

Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies

“Initial Evidence, Again”

Volume 2, Number 2 (July 1999)

SOURCES FOR THE INITIAL EVIDENCE DISCUSSION: A BIBLIOGRAPHIC ESSAY

Gerald J. Flokstra, III

INTRODUCTION

Initial Evidence was the distinctive theology that was basic to a revival movement. At least that is the culture that I caught growing up.¹ It is a doctrine discussed throughout the 20th century. There have been times that the issue caused discussion within a denomination. Usually a flow of writing followed. In the Assemblies of God there has been a steady production of tracts, pamphlets, and articles on initial evidence. It will be clear that this study focuses on North American sources, particularly on material from the Assemblies of God, U.S.A.

This article is divided into three parts. The first part is a discussion of basic sources when starting a study on initial evidence. A bibliographic essay makes up the second part focusing on works that are not mentioned in the various articles or books cited in part one. The last part lists works on initial evidence with some annotations. The goal is to provide the most complete list in print. It is not meant to index the subject of initial evidence in all periodical literature. *Paraclete*, *Enrichment*, *Pneuma*, *Advance*, and *Pulpit* are indexed in the bibliography.²

¹ I am not the only one that sees the impact and influence of this distinctive doctrine. For example see William Menzies "Frontiers in Theology: Issues at the Close of the First Pentecostal Century," in *Asian Issues on Pentecostalism: Theological Symposium for Asian Church Leaders, 18th Pentecostal World Conference, Seoul, Korea* (Seoul: International Theological Institute, 1998), pp. 15-30 (16-17) and Watson Mills, *Glossolalia: A Guide to the Research* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1986), p. 7.

² There are over 50 articles on the "Baptism" in the *Pentecostal Evangel*. An index is available on-line.

SOURCES TO START A STUDY³

A few sources are vital at the start. These would include *Initial Evidence* edited by Gary McGee (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1986); the July 1998 issue of the *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies*,⁴ the articles by Klaude Kendrick and Ben Aker on initial evidence in the *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1988); and J. Gordon Melton's *Encyclopedia of American Religions*, 3rd ed. (Detroit, MI: Gale Research, 1989) and the sister set *Religious Creeds*. Another work that makes hard-to-find documents available is *Readings on the Doctrine of Initial Evidence* compiled by Gary B. McGee (Springfield, MO: Assemblies of God Theological Seminary, 1996).⁵

There are a few historical studies of initial evidence in these sources. Harold Hunter's "Aspects of Initial-Evidence Dogma" in *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 1:2 (July 1998) is an overview that reveals issues that are still being dealt with today. The bibliographic data is sound and there is good breadth to the article. McGee covers a short span with "Early Pentecostal Hermeneutics: Tongues as Evidence in the Book of Acts" in *Initial Evidence*. There are plenty of references to documents most researchers can only wish to see or handle. Other historical studies in these works are on Parham and Seymour by Goff and Robeck respectively.

The theological approaches to initial evidence are more complex and harder to manage in an article or a book. Aker's article in *Dictionary of the Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements* blends various stances. Both *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* (July 1998) issue and *Initial Evidence* by McGee provide a platform for a number of interpretations. Society of Pentecostal Studies (SPS) papers and *Pneuma* have done the same.

There has been a vigorous exchange of writing in the area of Pentecostal hermeneutics and how it relates to initial evidence. Gordon

³ Details of references mentioned in this section can be found in the bibliographical section.

⁴ These two are also indexed in the bibliography.

⁵ McGee concentrates the selections on articles written prior to 1925 which are by far the hardest to locate. The majority of the articles cover the Bosworth-Kerr debate. Parham, Barratt, McPherson, and other key figures are included. Two articles from the mid-1980s debate hermeneutical stances within Pentecostalism. Two from the 1990s finish the readings.

Fee, Robert Menzies, William Menzies, and Roger Stronstad are well published as to their understanding of hermeneutics and initial evidence. Harold Hunter, Howard Ervin, and James Dunn are important outside the Assemblies of God. *Pneuma* and *Paraclete* also have a series of articles on Pentecostal hermeneutics. This article cannot interact with all of them, but lists some of the articles in the bibliography.

J. Gordon Melton provides excellent tools in *The Encyclopedia of American Religions* and *American Religious Creeds*. They are based on the methodology of Arthur Piepkorn's *Profiles in Belief: Holiness and Pentecostal*, vol. 3 (New York: Harper & Row, 1979). Melton expanded the coverage and included more information on official publications and statistics. Piepkorn gave better bibliographies. *Religious Creeds* brings together the source documents of a multitude of Pentecostal groups that are variously called creeds or articles of faith.

THE ESSAY

There are many bibliographies on Pentecostalism and the Holy Spirit. Only one (Schandorff) uses "Initial Evidence" as a subheading for "Baptism in the Holy Spirit." Because of this, bibliographies are useful only in pointing to a large body of literature leaving the sorting into those dealing with initial evidence as a second step. The best sources for keeping current are the *SPS Newsletter* and ATLA's indexes. There has yet to be a bibliography specifically reflecting Pentecostal interests. Such specific indexing of all works about, by, or on a group would necessitate a specific heading like initial evidence.

