him is well balanced by references to incidents living in the memories of his family and close friends, and it is well that this side of his character should be stressed in view of the frigid exterior which Gregg generally exhibited in his public duties. As a scholar, Gregg has been compared with Headlam, and had he not been called to exacting administrative office at an early age, he might well have left behind a greater literary output, but his learning and scholarship were put to good use in the many problems with which he was called upon to deal. It was not, however, his learning so much as his wisdom, which was of the deepest value to the Church of Ireland, and never more than during the political unrest between 1916 and 1922. Here Gregg served both his church and his country with marked distinction at a time when passions were running high, and a false step might have placed churchmen in dangerous isolation. A bishop for forty-four years on the active list, and the only man to attend four Lambeth Conferences, Gregg increased his reputation for sound judgment when called upon to deal with such diverse matters as education, clergy training, and

particularly controversy with the Church of Rome. From his early series of sermons while still a curate in Cork, which was published and acclaimed as a minor classic, to his pastoral letter dealing with the dogma of the Assumption issued in 1950, his pronouncements were received with attention in many quarters outside Ireland. But he was always respected by the Roman Catholic community, and remained in general on friendly terms with the most prominent members of the Irish hierarchy.

Gregg was a lonely man, and was aware of the disadvantage caused by his remoteness and detachment without being able to overcome it. He has been fortunate in his biographer; as we should expect in one who has produced such notable studies of David Livingstone, Edward Wilson of the Antarctic, and Albert Schweitzer, Dr. Seaver has written a definitive life of his subject. In this comprehensive work, the author gives full weight to Gregg's massive scholarship, integrity and independence of outlook, which set a great archbishop against the background of a country beset with many peculiarly intractable problems.

COLLISS DAVIES.

#### THE CHAVASSE TWINS.

*By Selwyn Gummer. (Hodder & Stoughton.) 255 pp. 30s.*

A biography which appears soon after the death of a great public figure must inevitably show signs of haste and perhaps the absence of perspective which only time can reveal. The author is fully alive to these risks and seems unnecessarily prepared for criticism. Inevitably there is much more about Christopher than Noel, and the very deep affinity which existed between these identical twins is a fascinating story. Though Noel's tale is quickly told, it is very moving. Here was not only a great man of supreme courage and devotion to duty (as his unique double-V.C. shows) but a good and humble man of God. Christopher, too, showed the same courage as a chaplain to the Forces, and later when he lost a leg through a boating accident. His first living at Barrow revealed the character we know so well—his policy of bulldozing people into doing what they don't want to do and winning their affection in the process!

This book describes so accurately the man we knew. What some might only have thought, he would put into words without a thought of their effect on others. "Unpredictable" is the word so often used of him. His opposition to the New Prayer Book and his threat to leave the Church in 1927-28, and many years later his sermon at the Islington Conference, and his outburst at the Lambeth Conference against the "fundamentalists" were certainly unpredictable. No one ever heard him preach a poor sermon. Perhaps one of the greatest sermons ever preached in Oxford was his historic oration in St. Mary the Virgin on the occasion of the Celebration of the Fourth Centenary of the Reformation. His name will always be associated with that great report *Towards the Conversion of England*. It was a bitter sorrow to him that it was never followed up. He was impatient at the tendency to bureaucracy and the undue amount of time given by the church to her own internal affairs to the neglect of her real job. "I put evangelism down first on the programme of the church," he said, "and

I refuse to consider the rest of the agenda until the re-conversion of England is well under way".

Christopher Chavasse's greatest monument is St. Peter's College at Oxford, a splendid witness to his tireless determination in the face of mountainous difficulties. The remarkable thing about this man was the affection in which he was held even by those who had most cause to resent his treatment of them. He was true to character to the very end and he treated death when the great reaper called for him with the same aggressive disdain which he had so often shown to other less insistent visitors. Readers of this book will find a remarkably accurate assessment of the life of Bishop Chavasse, which is an achievement so soon after his passing.

T. G. MOHAN.

### JOHN WESLEY AND THE CHRISTIAN MINISTRY.

By A. B. Lawson. (S.P.C.K.) 210 pp. 30s.

The recent report on Anglican/Methodist conversations invests the appearance of this book with particular interest, not least because it is written by a Methodist minister. For the two centuries of Methodist existence, it has been evident that relations with Anglicanism have been strained, not so much because of doctrinal differences, as on church order. An examination of John Wesley's views on this subject makes clear not only the position of the founder of Methodism but also that of the whole denomination.

As in other instances, the matter is complicated by inconsistencies in Wesley's own mind. While the author rightly points out that Wesley's conversion *per se* did not alter his conception of the Christian ministry, by 1745 he had been led into practices which were hardly compatible with regular Anglicanism, namely, preaching without permission in other men's parishes, and appointing lay preachers unlicensed by a bishop. Though still protesting loyalty to the church of his birth, Wesley had already provided the grounds for an ultimate separation from the Church of England. These actions he proceeds to justify by reference to two books, Lord King's *Primitive Church* and Bishop Stillingfleet's *Irenicum*. But both these books appeared when the writers were young men, and they subsequently modified their views. Their first position, however, proved to be Wesley's last. After carefully reading these works, Wesley makes no objection to the function of a bishop being different from that of a presbyter; all he insists upon is that in essence they are the same order. As to diocesan episcopacy, Wesley argued that this was expedient but not necessary. Once he had established that presbyter=bishop, he was more concerned with the work than with the office of the presbyter-bishop. To him, "bishop" denoted a governing elder or superintendent, and in later years, his claim to "ordain" lay not only in the fact that being a presbyter or elder himself, he was therefore a spiritual bishop, but that he was a superintending-elder, in fact "superintendent" of the whole Methodist connection.

While trying to justify his "ordinations" as merely a delegation of personal authority for work abroad, his argument is invalidated by the nature of the ceremony employed, which included the laying on of

hands. The whole complicated matter poses the basic question: Granted the expediency of appointing someone who could "superintend" the Methodist organization in America, how was it that Wesley could still claim to be a loyal member of the Church of England while acting *ultra vires* in making such appointments? Mr. Lawson's clear grasp of the issues involved makes this book necessary reading for all who are working and praying for a closer understanding between the two churches.

COLLISS DAVIES.

## LUTHER.

By F. Lau. (S.C.M.) 178 pp. 21s.