Two works by Edwin Jones, *A Guide to the Study of the Pentecostal Movement*, 2 vols. (Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow, 1983) and *The Charismatic Movement* (Lanham, MD: Scarecrow, 1995), are vital to those studying any aspect of Pentecostalism and I send him my gratitude for such work. Use this index to find the dozens of works on glossolalia and baptism in the Holy Spirit. There are also works under the denominational headings that can be directly related to initial evidence. The first major attempt at a bibliography of the Holy Spirit is the work by Esther Schandorff, *The Doctrine of the Holy Spirit* (Lanham, MD: Scarecrow, 1995). There are sub-divisions under "Baptism in the Holy Spirit" entitled "Evidence." Browsing through the 10 pages on the "Baptism in the Holy Spirit" will be beneficial as will going to the "Subject Analysis Index" in the back of vol. 2 and running down some of

the denominational studies. One needs to exercise caution, however, when consulting the bibliographies by Watson Mills.

The interesting survey by David Reed, "From Movement to Institution" in *Summary of Proceedings* (Toronto: American Theological Library Association, 1991) is often overlooked. By dealing with people in three groups (crisis experience, second crisis experience, and second crisis experience accompanied by tongues) he provides an interesting glimpse into behavior claims that were frequent in early Pentecostal circles. Other surveys of tongue-speakers have been done without terminology that would equate it as easily with initial evidence.⁶

The Th.D thesis by Wessels in 1966, *The Doctrine of the Holy Spirit among the Assemblies of God* seems to be overlooked in the footnotes of the books on initial evidence. His study came at a time when the argument for and against initial evidence may have crystallized. Since that study is over 30 years old, it might be time for a replication to see if the trends he notes and the conclusions Poloma drew in 1988 continue to be a part of the Assembly of God clergy worldview.⁷

One of the tracts that is not discussed in any work above is Donald Gee's *Speaking in Tongues: The Initial Evidence of the Baptism in the Holy Spirit* (Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, Evangel Tract No. 961). This tract was also published in Canada and probably in Great Britain in the 1930s. Gee uses manifestation and evidence throughout and sign is used only once. Gee uses a classical Pentecostal hermeneutic when defending the doctrine. John R. Rice's *Speaking in Tongues* (Wheaton, IL: Sword of the Lord, n.d.) devoted a chapter entitled "Tongues Not the Bible Evidence" to refuting Gee's tract. In some ways reading these two tracts is a microcosm of the Pentecostal/non-Pentecostal monologue that still shows up occasionally, but was the rule until the early 1960s.

An example of oversimplification that can occur in this debate of initial evidence is the tract *The Baptism of the Spirit* by A. W. Kortkamp in "What the Bible Says About..." series put out by Gospel Publishing

⁶ For example Nancy Fields, *Pentecostal Charismatic Experiences* (Houston, TX: McGwinn, 1985) provides loads of data without the coherence of Reed.

⁷ Margaret Poloma, *The Assemblies of God at the Crossroads* (Knoxville, TN: University of Tennessee Press, 1988), and also Roland Wessels, *The Doctrine of the Baptism in the Holy Spirit among the Assemblies of God* (Berkeley, CA: Pacific School of Religion, 1966). It should be noted that the journal *Paraclete* started in this milieu of the crystalization and the beginnings of the Charismatic movement as well as the beginnings of a new generation of Pentecostals.

House. Even the title shows that the Assemblies of God had not learned from earlier experience that baptism *in, with* or *Spirit Baptism* was much more correct than baptism *of*.⁸

There are regular treatments of initial evidence in the curriculum of the Assemblies of God. The Teacher's Manuals entitled *Fundamentals of the Faith*, *Our Faith and Fellowship*, and *Holy Spirit* contain lessons or expansions of the shorter tracts and statements of the Assemblies of God. One lesson is entitled "Initial Evidence of the Baptism" from Frank M. Boyd's *Holy Spirit*. None are as thorough as Donald Gee's analysis. The latest addition to this official group of literature is a pamphlet written by Richard Dresselhaus with a title that fills the front page called *The Assemblies of God, Our Distinctive Doctrine: The Baptism in the Holy Spirit*.

An important aspect of the early debate on the baptism in the Holy Spirit was the understanding that the Bible gives other names to the experience besides "the baptism." Many non-Pentecostals were brought into Pentecost when they were challenged by the biblical phrases like the "promise of the Father." One of P. C. Nelson's early writings that stayed in print for decades was *The Baptism that Christ Gives*. He closes with "you will receive just as they did, and have the same evidence." The influence of such tracts is hard to determine.⁹ They can still be found in the tract racks of Assemblies of God churches and in Bible schools around the world.

The Assemblies of God produced its official position in many formats, and so did its ministers. Some examples include *Be Filled with the Spirit* by C. M. Ward (Springfield, MO: Revivaltime, 1975); *Filled with the Spirit: What the Scriptures say about the Pentecostal Baptism* by Robert Cunningham (Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1972); *The Baptism in the Holy Spirit* by Harold Horton (London: Assemblies of God Publishing House, n.d.); *The Baptism in the Holy Spirit* by Jimmy Swaggart (Baton Rouge, LA: Jimmy Swaggart Ministries, 1972); *The*

⁸ An example is Allan A. Swift's *The Spirit Within and Upon* (Green Lane, PA: Maranatha Park, n.d.), 31 pages all together. T. J. McCrossan argues a case I heard many times at Central Bible College in *Are All Christians Baptized with the Holy Ghost at Conversion?* (Seattle, WA: T. J. McCrossan, 1932). Of course, he leaves out tongues altogether and so does not discuss initial evidence, but he does state the *upon* argument. Using "baptism of" by Pentecostals is an on-going problem like the repeated articles on correct use of "Assemblies of God church".

⁹ My grandfather, Gerard John Flokstra, Sr., came into the Pentecostal experience after determining for himself that there was a baptism that Christ gives. He lost his Baptist pastorate in due course.

Baptism of the Holy Spirit and Speaking with God in the Unknown Tongue: What Is It? Is It for Everyone? What Is the Evidence? by Willard Cantelon (Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1951; revised ed. Plainfield, NJ: Logos, 1971); and *The Baptism in the Holy Spirit: The Doctrine, the Experience, the Evidence* (various publishers and titles from 1939-1942) by P. C. Nelson.

These books followed the same format in dealing with the reception of the Spirit in Acts, followed by a discussion of the difference between fruit, gifts, and baptism. Then a warning that initial means at the beginning and that there should be on-going evidence of the Spirit. There is a universal pastoral and theological concern that gift might become more important than the Gift-Giver. The oral nature of Pentecostalism shines through these writings as various anecdotes, illustrations, analogies, and comparisons are applied to the arguments for initial evidence and the baptism in the Holy Spirit.

The healing evangelists in the fifties produced volumes of pamphlets. Many of these evangelists started in the Assemblies¹⁰ and for the most part, their theology of initial evidence shows their roots. Gordon Lindsay, A. A. Allen, Kenneth Hagin, Lester Sumrall, Kenneth Copeland, and others spent varying amounts of time as credential holders in the Assemblies of God.¹¹ These were very popular writers and their periodicals and pamphlets can be found in all parts of the globe. They seem to be ignored in most of the scholarly literature and in libraries. These writings were for the popular audience. And they were popular. Some titles were printed in the thousands and distributed wherever the mail went.

Overlapping this period was the productions of the Full Gospel Businessmen's Fellowship International (FGBFI). Although the personal testimonies always speak of tongues, they do not promote the doctrine of initial evidence. Awareness of and publishing about the baptism in the Holy Spirit were hallmarks of the FGBFI. Twenty years later the same would hold true for Logos International publications that produced many titles on the baptism in the Holy Spirit. One of the most popular works was *The Holy Spirit and You* by Dennis and Rita Bennett (Plainfield, NJ:

¹⁰ See David Harrell, *All Things are Possible: The healing and Charismatic Revivals in Modern America* (Loomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1975). He gives fairly good biographies of many of the "healing evangelists." For example, he does not mention that Lester Sumrall was with the Assemblies of God early in his life. The bibliographic essay (pp. 240-54) is complete.

¹¹ I list at least one pamphlet from each evangelist named in the bibliography.

Logos, 1971). A second work to reach the hundreds of thousands in print from this time period was Don Basham's *A Handbook on Holy Spirit Baptism*. Basham answers two questions on the evidence issue. One is pro and the other non-committal.

In the 1970s, classical Pentecostals were far enough removed from the strictures of denominational culture to rethink, review, and renew their stance on initial evidence.¹² There are a few articles in the SPS papers and *Pneuma* that are historical. Some of these are indexed in the bibliography portion of this article. Many of the histories of Pentecostalism or the Assemblies of God deal with some of the initial evidence controversies.¹³

The bibliography that follows is meant to provide a bridge from the past understanding of initial evidence to the present grappling with the same topic by pointing to articles in every decade of the 20th century. It is also meant to span scholarly writings and popular writings as both writers and readers are seeking biblical truths. Most of all it should make research on the topic a bit easier by providing author indexing to a portion of the works already produced on initial evidence.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abrams, Minnie F. *The Baptism of the Holy Ghost and Fire*. 2nd ed. Kedgaon, India: Mukti Mission Press, 1906.

Abrams, Minnie F. "How the Recent Revival was Brought About in India." *Latter Rain Evangel* (July 1909). Pp. 6-13.

¹² Doug Oss points to Anthony Palma as the person that one re-thinking. See his article in *Enrichment*. Margaret Poloma contributes the re-stating to the maturing aspects of the denomination. Certainly, the transitions of the life of the denomination have caused a greater reflection on the distinctives and purposes of the denomination by a new generation. This is reflected in the flurry of writings on initial evidence and Pentecostal hermeneutics. There have also been a number of writings dealing with the beginnings of Pentecostalism. There has also been and some revisioning of the early history to the point of claiming that certain events are in reality myths.

¹³ Two bibliographic essays that are becoming dated, but would point to many historical works on Pentecostalism are Cecil Robeck's and David Faupel's *Guide to the Study of the American Pentecostal Movement*. Another short introduction to Pentecostal history is a chapter in *Twentieth-Century Evangelicalism: A Guide to the Sources* (New York: Garland, 1990) by Edith Blumhofer and Joel A. Carpenter.