The translation of this German work, by Professor Robert H. Fischer of Chicago, adds one more to the considerable number of short books on Luther at present available in English. The translator describes it in his preface as a "popular monograph", yet the book does not suffer from the customary defects of this type of writing. For the author, who is Professor of Church History at Leipzig and editor of the international *Luther Yearbook*, demonstrates on almost every page that he is fully aware of the complex problems presented by his subject, which can allow of no easy string of generalizations, whatever the restrictions of space. We cannot have all the answers for the cost of a few hours' reading. Indeed, on the central question of when Luther adopted his evangelical views the author has the honesty to conclude, in a "popular monograph", that "we are reduced to the sober acknowledgment that we cannot set up a calendar of Luther's inner development" (p. 67).

Some may feel that this piece of information is not much reward for their pains; but if the dramatic narrative and romantic attraction of the Reformation are missing in these pages, it is because the author has been more concerned to establish the exact stature of Luther within the movement with which he is associated. And it is for just this reason that the book is so useful. It is good to be reminded, in connexion with Luther's period of confinement in the Wartburg, that "the forces (of Reformation) were released precisely by the disappearance of Luther" (p. 93). It is good to be reminded that "we must not regard the territorial visitation system and the entire territorial church administration simply as a creation of Luther"; and that "Luther took over no leading position in his church in an outward sense" (pp. 130, 138). On the other hand, the massive theological influence of the one too often described as "this mendicant monk" (several times with a misprint) is clearly demonstrated by careful reference to his literary output. The demand for his books did not mean that he was the purveyor of the latest theological fashion. The humanists had a better claim to that doubtful distinction: it was Luther who first "made it clear that evangelical faith was something different from humanist piety" (p. 106). By making that distinction Luther hit on something fundamentally biblical, and men were compelled to take notice, whether from opposition or attraction.

J. E. TILLER.

## THE POPES AT AVIGNON (1305-1378).

By G. Mollat. (Nelson.) 361 pp. 42s.

Professor Mollat's great work on the Popes at Avignon was first published in 1912. But the ninth French edition of 1949, from which the present translation has been taken, was considerably revised by the author to take account of subsequent research, without, however, altering its original character of a thesis on the proposition that the so-called "Babylonish captivity of the Church" was by no means the eclipse of the papacy that had been commonly supposed. The success with which Mollat demonstrated his thesis half a century ago established his work as the standard authority on the subject which has never since become obsolete. There is, however, from start to finish a single-minded development of the thesis which leaves no room for excursions which would render the book more intelligible to a reader who is unfamiliar with the fourteenth century setting. The outstanding figure of Boniface VIII hangs like an unexplained shadow over the opening pages; and there is scarcely a hint that, had another chapter been written, it would have had to record the papacy plunging over the brink of schism. In that, of course, lies the success of the book: schism was clearly not the final degradation of a papacy already sunk into grave disrepute. But it must be made clear that this is a work of original research, not a general history of the church in the fourteenth century which might quite easily be hung upon some such title.

The work is divided into three sections: first, a brief character sketch of each pope in turn, with outlines and estimates of their reigns; second, chapters on papal relations with the European states throughout the period of residence at Avignon; and third, a description of the papal court and government and of the development which the administration underwent during the century. Mollat's case is accordingly also threefold: first, the personal qualities of the men themselves who wore the tiara at Avignon were comparable with their predecessors and successors; second, the subjection of the papacy to France during this period has been exaggerated into a myth; third, the continuation of the policy and the claims of the popes which had reached a climax under Boniface VIII received a check from the emergence of the strong nation-states, notably France and England, but not an effective check as yet. With the exception of Sicily, no instance can be found of a country where great strides were not made during the century with papal provisions and other claims. In England, admittedly, a great fuss was made in parliament and hostile legislation enacted, but nothing effective could be done (although Mollat fails to make clear that the popes very rarely in fact interfered with the lay patronage of parochial benefices in England). Indeed, the very good grounds which the author points out for the papal suppression of the election of bishops by chapters provide an important historical lesson which ought not to be overlooked in certain quarters today. In short, Mollat demonstrates that the criticisms of the Avignon residence by Petrarch, St. Catherine, and St. Bridget provide no reliable historical guide. Nor was it the policy of centralization which damaged the papacy as yet as much as the financial system entailed by the costly Italian wars.

J. E. TILLER.

## CHURCH MUSIC IN HISTORY AND PRACTICE.

By Winfred Douglas. Revised with additional material by Leonard Ellinwood. (Faber.) 266 pp. 35s.

The substance of this book was delivered by Canon Douglas as the Hale Memorial Lectures for 1935, at Evanston, Illinois. It has been brought up to date by the supply of references to subsequent works, and by the provision of a final chapter by Dr. L. Ellinwood, in which the developments of the last twenty-five years are reviewed (this chapter was itself a Hale Lecture).

A pure and strong concern for the glory of God unifies the book and ensures that the author's erudition never runs away with him out of the reader's reach, and that music is never set up as an object of worship. Canon Douglas's native air, in the realm of church music, was that of the early seventh century Gregorian collection, which he studied with the monks of Solesmes. For him, as (it would seem) for most others who have had the chance of getting this musical idiom into their bones, this is the music of worship *par excellence*, a standard to which subsequent material continually needs to be referred. But there is no suggestion that growth ceased at this point. The principles which are discerned in the Gregorian music—such as the subordination of the music to the text and to the task of conveying corporate praise to God rather than pleasure to man—are seen as capable of embodiment in new forms, "richer and nobler . . . than the world has yet seen" (p. 53). So the author shows no flagging of interest (unlike some writers who share his love of plainchant) when he comes to the subject of hymns, but gives us a full and sympathetic survey (which occupies almost half the book) of this considerable stream of praise, and of the tributaries that have flowed into it. "After the Bible and the Book of Common Prayer," he considers, ". . . the hymnal is our most precious spiritual treasure and spiritual tool" (p. 155). It is on spiritual rather than merely aesthetic grounds that he assesses the worth of hymnal music. Here is his account of the "new sort of hymn tune, wholly unlike any that had been known before", which the Dykes-Barnby-Stainer school introduced (along with much that was excellent) in the second half of the nineteenth century :

They adopted the methods of the secular part song, and obtained its effects less by strong congregational melody than by elaborate and luscious sounding harmonies for the choir. This tended to make the hymn a pretty thing to be heard, not a vital expression of religious faith to be uttered. It was inevitable that this phase should appear ; a general movement such as Romanticism has its weak elements as well as its strong ones. . . . The trouble with sentimentalism . . . is that it releases no spiritual energy for the work of God, but wastes itself in pleasant personal satisfactions (p. 210).