Aker, Ben C. "Initial Evidence, A Biblical Perspective." *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1988. Pp. 455-59.

Anderson, Gordon L. "Baptism in the Holy Spirit, Initial Evidence, and a New Model." *Paraclete* 27:4 (Fall 1993). Pp. 1-4.

Arrington, French. "The Indwelling, Baptism, and Infilling with the Holy Spirit: A Differentiation of Terms." *Pneuma* 3:2 (Fall 1981). Pp. 1-10.

Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies 1:2 (July 1998). The entire issue is devoted to the topic of initial evidence.

Basham, Don. *A Handbook on Holy Spirit Baptism*. Reading: Gateway Outreach, 1969. (Published in the U.S by Whitaker Books). His answers to questions 18 and 19 on initial evidence say yes and then maybe. This book is still in print.

Basham, Don. *Ministering the Baptism in the Holy Spirit*. Monroeville, PA: Whitaker, 1971. Chapter 3 deals with initial evidence. Focuses on pastoral aspects.

Berg, A. and M. Berg. "Helping Believers Receive." *Advance* 2:3 (March 1966). P. 12.

Blumhofer, Edith. "Alexander Boddy and the Rise of Pentecostalism in Great Britain." *Pneuma* 1:8 (Spring 1986). Pp. 31-40. Read this in conjunction with Van der Laan's article.

Blumhofer, Edith L. *"Pentecost in My Soul": Explorations in the Meaning of Pentecostal Experience in the early Assemblies of God*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1989. The testimonies usually come around to the baptism sooner or later.

Bosworth, F. F. *Do All Speak with Tongues?* New York: Christian Alliance Publishing Company, n.d. This article can be found in *Readings* compiled by McGee. Scandorff gives an edition of 24 pages printed in Dallas.

Boyd, Frank M. *Holy Spirit*. The Christian Faith Series Teacher's Manual. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1963. One lesson on initial evidence.

Boyd, Frank M. *The Spirit Works Today: A Biblical Study of the Person and Work of the Holy Spirit*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1970. This is a revision of the 1963 work. See chapter 8 for his discussion of initial evidence.

Brandt, R. L. *Charismatics Are We Missing Something?* Plainfield, NJ: Logos, 1981. Seems to be the same book as below.

Brandt, R. L. *Tongues the Greatest Gift?: Charismatics Are We Missing Something?* South Plainfield, NJ: Bridge, 1981. Chapter 4 "Why not Wind and Fire" deals with initial evidence.

Braswell, Robert D. "Passing Down Pentecost." *Paraclete* 28:3 (Summer 94). Pp. 1-11. Survey of beliefs that an Assemblies of God Sunday School group hold. Initial evidence enters the picture slightly.

Bresson, B. L., *Studies in Ecstasy*. New York: Vantage, 1966.

Brewster, P. S. *The Spreading Flame of Pentecost*. London: Elim Publishing House, 1970. Chapter 4 is on the initial evidence. Weakness of the book is the quotes from various authors without any full bibliographic information useful to finding the sources.

Bridges, James K. "Pentecost-A New Empowerment for Witness and Ministry." *Enrichment* 4:2 (Spring 1999). Pp. 77-81.

Brumback, Carl. *What Meaneth This?* Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1947. Probably the most quoted book produced by a Pentecostal on the baptism in the Holy Spirit.

Burdick, Donald W. *Tongues: To Speak or Not to Speak*. Chicago: Moody, 1969. Uses the word "evidential" throughout, but is anti-Pentecostal.

Burgess, Stanley M. "Evidence of the Spirit: The Ancient and Eastern Churches." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 3-19.

Burgess, Stanley M. "Evidence of the Spirit: The Medieval and Modern Western Churches." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 20-40.

Caldwell, William. *Pentecostal Baptism*. Tulsa, OK: Front Line Evangelism, 1963.

Campbell, Bob. *Baptism in the Holy Spirit: Command or Option?* Monroeville, PA: Whitaker, 1973. Chapter 4 is on the evidence. He also uses the term witness.

Carlson, G. Raymond. "This Is That." *Paraclete* 8:2 (Spring 1974). Pp. 22-25.

Carothers, W.J., *The Baptism in the Holy Ghost and Speaking in Tongues*. Zion City, IL: n. p., 1906. Robeck states this was also published in Houston in 1906.

Chan, Simon. "The Language Game of Glossolalia, or Making Sense of the 'Initial Evidence'." In *Pentecostalism in Context: Essays in Honor of William W. Menzies*. Eds. W. Ma and R. Menzies. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1997. Pp. 80-95.

Christenson, Larry. *Speaking in Tongues*. Minneapolis, MN: Dimension, 1968. Thirty years and still in print. Discusses the 'sign' of tongues in a very broad sense.

Clark, Mathew S. "Initial Evidence: A Southern Africa Perspective." *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 1:2 (July 1998). Pp. 203-17.

Cottle, Ronald E. "Tongues as Evidence." *Paraclete* 13:2 (Spring 1979). Pp. 14-16.