Canon Douglas would probably have described himself, with reservations about the labels, as Catholic-Evangelical-Liberal ; accordingly, people of each of these groups will find theological meat and poison by turns served up to them here. But it would be hard to find a more scholarly and devout (because God-centred) account and

discussion of the whole field of western church music than this. It can be warmly recommended.

DEREK KIDNER.

### HISTORICAL TRADITION IN THE FOURTH GOSPEL.

By C. H. Dodd. (Cambridge University Press.) 435 pp. 55s.

In this book, which embodies the first course of Sarum Lectures delivered in the University of Oxford nine years ago, Professor Dodd has given us a sequel to his book *The Interpretation of the Fourth Gospel*, published at that time, and in particular an expansion of its appendix which carried the title, "Some considerations upon the historical aspect of the Fourth Gospel". A scholarly and closely reasoned thesis, it reflects half a century of thought, study, and discussion on one of the most fascinating of all the books of the New Testament. For some time the historical character of this confessedly "spiritual gospel" has been at a discount; this book will do much towards reinstating the Johannine Gospel as a reliable witness of the things concerning the Lord Jesus. For behind it all Dr. Dodd discerns an ancient form of oral tradition independent of that represented in the synoptics and of equal value with it. In the nineteenth century inconclusive arguments about the authorship of this gospel drew attention away from some of its more important aspects. Modern emphasis on the corporate nature of the tradition has made possible a renewed study of the theology of the gospel and opened up the historical question afresh.

Dodd proceeds to subject to detailed scrutiny first the Passion narratives, then the account of our Lord's public ministry as a prelude to the Passion, and then John's description of John the Baptist and the call of the first disciples. In the second part of the book he examines the sayings of Jesus, both discourse and dialogue. Again and again he shows that where the account of an incident or saying in the Fourth gospel differs from that of the other three evangelists, the differences are rarely if ever attributable to theological causes. It is unlikely therefore, he argues, that the author had one or other of the synoptic gospels before him and altered their accounts to suit his own special viewpoint; the probability is that he had access to an independent strain of the common tradition. Why otherwise does he omit to mention the darkness over all the earth at the crucifixion, or the rending of the veil, or the witness of the centurion, each of which would have suited his theological purpose very well, and why in the early narratives does he mention factual details like "Aenon near to Salim" as the venue for John's baptizing activity unless he is reproducing an authentic tradition about this and other places? Again, the Johannine account of the Resurrection appearances has all the marks of a connected story of which we seem to have only isolated pericopæ in the synoptics.

Dodd concludes from this that behind all the four gospels we have a general schema or pattern upon which each evangelist freely draws, but that the adaptation of the common tradition in the Fourth Gospel can rarely be proved to have a literary dependence on the other three; on the contrary, its manifest contacts with Jewish tradition and its understanding of the situation in the Holy Land before the great rebellion of A.D. 66 make it probable that this strand of the tradition was formulated substantially before that date and in Palestine itself.

" Even the boldest flights of Johannine theology have a firm starting-point in the tradition " (p. 161). Now that the synoptic gospels are admitted to be theologically conditioned also, the gap between them and the Gospel of St. John has been considerably narrowed both in time and content. Although, for instance, it is, generally asserted that John has no parables, only allegories, Professor Dodd is able to detach at least six passages which are parabolic in form (for example, the passage about the benighted traveller in 11 : 9f) and to show that " in form, content, and purport, often even in vocabulary (they) find their natural place in the family to which the synoptic parables belong " (p. 386). This raises the important question : is it right to claim that any teaching in the Fourth Gospel which appears to go beyond that of the synoptics must *necessarily* be credited to the evangelist and denied to the earlier tradition? Dodd thinks not so ; and by an impressive accumulation of arguments based on every part of the gospel, has, in the opinion of at least one reader, proved his case beyond any reasonable doubt.

L. E. H. STEPHENS-HODGE.

### THE JUSTICE OF GOD IN THE TEACHING OF JESUS.

By J. A. Baird. (S.C.M.) 283 pp. 35s.

This is a remarkably original and penetrating book. Professor Baird, in reaction from the prevalent idea that the love of God is the only proper norm in theology, insists that the justice of God is even more basic in the teaching of Jesus as recorded in the synoptics.

This emphasis itself is refreshing enough ; it is even more refreshing to find a reverent, able, and exceedingly well read scholar examining the synoptic gospels (of all places !) to discover the distinctive " systematic theology " of Jesus ; for too long, he complains, the theologian and the gospel critic have gone different ways. Of course, he is well aware of the formidable and long established bastions of critical orthodoxy he must undermine, and he begins with a most impressive chapter defending the *historisch* from disparagement at the hands of the *geschichtlich*. Having cleared the decks for the treatment of the synoptics as a reliable source, he first shows how Jesus stands foursquare in the prophetic understanding of the justice and righteousness, the love and wrath of God, although, here as elsewhere, Jesus transforms and enhances everything He touches. He then goes on to examine the crisis arising from the coming of Jesus into the world. In his chapter on the cosmological crisis he argues that the teaching of Jesus is not in the three dimensional categories of Newtonian physics, but fits much better into the world view of Einstein, thus turning the flank of those who would demythologize the gospels in the interests of a dated physical theory ! He then turns to the chronological crisis brought about by Jesus, and brings some fascinating new insights to bear : Jesus did not merely restate (so Cullmann) the old Hebrew linear view of time, which admittedly holds good for God's world, but also introduced a vertical dimension into the time scale, one of immediate relationship with God for whom duration has no meaning.

He then applies this to the current eschatological debate, and has some shrewd criticisms of Jeremias' *Parables of Jesus*, for failing to see that the Kingdom comes on two planes of reference ; horizontally

(that is, in man's time scale) Jesus spoke of delay in the parousia, and warned against the prevalent preoccupation with time so characteristic of the apocalyptists, while vertically (that is, in God's time scale) He saw the parousia as ever imminent.

In the succeeding section he shows the relevance of all this for the proper understanding of human psychology and history. Man, to Jesus, is a psychosomatic unity with the *possibility* of experiencing life in the Spirit. He can "fill the God-shaped vacuum in his soul with a brand-new dimension of life, or else reject God's presence of love, and so keep the soul on the psychosomatic level of death, dark and empty" (p. 198). Man must decide. What of those who reject the salvation of God? They will neither be saved against their will, nor tormented endlessly. Baird comes down firmly and impressively for conditional immortality. What then of the wrath of God? In history it is exercised on those who reject His kindly rule in terms of frustration, pain, loneliness, *die Angst* and *das Nichtige*; at the end of a man's history, it means extinction in contrast to the eternal life so freely offered him. In his concluding chapter, Professor Baird urges that the incarnation of Jesus is the incarnation of crisis, in which man is set at the point of tension between the love and holiness of God, between the temporal and the eternal time scales. Man is therefore faced with an urgent decision for or against God, and by his choice he judges himself—a judgment which God underwrites.