Cotton, Roger, Zenas Bicket, and Benny Aker. "What Does It Mean to Be Pentecostal?" *Enrichment* 1:1 (Winter 1996), Pp. 99-103. Article of same title first published in *Paraclete* 28:3 (Summer 1994), pp. 12-17.

Cox, Raymond L. "Initial Evidence or Spiritual Development." *Paraclete* 7:4 (Fall 1973). Pp. 13-17.

Crawford, Mattie. *Baptism of the Holy Spirit: The Greatest Need of the Church Today*. Los Angeles: Mattie Crawford, 1926. Substantial pages and good apology for tongues.

Cunningham, Robert C. *Filled with the Spirit: What the Scriptures Say about the Pentecostal Baptism*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1972. Chapter on evidences.

Damboriena, Prudencioi. *Tongues as of Fire: Pentecostalism in Contemporary Christianity*. Washington, DC: Corpus Book, 1969. See chapter 6 "Speaking with Tongues" for conclusions that Pentecostals do not hold.

Dela Cruz, Roli G. "Salvation in Christ and Baptism in Spirit: A Response to Robert Menzies, 'Evidential Tongues: An Essay on Theological Method'." *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 1:2 (July 1998). Pp. 125-47.

Dorries, David W. "Edward Irving and the 'Standing Sign' of Spirit Baptism." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 1991. Pp. 41-56.

Duffield, G. P. and N. M. van Cleave. *Foundations of Pentecostal Theology*. San Dimas, CA: LIFE Bible College, 1983.

Faulpel, David W. *The American Pentecostal Movement: A Bibliographical Essay*. Society for Pentecostal Studies, 1972. A bit dated, but the annotations are good.

Fee, Gordon D. "Baptism in the Holy Spirit: The Issue of Separability and Subsequence." *Pneuma* 7:2 (Fall 1985).

Fee, Gordon D. "Toward of Pauline Theology of Glossolalia." In *Pentecostalism in Context: Essays in Honor of William W. Menzies*. Eds., W. Ma and R. P. Menzies. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1997. Pp. 24-37.

Flower, Joseph R. "The Pentecostal Pattern." *Paraclete* 8:3 (Summer 1974). Pp. 22-26.

Flower, Joseph R. "Speaking with Tongues—Sign or Stumbling Block." *Paraclete* 2:2 (Spring 1968). Pp. 16-19.

Frodsham, Stanley H. *Have Ye Received the Holy Ghost?* Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, n.d. Tract number 34-4268. Uses the pattern argument of Acts.

Frodsham, Stanley H. *With Signs Following*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1926. At least four different editions of this book have been printed; 1926, 1928, 1941, 1946. There is a fair amount of change from one to another.

Frost, Robert C. *Aglow with the Spirit*. Northridge, CA: Voice of Christian, 1965. Chapter five discusses the initial evidence of Scripture, but does not apply it to today.

Frost, Robert C. *Aglow with the Spirit*. Rev. Ed. Plainfield, NJ: Logos, 1971.

Gee, Donald. "Jesus—The Baptizer." *Paraclete* 15:2 (Spring 1981). Pp. 6-9.

Gee, Donald. *Speaking in Tongues: The Initial Evidence of the Baptism in the Holy Spirit*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, n.d.. Tract number 951.

Goff, James R., Jr. *Fields White unto Harvest*. Fayetteville, AK: University of Arkansas, 1988.

Goff, James R., Jr. "Initial Tongues in the Theology of Charles Fox Parham." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 1991. Pp. 57-71.

Goodwin, John W. *The Miracle of Pentecost or The Evidence by Speaking with Tongues*. Kansas City, MO: Pentecostal Nazarene, n.d.

Goss, Ethel E. *The Winds of God: The Story of the Early Pentecostal Movement 1901-1914 in the Life of Howard A. Goss*. Hazelwood, MO: Word Aflame, 1958.

Graham, P. Edward. "Do the Deaf Speak in Tongues?" *Paraclete* 24:4 (Fall 1990). Pp. 21-27.

Hackett, Charles. "Leading People into the Holy Spirit Baptism." *Advance* 18:5 (May 1982). P. 4.

Hagin, Kenneth E. *The Bible Way to Receive the Holy Spirit*. Tulsa, OK: Kenneth Hagin Ministries, 1981.

Hagin, Kenneth E. *Why Tongues?* Tulsa, OK: Kenneth Hagin Ministries, 1975.

Hall, J. L. "A Oneness Pentecostal Looks at Initial Evidence." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991, Pp. 168-88.

Hamilton, Michael P., Ed. *The Charismatic Movement*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1975.

Hartwick, A. Reuben. "Speaking in Tongues: The Initial Physical Evidence of the Baptism in the Holy Spirit." *Paraclete* 29:3 (Summer 1995). Pp. 9-15.

Hayford, Jack, *The Beauty of Spiritual Language: My Journey Toward the Heart of God*. Dallas, TX: Word, 1992.

Ho, Melvin. "A Comparison of Glossolalia in Acts and Corinthians." *Paraclete* 20:2 (Spring 1986). Pp. 15-19.

Hodges, Melvin L. "The Baptism in the Holy Spirit Identified." *Paraclete* 5:4 (Fall 1971). Pp. 22-26.

Hodges, Melvin L. "A Distinct Experience." *Paraclete* 6:2 (Spring 1972). Pp. 22-28.