Such is a rough summary of a profound, unusual, and arresting book. It is not easy reading, but it is extremely rewarding. I do not know of any book that has treated the creative thought of Jesus so perceptively and consistently. There is hardly any point in synoptic study, or indeed, New Testament theology, which is not illuminated by this most important work. It is something to read and read again. I conclude with this sample of the way in which Baird resolves the antimony in Jesus' teaching about judgment and the after-life (p. 270): "Judgment after an indefinite time would be a reference to the final crisis from a horizontal point of view, in human terms. Judgment immediately at death would indicate a vertical concept of the final crisis where physical three-dimensional time has no meaning; where 'a thousand years are but as yesterday when it is past' (Ps. 90 : 4)."

E. M. B. GREEN.

## THE PARABLES OF JESUS.

By Joachim Jeremias. (S.C.M.) 248 pp. 30s.

The first English edition of this truly epoch-making book was published by the S.C.M. Press in 1954, based on the third German edition. This fresh translation is based on the sixth German edition, in which Dr. Jeremias has both revised and expanded his earlier views, particularly in allowing for the possibility that Jesus did make room for a future coming of the kingdom at some interval after His death, and in taking account of the parables in the recently discovered *Gospel of Thomas*.

As is well known, Jülicher delivered us once and for all from the fantastic allegorization that had bedevilled the exegesis of the parables for centuries. He urged that a parable has but one point—and that, to

him, was usually a moral platitude. Dodd advanced on him by showing that the parables must refer to specific situations in the life of Jesus, and he believed that they must be freed from any reference to a future *parousia*, but teach eschatology realized in the person of Jesus. Jeremias accepts the main positions of these two, though not their details, and takes the investigation a stage further. He tries to uncover the original form of Jesus' message. In order to do so, he has to remove various kinds of accretions which he thinks have obscured it. In the first English edition he found seven, now he finds ten such skins which he peels off in order to discover the meaning which Jesus Himself gave to the parables. As a result, he is able to give an exegesis of the parables (much expanded in this edition) which groups them into eight categories in terms of their message—God's mercy for sinners, the imminence of catastrophe, salvation as a present reality, and so forth. He then appends a section on Christ's parabolic actions, and a conclusion.

Space does not permit a critique of this important work ; such will be found, for instance, in two recent publications, by J. A. Baird, in *The Justice of God in the Teaching of Jesus*, and H. I. Marshall, in *Eschatology and the Parables*. Suffice it to say that whether or not Jeremias' criteria for detecting alterations by the evangelists to the meaning of Jesus will stand critical investigation, this is a book which no thoughtful preacher can afford to neglect. Not only is it fresh and constantly suggestive, but it elucidates the Palestinian background of the parables of Jesus as does no other book. E. M. B. GREEN.

#### ON PAUL AND JOHN.

By T. W. Manson. (S.C.M.) 168 pp. 13s. 6d.

Dr. Matthew Black has put us further in his debt by editing some lecture notes of the late Professor T. W. Manson on Paul and John. Although these were delivered some fifteen years ago, as Dr. Black claims, "the work of a great scholar like Manson does not date".

He begins with Paul, and with Paul's conversion—"a radical change from a self-centred to a Christ-centred life". In the three chapters that follow, he considers the threefold significance and relevance of Christ crucified, in the cosmos, in the individual, and in the church. In the first of these he deals helpfully with Christ's defeat of demonic powers and his exaltation as King ; it is exciting to find someone who enables twentieth century men to understand the apocalyptic demonology which provides the background for Paul's thought. There follows a chapter on Christ as Saviour. Manson first outlines Paul's analysis of human nature, *pneuma*, *sarx*, and so on ; then he goes on to evaluate God's redemption in Christ. This is the weakest part of the book. After quoting no less powerful a verse than Rom. 5 : 10, he appends this scandalously inadequate interpretation : "The death of Christ is for Paul the demonstration of the love of Christ" (p. 52). On the next page he makes the dangerously misleading statement that once a man is reconciled with God "the root of sin is dug out of his life". His general approach to the atonement is in terms of personal categories. He sees justification as the amnesty of a king rather than the acquittal of a judge. The wrath of God is soft-pedalled, Anselm

and all his works are anathematized, and "the supreme work of Christ in relation to justification must be that He makes it possible for sinful men truly to repent" (p. 58). There follows a pleasing but short chapter on the Church, with some penetrating comments on apostasy. However, even an ardent admirer of T. W. Manson may be forgiven for looking elsewhere for more profound and sympathetic understanding of St. Paul.

Manson is much more at home in the intellectual and spiritual climate of St. John. He writes brilliantly on the leading themes in the Gospel—the emphasis on the choice man faces between salvation and destruction, the stress on man's filial relationship with God in Christ, the nature of the "world". He then examines in detail two themes in Christ's revelation, truth and love, before turning to two final chapters on Johannine Christology and the Logos doctrine. Manson sees John's advance on the Synoptics as threefold. Jesus is uniquely Son, *monogenes*; He is pre-existent; and He is one with God (10 : 30), a unity which Manson interprets as an identity of will rather than substance. "In Jesus," he concludes, "we have the complete and final manifestation of God . . . in Jesus all that *we* can know of God is made known." So ends a useful if not an earth-shaking book. Happy and rare are the lecturers whose utterances would read so well in print fifteen years later.

E. M. B. GREEN.

#### INTERPRETING THE MIRACLES.

By R. H. Fuller. (S.C.M.) 128 pp. 8s. 6d.

Professor Fuller has produced another interesting and important book. He is deeply concerned to get to the real meaning of the miracles as "a challenge to faith—faith in the redemptive action of God which is breaking through in Jesus' person, His words and deeds". He brings out well the fact that they are made contemporary in the ministry of word and sacrament. There is a great deal here which will deepen our understanding and encourage our preaching.

We cannot, however, avoid the question of historicity when we discuss the miracles. The simple believer as well as the unbeliever, inevitably asks, "But did it really happen?" Here, Professor Fuller is perhaps less positive. He criticizes those who will not go behind the apostolic witness—conservatives and liberals both come under fire—and he concludes that the general historicity of the miracles may be accepted, though it is comparatively irrelevant whether individual ones did actually happen. He appeals to "fundamentalists" to come to terms with "modern critical believers" over concentrating on the meaning of the miracles and not worrying about the historicity of the nature miracles. It is these which Professor Fuller finds ~~it~~ most difficult to accept, and amongst other scholars whom he lists as sharing his views on this there is at least one whose writings on the subject suggest that he does not. It is hard to acquit him here of adopting an *a priori* position such as he has criticized in others.

Combined with his scepticism over the nature miracles, the author accepts the more extreme premisses of form-criticism by which the possibility of authenticity is denied to anything attributed to Jesus which reflects the post-Resurrection faith of the Church or is paralleled

in Rabbinic sources. His views on the Fourth Gospel assume that it depends to a large extent on the Synoptic tradition—a view which has been weightily challenged recently. All these are issues which cannot be dismissed as irrelevant. Yet let us by all means agree that the main thing is the meaning of the miracles, and let us join with Professor Fuller in a truly biblical presentation of them to our generation.

R. E. NIXON.

#### THE EXODUS IN THE NEW TESTAMENT.

By R. E. Nixon. (Tyndale Press.) 32 pp. 2s.

In this brief monograph, which is the 1962 Tyndale New Testament Lecture, Mr. Nixon first establishes the importance of the Exodus in the Old Testament and shows how even there it is seen to be anticipatory of a new and greater act of deliverance. He then defends typology against a charge of undue allegorism on the ground that it involves a real correspondence between the actions of God in redemption and judgment on different occasions and is not merely fortuitous. The Exodus pattern is then traced successively through the Gospels and Acts, the Pauline Epistles and Hebrews, 1 Peter and Revelation, and is seen to be basic to almost every book of the New Testament. "The whole gospel tradition," as Professor Alan Richardson is quoted as saying, "is cast into a Pentateuchal shape", and the various resemblances are here set out and appraised. Our Lord's activity is described in terms which reflect the Exodus, the wilderness wanderings, and the entry into the promised land, and He is represented as a Second Moses and a Second Joshua. His teaching draws on Pentateuchal images such as those of the brazen serpent and the manna, and the titles given to Him are those ascribed to Yahweh at that formative period of history. Israel's stubbornness is repeated in their rejection of the new Moses and this comes out particularly in Stephen's speech in the Acts and in the Epistle to the Hebrews. Special significance attaches to the Christian re-interpretation of Passover and Pentecost, and the Cross and the gift of the Spirit are shown to be essentially a fulfilment of the earlier acts of deliverance. In days when the close links between the two Testaments are being emphasized once more, this is an instructive and encouraging study.

L. E. H. STEPHENS-HODGE.

#### FOUR PROPHETS: A MODERN TRANSLATION FROM THE HEBREW.

By J. B. Phillips. (Bles.) 161 pp. 15s.

Like a series of old paintings cleaned and restored, these four prophets (or, should we say, three-and-a-half?) display something of their first force and freshness in this new translation. They remain prophets of Israel: they have, happily, not been re clothed in lounge suits and made to chat about religion, but declaim their oracles with the full voice, in language which has lost nothing but its obscurity. Mr. Phillips speaks in his introduction of "this forceful language" of Hebrew, in which "almost every letter is a tensed muscle"; he has shown his uncanny skill in the way he has kept this tautness, or the impression of it, along with his accustomed clarity.

There are many felicitous touches. In the context of Hosea, what

could be better than "true love" as the rendering of *hesed* in 6 : 6 ? (But various expressions are used for it in other places : "kindness" in 12 : 6, "mercy" in Mic. 6 : 8.) The nuance of the taunt, "like David!" in Amos 6 : 5, is captured in the words : "as though you were David himself!" In the famous passage on sins like scarlet, the subject is broached with, "Come, now, and let us settle the matter"; and the baffling "precept upon precept" altercation in Isaiah 28 : 10 is given a flavour of Gertrude Stein :

"Do we have to learn that  
The-law-is-the-law-is-the-law,  
The-rule-is-the-rule-is-the-rule,  
A little bit here, a little bit there?"

—a quite brilliant stroke. The punning passage in Micah 1 is well handled, and the problem of "Woe!" or "Ho!" becomes no problem at all, for the word is made to vary with the mood of the oracles it introduces. "And now for Assyria, the whip of my anger," seems exactly right; but so does, "Why this crown of pride on Ephraim's drunken head!"; and even "Hi! You land of buzzing insects".

One or two criticisms are possible. In Isaiah 9 : 6 the rhythm is needlessly lost with the change of tense : "For to us a child will be born . . .", when other prophetic perfects in the same passage have stayed intact. In Hosea 8 : 7, "And their harvest shall be the whirlwind", is cumbersome and less exact than the proverbial, "And they shall reap. . .". In Amos 2 : 8, "their gods" are read as plural because "the house" has been gratuitously changed to "the houses". And in the introductory pages, while the translator's own preface is full of good things (including a forthright attack on moral relativity), the "historical background" contributed by the Rev. Edwin Robertson contains some very questionable assertions, culminating in the statement (of a kind which was all too common a generation or two ago) : "No written material of any lasting religious significance survives from the period before these eighth-century prophets".

But it is difficult to praise the translation as a whole too highly. It should bring the message of Amos, Hosea, Isaiah (1-39), and Micah to a generation which needs it as urgently as any in history.

DEREK KIDNER.

#### ISRAEL AND THE NATIONS : FROM THE EXODUS TO THE FALL OF THE SECOND TEMPLE.

*By F. F. Bruce. (Paternoster Press.) 254 pp. 16s.*

With Professor Bruce versatility and accuracy are met together. Whether he is writing on Church History, on the New Testament, on Qumran, or on the Old Testament, he is always the master of his subject, and of its current discussion. He is also unfailingly lucid; and this quality is very desirable in one who sets out to cover thirteen centuries in two hundred and fifty pages.

As the sub-title shows, the story is selective : it begins with Moses and ends with the fall of Jerusalem in A.D. 70. Within this period the

pre-exilic part of the history occupies only a third of the book, in order that the less familiar and more tangled tale of later days can be adequately unfolded. This is probably a wise balance: one gains a good panoramic view, even if there is seldom time to stop and take stock of what is developing inwardly in the formative early times. When David breathes his last we hasten on to Solomon with scarcely a backward look; there is no leisure to ask what his permanent and spiritual legacy is: only to mark what became of his empire. This is probably inevitable, if we are to have the external facts in this small compass—and we do get them, with masterly clarity; nevertheless the bones of the history are rather lacking in marrow.