Holdcroft, L. Thomas. "Spirit Baptism: Its Nature and Chronology." *Paraclete* 1 (Fall 1967). Pp. 27-30.

Horton, Harold. *The Baptism in the Holy Spirit: A Challenge to Whole-Hearted Seekers After God*. London: Assemblies of God Publishing House, n.d. The copy I have says 1961, but I think it is a reprint.

Horton, Stanley M. "I Believe . . . In the Baptism in the Holy Spirit." *Advance* 22:6 (June 1986). P. 4. Touches on the subject as he does so frequently.

Horton, Wade, editor. *The Glossolalia Phenomenon*. Cleveland, TN: Pathway, 1966.

Hoy, Albert L. "What Does It Mean to Be Full of the Spirit?" *Paraclete* 20:3 (Summer 1986). Pp. 6-9.

Hoy, Albert L. "Seven Uses of Tongues." *Paraclete* 13:2 (Spring 1979). Pp. 8-13.

Hunter, Charles and Frances. *Why Should "I" Speak in Tongues???* Houston, TX: Hunter Ministries Publishing Company, 1976. A book of testimonies with an introduction that deals with initial evidence as "the only proof."

Hunter, Harold D. "Aspects of Initial-Evidence Dogma: A European-American Holiness Pentecostal Perspective." *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 1:2 (July 1998). Pp. 185-202.

Hunter, Harold D. *Spirit-Baptism: A Pentecostal Alternative*. Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1983. Preface states that seeking a biblical evidence of the work of the Spirit is a reason for the work.

Hunter, Harold D. "Spirit-Baptism and the 1896 Revival in Cherokee County, North Carolina." *Pneuma* 5:2 (Fall 1983). Pp. 1-17.

Hurst, D. V. "The Evidence Points to the Evidence." *Paraclete* 2:1 (Winter 1968). Pp. 22-31. Expands some of the points of Gee's logical approach.

Hurtado, Larry W. "Normal, but Not a Norm: Initial Evidence and the New Testament." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 1991. Pp. 189-201.

"The Initial Physical Evidence of the Baptism in the Holy Spirit (Position Paper)." *Paraclete* 16:2 (Spring 1982). Pp. 1-7. Also published in tract form by Gospel Publishing House.

Johns, Donald A. "Some New Directions in the Hermeneutics of Classical Pentecostalism's Doctrine of Initial Evidence." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 145-67.

Jone, Charles Edwin. *A Guide to the Study of the Pentecostal Movement*, 2 Vols. ATLA Bibliography Series, No. 6. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow, 1983. Does not use "initial evidence" as a subject or subheading, but it will point to many works not listed here.

Kelsey, Morton T. *Tongue Speaking: An Experiment in Spiritual Experience*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1964. Published in paperback in 1968. Has one chapter on "Biblical Evidence" and discusses various interpretations though out.

Kendrick, Klaude. "Initial Evidence, A Historical Perspective." *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1988. Pp. 459-60.

Kerr, D. W. "The Bible Evidence of the Baptism with the Holy Ghost." In *The Phenomena of Pentecost*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1931. A book of five essays by different authors. Title comes from the first essay by Donald Gee. D. W. Kerr states that the Acts 2:4 is the sample that the other Acts passages are to interpreted by.

Kortkamp, A. W. *The Baptism of the Spirit*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, n.d. Tract number 34-4285.

Krister, Stendahl. "The New Testament Evidence." In *The Charismatic Movement*. Ed. M. P. Hamilton. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1975. Pp. 49-60.

LaBerge, Agnes N. O. *What God Hath Wrought: Life and Works of Mrs. Agnes N. O. Laberge, Nee Miss Agnes N. Ozman*. Chicago: Herald, 1921.

Lavang, Raymond K. "The Content of an Utterance in Tongues." *Paraclete* 23:1 (Winter 1989). Pp. 14-20.

Lawrence, B. F. *The Apostolic Faith Restored*. St. Louis, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1916.

Lederle, Henry I. "Initial Evidence and the Charismatic Movement: An Ecumenical Appraisal." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 131-41.

Lee, Edgar. "Affirmed: The Baptism in the Holy Spirit." *Advance* 29:6 (June 1993). P. 6.

Lim, David S. "An Evangelical Critique of 'Initial Evidence' Doctrine." *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 1:2 (July 1998). Pp. 219-29.

Lindsay, Gordon. *How to Receive the Baptism in the Holy Spirit*. Dallas, TX: Christ for the Nations, n.d.

Linzey, S. "Receiving the Baptism in the Holy Spirit." *Advance* 29:6 (June 1993). P. 9 and 29:126 (December 1993). P. 38.

Litzman, Warren. *Pentecostal Truths*. Waco, TX: Litzman Pentecostal Campaigns, 1956. One of the truths is initial evidence.

Lowery, T. L. *Gifted to Serve*. Cleveland, TN: Pathway, 1997. Especially, pages 127-40.

Macchia, Frank D. "Groans Too Deep for Words: Towards a Theology of Tongues as Initial Evidence." *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 1:2 (July 1998). Pp. 149-73.