Here and there, too, the standpoint is a little too near ground-level for the present reviewer. One would not easily gather, for instance, that the plagues of Egypt came and went at the express bidding of Moses, or that the sea receded before his rod; rather, that he traced, though rightly enough, the hand of God in these events. Nor does it appear that the forty years in the wilderness were punitive; they are viewed as a necessary training period. There are also one or two minor concessions to critical conjectures: in the realm of chronology, Saul's prophesying is made to follow his first victory (against 1 Sam. 10:9), and Ezra is sent to Jerusalem, "very probably at the suggestion of Nehemiah" (against the sequence set out in Ezra-Nehemiah); while in the realm of interpretation the golden calves of Jeroboam are taken (as Albright suggested) to have been mere pedestals for the invisible throne of Yahweh. This last suggestion is plausible enough until one re-reads what both Jeroboam himself and the author of 1 Kings said of them (1 Ki. 12:28, 32), and until one asks why Hosea thought it necessary to say of the calf of Samaria, "A workman made it; it is not God" (Hos. 8:6).

But it would be carping to dwell on these minutiae. The refreshing fact is that the history of Israel is no longer solely written by sceptical authors; instead, the student can be introduced to it by a scholar of repute who submits to the Word of God as written, and who has managed to produce a book which even a student has some chance of affording to buy.

DEREK KIDNER.

#### THE DEAD SEA SCROLLS.

*By Charles F. Pfeiffer. (Baker Book House.) 119 pp. \$2.50.*

#### RAS SHAMRA AND THE BIBLE.

*By Charles F. Pfeiffer. (Baker Book House.) 73 pp. \$1.50.*

Here are two interesting short books by a distinguished American conservative Old Testament scholar. Dr. Pfeiffer, who is Professor of Old Testament at Gordon Divinity School, has already produced three volumes of an Old Testament history series and is editor of the forthcoming *The Biblical World: A Dictionary of Biblical Archaeology*.

The book on the Dead Sea Scrolls is written with considerable clarity and most of the technical terms from "Essenes" to "Carbon 14" are carefully explained for the layman. The style is readable and there are some good illustrations. This volume is in fact the second edition of a work first published in 1957, the only addition

being a chapter (in slightly different type) on Biblical Interpretation at Qumran. Dr. Pfeiffer is cautious in his conclusions and feels that positive identification of the figures and situations in the scrolls is still not possible. He has some interesting points on the light that they throw on the Old Testament text, and he reminds us that all the commentaries found are on the canonical books of the Hebrew Bible. He thinks that the evidence points to an early date for Daniel, but he is very emphatic that there is nothing approaching proof for this and that over-hasty conclusions must not be drawn. The views of a representative selection of scholars are set out, and altogether the book provides a very good introduction to the study of the Scrolls.

The paperback on Ras Shamra (the first in the series of *Baker Studies in Biblical Archaeology*) though shorter is equally helpful as an introduction to the study of another of the major archaeological discoveries of recent years. Dr. Pfeiffer demonstrates some of the parallels between Ras Shamra and the Old Testament, but reminds us that "we should not conclude that the Israelites directly borrowed their literary forms from Ugarit. Both peoples drew upon a literary and cultural inheritance which was common to the western Semites and, in a measure, to all Near Eastern peoples." R. E. NIXON.

#### THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND AND THE METHODIST CHURCH:

A CONSIDERATION OF THE REPORT, "CONVERSATIONS BETWEEN THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND AND THE METHODIST CHURCH".

*Edited by J. I. Packer. (Marcham Manor Press.) 63 pp. 3s. 9d.*

This symposium is a study of the "Conversations Report" in ten essays by six Anglicans, one of whom is a layman. It is issued in the same type, the same format, and has the same number of pages as the work which its authors are considering. It subjects the "Conversations Report" to a critique that is at once sympathetic, scriptural, and in accord with the Anglican formularies. Though not always easy reading, it is written fairly and from a clear and consistent position.

Dr. Packer sets the scene in a judicious opening chapter. Then follows the Rev. J. A. Motyer's contribution on "Scripture and Tradition", which is remarkable for its clarity and power. On "The Gospel and the Sacraments", the Rev. R. T. Beckwith is at times compressed and at times desultory; this is perhaps the least satisfactory chapter, though it shows clearly enough the confusion of the Report on this crucial relation. In a later chapter on "Priesthood", the same writer most effectively outlines scriptural teaching and Reformed Anglican doctrine. He finds the Report lacking both in precision and in faithfulness to historic Anglicanism. On "Episcopacy", Dr. Packer trenchantly deals with the studied vagueness of the Report. After an historical survey and a close look at both the Interim Statement and the Report he has no difficulty in showing that since "episcopal ordination is theologically identical with non-episcopal ordination", the Report's treatment of this central issue is "an unhappy performance. . . . Anglicanism at its very worst".

Later chapters descend to more close detail. The Rev. C. O. Buchanan's forceful and cogent study of the Service of Reconciliation demonstrates that this rite endangers evangelical truth, tends to

produce many anomalous and controversial situations and is, in any case, unnecessary according to the official declarations of both churches. Later the same writer considers "Ways and Means", and again finds the Report illogical and divisive in its various "stages of reunion". The South India pattern is strongly urged as the better way. The Rev. Colin Brown looks forward to the new church, and with some foreboding shows that if the Report were to be followed in many respects those supporting it would be signing a blank cheque, a situation he likens to "a marriage based on ignorance and irresponsibility". Mr. G. E. Duffield contributes a judicious survey on "Reunion and Establishment" (what profound and far-reaching changes the Report foreshadows in a few short sentences!) and Dr. Packer sums up in no uncertain terms. It is difficult to resist his conclusions.

This book has several outstanding merits. It is never superficial, slick, or tub-thumping. It deals seriously and fairly with what is by any standards an infuriatingly vague document. It keeps strictly to matters raised, and deals with them in the light of principle. The writers stand unshamedly under the authority of Scripture, and make clear their allegiance to the doctrinal standards of the Church of England, which all Anglican clergy profess. It shows evangelical Anglicanism (which is nothing more nor less than the Church of England when she is true to herself) to be capable of informed, sustained theological thinking which has both intellectual integrity and practical relevance to our English situation. The style is a little rough, and the document under consideration speaks with many voices—these things do not make for an easy book to read. But it should certainly head the list of recommended works for study groups and conferences on the "Conversations Report". It would be heartening indeed if some benefactor could send a copy to every Anglican clergyman! It deserves the widest circulation in these years when the majority of Anglican opinion is so confused on so many topics. O. R. JOHNSTON.

### THE ANGLICAN-METHODIST CONVERSATIONS AND PROBLEMS OF CHURCH UNITY :

SOME PERSONAL REFLECTIONS.

*By Archbishop Lord Fisher of Lambeth. (Oxford University Press.) 44 pp. 4s.*

This criticism of the Report on the Anglican/Methodist Conversations is the third such criticism to come from the Anglican side (and incidentally easily the most expensive for the number of pages). First, Evangelicals criticized the Report in *The Church of England and the Methodist Church*, then an Anglo-Catholic in *Order or Chaos?*, and now Lord Fisher, as well as the statements from The Church Union and a group of representative Evangelicals. One thing is clear. In its present form the Report will not do.

Lord Fisher starts in exactly the right place by acknowledging the unity which already exists between Christians, a unity expressed in the one Christian baptism. His two main criticisms are then directed against Stage 2 and against the service of reconciliation. He seems content to stop at Stage 1, holding that it is far too early to see what

the final shape of a reunited church would be, and that in any case it is impossible to commit ourselves to Stage 2 at this early juncture. He is surely quite correct in underlining the vagueness of Stage 2, a vagueness which certainly needs avoiding when such radical changes are hinted at, but is there really any advantage in just Stage 1? Lord Fisher thinks full communion would be a great step forward in unity, but is this so? It would mean parallel episcopal churches existing side by side thus contravening the "one church in one place" biblical principle, and in any case Methodists are at present welcomed to communion in the parish church. If intercommunion were the great aim, it could be granted without all the palaver of Stage 1.

Lord Fisher is afraid the service of reconciliation will be construed as re-ordination, and he very properly wants this ruled out. He approves of this service if it is conceived in terms of authorization of ministry and nothing else. That is the only possible defence of such a service, but will it do today? Everyone knows that the service is ambiguous just so that Anglo-Catholics can read it as ordination to the priesthood (or whatever terms they use to describe that basic idea), so is it practical to do what Lord Fisher suggests? Would not the South India method be better as it undercuts the whole controversy?

Strong things are said by the author about the ministry. He is clear that there is no one biblical pattern of ministry, and that priest simply means presbyter in the Prayer Book. His statements on "freedom from the State" are admirable, and what could be more timely than this?—"It seems a pity, just at this time when stability in tried values is of great importance for the nation, for the Church of England to seek to run away from the duties and responsibilities which fall upon it as the established Church. It should be anxious to serve until the nation wishes to discharge it" (p. 43). A useful corrective to those currently seeking to encourage separation.

Finally, Lord Fisher does not like the way the Report makes out that there are two separate traditions in the Church of England. He describes this as an old-fashioned way of stating things. We all know that he thinks catholic and protestant are dated words, but just at this point is not the Report right? Who can dispute there are mutually exclusive theologies living side by side in the Church of England, often in a state of considerable tension? G. E. DUFFIELD.

#### WORSHIP IN A UNITED CHURCH.

*By Trevor Beeson and Robin Sharp.*

#### CHURCH GOVERNMENT.

*By T. A. R. Levett and Edward Rogers.*

#### SOCIAL QUESTIONS.

*By Kenneth Greet and Martin Reardon.*

#### THE CHURCHES' OUTREACH.

*By Douglas Hubery and Dewi Morgan.*

*Star Books on Reunion, Second Series. (Mowbrays and Epworth jointly.) 58 pp. each. 3s. 6d. each.*

These four booklets are designed to provide basic information in simple form for Anglicans and Methodists to study. The idea is that

the ordinary members of each church may understand the working and thinking of the other church.

The first booklet is a good one. Mr. Beeson is too good a minister to fall for the fashionable writing off of the Prayer Book. He rightly stresses the conservatism of Anglicans in their modes of worship, but he is not unaware of the influence of the liturgical movement, though he ought to be a little more critical of it. Mr. Sharp stresses the importance of hymns to Methodists, though it will surprise many Anglicans how like the Prayer Book most Methodist services are—which is as Wesley would have had it, no doubt.

The second booklet is less good. Mr. Levett mixes some useful information with some fantasy about the doctrine of the ministry and how the faith came to England. Mr. Rogers outlines the place in Methodism of the Conference, the circuit, the district, and the itinerant ministry, but he falls victim to the common illusion that, just because parliamentary sanction is needed for Anglican legislation, the Church of England is not free. Many think it far freer than Methodism with its autocratic Conference, and in any case the whole Church decides representatively through Parliament.

Mr. Greet and Mr. Reardon have produced the best booklet. It is the most readable, and shows the very considerable concern in both churches for the social outworking of the Gospel. They begin with the effects of the Evangelical Revival as seen in men like Wilberforce and the members of the Clapham Sect. Then they move to more recent times, noting *en route* the prominent Methodist contribution to the origins of trade unions. Methodist views on total abstinence and gambling are discussed, and so are such matters as divorce and remarriage, Sunday observance, and a common approach to all these problems.

The last booklet deals with missionary work. The main fact which emerges is that Anglicans work almost entirely through societies, whereas Methodists usually work through official Methodist channels.

The four little books are useful, though a tendency is evident throughout to plug most of the official lines. This is seen both in the choice of general editors and of authors. But the publications should further mutual understanding.

G. E. DUFFIELD.

#### THE HONEST TO GOD DEBATE : SOME REACTIONS TO THE BOOK " HONEST TO GOD ".

*Edited by David L. Edwards with a new chapter by its author,  
John A. T. Robinson. (S.C.M.) 287 pp. 6s.*

#### FOUR ANCHORS FROM THE STERN : NOTTINGHAM REACTIONS TO RECENT CAMBRIDGE ESSAYS.

*Edited by Alan Richardson. (S.C.M.) 47 pp. 2s. 6d.*

The future historian of twentieth century religion will find *The Honest to God Debate* a handy source book. In the space of 287 pages it gives a cross-section of opinion provoked by the Bishop of Woolwich's celebrated *ballon d'essai*. Extracts from letters, twenty-three reviews, and half-a-dozen essays are rounded off by a personal confession from the bishop himself.

To attempt to summarize this book would be to go over the whole debate again. But not quite. Apart from a cursory acknowledgment of their existence in the preface (and some comments on the archbishop by the bishop in the last chapter) no account is taken of the four most substantial replies to *Honest to God* so far published: the Archbishop of Canterbury's *Image Old and New*, O. Fielding Clarke's *For Christ's Sake*, J. I. Packer's *Keep Yourselves from Idols*, and Alan Richardson's *Four Anchors from the Stern*. Doubtless the editor has his reasons for this, but many readers will get the uncomfortable feeling that a number of issues have not been as frankly faced as they might have been.