Macchia, Frank D. "Sighs Too Deep for Words: Towards a Theology of Glossolalia." *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 1 (1992). Pp. 47-73.

Macchia, Frank D. "Tongues as a Sign: Towards a Sacramental Understanding of Pentecostal Experience." *Pneuma* 15:1 (Spring 1993). Pp. 61-76.

MacDonald, William Graham. "Biblical Glossolalia—Thesis 5." *Paraclete* 27:4 (Fall 1993). Pp. 15-22.

McDonnell, K. and G. T. Montague. *Christian Initiation and Baptism in the Holy Spirit from the First Eight Centuries*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical, 1991. Normative is the word.

McGee, Gary B. "Baptism of the Holy Ghost and Fire! The Revival Legacy of Minnie F. Abrams of India." *Enrichment* 3:3 (Summer 1998). Pp. 80-87.

McGee, Gary B. "Early Pentecostal Hermeneutics: Tongues as Evidence in the Book of Acts." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 96-118.

McGee, Gary B. "Initial Evidence and Subsequent Mediocrity." *Advance* 27:7 (July 1991). P. 6.

McGee, Gary B. "Popular Expositions of Initial Evidence in Pentecostalism." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 119-30.

McGee, Gary B., compiler. *Readings on the Doctrine of Initial Evidence*. Springfield, MO: Assemblies of God Theological Seminary, 1996.

McGee, Gary B., editor. *Initial Evidence: Historical and Biblical Perspectives on the Pentecostal Doctrine of Spirit Baptism*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991.

McPherson, Aimee Semple. *The Holy Spirit*. Los Angeles: Challpin, 1931. Not referred to much today.

Menzies, Robert P. *Empowered for Witness: The Spirit in Luke-Acts*. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1995. Especially chapter 13.

Menzies, Robert P. "Evidential Tongues: An Essay on Theological Method." *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 1:2 (July 1998). Pp. 111-23.

Michaels, J. Ramsey. "Evidences of the Spirit, or the Spirit as Evidence? Some Non-Pentecostal Reflections." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 202-18.

Miller, Elmer C. *Pentecost Examined*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1936. Standard Assemblies of God fare.

Nelson, P. C. *The Baptism That Christ Gives*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, n.d.. Tract number 34-4260.

Nelson, P. C. "Concerning the Baptism in the Spirit." *Advance* 13:6 (June 1977). P. 28.

Nelson, P. C. *Did They Speak with Tongues in Samaria?* Enid, OK: Southwestern Press, n.d. Late 1930s and hard to find, but good to read.

Nunn, David. *Pentecost*. Dallas, TX: David Nunn, n.d.. Tract.

Orfila, Ansley. "The Purpose of Tongues." *Paraclete* 9:4 (Fall 1975). Pp. 25-27.

Oss, Douglas A. "Is Baptism in the Holy Spirit Subsequent to Salvation? A Biblical Theological Analysis." *Enrichment* 1:4 (Fall 1996). Pp. 72-77.

Palma, Anthony D. "Another Look at Acts 2:4." *Advance* 30:9 (September 1994). P. 22.

Palma, Anthony D. "Baptized By and In the Holy Spirit." *Advance* 30:8 (August 1994). P. 16.

Palma, Anthony D. "Filled with the Spirit Part 2: Subsequence in Relation to the Baptism in the Holy Spirit." *Enrichment* 3:4 (Fall 1998). Pp. 80-85.

Palma, Anthony D. "Filled with the Spirit Part 3: Is Glossolalia a Necessary Component of the Baptism in the Holy Spirit." *Enrichment* 4:2 (Spring 1999). Pp. 92-97.

Palma, Anthony D. "The Promise of the Spirit." *Advance* 16:5 (May 1980). P. 4.

Parham, Charles F. *A Voice Crying in the Wilderness*. Baxter Springs, KS: Apostolic Faith Bible College, 1910. Goff entitles this book Kol Kare Bomidar when self-published in Kansas City in 1902 and some of the reprints do have that title on the front cover, but not on the title page. McGee gives the 1910 date as a reprint of the 2nd edition. There are many reprints such as the one in 1944 by Joplin Printing Company.

Parham, Sarah E. *The Life of Charles F. Parham: Founder of the Apostolic Faith Movement*. Joplin, MO: Tri-State, 1930. Reprinted a number of times; the most expensive was the one by Garland in the late 1980s.

Pearlman, Myer. *Knowing the Doctrines of the Bible*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1937. Reprinted many times and in paperback. Nothing unexpected here.

Perkins, Jonathan Edward. *The Baptism of the Holy Spirit*. Los Angeles: Jonathan Perkins, 1945. One of his later writings.

Plüss, Jean-Daniel. "Auza and Other Myths: The Long and Winding Road from Experience to Stated Belief and Back Again." *Pneuma* 15:2 (Fall 1993). Pp. 189-201.

Poloma, Margaret M. *The Assemblies of God at the Crossroads: Charisma and Institutional Dilemmas*. Knoxville, TN: University of Tennessee Press, 1989.

Rainey, Chris. "Harold Horton (1881-1960): His Views on Initial Evidence." *Paraclete* 28:2 (Spring 1994). Pp. 23-27. One of the few papers on Assemblies of God writers/theologians and their views on initial evidence that was published. Many were produced by Assemblies of God Theological Seminary students and

can be found in the Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center and Assemblies of God Theological Seminary library.