The most interesting (and the most poignant) chapter is Dr. Robinson's own contribution. Contrary to many impressions, the bishop insists that he has no desire to replace one set of images by another (for example, height by depth). He has no desire to deny any article of the creeds. He has no interest whatever in a God "conceived in some vaguely impersonal pantheistic terms". He wishes to remain a biblical theologian ("and a fairly conservative one at that"). But when all is said and done, the bishop still stands by his original thesis:

The question of God is whether these experiences of depth (and everything else in life) are to be interpreted in terms of 'Being as gracious'—that is, for the Christian, in terms of the grace of our Lord Jesus Christ and the love of God and the fellowship of the Holy Spirit (p. 261).

What Dr. Robinson still does not appear to see is the intellectual impasse involved in this formulation. On the one hand, there is the problem for the Christian of reducing without remainder the biblical doctrine of the Trinity to the concept of "Being as gracious". On the other hand, there is the problem for the non-Christian first of accepting the idea of "Being as gracious", and then of remythologizing these experiences of depth (and everything else in life) as experiences of the Triune God. Sooner or later one of these two ideas—the pantheistic notion of "Being as gracious" or the supernaturalistic Christian view of the Trinity—will have to give way. As the debate stands at the moment in the bishop's mind, it is difficult to see, despite his attempts at clarification, which will win in the end.

A much more modest booklet is the Nottingham symposium edited by Professor Richardson, *Four Anchors from the Stern*. Its starting point is not only *Honest to God* but also *Soundings and Objections to Christian Belief*. Professor Richardson puts the doctrine of God in its biblical context. A. R. C. Leaney and Stuart G. Hall write on Jesus and the Holy Spirit. James Richmond takes us on a quick conducted tour round the top names in contemporary philosophical theology. There is much here that is suggestive. And 1963 might have been a more fruitful year theologically, if this, and not some of the other books mentioned, had been the main talking point. COLIN BROWN.

#### SCHOOL AND CHURCH: PARTNERS IN EDUCATION.

By J. A. Wainwright. (Oxford University Press.) 103 pp.  
7s. 6d.

A few years ago the then Chaplain of St. Paul's Training College,

Cheltenham, wrote a pamphlet for the National Society entitled *The Rôle of the Church Training Colleges for Teachers*, in which he set out the difficulties the colleges face in their efforts to produce Christian teachers, because of the ignorance of the Christian faith in general, and of the Bible in particular, of the great majority of their entrants. It is this apparent failure of the religious provisions of the Education Act of 1944 which is a serious cause for concern.

Mr. Wainwright, no longer Chaplain of St. Paul's, but Secretary of the Education Department of the British Council of Churches, seeks to face the problem and to suggest a remedy. Rightly, he thinks that the problem has been aggravated by our having expected too much of classroom instruction. He quotes the Lincoln Agreed Syllabus: "The aim of religious instruction is not merely to impart religious knowledge, but to bring the scholars into living contact with Christ in a worshipping community". Obviously, a boy or girl who in school years never goes to church will not become a worshipper in church on leaving school just from a sense of loss caused by the absence of the school assembly!

The remedy, therefore, is to overcome this loss of contact with church *while the boy or girl is still at school*, and this can only be achieved by better co-operation between the churches and the schools—especially the county schools (where the religious side of the Act seems to have been least successful).

Mr. Wainwright begins with a reference to the report entitled *School-Church Relationships*, published in 1962, and the product of a joint study group of the National Union of Teachers and the Education Department of the British Council of Churches, which sets out possible ways of co-operation. Mr. Wainwright's present aim is to "go on from the report by making more detailed suggestions about the sort of things that can be done, and the ways of tackling them together".

Here, then, is described how to get started, and the services the church can offer to the teacher in the classroom, and to the teacher as a person. These services include ideas for clerical visits to the schools, visits by the schools to churches, project activities, local news-sheets, "parson-teacher" organization, study groups, "learning to earning" conferences, "school to church" conferences, school-leavers' services, and co-operation between day school and Sunday school. This last involves all kinds of problems, as the British Council of Churches Report *Growing Christians* (in which your reviewer took part) makes only too clear.

The chapter describing efforts—some successful, some not—to put these ideas into practice is especially informative. The book closes with useful appendices on the relevant provisions of the 1944 and 1946 Education Acts, and an account of certificates and diplomas useful to Scripture teachers.

H. J. BURGESS.

#### WORLD ARCHITECTURE : AN ILLUSTRATED HISTORY.

(Paul Hamlyn.) 348 pp. 5 guineas.

There are few more fascinating subjects than that of the architecture, in all its variation of simplicity and elaboration, of the different ages and lands of our world. It is a subject which spans the whole range of

human history and achievement, and which, in the nature of the case, requires the illumination of pictures and diagrams if the reader is to be suitably instructed. Words alone are inadequate for this immense subject : visual representation is essential, even though in a book this can be no more than two-dimensional in character, if one is to have some true appreciation of the achievements of human labour and genius in the sphere of architecture. The ideal, of course, is to see the buildings themselves ; and in this travel-conscious age this is becoming more and more of a possibility for great numbers of people. But even then one can benefit from a reliable guide, an illustrated introduction to the subject, so that one can have some prior understanding of what one subsequently sees at first hand and be enabled to inspect and admire a structure with some degree of intelligence.

*World Architecture* is a magnificent production, abundantly illustrated with 32 pages of colour plates and over a thousand photographs and drawings in black and white. The Introduction is by Professor Henry-Russell Hitchcock of Smith College, Northampton, Massachusetts, and the sections on Ancient and Classical Architecture, and the Architecture of the Chinese, Japanese, Indian, Islamic, Medieval, Renaissance, and Modern periods have been contributed by Professor H. Seton Lloyd of London University, Mr. Andrew Boyd, Mr. Andrew Carden, Mr. Philip Rawson of the University of Durham (who is responsible for both Indian and Islamic sections), Professor David Talbot Rice of the University of Edinburgh, Mr. Norbert Lynton, and Professor John Jacobus of the University of California, respectively. It would be difficult to imagine a finer or more splendid directory to the treasures of the architectural world. The text is clear and concise, and is enlightened with numerous pictures in juxtaposition. Naturally, even a large work can hardly be so comprehensive as to be exhaustive ; thus gaps are to be expected : for example, Portugal, which has a wealth of notable buildings, including the unforgettable church of Sao Jeronimo in Lisbon, hardly gets a look in.

But this is a volume to value and enjoy. It will bring into the home, and not least to the wondering mind of the young, a whole world of exciting discovery and it will implant a desire in that mind to visit and participate in the atmosphere of at least some of these glories of human construction.

PHILIP E. HUGHES.

---