Reed, David A. "From Movement to Institution: A Case Study of Charismatic Renewal in the Anglican Church of Canada." In *Summary of Proceedings Forty-Fifth Annual Conference of the American Theological Library Association*. Toronto: University of Toronto and The Toronto School of Theology, 1991. Pp. 173-194.

Rice, John R. *Speaking with Tongues*. Wheaton, IL: Sword of the Lord, n.d. Chapter against initial evidence.

Ripley, Jim. "Ministering the Baptism in the Holy Spirit." *Enrichment* 4:2 (Spring 1999). Pp. 79.

Robeck, Cecil M., Jr. "William J. Seymour and 'the Bible Evidence'." In *Initial Evidence*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991. Pp. 72-95.

Rowlands, Gerald and JoAnne Sekowsky. *The Holy Spirit and His Gifts: A Study of the Spiritual Gifts*. Lynnwood, WA: Aglow, 1984. One chapter is on initial evidence.

Schandorff, Esther Dech. *The Doctrine of the Holy Spirit: A Bibliography Showing Its Chronological Development*, 2 Vols. ATLA Bibliography Series, No. 28. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow, 1995. First work that understands the need to subdivide baptism in the Holy Spirit with initial evidence. I only wish the Library of Congress would follow. However, only a handful of items match the subheading.

Shumway, C. W. "A Critical History of Glossolalia." Ph.D. Dissertation. Boston: Boston University, 1919. Wrote other pertinent items that are hard to find. Footnotes do not agree on titles and publishers on his other items.

Steinberg, Hardy W. "Initial Evidence of the Baptism in the Holy Spirit." *Conference on the Holy Spirit Digest*. Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1983. Vol. 1. Pp. 37-41. Also published in *Advance* 19:5 (May 1983). Strong statement from a strong proponent.

Synan, Vinson. "The Role of Tongues as Initial Evidence." In *Twenty-Third Annual Meeting of the Society of Pentecostal Studies Conference Papers on "To the Ends of the Earth"* (Guadalajara, Mexico: SPS, 1993). Pp. 1-23. Also published in *World Pentecost* 52 (Spring 1997), pp. 9-10, 15-17. Also in *Spirit and Renewal: Essays in Honor of J. Rodman Williams*. Ed. Mark W. Wilson. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1994. Pp. 67-82.

Tan May Ling. "A Response to Frank Macchia's 'Groans too Deep for Words: Towards a Theology of Tongues as Initial Evidence'." *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 1:2 (July 1998). Pp. 175-83.

Taylor, Cheryl. "Deaf and the Initial Evidence." *Paraclete* 29:3 (Summer 1995). P. 37.

- Tedeschi, E. "Everyone? Are You Sure, Joel?" *Advance* 8:5 (May 1972). P. 4
- Turner, Max. "Tongues: An Experience for All in the Pauline Churches?" *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 1:2 (July 1998). Pp. 231-53.
- Valentine, Harry. *Pentecost in the Light of the Bible*. Springfield, PA: Harry Valentine, 1965. States that one of the purposes of the book is to show what the initial evidence is.
- Van der Laan, Cornelis. "The Proceedings of the Leaders' Meetings (1908-1911) and of the International Pentecostal Church (1912-1914)." *Pneuma* 11:1 (Spring 1989). Pp. 40-41. Good historical study with plenty of references.
- Vanzandt, J. C., *Speaking in Tongues*. Portland, OR: J. C. Vanzandt, n.d. Fairly early study.
- Vivier, Lincoln M. *Glossolalia*. Johannesburg, South Africa: University of Witwatersrand, 1960. This thesis is an often-quoted study that is simply hard to find.
- Walker, Paul H. *The Baptism with the Holy Ghost and the Evidence*. Cleveland, TN: Church of God, 1962. Another printing came out in 1972.
- Ward, C. M. *Be Filled with the Spirit*. Springfield, MO: Revivaltime, 1975.
- Wayne, Stanley M. "Glossolalia as Evidence." *Paraclete* 13:4 (Fall 1979). Pp. 11-13.
- Welch, J. "What the Baptism Really Is." *Advance* 25:8 (August 1989). P. 4.
- Wessels, Roland. "The Doctrine of the Baptism in the Holy Spirit among the Assemblies of God." Th.D. Dissertation. Berkeley, CA: Pacific School of Religion, 1966.
- Wessels, Roland. "The Meaning of Spirit Baptism and How to Receive It as Taught in the Assemblies of God." *Society for Pentecostal Studies Papers*, 1991.
- Wessels, Roland. "The Spirit Baptism, Nineteenth Century Roots." *Pneuma* 14:2 (Fall 1992). Pp. 127-58.
- Wiebe, P. H. "The Pentecostal Initial Evidence Doctrine." *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 27:4 (December 1984). Pp. 465-72.
- William, J. Rodman. *Renewal Theology*. Grand Rapids, Zondervan, 1996. Latest statement seems to advocate initial evidence.
- Williams, E. S. "As at the Beginning." *Advance* 25:6 (June 1989). P. 4.